

To: Renate Behrens, Chair, RDA Steering Committee
CC: Anne Welsh, Secretary, RDA Steering Committee
From: Chris Holden, RDA Technical Team Liaison
Subject: Formal response to RSC/TranslationsTLO/2026/1

The Technical Working Group would like to thank the Translations Officer for the large amount of work they have done on these proposals in order to respond to community feedback and make RDA more useful to various communities.

These proposals would introduce a large number of elements to the Toolkit. Part of this is due to the nature of RDA itself, because each new agent element requires a narrower element that corresponds to each class of agent, as well as an inverse element. Because of this, each new agent element should be approached with caution, and serve an identified need for a specific cataloging community. Additionally, different standards will serve different needs, and it is not required that RDA have a specific element that correlates with elements in other standards, such as the MARC relator codes.

In this case, we accept the proposal's argument that these elements are "crucial" to the rare materials cataloging community, and settling for the use of broader elements would lead to an unacceptable lack of specificity when it comes to cataloging rare materials. We appreciate that the proposal cites specific community feedback and points out that the adoption of these new elements will likely further the use of RDA in these communities. We also acknowledge that rare materials catalogers are the domain experts of these proposed elements, and so we defer to their judgement that these elements are necessary for the description of rare materials.

In general, however, we caution against a creep of more and more specific elements, and encourage communities to consider localized subtypes of elements for community-specific purposes. We would like to remind all RDA users that, if the Toolkit lacks a specific element, that does not bar a community from defining a local subtype that fits within the hierarchy of the Toolkit (many communities, for example, define an ISBN as a subtype of Manifestation: **identifier for manifestation**, even though there is not a specific element in RDA for ISBN identifiers). In the future, the Community Resources section of the Toolkit might be considered as a platform for documenting community-specific subtypes that don't necessarily merit inclusion in the full Toolkit. However, in the specific case of this group of elements, we acknowledge the expressed need from the international rare materials cataloging community.

Recommendation 1.1: Adding "compositor agent / etc." and "compositor agent / etc. of" to the Toolkit.

Approve. We recommend adding "compositor" as an alternate label to "compositor agent" to match the recommendation given for the RDA Glossary in Recommendation 1.2.

Recommendation 1.2: Adding "compositor agent / etc." and "compositor agent / etc. of" to

the Glossary

Approve.

Recommendation 1.3: Adding “has compositor agent / etc.” and “is compositor agent / etc. of” to the Glossary

Approve.

Recommendation 2.1: Adding “facsimilist agent / etc.” and “facsimilist agent / etc. of” to the Toolkit

Approve. We recommend adding “facsimilist” as an alternate label for “facsimilist agent” and “facsimilist of” as an alternate label for “facsimilist agent of” to match the alternate labels recommended in Recommendation 2.2.

Recommendation 2.2: Adding “facsimilist agent / etc.” and “facsimilist agent / etc. of” to the Glossary

Approve.

Recommendation 2.3: Adding “has facsimilist agent / etc.” and “is facsimilist agent / etc. of” to the Registry

Approve.

Recommendation 3.1: Adding “printer of plates agent /etc.” and “printer of plates agent of /etc.” to the Toolkit

Approve. We recommend adding “printer of plates” as an alternate label for “printer of plates agent” and “printer of plates of” as an alternate label for “printer of plates agent of” to match the alternate labels recommended in Recommendation 3.4.

Recommendation 3.2: Ensuring the *prerecording* section of each new terms alerts cataloguers to the existence of “platemaker agent” elements

Approve.

Recommendation 3.3: Ensuring reciprocal instructions are inserted in the “printmaker” and “platemaker” elements

Approve.

Recommendation 3.4: Adding “printer agent / etc. of plates” and “printer agent / etc. of plates of” to the Glossary

Approve.

Recommendation 3.5: Adding “has printer agent / etc. of plates” and “is printer agent / etc. of plates of” to the Registry

Approve.

Recommendation 4.1: Adding “rubricator agent / etc.” and “rubricator agent / etc. of” to the Toolkit

Approve. We recommend adding “rubricator” as an alternate label to “rubricator agent” and “rubricator of” as an alternate label to “rubricator agent of” to match the recommendations for the RDA Glossary in Recommendation 4.2.

Recommendation 4.2: Adding “rubricator agent / etc.” and “rubricator agent / etc. of” to the Glossary

Approve.

Recommendation 4.3: Adding “has rubricator agent / etc.” and “is rubricator agent / etc. of” to the Registry

Approve.

Recommendation 5.1: Adding “scribe agent / etc.” and “scribe agent / etc. of” to the Toolkit

Approve.

We recommend adding “scribe” as an alternate label to “scribe agent” and “scribe of” as an alternate label to “scribe agent of” to match the recommendations for the RDA Glossary in Recommendation 5.2.

There currently exists the element Expression: **transcriber agent** and its associated narrower elements. It may be prudent to include alerts in the *prerecording* sections of the **scribe agent** and **transcriber agent** elements that inform the cataloger of the existence of the similarly named element.

Recommendation 5.2: Adding “scribe agent / etc.” and “scribe agent / etc. of” to the Glossary

Approve.

Recommendation 5.3: Adding “has scribe agent / etc.” and “is scribe agent / etc. of” to the

Registry

Approve.

Recommendation 6.1: Adding “type designer agent / etc.” and “type designer agent / etc. of” to the Toolkit

Approve.

We recommend adding “type designer” as an alternate label to “type designer agent” and “type designer of” as an alternate label to “type designer agent of” to match the recommendations for the RDA Glossary in Recommendation 6.2.

Recommendation 6.2: Adding “type designer agent / etc.” and “type designer agent / etc. of” to the Glossary

Approve.

Recommendation 6.3: Adding “has type designer agent / etc.” and “is type designer agent / etc. of” to the Registry

Approve.

Recommendation 7.1: Adding “typographer agent / etc.” and “typographer agent / etc. of” to the Toolkit

Approve.

We recommend adding “typographer” as an alternate label to “typographer agent” and “typographer of” as an alternate label to “typographer agent of” to match the recommendations for the RDA Glossary in Recommendation 7.2.

Recommendation 7.2: Adding “typographer agent / etc.” and “typographer agent / etc. of” to the Glossary

Approve.

Recommendation 7.3: Adding “has typographer agent / etc.” and “is typographer agent / etc. of” to the Registry

Approve.

Recommendation 8.1: Adding “woodcutter agent / etc.” and “woodcutter agent / etc. of” to the Toolkit

Approve.

We recommend adding “woodcutter” as an alternate label to “woodcutter agent” and “woodcutter of”. As an alternate label to “woodcutter agent of” to match the recommendations for the RDA Glossary in Recommendation 8.2.

Recommendation 8.2: Adding “woodcutter agent / etc.” and “woodcutter agent / etc. of” to the Glossary

Approve.

Recommendation 8.3: Adding “has woodcutter agent / etc.” and “is woodcutter agent / etc. of” to the Registry

Approve.