

To: Renate Behrens, RSC Chair
From: Anne Welsh, RSC Secretary
Subject: Summary of formal responses to RSC/TechnicalWG/2026/4 -- Soft-deprecated elements specific to content and carrier types

This document collates in tabular form the responses received from voting members of the RSC to [RSC/TechnicalWG/2026/4](#), viz:

- [RSC/TechnicalWG/2026/4/ALyC](#)
- [RSC/TechnicalWG/2026/4/EOO](#)
- [RSC/TechnicalWG/2026/4/ExamplesEditor](#)
- [RSC/TechnicalWG/2026/4/EURIG](#)
- [RSC/TechnicalWG/2026/4/NARDAC](#)
- [RSC/TechnicalWG/2026/4/ORDAC](#)
- [RSC/TechnicalWG/2026/4/TranslationsTLO](#)
- [RSC/TechnicalWG/2026/4/WCEO](#)

Recommendation 1	Approved by : ALyC, EOO, ExamplesEditor, ORDAC, WCEO Approved with amendments by: EURIG ; NARDAC	Note 1: Total number of respondents: 8 Note 2: Reuse soft- deprecated terms as alternate labels of the broader elements into which they are assumed. Note 3: Consideration of deprecated items being subsumed by broader terms and the impact on their meaning.
------------------	--	--

Note 1: Responses were received from all **8** voting members of the RSC.

Note 2: [EURIG](#) suggests, “Since the soft deprecated elements provide a more human readable label than the preferred elements, EURIG finds it important that the deprecated element labels become part of the remaining, broader elements’ lists of alternative labels in the RDA Toolkit. For example, “on disc with manifestation” would become an alternative label for “on carrier unit with”.

Note 3: [NARDAC](#) sees implications on the meanings of the current broader terms once the soft-deprecated terms are subsumed by them:

“In the introduction to the Technical Working Group’s proposal, it is pointed out that the elements Item: filmed with item, Item: on disc with item, Manifestation: filmed with manifestation, and Manifestation: on disc with manifestation are redundant because the same information can be ascertained from the elements Item: on manifestation with and Manifestation: on carrier unit with and the RDA Carrier Type.

When the elements identified in recommendations 1.1-1.4, below, are fully deprecated, it might be useful to evaluate their impact on the definitions for Item: on manifestation with and Manifestation: on carrier unit with. Looking at the definitions and scope of the elements, we noticed a shift in meaning that might need to be examined (emphasis ours):

- filmed with item: An item that is *contained* on the same microform as an item.
- on disc with item: An item that is *contained* on the same disc as an item.
- on manifestation with: An item that is *reproduced* on the same manifestation as an item.
- filmed with manifestation: A manifestation that is *issued* on the same microform with a manifestation being described.
- on disc with manifestation: A manifestation that is *issued* on the same disc with a manifestation being described.
- on carrier unit with: A manifestation that is *a part of* the same carrier unit as another part manifestation.

The first two Item elements, which are fully deprecated in recommendations 1.1-1.2, below, reference items that are *contained* on the same carrier as another item. However, Item: on manifestation with is used for items that are *reproduced* on the same manifestation as another item. The term “reproduced” suggests that the publisher is engaging in post-publication activity with respect to the original content, while the term “contained” does not seem to be as restrictive. Is it preferable to adjust the definition and scope of Item: on manifestation with to mirror the language using “contained” in the deprecated elements?

Similarly, the first two Manifestation elements listed above, which are fully deprecated in recommendations 1.3-1.4, below, are used for manifestations *issued* on the same carrier unit. The element Manifestation: on carrier unit with refers to manifestations that are *part of* the same carrier unit as another part manifestation. Is meaning lost when the language shifts from “issued” to “part of” and from “a manifestation being described” to “another part manifestation”?

