

To: RDA Steering Committee
 From: NARDAC
 Subject: Inconsistency in the transcribed manifestation elements related to source of information

Abstract

NARDAC proposes the addition of one or two options, as appropriate, for all Manifestation elements that relate to identification of the work. In original RDA, these are considered transcription elements; in official RDA, these are now a combination of shortcuts, relationship elements (to Nomen), and transcription elements. The options would offer clear instructions on what a source of information may be or where to find the options on potential sources of information. This will simplify the process of finding the correct instructions for catalogers.

Background

Data provenance: [Recording a source of metadata that is a manifestation that is being described](#) has general instructions to help decide what are the preferred sources for different formats. These options are meant to be applied to the following transcribed elements or their subtypes, according to the preliminary text in *Data provenance: Recording a source of metadata*.

- Manifestation: distribution statement
- Manifestation: edition statement
- Manifestation: manifestation statement
- Manifestation: manufacture statement
- Manifestation: production statement
- Manifestation: publication statement
- Manifestation: series statement
- Manifestation: statement of responsibility
- Manifestation: title of manifestation

However, *some* of the transcribed elements affected by this chapter also have the Option: “Use any source of information.” (E.g. under [edition statement](#))

After a search for this phrase, NARDAC found that the option is found in the elements listed below.

Manifestation transcription elements that include the option:

[abbreviated title](#)
[contact information](#)
[designation of](#)
[edition](#)

[designation of](#)
[named revision of](#)
[edition](#)
[edition statement](#)

[other title](#)
[information of](#)
[series](#)
[series statement](#)

Elements with a range of Nomen that include the option:

<u>identifier for agent</u>	<u>identifier for RDA</u>	<u>name of family</u>
<u>identifier for</u>	<u>entity</u>	<u>name of person</u>
<u>collective agent</u>	<u>identifier for</u>	<u>name of place</u>
<u>identifier for</u>	<u>timespan</u>	<u>name of RDA</u>
<u>corporate body</u>	<u>identifier for work</u>	<u>entity</u>
<u>identifier for</u>	<u>identifier for work</u>	<u>name of timespan</u>
<u>expression</u>	<u>group</u>	<u>title of expression</u>
<u>identifier for family</u>	<u>ISSN</u>	<u>title of item</u>
<u>identifier for item</u>	<u>name of agent</u>	<u>title of</u>
<u>identifier for</u>	<u>name of collective</u>	<u>manifestation</u>
<u>manifestation</u>	<u>agent</u>	<u>title of work</u>
<u>identifier for person</u>	<u>name of corporate</u>	
<u>identifier for place</u>	<u>body</u>	

Having examined this pattern, we have no issue with the elements with a range of Nomen. We recognize that elements that now have a range of Nomen are the relationship element version of what were previously also transcribed elements. However, we are puzzled by the inconsistency of the inclusion of the option with some Manifestation transcription elements, but not others. The following manifestation transcription elements lack the option:

- title proper
- parallel title proper
- variant title of manifestation
- title of series
- parallel title of series
- other title information
- parallel other title information
- statement of responsibility
- statement of responsibility relating to title proper
- parallel statement of responsibility relating to title proper
- statement of responsibility relating to edition
- parallel statement of responsibility relating to edition
- statement of responsibility relating to named revision of edition
- parallel statement of responsibility relating to named revision of edition
- statement of responsibility relating to series
- parallel statement of responsibility relating to series
- designation of edition
- parallel designation of edition
- parallel designation of named revision of edition
- production statement
- place of production
- parallel place of production
- name of producer
- parallel name of producer
- date of production

- publication statement
- place of publication
- parallel place of publication
- name of publisher
- parallel name of publisher
- date of publication
- distribution statement
- place of distribution
- parallel place of distribution
- name of distributor
- parallel name of distributor
- date of distribution
- manufacture statement
- place of manufacture
- parallel place of manufacture
- name of manufacturer
- parallel name of manufacturer
- date of manufacture
- numbering within sequence
- parallel other title information of series
- numbering of sequence
- first alphanumeric designation of sequence
- first chronological designation of sequence
- last alphanumeric designation of sequence
- last chronological designation of sequence
- first alphanumeric designation of alternative sequence
- first chronological designation of alternative sequence
- last alphanumeric designation of alternative sequence
- last chronological designation of alternative sequence

The original RDA Toolkit defines a source of information for *all* of the Manifestation elements.

For all of the transcribed elements, the list consistently includes a reference to RDA 2.2.4. The instructions mentioned in RDA 2.2.4 indicate that while there is a preferred order to the source of information, all transcription elements may eventually take information from outside the manifestation itself, ending with “any other available source (e.g., a reference source).” In essence, this instruction is the same as the Official RDA option “Use any source of information.”

For example, in Original RDA, the element other title information first tells the cataloger to use the same source of information as the title proper (RDA 2.3.4.2), but it also points the cataloger to 2.3.2.2. This instruction is the basic source of information instruction for title proper, which then points the cataloger to 2.2.2-2.2.3. Having followed this path of instructions, the end result is that other title information may be taken first from the same location as the title proper, then through a preferred list of other locations on the manifestation, and finally from outside the manifestation. This path of instructions holds true for *all the transcribed elements*.

As a result, when doing this analysis, NARDAC was concerned that these elements did *not* contain any such instruction in Official RDA. There are two options, therefore, that NARDAC feels are missing: first is the option that points to the location of the instructions under *Data provenance*: [*Recording a source of metadata that is a manifestation that is being described*](#); and second, the option to use any source of information that is valid. (Preferred order listings for this second option can be added in policy statements, so do not need to be included in the option itself.)

As a starting point, one reason that adding these options would be beneficial is basic functionality. While the sections in Data provenance do provide guidance on choosing a source of information for all of these elements, there is nothing in the transcribed element pages that points to this guidance. While there is generally a section on approximately 49 of these elements that points to Data provenance guidance under the “Recording an unstructured description” section, that option is related to recording what the source of information **is**, not directing the cataloger to the options related to **choosing the source of information**. This means that a cataloger has to know where to look to find this guidance **without any direction** from within the element. In addition, there is no option or other text within the element page on which policy statements related to choice of source of information can display within context. Therefore having these instructions on every element, regardless of whether or not these are superelements or subelements, would increase the efficiency of cataloging.

In gathering information about these elements from the Technical WG Chair, several points were made that should be mentioned here in order to address their relevance to the recommendations. The first point is that many of these elements have the option on a broader element, which means that they then apply to all the narrower elements.

The element title of manifestation is an example of this, as the option to use any source of information that applies to all of the narrower elements under it. While we understand this application, the above-mentioned ideal of ease and efficiency in cataloging means that this adds several steps to the process of finding the relevant information. If the options and related policy statements were already there on every element, then what would take several steps now can be condensed down to one click.

The second point that the Chair of the Technical Working Group mentioned is the fact that some of these elements are now shortcut elements instead of transcription elements (e.g., name of publisher). However, we fail to understand why this should prevent transcription-related instructions from being offered on that element page. There is, after all, an entire section on recording unstructured description, with transcription-related instructions already there on many of these elements, and so it does not seem inappropriate to include source of information instructions on these pages as well.

Recommendation 1

NARDAC recommends that the basic option to *Use any source of information* be added to all of the Manifestation transcription elements. It is already a boilerplate phrase and can easily be added.

Recording an unstructured description

OPTION

Use any source of information.

Record the form found in the *source of information*.

Elements¹:

- title proper
 - [21.93.72.57 Prerecording](#) describes solely that this does not include Manifestation: [other title information](#) or Manifestation: [parallel other title information](#)
 - [06.38.44.25 Recording an unstructured description](#) currently begins with the option to “Record a value of Manifestation: [title of manifestation](#)”.
- parallel title proper
 - [25.34.40.15 Prerecording](#) has the recommended option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [title proper](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [83.43.13.23 Recording an unstructured description](#) currently begins with the option to “Apply the instructions at Manifestation: [title of manifestation. Recording an unstructured description](#)”.
- variant title of manifestation
 - [26.09.89.56 Prerecording](#) describes what a variant title of manifestation may be.
 - [11.98.23.69 Recording an unstructured description](#) currently begins with the option to “Record a value of Manifestation: [title of manifestation](#)”.
- title of series
 - [22.16.56.11 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [series statement](#). It includes the option to

¹ Note from RSC Secretary: for the convenience of RSC members, I have added links and the current text from the Prerecording section of each element and the opening text of the section on Recording an unstructured description where appropriate. Please note that many of these elements have been soft-deprecated, as indicated by the recommendation in the Prerecording section not to use them. As part of the soft-deprecation process, the RSC decided not to develop these elements further. However, the Technical Team Liaison Officer’s plans for currently soft-deprecated elements may come into play here.

- “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation series statement](#).”
- [76.31.51.81 Recording an unstructured description](#) currently begins with the option to “Apply the basic instructions on recording titles at Manifestation: [title of manifestation](#)”.
 - parallel title of series
 - [39.81.84.47 Prerecording](#) has the recommended option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [title of series](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [96.54.06.06 Recording an unstructured description](#) currently begins with the option to “Apply the instructions at Manifestation: [parallel title proper](#)”.
 - other title information
 - [26.21.45.47 Recording an unstructured description](#) currently begins with the option to “Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#)”.
 - parallel other title information
 - [65.69.55.53 Prerecording](#) has the recommended option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [other title information](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [88.55.53.99 Recoding an unstructured description](#) currently begins with the option to “Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).”
 - statement of responsibility
 - [84.63.74.70 Prerecording](#) lists the categories of statements of responsibilities and their agents as well as linking to guidance.
 - [05.60.15.87 Recording an unstructured description](#) currently begins with the option “Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).”
 - statement of responsibility relating to title proper
 - [93.21.10.24 Prerecording](#) has the option “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation title and responsibility statement](#).”
 - [40.99.96.43 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Record one of more statements that identify the creators of expressions or works embodied by a manifestation.”
 - parallel statement of responsibility relating to title proper
 - [53.36.38.96 Prerecording](#) has the recommended option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [statement relating to title proper](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [29.86.32.91 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).”
 - statement of responsibility relating to edition
 - [93.40.68.17 Prerecording](#) has the option “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation edition statement](#).”

- [02.71.53.38 Recording an unstructured description](#) includes the instruction “For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).”²
- parallel statement of responsibility relating to edition
 - [39.32.77.60 Prerecording](#) has the recommended option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [statement of responsibility relating to edition](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [70.72.90.75 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).”
- statement of responsibility relating to named revision of edition
 - [02.20.85.25 Prerecording](#) has the recommended option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [statement of responsibility relating to named revision of edition](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [69.66.53.05 Recording an unstructured description](#) currently begins with the option “Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).”
- parallel statement of responsibility relating to named revision of edition
 - [02.20.85.25 Prerecording](#) has the recommended option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [statement of responsibility relating to named revision of edition](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [69.66.53.05 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).”
- statement of responsibility relating to series
 - [96.08.00.85 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [series statement](#). It includes the instruction to “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation series statement](#).”
 - [57.80.61.06 Recording an unstructured description](#) instructs “For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).”³
- parallel statement of responsibility relating to series
 - [78.63.10.25 Prerecording](#) recommends the option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [statement of responsibility relating to series](#) instead to record a value.”

² Note from RSC Secretary: I noted when checking this element that there are three condition options followed by [78.98.77.00 Data provenance](#) and then the generalised instruction. I believe that [78.98.77.00 Data provenance](#) should follow the generalised instruction and will correct this when editing reopens.

³ Note from RSC Secretary: I noted when checking this element that [70.00.82.35 Data provenance](#) is appearing at the top of [57.80.61.06 Recording an unstructured description](#) and will correct this as soon as editing reopens.

- [48.28.64.89 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription.](#)”
- designation of edition
 - [69.37.86.15 Prerecording](#) states “This element is a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [edition statement](#).”
 - [75.71.17.85 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Use any *source of information*. Record the form found in the *source of information*.”
- parallel designation of edition
 - [10.91.11.45 Prerecording](#) recommends the option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [designation of edition](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [88.09.93.05 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Apply the instructions at Manifestation: [edition statement](#).”
- parallel designation of named revision of edition
 - [68.30.53.77 Prerecording](#) recommends the option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [designation of named revision of edition](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [85.45.64.31 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Apply the instructions at Manifestation: [edition statement](#).”
- production statement
 - [03.01.85.19 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *superelement* and references Manifestation: [date of production](#), Manifestation: [name of producer](#) and Manifestation: [place of production](#), from which its values are composed and gives the option to “Record an unstructured description using basic, normalized, or other transcription guidelines as a Manifestation: [manifestation production statement](#).”
 - [78.61.62.09 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription.](#)”
- place of production
 - [51.22.90.99 Prerecording](#) described this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [production statement](#) and gives the option to “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation production statement](#).”
 - [57.11.46.35 Recording an unstructured description](#) instructs “Record an unstructured description for a related place as a value of Place: [name of place](#).”
- parallel place of production
 - [97.27.67.74 Prerecording](#) recommends the option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [place of production](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [18.90.09.08 Recording an unstructured description](#) instructs “Record an unstructured description for a related place as a value of Place: [name of place](#).”
- name of producer

- [03.78.95.24 Prerecording](#) describes this as a shortcut and includes the option to “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation production statement](#).”
- [72.80.51.43 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option to “Record a name by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).”
- parallel name of producer
 - [64.77.28.43 Prerecording](#) recommends the option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [name of producer](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [69.64.23.29 Recording an unstructured description](#) consists of the instruction “For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).”
- date of production
 - [66.15.15.99 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [production statement](#) and includes the option to “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation production statement](#).”
 - [79.57.99.20 Recording an unstructured description](#) instructs “Record an unstructured description for a related timespan as a value of Timespan: [name of timespan](#).”
- publication statement
 - [36.03.73.72 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *superelement* and lists Manifestation: [date of publication](#), Manifestation: [name of publisher](#) and Manifestation: [place of publication](#) as the *subelements* from which its values are composed. It includes the option to “Record an unstructured description using basic, normalized, or other transcription guidelines as a Manifestation: [manifestation publication statement](#).”
 - [84.34.54.74 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).”
- place of publication
 - [34.84.04.04 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [publication statement](#) and includes the option to “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation publication statement](#).”
 - [66.61.78.52 Recording an unstructured description](#) instructs “Record an unstructured description for a related place as a value of Place: [name of place](#).”
- parallel place of publication
 - [73.78.16.18 Prerecording](#) recommends the option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [place of publication](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [52.56.24.96 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the instruction “Record an unstructured description for a related place as a value of Place: [name of place](#).”

- name of publisher
 - [22.34.83.93 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *shortcut* for a chain of Manifestation: [publisher agent](#) and Agent: [name of agent](#). It includes the option “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation publication statement](#).”
 - [01.25.32.40 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Record a name by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).”
- parallel name of publisher
 - [81.40.33.77 Prerecording](#) recommends the option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [name of publisher](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [37.53.09.09 Recording an unstructured description](#) consists of the instruction “For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).”
- date of publication
 - [82.98.60.69 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [publication statement](#). It includes the option to “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation publication statement](#).”
 - [72.30.28.23 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the instruction “Record an unstructured description for a related timespan as a value of Timespan: [name of timespan](#).”
- distribution statement
 - [48.17.57.66 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *superelement* and lists Manifestation: [date of distribution](#), Manifestation: [name of distributor](#) and Manifestation: [place of distribution](#) as the *subelements* from which its values are composed. It includes the option to “Record an unstructured description using basic, normalized, or other transcription guidelines as a Manifestation: [manifestation distribution statement](#).”⁴
 - [93.35.48.56 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).”
- place of distribution
 - [83.51.20.37 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [distribution statement](#) and includes the option to “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation distribution statement](#).”
 - [33.39.86.39 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the instruction to “Record an unstructured description for a related place as a value of Place: [name of place](#).”

⁴ Note from RSC Secretary: I noticed that this general option is appearing *after* condition options for early printed resources and facsimiles and will correct this as soon as editing reopens.

- parallel place of distribution
 - [71.68.81.98 Prerecording](#) recommends the option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [place of distribution](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [39.78.65.78 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the instruction “Record an unstructured description for a related place as a value of Place: [name of place](#).”
- name of distributor
 - [55.36.23.10 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *shortcut* for the chain Manifestation: [distributor agent](#) and Agent: [name of agent](#). It includes the option to “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation distribution statement](#).”
 - [18.56.66.45 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Record a name by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).”
- parallel name of distributor
 - [97.33.91.10 Prerecording](#) recommends the option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [name of distributor](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [95.28.69.83 Recording an unstructured description](#) consists of the instruction “For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).”
- date of distribution
 - [48.42.24.03 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [distribution statement](#). It includes the option to “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation distribution statement](#).”
 - [78.99.89.14 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the instruction “Record an unstructured description for a related timespan as a value of Timespan: [name of timespan](#).”
- manufacture statement
 - [22.46.28.63 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *superelement* and lists Manifestation: [date of manufacture](#), Manifestation: [name of manufacturer](#) and Manifestation: [place of manufacture](#) as the *subelements* from which its values are composed. It includes the option to “Record an unstructured description using basic, normalized, or other transcription guidelines as a Manifestation: [manifestation manufacture statement](#).”⁵
 - [33.41.36.26 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).”
- place of manufacture

⁵ Note from RSC Secretary: I noticed that this general option is appearing *after* condition options for early printed resources and facsimiles and will correct this as soon as editing reopens.

- [94.87.20.13 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [manufacture statement](#). It includes the option to “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation manufacture statement](#).”
- [57.16.39.78 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the instruction to “Record an unstructured description for a related place as a value of Place: [name of place](#).”
- parallel place of manufacture
 - [01.00.09.83 Prerecording](#) has the recommended option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [place of manufacture](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [75.41.95.79 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the instruction “Record an unstructured description for a related place as a value of Place: [name of place](#).”
- name of manufacturer
 - [29.21.63.49 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *shortcut* for the chain consisting of Manifestation: [manufacturer agent](#) and Agent: [name of agent](#) and as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [manufacture statement](#). It has an option to “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation manufacture statement](#).”
 - [05.85.52.61 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Record a name by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).”
- parallel name of manufacturer
 - [92.70.08.10 Prerecording](#) has the recommended option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [name of manufacturer](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [80.81.65.37 Recording an unstructured description](#) consists of the instruction “For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).”
- date of manufacture
 - [30.52.30.77 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [manufacture statement](#) and includes the option to “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation manufacture statement](#).”
 - [41.64.13.41 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the instruction “Record an unstructured description for a related timespan as a value of Timespan: [name of timespan](#).”
- numbering within sequence
 - [48.52.70.55 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [series statement](#) and includes the option to “Record an unstructured description within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation series statement](#).”
 - [31.41.30.52 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word content

from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).”

- parallel other title information of series
 - [53.84.63.75 Prerecording](#) recommends the option “Do not use this element; use Manifestation: [other title information of series](#) instead to record a value.”
 - [35.56.40.51 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).”
- numbering of sequence
 - [98.04.24.32 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *superelement* of multiple subelements.
 - [12.79.20.78 Recording an unstructured description](#) begins with the option “Record numbers by applying the guidance at [Guidelines on normalized transcription. Numbers](#).”
- first alphanumeric designation of sequence
 - [22.62.38.42 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [numbering of sequence](#).
 - [38.02.42.28 Recording an unstructured description](#) has the instruction “For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).”⁶
- first chronological designation of sequence
 - [73.82.49.20 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [numbering of sequence](#).
 - [46.25.83.57 Recording an unstructured description](#) includes the instruction “For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).”⁷
- last alphanumeric designation of sequence
 - [28.47.69.00 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [numbering of sequence](#).
 - [41.19.15.49 Recording an unstructured description](#) includes the instruction “For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).”⁸
- last chronological designation of sequence
 - [78.79.21.90 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [numbering of sequence](#).

⁶ Note from RSC Secretary: I noticed that [28.96.67.51 Data provenance](#) is appearing before the generalised instruction and will correct this as soon as editing reopens.

⁷ Note from RSC Secretary: I noticed that [20.34.69.54 Data provenance](#) is appearing before the generalised instruction and will correct this as soon as editing reopens.

⁸ Note from RSC Secretary: I noticed that [92.63.82.76 Data provenance](#) is appearing before the generalised instruction and will correct this as soon as editing reopens.

- [51.94.01.08 Recording an unstructured description](#) includes the instruction “For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).”⁹
- first alphanumeric designation of alternative sequence
 - [81.77.69.75 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [numbering of sequence](#).
 - [77.50.40.79 Recording an unstructured description](#) includes the instruction “For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).”¹⁰
- first chronological designation of alternative sequence
 - [56.21.38.99 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [numbering of sequence](#).
 - [17.59.04.21 Recording an unstructured description](#) includes the instruction “For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).”
- last alphanumeric designation of alternative sequence
 - [11.06.39.76 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [numbering of sequence](#).
 - [47.97.54.85 Recording an unstructured description](#) includes the instruction “For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).”¹¹
- last chronological designation of alternative sequence
 - [18.32.92.80 Prerecording](#) describes this as a *subelement* of the *superelement* Manifestation: [numbering of sequence](#).
 - [51.98.91.62 Recording an unstructured description](#) includes the instruction “For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).”¹²

Recommendation 2

We also recommend adding a first option under unstructured description to *all* of the manifestation transcription elements that directs the cataloger to the guidance chapter section [Data provenance: Recording a source of metadata that is a manifestation that is being described](#), which contains guidance on choosing the source of information for unstructured descriptions. It seems odd that the Data provenance chapter contains this rather elaborate guidance but it is never referred to from the transcription elements where it would be applied.

⁹ Note from RSC Secretary: I noticed that [41.27.15.97 Data provenance](#) is appearing before the generalised instruction and will correct this as soon as editing reopens.

¹⁰ Note from RSC Secretary: I noticed that [84.98.76.01 Data provenance](#) is appearing before the generalised instruction and will correct this as soon as editing reopens.

¹¹ Note from RSC Secretary: I noticed that [98.35.75.82 Data provenance](#) is appearing before the generalised instruction and will correct this as soon as editing reopens.

¹² Note from RSC Secretary: I noticed that [32.10.71.84 Data provenance](#) is appearing before the generalised instruction and will correct this as soon as editing reopens.

We suggest this text: “OPTION: Select a source of information based on the options found in [Data provenance: Recording a source of metadata that is a manifestation that is being described](#). Record the form found in the source of information.”¹³

Impact statements

Impact of proposed changes on users

None for most users. Policy makers will need to consider policies in relation to the new options. This should not impact translators significantly, since these will be boilerplate elements. Only one new phrase will need translation, and it is similar to many existing options.

Impact of proposed changes on policy statement writers

Although this does mean that several policy statements will need to be added on quite a few elements, ultimately this should simplify the work of policy statement writers, as it will give an appropriate location for information about the source of information for all the needed elements.

Impact of proposed changes on catalogers

Imposing consistency regarding the option to use any source of information between the manifestation transcription elements will reduce confusion to catalogers who have observed the inconsistency and who might waste time trying to understand why the option is available for some elements and not for others. Recommendation 2 (including an option about using the data provenance guidance) will greatly improve catalogers’ ability to *find* that guidance, which most catalogers report having difficulty finding now.

Impact of proposed changes on legacy data

None.

Impact of proposed changes on RDA

Consistency between elements will be improved. A perceived gap (no reference to the Data provenance guidance from the elements where it would be applied) will be closed.

Proposal

Recommendation 1. Add the option “Use any source of information” following Recording an unstructured description to all manifestation transcription element that lack the option

¹³ Note from RSC Secretary: The following text has been used in many elements, but does not appear to have been applied to *all* elements:

OPTION

Record a *source of information*. For general guidance, see Guidance: Data provenance. [Recording a source of metadata](#).

I would suggest using this established phrase for consistency.

Example element: [date of publication](#)
[date of publication](#)

Marked-up copy

Recording an unstructured description

OPTION

Use any *source of information*.

Record the form found in the *source of information*.

Clean copy

Recording an unstructured description

OPTION

Use any *source of information*.

Record the form found in the *source of information*.

This recommendation would apply to all of these elements:

- title proper
- parallel title proper
- variant title of manifestation
- title of series
- parallel title of series
- other title information
- parallel other title information
- statement of responsibility
- statement of responsibility relating to title proper
- parallel statement of responsibility relating to title proper
- statement of responsibility relating to edition
- parallel statement of responsibility relating to edition
- statement of responsibility relating to named revision of edition
- parallel statement of responsibility relating to named revision of edition
- statement of responsibility relating to series
- parallel statement of responsibility relating to series
- designation of edition
- parallel designation of edition
- parallel designation of named revision of edition
- production statement
- place of production
- parallel place of production
- name of producer
- parallel name of producer
- date of production
- publication statement
- place of publication
- parallel place of publication
- name of publisher

- parallel name of publisher
- date of publication
- distribution statement
- place of distribution
- parallel place of distribution
- name of distributor
- parallel name of distributor
- date of distribution
- manufacture statement
- place of manufacture
- parallel place of manufacture
- name of manufacturer
- parallel name of manufacturer
- date of manufacture
- numbering within sequence
- parallel other title information of series
- numbering of sequence
- first alphanumeric designation of sequence
- first chronological designation of sequence
- last alphanumeric designation of sequence
- last chronological designation of sequence
- first alphanumeric designation of alternative sequence
- first chronological designation of alternative sequence
- last alphanumeric designation of alternative sequence
- last chronological designation of alternative sequence

Recommendation 2. Add as the first option to choose a source of information following the guidelines under Data provenance following Recording an unstructured description in all manifestation transcription elements¹⁴

Example elements: [abbreviated title](#), [date of publication](#)

[abbreviated title](#) [Only the data provenance option needed; existing option given to show recommended placement of the data provenance option]

Marked-up copy (Marking also showing Recommendation 1 if applicable).

Recording an unstructured description

OPTION

Select a source of information based on the options found in [Data provenance: Recording a source of metadata that is a manifestation that is being described](#).

Record the form found in the *source of information*.

OPTION

Use any *source of information*.

¹⁴ Note from RSC Secretary: Please see footnote 13 about existing wording in many (but not all) elements.

Record the form found in the *source of information*.

Clean copy

Recording an unstructured description

OPTION

Select a source of information based on the options found in [Data provenance: Recording a source of metadata that is a manifestation that is being described](#).

Record the form found in the *source of information*.

OPTION

Use any *source of information*.

Record the form found in the *source of information*.

[date of publication](#) [addition of both options needed]

Marked-up copy

Recording an unstructured description

OPTION

Select a source of information based on the options found in [Data provenance: Recording a source of metadata that is a manifestation that is being described](#).

Record the form found in the *source of information*.

OPTION

Use any *source of information*.

Record the form found in the *source of information*.

Clean copy

Recording an unstructured description

OPTION

Select a source of information based on the options found in [Data provenance: Recording a source of metadata that is a manifestation that is being described](#).

Record the form found in the *source of information*.

OPTION

Use any *source of information*.

Record the form found in the *source of information*.

This recommendation would apply to all of these elements:

- title proper
- parallel title proper
- variant title of manifestation
- title of series
- parallel title of series
- other title information
- parallel other title information

- statement of responsibility
- statement of responsibility relating to title proper
- parallel statement of responsibility relating to title proper
- statement of responsibility relating to edition
- parallel statement of responsibility relating to edition
- statement of responsibility relating to named revision of edition
- parallel statement of responsibility relating to named revision of edition
- statement of responsibility relating to series
- parallel statement of responsibility relating to series
- designation of edition
- parallel designation of edition
- parallel designation of named revision of edition
- production statement
- place of production
- parallel place of production
- name of producer
- parallel name of producer
- date of production
- publication statement
- place of publication
- parallel place of publication
- name of publisher
- parallel name of publisher
- date of publication
- distribution statement
- place of distribution
- parallel place of distribution
- name of distributor
- parallel name of distributor
- date of distribution
- manufacture statement
- place of manufacture
- parallel place of manufacture
- name of manufacturer
- parallel name of manufacturer
- date of manufacture
- numbering within sequence
- parallel other title information of series
- numbering of sequence
- first alphanumeric designation of sequence
- first chronological designation of sequence
- last alphanumeric designation of sequence
- last chronological designation of sequence
- first alphanumeric designation of alternative sequence
- first chronological designation of alternative sequence

- last alphanumeric designation of alternative sequence
- last chronological designation of alternative sequence

This recommendation would also impact these elements by the addition of the first option:

- abbreviated title
- contact information
- designation of edition
- designation of named revision of edition
- edition statement
- other title information of series
- series statement