

To: Renate Behrens, Chair, RDA Steering Committee
CC: Anne Welsh, RSC Secretary
From: Trina Soderquist, NARDAC representative to the RSC
Subject: Formal response to RSC/TechnicalWG/2026/5 - Soft-deprecated “Note on” elements

The North American RDA Committee (NARDAC) appreciates the Technical Working Group’s continuing efforts to discuss, manage, and resolve issues surrounding soft-deprecated elements in the RDA Toolkit. NARDAC generally supports the recommendations outlined in the proposal to introduce new “note” elements, update guidance and existing elements, and fully deprecate older “note on” elements.

General Comments

We note the same issues with phrasing identified by the Examples Editor in her response to this proposal. Specifically, “type” should be used instead of “specific categories,” “provides information...on” is preferred over “provides information...about,” and indefinite articles used instead of definite articles. In our comments on individual recommendations, we will not repeat the Examples Editor’s work done to update the definitions for elements in recommendations 1.1-1.4 and 1.6-1.13.

We received one suggestion to include the names of deprecated elements as alternate labels for the new elements. This would help users of the Toolkit find and acclimate to the new elements. Additional alternate labels are listed in the recommendations below.

We have one editorial comment about the *Issue* section, in the final sentence of the final paragraph on page 4.

Marked-up copy:

...“For a *metadata work* describing an *online resource*, this element can also include the ~~data~~ date on which the manifestation was viewed for description”).

Clean copy:

...“For a *metadata work* describing an *online resource*, this element can also include the date on which the manifestation was viewed for description”).

Finally, several of our constituents felt that the *Impact* section did not adequately address the effect that proceeding with these proposals at the current time will have on implementation and training activities. Many institutions are actively developing training and preparing for implementation ahead of the retirement of the original RDA Toolkit on May 11, 2027. Changes to these “note on” elements may require revisions to training materials, policy statements, and

other documentation. This may be particularly significant for multilingual institutions that maintain these resources in more than one language.

Recommendation 1.1. Introduce the element Expression: **note on category of expression**

NARDAC approves the recommendation, with amendments as made by the Examples Editor.

Recommendation 1.2. Introduce the element Expression: **note on content characteristic of expression**, which will include the conditions and options formerly present on Expression: **details of cartographic content**

NARDAC approves the recommendation, with amendments as made by the Examples Editor.

We also suggest adding the alternate labels to the element Expression: **note on content characteristic of expression**:

- details of cartographic content
- note on changes in content characteristics

Additionally, we suggest adding the instructions under *Recording* ([26.31.53.19](#)) on the element page for Expression: **details of cartographic content** under the section *Cartographic content* on the element page for Expression: **note on content characteristic of expression**.

Clean copy only (since this adds instructions):

Cartographic content

For instructions on recording technical details of the representation of cartographic content in digital form, see Manifestation: **digital representation of cartographic content**.

This reference connecting the two elements will continue to be helpful to users of the Toolkit.

Recommendation 1.3. Introduce the element Expression: **note on entity associated with expression**

NARDAC approves the recommendation, with amendments as made by the Examples Editor.

Recommendation 1.4. Introduce the element Item: **note on category of item**

NARDAC approves the recommendation, with amendments as made by the Examples Editor.

Recommendation 1.5. Change the element label for Item: **modification of item** to Item: **note on modification of item**

NARDAC approves the recommendation, with the recommendation to add the following alternate labels to the element Item: **note on modification of item**:

- modification of item
- note on dimensions of item
- note on extent of item

Recommendation 1.6. Introduce the element Item: **note on entity associated with item**

NARDAC approves the recommendation, with amendments as made by the Examples Editor.

Recommendation 1.7. Introduce the element Manifestation: **note on category of manifestation**

NARDAC approves the recommendation, with amendments as made by the Examples Editor.

Recommendation 1.8. Introduce the element Manifestation: **note on statement associated with manifestation**

NARDAC approves the recommendation, with the following amendments.

We suggest adding the following alternate labels to the element Manifestation: **note on statement associated with manifestation**:

- note on copyright date
- note on distribution statement
- note on edition statement
- note on identifier for manifestation
- note on manufacture statement
- note on numbering of sequence
- note on production statement
- note on publication statement
- note on series statement
- note on statement of responsibility
- note on title

We think it would be helpful for users to add some clarity around *statement elements*, perhaps with a separate definition in the glossary.

Under *Recording an unstructured description*, there are two options to “Record details or other unstructured information.” Delete the second option. For consistency with other elements (for example, Manifestation: **title proper**), the general guidance instruction should appear after all the general options and before the *Manifestation statements* section.

Marked-up copy:

OPTION

Record details or other unstructured information.

~~For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods.~~

~~**Recording an unstructured description.**~~

~~OPTION~~

~~Record details or other unstructured information~~

~~[...]~~

For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods.

Recording an unstructured description.

Manifestation statements

Clean copy:

OPTION

Record details or other unstructured information.

[...]

For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods.

Recording an unstructured description.

Manifestation statements

We also suggest adding the instructions from the first option ([31.03.54.75](#)) under *Recording an unstructured description* on the element page for Manifestation: **note on series statement** to the *Series statement* section on the element page for Manifestation: **note on statement associated with manifestation**.

Clean copy only (since this adds instructions):

Series statement

OPTION

Record a note on information relating to series that is too complex to be recorded in
Manifestation: **series statement**.

Under the section *Manifestations embodying integrating works*, delete the option to “Record details or other unstructured information.” This option already appears under *Recording an unstructured description*.

Marked-up copy:

CONDITION

Changes have been numerous.

CONDITION OPTION

Record a general note.

~~OPTION~~

~~Record details or other unstructured information.~~

Clean copy:

CONDITION

Changes have been numerous.

CONDITION OPTION

Record a general note.

Recommendation 1.9. Introduce the element Manifestation: **note on physical characteristic of manifestation**

NARDAC approves the recommendation, with amendments as made by the Examples Editor.

We also suggest adding the following alternate labels to the element Manifestation: **note on physical characteristic of manifestation**:

- note on carrier
- note on changes in carrier characteristics
- note on dimensions of manifestation
- note on extent of manifestation

Recommendation 1.10. Introduce the element Manifestation: **note on entity associated with manifestation**

NARDAC approves the recommendation, with amendments as made by the Examples Editor.

Recommendation 1.11. Introduce the element Work: **note on category of work**

NARDAC approves the recommendation, with amendments as made by the Examples Editor.

Recommendation 1.12. Introduce the element Work: **note on content characteristic of work**

NARDAC approves the recommendation, with amendments as made by the Examples Editor.

Recommendation 1.13. Introduce the element Work: **note on entity associated with work**

NARDAC approves the recommendation, with amendments as made by the Examples Editor.

Recommendation 2.1. Change the following Condition Option under Guidance->Resource description->Describing an expression (32.12.85.69)

NARDAC approves the recommendation, but notes an apparent typo:

Marked-up copy:

CONDITION OPTION

Consider the variation in value to indicate a new work. Record information about the change in value as a Work: **note on ~~change in~~ content characteristic of work**.

Clean copy:

CONDITION OPTION

Consider the variation in value to indicate a new work. Record information about the change in value as a Work: **note on content characteristic of work**.

Recommendation 2.2. Change the following condition options under Guidance->Resource description->Describing a manifestation (06.26.53.93)

NARDAC approves the recommendation.

Recommendation 2.3. Under Work: **note on metadata work**, add the following text

NARDAC approves the recommendation, and we suggest removing the instructions under *Prerecording*:

When a metadata work describes an *online resource*, this element can also include the date on which the manifestation was viewed to record the metadata work.

This guidance is repeated in the section *Date of viewing an online resource*:

OPTION

For an *online resource*, record a note identifying the date on which the manifestation was viewed for a description in a metadata work.

Additionally, we recommend adding the following alternate label to the element Work: **note on metadata work**:

- note on issue or part of iteration used as basis for identification of manifestation

Recommendation 3: Fully deprecate older “note” elements and remove references to them in the Toolkit

NARDAC approves.