

To: Renate Behrens, Chair, RDA Steering Committee
CC: Anne Welsh, RSC Secretary
From: Trina Soderquist, NARDAC representative
Subject: NARDAC response to RSC/TechnicalWG/2026/4 - Soft-deprecated elements specific to content and carrier types

NARDAC supports these recommendations to fully deprecate soft-deprecated elements specific to content and carrier types.

In the introduction to the Technical Working Group's proposal, it is pointed out that the elements Item: filmed with item, Item: on disc with item, Manifestation: filmed with manifestation, and Manifestation: on disc with manifestation are redundant because the same information can be ascertained from the elements Item: on manifestation with and Manifestation: on carrier unit with and the RDA Carrier Type.

When the elements identified in recommendations 1.1-1.4, below, are fully deprecated, it might be useful to evaluate their impact on the definitions for Item: on manifestation with and Manifestation: on carrier unit with. Looking at the definitions and scope of the elements, we noticed a shift in meaning that might need to be examined (emphasis ours):

- filmed with item: An item that is *contained* on the same microform as an item.
- on disc with item: An item that is *contained* on the same disc as an item.
- on manifestation with: An item that is *reproduced* on the same manifestation as an item.
- filmed with manifestation: A manifestation that is *issued* on the same microform with a manifestation being described.
- on disc with manifestation: A manifestation that is *issued* on the same disc with a manifestation being described.
- on carrier unit with: A manifestation that is *a part of* the same carrier unit as another part manifestation.

The first two Item elements, which are fully deprecated in recommendations 1.1-1.2, below, reference items that are *contained* on the same carrier as another item. However, Item: on manifestation with is used for items that are *reproduced* on the same manifestation as another item. The term “reproduced” suggests that the publisher is engaging in post-publication activity with respect to the original content, while the term “contained” does not seem to be as restrictive. Is it preferable to adjust the definition and scope of Item: on manifestation with to mirror the language using “contained” in the deprecated elements?

Similarly, the first two Manifestation elements listed above, which are fully deprecated in recommendations 1.3-1.4, below, are used for manifestations *issued* on the same carrier unit. The element Manifestation: on carrier unit with refers to manifestations that are *part of* the same

carrier unit as another part manifestation. Is meaning lost when the language shifts from “issued” to “part of” and from “a manifestation being described” to “another part manifestation”?

Recommendation 1. Fully deprecate the following elements in the RDA Registry and remove them from the Toolkit. Remove these elements from the alignment of soft-deprecated elements in the RDA Registry, and add them to a new alignment of fully-deprecated elements to RDA elements, to be included in the Registry.

Recommendation 1.1. Item: filmed with item

NARDAC approves of the recommendation.

Recommendation 1.2. Item: on disc with item

NARDAC approves of the recommendation.

Recommendation 1.3. Manifestation: filmed with manifestation

NARDAC approves of the recommendation.

Recommendation 1.4. Manifestation: on disc with manifestation

NARDAC approves of the recommendation.

Recommendation 1.5. Expression: scale of still image or three-dimensional form

NARDAC approves of the recommendation.