

To: Renate Behrens, Chair, RDA Steering Committee

CC: Anne Welsh, Secretary, RDA Steering Committee

From: Jessica Grzegorski, RDA Examples Editor

Subject: Proposal to revise the preferred order of recording sources for early printed resources in Data provenance: Recording a source of metadata that is a manifestation that is being described

Abstract

This proposal recommends a minor revision to the preferred order of recording sources for early printed resources in a [condition option](#) (80.40.48.28) in the guidance chapter section [Data provenance: Recording a source of metadata that is a manifestation that is being described](#).

Background

Over the last several decades, both international (e.g. ISBD(A)) and Anglo-American (e.g. AACR2) cataloging standards have carved out provisions for early printed resources. In some cases, separate manuals for the description of rare and early printed resources, which are based on these generalist standards, have been published to meet the needs of the rare materials cataloging community. A recent example of such a standard is [Descriptive Cataloging of Rare Materials \(RDA Edition\) \(DCRMR\)](#), which is aligned with Official RDA and was first published in 2022.

Data provenance, including sources of information within or external to a manifestation that form the basis of a description, is particularly important to the description of early printed resources. Instructions for early printed books, for example, privilege the title page (or equivalent) as the source of information and provide a preferred order of sources for resources without a title page. This order of preference has changed over time in different metadata standards, as noted in the table below:

AACR2 ¹ (section 2.13)	DCRM(B) ² (section 0C)	Official RDA (citation: 80.40.48.28)	DCRMR ³ (section 0.1.3)
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. title page 2. caption 3. colophon 4. cover 5. running title 6. incipit <i>or</i> explicit 7. privilege <i>or</i> imprimatur 8. other sources 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. title page 2. source within the preliminaries or colophon 3. source elsewhere within the publication 4. reference source 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. <i>title page, title sheet, or title card</i> 2. colophon 3. <i>cover or jacket</i> issued with the manifestation 4. <i>caption</i> 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. title page, title sheet, or title card 2. colophon 3. source within the preliminaries 4. caption title 5. cover integral to the resource 6. source elsewhere within the resource

Justification

Because catalogers who use DCRMR do so in tandem with Official RDA, it would be beneficial for the order of preference of recording sources for early printed resources to align in both standards. Members of the RSC Rare Materials Working Group (2016-2019) also served on the editorial group that drafted rare materials policy statements for Original RDA, which laid part of the foundation for DCRMR. The first completed draft of those policy statements ordered the sources as they now appear in DCRMR.

It is not the aim of this proposal to copy the order of preference verbatim from DCRMR. Rather, it is to mitigate confusion by reordering the existing text of the condition option in RDA to align with the order of preference in DCRMR (i.e., moving “caption” after “colophon” but not adding “source within the preliminaries” or “source elsewhere within the resource”).

¹ *Anglo-American Cataloguing Rules*, 2nd ed., ed. Joint Steering Committee for Revision of AACR (Chicago: American Library Association, 2005), <https://original.rdatoolkit.org/aacr2/>

² *Descriptive Cataloging of Rare Materials (Books)*, ed. Bibliographic Standards Committee, Rare Books and Manuscripts Section, Association of College and Research Libraries (Washington, DC: Cataloging Distribution Service, Library of Congress, 2011), <https://rbms.info/files/dcrmb/dcrmb/DCRMB3.pdf>

³ *Descriptive Cataloging of Rare Materials (RDA Edition)*, ed. RBMS RDA Editorial Group, Bibliographic Standards Committee, Rare Books and Manuscripts Section, Association of College and Research Libraries, <https://bsc.rbms.info/DCRMR>

Impact

Because neither the current condition option nor the proposed revision is explicitly prescriptive, the proposed revision should not affect legacy data. RDA users will benefit from the clarity and increased level of interoperability that the revision brings between RDA and DCRM. Policy statement writers will need to evaluate their current statements for the affected condition option to determine whether they would like to revise them. However, since the proposed revision is minor, does not largely change the substance of the instruction, and covers only one condition option, policy statement writers should be minimally affected.

Recommendations

Recommendation 1: Revise the preferred order of recording sources for early printed resources in condition option [80.40.48.28](#) of the [Data provenance: Recording a source of metadata that is a manifestation that is being described](#) section.

Marked-up copy:

CONDITION

The source of a *metadata work* is a manifestation that is being described.

A manifestation consists of one or more pages, leaves, sheets, or cards.

A manifestation is an *early printed resource*.

CONDITION OPTION

Prefer the following recording sources, in this order:

1. A *title page, title sheet, or title card*
2. A colophon
3. A ~~cover or jacket issued with the manifestation~~ caption
4. A ~~caption~~ cover or jacket issued with the manifestation

Clean copy:

CONDITION

The source of a *metadata work* is a manifestation that is being described.

A manifestation consists of one or more pages, leaves, sheets, or cards.

A manifestation is an *early printed resource*.

CONDITION OPTION

Prefer the following recording sources, in this order:

1. A *title page, title sheet, or title card*
2. A colophon
3. A *caption*
4. A *cover or jacket* issued with the manifestation

Summary of recommendations

Recommendation 1: Revise the preferred order of recording sources for early printed resources in condition option [80.40.48.28](#) of the [Data provenance: Recording a source of metadata that is a manifestation that is being described](#) section.