

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA

From: Damian Iseminger, Chair, JSC Music Working Group

Subject: Revisions to 6JSC/MusicWG/12, Additions to Access Points Representing
Compilations of Musical Works (6.28.1.11)

Related documents:

6JSC/MusicWG/12
6JSC/MusicWG/12/ACOC response
6JSC/MusicWG/12/ALA response
6JSC/MusicWG/12/CCC response
6JSC/MusicWG/12/DNB response
6JSC/MusicWG/12/EURIG response
6JSC/MusicWG/12/LC response
6JSC/MusicWG/12/UK response

Abstract

This revised proposal suggests changes to instructions in *RDA* that are used when making additions to authorized access points for musical works when the preferred title is a conventional collective naming a type of composition. Two options are presented: one based on comments received in 6JSC/MusicWG/12/LC Response and the other based on comments received in 6JSC/MusicWG/12/DNB response.

Justification

The purpose of this revised proposal is to take into account comments from the JSC responses regarding 6JSC/MusicWG/12

Issues requiring resolution

The ACOC, ALA, CCC, EURIG, and UK responses were favorable to the revisions presented in 6JSC/MusicWG/12. The ALA response suggested a replacement text that preserved the intent of the proposed revisions. However LC was not in favor of the proposal, suggesting that smaller changes limited only to 6.28.1.11 should be considered while the DNB response did not want any special instructions in *RDA* for additions to music compilation access points.

The underlying issue that led to the formulation of 6JSC/MusicWG/12 in the first place was the implication present in the current 6.28.1.11 that only medium of performance could be used as an addition for compilation access points that included a conventional collective

title naming a type of composition. To answer the concerns of LC and DNB, the Working Group presents two options for allowing additions to access points for compilations naming a type of composition.

Option 1, based mostly on the comments in the LC response, preserves 6.28.1.11. The following changes have been made:

- The caption is modified so that it is clear that the instruction is only applicable to authorized access points for compilations using a conventional collective title naming a type of composition.
- The text of the instruction includes a reference to the medium of performance additions at 6.28.1.9.1.
- A final paragraph that sends users to 6.27.1.9 for further additions.

Option 1 also adds a paragraph to 6.28.1.9 that sends users to 6.28.1.11 for compilations and a paragraph at 6.28.1.10 that sends users to 6.27.1.9 for additions to compilation access points with distinctive titles. It is the opinion of some on the Working Group that the additions in the current 6.28.1.10 for distinguishing access points would be less useful for compilations than the additions listed at 6.27.1.9, especially for a compilation access point that is representing a series.¹

Option 2, based on the comments received in the DNB response, does away with 6.28.1.11 completely. However it should be noted that the Working Group disagrees with DNB that no special instructions are needed for additions to music compilation access points naming a single type of composition. This chiefly has to do with the situation regarding the placement of medium of performance in the access point when the preferred title for an incomplete compilation uses a conventional collective title naming a type of composition and the term *Selections*. In these cases, the medium of performance must come after the conventional collective title, but before *Selections*.

To address this problem, the Working Group proposes in option 2 that an additional paragraph be added to 6.28.1.9 that specifies that additions made there should be placed before *Selections* in an access point representing an incomplete compilation of works that uses a conventional collective title naming a type of composition. The group also suggests that an Examples box be added after this paragraph. The Working Group also proposes a paragraph for 6.28.1.9.4 that instructs one to make the additions listed following *Selections*. The Working Group has also standardized the listing of additional elements in 6.28.1.9.4 using the names of the elements as they appear in *RDA*.

An additional paragraph for current 6.28.1.10 that would send users to 6.27.1.9 for additions to compilation access points with distinctive titles has also been proposed for this

¹ This paragraph may not be needed in 6.28.1.10 if option 2 in 6JSC/MusicWG/11/rev is selected as a replacement text for 6.28.1.10.

option and uses the same text as proposed in Option #1, Change #2. The justification for including this is the same as detailed above in the discussion concerning Option 1.²

Impact of the revisions

The changes proposed in either option do not change the practice of adding medium of performance to access points with conventional collective titles naming a type of composition when *Selections* is part of the preferred title. The proposal simply allows for further additions to be made, if needed.

Changes

Option #1

Change #1

Marked-up version (no clean version provided)

6.28.1.9 Additions to Access Points Representing Musical Works with Titles That Are Not Distinctive

Make additions to access points if the preferred title for the work (see [6.14.2](#)) consists solely of the name of a type, or of two or more types, of composition. Add the following elements (in this order), as applicable:

- a) medium of performance (see [6.28.1.9.1](#))
- b) numeric designation (see [6.28.1.9.2](#))
- c) key (see [6.28.1.9.3](#)).

EXAMPLE

Enesco, Georges, 1881–1955. Sonatas, violin, piano, no. 2, op. 6, F minor

If medium of performance, numeric designation, and key are not sufficient or are not available to distinguish the access point from one that is the same or similar but represents a different work or represents a person, family, corporate body, or place, apply the instructions at [6.28.1.9.4](#).

² As with option 1 in this proposal, this paragraph may not be needed in 6.28.1.10 if option 2 in 6JSC/MusicWG/11/rev is selected as a replacement text for 6.28.1.10.

For a compilation of musical works, apply the instructions at [6.28.1.11](#).

[Remainder of 6.28.1.9.unchanged]

Change #2

Marked-up version (no clean version provided)

6.28.1.10 Additions to Access Points Representing Musical Works with Distinctive Titles

[Add the following to the end of the instruction. This paragraph would not be needed if option 2 in 6JSC/MusicWG/11/rev is accepted]:

For a compilation of musical works, apply the instructions at [6.27.1.9](#).

Change #3

Marked-up version (no clean version provided)

6.28.1.11 Additions to Access Points Representing Compilations of Musical Works of a Single Type of Composition

For a compilation containing works of a single type of composition, add the medium of performance to the access point, unless the medium is the same as the one implied by the title or unless the works are for various media (see [6.28.1.9.1](#)).

Record the conventional collective title *Selections* following the medium, as applicable.

EXAMPLE

Chopin, Frédéric, 1810–1849. Polonaises, piano

Haydn, Joseph, 1732–1809. Quartets, violins, viola, cello

Grieg, Edvard, 1843–1907. Sonatas, violin, piano

Scriabin, Aleksandr Nikolayevich, 1872–1915. Sonatas, piano. Selections

but

Beethoven, Ludwig van, 1770–1827. Symphonies. Selections
Implied medium: orchestra

Leclerc, Félix. Songs
Implied medium: solo voice or voices with instrumental and/or vocal accompaniment

Poulenc, Francis, 1899–1963. Concertos. Selections
For various media

If medium of performance is not sufficient to distinguish the access point from one that is the same or similar but represents a different work or represents a person, family, corporate body, or place, apply the instructions at [6.27.1.9](#).

Option #2

Change #1

Marked-up version (no clean version provided)

6.28.1.9 Additions to Access Points Representing Musical Works with Titles That Are Not Distinctive

Make additions to access points if the preferred title for the work (see [6.14.2](#)) consists solely of the name of a type, or of two or more types, of composition. Add the following elements (in this order), as applicable:

- a) medium of performance (see [6.28.1.9.1](#))
- b) numeric designation (see [6.28.1.9.2](#))
- c) key (see [6.28.1.9.3](#)).

EXAMPLE

Enesco, Georges, 1881–1955. Sonatas, violin, piano, no. 2, op. 6, F minor

For a compilation of musical works, record the conventional collective title *Selections* following the additions, as applicable.

EXAMPLE

[The following is a suggestion for the Examples Editor]

Scriabin, Aleksandr Nikolayevich, 1872–1915. Sonatas, piano. Selections

If medium of performance, numeric designation, and key are not sufficient or are not available to distinguish the access point from one that is the same or similar but represents a different work or represents a person, family, corporate body, or place, apply the instructions at [6.28.1.9.4](#).

Change #2

Marked-up version

6.28.1.9.4 Additions for Access Points When Medium of Performance, Etc. Insufficient, or Not Available

If:

the titles are not distinctive

and

the medium of performance, numeric designation, and key are not sufficient, or are not available, to distinguish between them

then:

add one of the following elements (in this order of preference):

- a) ~~the year of completion of composition~~ date of the work (see 6.4)
- b) ~~the year of original publication~~ place of origin of the work (see ~~6.4~~ 6.5)
- c) ~~any other identifying element, such as place of composition (see 6.5), or the name of the first publisher~~ another distinguishing characteristic of the work (see 6.6).

EXAMPLE

[remain the same]

For a compilation of musical works, record the additional elements following the conventional collective title *Selections*, as applicable.

EXAMPLE

[To be supplied by Examples Editor]

Clean version

6.28.1.9.4 Additions for Access Points When Medium of Performance, Etc. Insufficient, or Not Available

If:

the titles are not distinctive

and

the medium of performance, numeric designation, and key are not sufficient, or are not available, to distinguish between them

then:

add one of the following elements (in this order of preference):

- a) date of the work (see 6.4)
- b) place of origin of the work (see 6.5)
- c) another distinguishing characteristic of the work (see 6.6).

EXAMPLE

[remain the same]

For a compilation of musical works, record the additional elements following the conventional collective title *Selections*, as applicable.

EXAMPLE

[To be supplied by Examples Editor]

Change #3

Marked-up version (no clean version provided)

~~6.28.1.11 Additions to Access Points Representing Compilations of Musical Works~~

~~For a compilation containing works of a single type of composition, add the medium of performance to the access point, unless the medium is the same as the one implied by the title or unless the works are for various media. Record the conventional collective title *Selections* following the medium, as applicable.~~

EXAMPLE

~~Chopin, Frédéric, 1810–1849. Polonaises, piano~~

~~Haydn, Joseph, 1732–1809. Quartets, violins, viola, cello~~

~~Grieg, Edvard, 1843–1907. Sonatas, violin, piano~~

~~Scriabin, Aleksandr Nikolayevich, 1872–1915. Sonatas, piano. Selections~~

~~*but*~~

~~Beethoven, Ludwig van, 1770–1827. Symphonies. Selections~~

~~Implied medium: orchestra~~

~~Leclerc, Félix. Songs
Implied medium: solo voice or voices with instrumental and/or vocal accompaniment~~

~~Poulenc, Francis, 1899–1963. Concertos. Selections
For various media~~

Change #4

Please see option #1, change #2 above for the proposed text.

Other changes in RDA

If option 1 is adopted, the examples of compilation access points in 6.28.1.9.1 may have to be removed or replaced because compilations of a single type of composition are treated at 6.28.1.11.³ However, since the revisions proposed for 6.28.1.11 include a reference to 6.28.1.9.1 for adding medium, it may not be problematic to leave in these examples, since both kinds of access points have preferred titles that are not distinctive.

If option 2 is adopted, references in chapter 6 to 6.28.1.11 will need to be changed. This would include instructions 6.15.1.3, 6.27.1.9, 6.28.1.1, 6.28.2.4, 6.28.4.1, 6.28.4.3, 6.28.4.4, and 6.28.4.5. In all cases 6.28.1.11 is present as the end of a range of instructions. The end of the range would need to be changed to 6.28.1.10.

Changes to the RDA Element Set

There are no changes to the RDA Element Set.

³ The examples in question are Mitchell, Joni. Songs and Widor, Charles-Marie, 1844-1937. Symphonies, organ in Exception a) ii) and Sor, Fernando, 1778–1839. Songs, guitar accompaniment in Exception h).