

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Kathy Glennan, ALA Representative
Subject: Revisions to Additions to Access Points Representing Compilations to Musical Works (6.28.1.11)

ALA thanks the JSC Music Working Group for this proposal to clarify the instructions for creating authorized access points to represent compilations of musical works. While we agree to clarify this instruction to encompass all musical compilations, we recommend a different approach.

ALA does not believe that additional changes are needed to the general instructions in 6.27.1.9, a question raised by the Working Group; the existing references to 6.2.2 throughout the sub-instructions in 6.27 should already address this situation.

In terms of instructions for compilations with distinctive titles, ALA suggests changes to two instructions. Our proposed changes address all types of compilations and attempt to keep the instructions as simple as possible.

Change #1 – Revisions to 6.28.1.9

ALA recommends:

- Limiting the application of the instructions to individual musical works in the first paragraph, specifying 6.14.2.5, instead of the more general reference to 6.14.2.
- Adding a final paragraph referring to 6.28.1.11 for compilations.

Marked-up copy

6.28.1.9 Additions to Access Points Representing Musical Works with Titles That Are Not Distinctive

Make additions to access points if the preferred title for ~~the~~ an individual musical work (see [6.14.2.5](#)) consists solely of the name of a type, or of two or more types, of composition.

Add the following elements (in this order), as applicable:

- a) medium of performance (see [6.28.1.9.1](#))
- b) numeric designation (see [6.28.1.9.2](#))
- c) key (see [6.28.1.9.3](#)).

EXAMPLE

Enesco, Georges, 1881–1955. Sonatas, violin, piano, no. 2, op. 6, F minor

If medium of performance, numeric designation, and key are not sufficient or are not available to distinguish the access point from one that is the same or similar but represents a different work or represents a person, family, corporate body, or place, apply the instructions at [6.28.1.9.4](#).

For a compilation of musical works, apply the instructions at [6.28.1.11](#).

Clean copy

6.28.1.9 Additions to Access Points Representing Musical Works with Titles That Are Not Distinctive

Make additions to access points if the preferred title for an individual musical work (see [6.14.2.5](#)) consists solely of the name of a type, or of two or more types, of composition.

Add the following elements (in this order), as applicable:

- a) medium of performance (see [6.28.1.9.1](#))
- b) numeric designation (see [6.28.1.9.2](#))
- c) key (see [6.28.1.9.3](#)).

EXAMPLE

Enesco, Georges, 1881–1955. Sonatas, violin, piano, no. 2, op. 6, F minor

If medium of performance, numeric designation, and key are not sufficient or are not available to distinguish the access point from one that is the same or similar but represents a different work or represents a person, family, corporate body, or place, apply the instructions at [6.28.1.9.4](#).

For a compilation of musical works, apply the instructions at [6.28.1.11](#).

Change #2 – Replacement of [6.28.1.11](#)

In analyzing the existing and proposed instructions, ALA has observed several problems with attempting to provide explicit guidance about the placement of the term “Selections” in an authorized access point (proposed by the Working Group as [6.28.1.11.1](#)):

- The current and proposed instructions imply that the compilation is being named by a single title (rather than having separate AAPs for each work in the compilation).
- [6.28.1.11](#) should be able to be applied selectively within a single compilation. That is, ALA believes that it should be possible to create separate AAPs for some works in a compilation while identifying the remainder collectively.
- Per the alternative to [6.14.2.8.4](#), the term “Selections” is recorded as part of the preferred title.
- Both the current and proposed instructions in [6.28.1.11](#) support current practice: to intersperse the medium of performance (as applicable) between the conventional collective title and the term “Selections”; this is obviously an exceptional practice.

As a result of this analysis, our proposal below:

- Does not introduce a new sub-instruction.
- Adds an initial paragraph stating that this applies to compilations of musical works by one composer that are identified by a collective title.
- Refers to the instructions at [6.27.1.9](#) for compilations with a distinctive title (rather than replicating those instructions here). We see no need to be explicit about the

- ability to add medium of performance in this case, since 6.27.1.9 refers to 6.6 (*Other Distinguishing Characteristic of the Work*).
- Rephrases the instructions for additions when the compilation uses a conventional collective title. We recommend retaining some of the existing examples here, although it certainly would be possible to replace or add to them.
 - Creates an exception for the order of elements when “Selections” is included. We recognize that this may not offer the necessary flexibility to properly identify a (compiled) work before adding the term Selections, such as Homilius, Gottfried August, 1714-1785. Choralvorspiele (Poel. Mus. Ms. 364). Selections However, we believe this to be a rare situation that could be addressed in an application profile instead.
 - Adds a final paragraph referring to 6.27.1.4 for compilations of works by different creators.

Complete replacement of current instruction – only clean copy provided

6.28.1.11 Additions to Access Points Representing Compilations of Musical Works

Apply the following instructions to a compilation of musical works by a single composer with a collective title.

For compilations identified by a distinctive title, apply the instructions at [6.27.1.9](#).

For compilations identified by a conventional collective title (see [6.14.2.8](#)), add the following elements, as appropriate:

- a) medium of performance (see [6.28.1.9.1](#))
- b) one or more of the additions specified at [6.27.1.9](#).

EXAMPLE

Chopin, Frédéric, 1810–1849. Polonaises, piano
Haydn, Joseph, 1732–1809. Quartets, violins, viola, cello
Grieg, Edvard, 1843–1907. Sonatas, violin, piano

but

Leclerc, Félix. Songs

Implied medium: solo voice or voices with instrumental and/or vocal accompaniment

Exception

When the preferred title includes the term *Selections* (see [6.14.2.8.4 alternative](#)), record the elements in the following order:

- a) conventional collective title (see [6.14.2.8.1-6.14.2.8.3](#))
- b) medium of performance
- c) *Selections*
- d) one or more of the additions specified at [6.27.1.9](#), as appropriate.

EXAMPLE

Scriabin, Aleksandr Nikolayevich, 1872–1915. Sonatas, piano. Selections

For compilations of musical works by different persons, families, or corporate bodies, apply the instructions at [6.27.1.4](#).