

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Kathy Glennan, ALA Representative
Subject: Revision proposal for conventional collective titles in *RDA* 6.14.2.8 and Glossary definitions for conventional collective titles and the term *Type of Composition*

ALA thanks the JSC Music Working Group for this proposal to move the conventional collective terms to examples in 6.14.2 and to clarify the meaning and use of the term “type of composition”. We support the proposal and offer the following comments and rewording suggestions.

General comments

In the discussion section, the JSC Music Working Group notes the difficulty of providing a single instruction that works in multiple languages for constructing conventional collective titles for music. ALA can accept the solution taken in the proposal, to use a collective title “generally descriptive of the medium.” However, we could also agree to an English-language solution that more closely mirrors the current instructions, with the understanding that RDA translations are not always literal but may be adaptations instead. In any case, we strongly support a solution that does not make significant changes to current practice.

ALA observes that the music-specific instructions lack guidance for compilations by different persons, families, or corporate bodies. We propose a revision below that includes a reference to the instructions proposed in 6JSC/LC/29.

Comments on Recommendations

Recommendation 1: Removing all listed terms from RDA 6.14.2.8.3–6.14.2.8.5 and from the Glossary.

Agree.

Recommendation 2: Merging RDA 6.14.2.8.3 and 6.14.2.8.4 into a single instruction for one broad or specific medium.

Agree.

Recommendation 3: Revising and adding language to the newly merged instruction to construct a conventional collective title generally descriptive of the medium, using terms for the media as found in standards lists, if available.

Agree in principle; see rewording suggestions below.

Recommendation 4: Revising and adding language to the instruction for conventional collective titles of one type of composition to use the name of the type of composition as found in standard lists, if available, as the conventional collective title.

Agree in principle; see rewording suggestions below.

Recommendation 5: Adding examples for conventional collective titles for one broad or specific medium and for one type of composition.

Agree.

Recommendation 6: Re-doing the definition for *Type of Composition* in the Glossary so that it is clear that it refers to terms that may be indicative of the form or genre, or may be generic terms.

ALA generally agrees with the proposed revision for “Type of Composition” in the Glossary. However, we believe that there are too many exemplars in this definition. We recommend consulting with the JSC Music Working Group to identify terms that essentially represent the same concept, so the list can be shortened. We also recommend adding a comma after the first “e.g.” and before the final “or”.

Recommendation 7: Replacing the word *type* in RDA instructions with *type of composition*, where that meaning is intended, to decrease ambiguity.

Agree in principle; however, we believe that the shorthand use of “type” alone is acceptable when “type of composition” is already used in the same sentence. For example, see our suggested rewording of the 1st paragraph in 6.14.2.8.4.

Additional comments:

6.14.2.8.1, Recording the Preferred Title for Compilations of Musical Works

- ALA recommends revising the 1st paragraph to use “commonly identified” instead of “become known” (consistent with our recommendations in 6JSC/Chair/15/rev/2/ALA response, 6JSC/LC/29/ALA response, and 6JSC/LC/30/ALA response).
- We suggest adding language to the first two paragraphs to make it clear that these instructions are limited to compilations of musical works by one person, family, or corporate body. We recommend using the term “composer” in this case, since these instructions are limited to musical works.
- In the second paragraph, we recommend removing “for a compilation of musical works” because the instruction is only about compilations of musical works.
- We recommend adding a paragraph that refers to the new instruction proposed in 6JSC/LC/29, for compilations of works by different persons, families, or corporate bodies. As with the previous paragraphs in this instruction, we recommend using the term “composer” here.

Marked-up copy, based on the JSC Music Working Group's proposal**6.14.2.8.1 Recording the Preferred Title for Compilations of Musical Works**

If a compilation of musical works by one composer ~~has become known~~ is commonly identified by a title through use in resources embodying that compilation or in reference sources, apply the instructions at **6.2.2.4–6.2.2.5**.

For other compilations by one composer, record the preferred title ~~for a compilation of musical works~~ by applying the instructions at **6.14.2.8.2–6.14.2.8.5**, as applicable.

For a compilation of works by different composers, apply the instructions at **6.2.2.12**¹.

Clean copy**6.14.2.8.1 Recording the Preferred Title for Compilations of Musical Works**

If a compilation of musical works by one composer is commonly identified by a title through use in resources embodying that compilation or in reference sources, apply the instructions at **6.2.2.4–6.2.2.5**.

For other compilations by one composer, record the preferred title for a compilation of musical works by applying the instructions at **6.14.2.8.2–6.14.2.8.5**, as applicable.

For a compilation of works by different composers, apply the instructions at **6.2.2.12**.

6.14.2.8.2, Complete Works

- Agree with the addition of “as the preferred title”.

6.14.2.8.3, Complete Works for one Broad or Specific Medium

- ALA agrees with these changes in principle. However, we offer the following suggested revision, which:
 - Uses an if/then instruction for clarity.
 - Reinstates the phrase “as the preferred title”.
 - Replaces the phrase “media of performance” with “medium of performance”; the latter is the preferred usage throughout RDA.

Because our proposed revision is extensive, we have only provided a clean copy.

Clean copy, to replace the JSC Music Working Group's proposal for 6.14.2.8.3**6.14.2.8.3 Complete Works for One Broad or Specific Medium**

If:

a compilation of works consists of, or purports to be, all of a composer's works for one broad or specific medium

¹ Numbering based on ALA response to 6JSC/LC/30.

and

the works are not of a single type of composition

then:

record a conventional collective title generally descriptive of the original medium as the preferred title. Select terms for the medium of performance from a standard list, if available.

EXAMPLE

Brass ensemble music

Choral music

Instrumental music

Keyboard instrument music

Orchestra music

Piano music

Piano music, 4 hands

Piano music, pianos (2)

Violin, piano music

Violins (2), viola, cello music

Vocal music

If the works are of a single type of composition, apply the instructions at [6.14.2.8.4](#).

6.14.2.8.4, Complete Works of One Type of Composition for One Specific Medium or Various Media

- ALA agrees with these changes in principle. However, we offer the following suggested revision to the instruction which:
 - Mirrors the language suggested above for 6.14.2.8.3.
 - Substitutes “type” for “type of composition” when this phrase would be used twice in the same sentence.
 - Uses the singular “type of composition” in the final sentence.

Marked-up copy, based on the JSC Music Working Group’s proposal

6.14.2.8.4 Complete Works of One Type of Composition for One Specific Medium or Various Media

~~For~~ If a compilation of works ~~that~~ consists of, or purports to be, all of a composer’s works of one type of composition, record ~~the name of the type of composition as the~~ a conventional collective title using the name of the type as the preferred title. Select terms for the types of compositions from a standard list, if available.

[examples unchanged from proposal]

Clean copy

6.14.2.8.4 Complete Works of One Type of Composition for One Specific Medium or Various Media

If a compilation of works consists of, or purports to be, all of a composer's works of one type of composition, record a conventional collective title using the name of the type as the preferred title. Select terms for the type of composition from a standard list, if available.

[examples unchanged from proposal]