

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Kathy Glennan, ALA Representative
Subject: Revision proposal for choosing and recording preferred titles for music in RDA 6.14.2.3–6.14.2.6

ALA thanks the JSC Music Working Group for this proposal to clarify the instructions for choosing and recording preferred titles for music in RDA 6.14. We generally support the proposal and offer the following comments and suggested revisions.

General comments

ALA agrees with the intent to align the instructions for musical works more closely with similar instructions in RDA 6.2.2. We recommend that whatever changes are made to those instructions as a result of 6JSC/LC/30 also be considered for incorporation in 6.14.2.

Consonant with our analysis of 6.2.2 in relation to 6JSC/LC/30, ALA finds difficulties in applying these instructions in relation to determining the title in the “original language” when a musical work has no language content. Our suggested revisions here are compatible with our response to that proposal.

ALA recommends retaining the references to 6.14.2.3 throughout, to ensure that the proposed revisions do not change the practice for recording preferred titles for parts of compositions.

The proposed revisions, especially in relation to the labels for the examples, point out a serious problem with the term “preferred title” in this section of RDA. The *final* preferred title is not determined until all of the applicable instructions in 6.14 have been applied. ALA reviewers were struck by the fact that all of the following were identified as preferred titles for the same work (Beethoven’s 3rd symphony):

| | |
|-----------------------|------------------------|
| 6.14.2.3 | <i>Sinfonia eroica</i> |
| 6.14.2.4.1, exception | <i>Sinfonia</i> |
| 6.14.2.4.2.2 | <i>Symphonies</i> |

We note that the proposal deals with this situation by using “preferred title before omissions” and “preferred title after omissions”; however, this language does not appear consistently throughout the instructions. ALA would prefer a more consistent and descriptive label for those preferred titles that are not yet in their final form. We note that the current version of 6.14.2.4 indicates the not-yet-final status of the preferred title by including the phrase “as defined in this instruction”. We recommend using “basis for the preferred title” instead. Alternative constructions for the example labels include “Initial form of preferred title” and “Preferred title per 6.14.2.4.1 [etc.]”.

ALA appreciates the extensive effort of the Music WG to suggest new examples, and we welcome the addition of examples for a folk song, national anthem, and popular music.

However, we believe that the number of examples should be reduced and that the format of the examples should be simplified. While we find the illustrations of how examples are affected by moving through the instructions in 6.14 informative, we see no need to include the transformations of all of the examples.

Specific comments

6.14.2.3, Choosing the Preferred Title for a Musical Work

ALA recommends a revision of both 6.14.2.2 and 6.14.2.3. We believe our revisions accomplish the same goals as the rewording presented in the proposal. Specifically, we suggest:

- Simplifying the Sources of Information instruction at 6.14.2.2 to match our proposal for 6.2.2.2 (see 6JSC/LC/30/ALA response).
- Moving the specific instructions for works created after 1500 and before 1501 to 6.14.2.3, along with the priority order for choosing the preferred titles in each case. Relocating these (reworded) instructions parallels the location of the equivalent general instructions (6.2.2.4 and 6.2.2.5).
- Adding language to acknowledge that the preferred title in 6.14.2.3 will not necessarily be the final version of the preferred title (“...as the basis for the preferred title...”)
- Retaining the concept of “the composer’s original title” for works created after 1500 and putting this as the first of three preferences.
- Removing any reference to the “original language” of the title, since many musical works have no language content.
- Using “commonly identified” instead of “become known” (consistent with our recommendation in 6JSC/Chair/15/rev/2/ALA response).
- Removing all references to “modern” reference sources (also in 6JSC/LC/30/ALA response).
- Moving the instruction about alternative titles to 6.14.2.4, to mirror the recommended location in 6JSC/LC/30.
- Including instructions for works without titles, which essentially replicate the instruction proposed in 6JSC/LC/30 (as revised in the ALA response). It would be possible to reference that instruction instead.

Because our changes below are extensive, we have only provided a clean copy.

Clean copy, to replace the current 6.14.2.2 & 6.14.2.3

6.14.2.2 Sources of Information

Determine the preferred title for the musical work from:
resources embodying the work

or

reference sources.

6.14.2.3 Choosing the Preferred Title for a Musical Work

For musical works created after 1500, choose one of these options as the basis for the preferred title (in this order of preference):

- a) the composer's original title
- b) the title by which the work is commonly identified either through use in resources embodying the work or in reference sources
- c) the title proper of the original edition (see [2.3.2](#)).

[appropriate examples to be determined]

For musical works created before 1501, choose as the basis for the preferred title the title or form of title by which the work is commonly identified in reference sources, if applicable. If the evidence of reference sources is inconclusive, choose (in this order of preference) the title most frequently found in:

- a) modern editions
- b) early editions
- c) manuscript copies.

[appropriate examples to be determined]

If:

the title of the musical work is not available in resources embodying the work or in reference sources

or

the work has no title

then:

choose a devised title (see [2.3.2.11](#)) as the preferred title.

[appropriate examples to be determined]

For compilations of musical works without a collective title, apply the instructions at [6.2.2.11-6.2.2.12](#), as applicable.

6.14.2.4, Recording the Preferred Title for a Musical Work

ALA agrees to:

- Move the current instructions at 6.14.2.5 to sub-instructions in 6.14.2.4, with rewording as suggested below.
- Remove the current 6.14.2.4.f in the proposed 6.14.2.4.1, since “adjectives and epithets not part of the original title of the work” would already have been omitted per 6.14.2.3.
- Change the scope for the exception at 6.14.2.4.2.1.
- Remove the instructions for duets (6.14.2.6).

We suggest the following revisions to this section:

- Omitting the reference to 6.14.2.3 in the first sentence of 6.14.2.4. While we understand that this phrasing is designed to remind cataloguers to apply that instruction first, this type of reference is not used in the equivalent instructions elsewhere in Chapter 6. There are other places in this section where that reference is appropriate, however, as noted below.
- Adding the “alternative title” instruction as the 2nd paragraph in the revised 6.14.2.4, reworded to match the recommendation in 6JSC/LC/30:

Do not record an alternative title as part of the preferred title.

- Rephrasing the optional omission. ALA does not agree with using wording from Chapter 2 in Chapter 6 due to the different purposes of these chapters. We also believe that it is inappropriate to mandate retaining the first five words in an abridged preferred title, since some of these lengthy titles have a large number of introductory words. Although this instruction has traditionally applied only to musical works, we wonder if it should also be generalized for the rest of Chapter 6.

For this instruction, we suggest the rewording below.

For works with very long titles, record an abridged title instead of the complete title as the preferred title.

We also recommend starting the example explanation with “Basis for preferred title” instead of “Preferred title chosen”.

- Revising the wording in the Exception to 6.14.2.4, and providing a clearer explanation regarding the status of the “preferred title” in the example.
- Rewording the first paragraph under 6.14.2.4.1, *Omissions* to retain the reference to 6.14.2.3. This will ensure that the preferred titles for parts (currently 6.14.2.7) do not require the same language and numbering normalization:

When recording the preferred title chosen according to **6.14.2.3**, omit the following:

- Limiting the number of examples in 6.14.2.4.1 and changing the example explanation from “Preferred title before omissions” to “Preferred title based on”.
- Simplifying the example explanation text in 6.14.2.4.2.1 and 6.14.2.4.2.2. ALA sees no need to explain that the term recorded (1st line of the example) is the “preferred title after omissions”. The occasional demonstration of changing the initial preferred title to a cognate term in English also seems unnecessary.

*Marked-up copy, based on the text of the proposal***6.14.2.4 Recording the Preferred Title for a Musical Work**

Record the title chosen as the preferred title for a musical work ~~according to 6.14.2.3~~ by applying the basic instructions at **6.2.1**. Apply the additional instructions at **6.14.2.4.1-6.14.2.4.2**, as applicable.

Do not record an alternative title as part of the preferred title.

[appropriate examples to be determined]

Optional omission

~~Abridge a long title only if it can be abridged without loss of essential information. Never omit any of the first five words.~~

For works with very long titles, record an abridged title instead of the complete title as the preferred title.

EXAMPLE

A book of psalmody containing variety of tunes

Basis for preferred title: A book of psalmody containing variety of tunes, both of the common and particular measures with chanting tunes for Te-Deum, Jubilate Deo, Magnificat, Nunc Dimittis, likewise the order of performing Divine Service by way of chanting, after the Cathedral manner, suitable for our country churches with several psalms, hymns and seventeen anthems, all set in four parts, some of them never before published

Exception

If:

~~the title recorded is a distinctive title that includes the name of a type of composition~~
the preferred title is distinctive

and

it includes the name of a type of composition

and

all of the composer's works of that type are also cited as a numbered sequence of compositions of that type

then:

record only the name of the type as the preferred title. Apply the additional instructions at **6.14.2.4.2**, as applicable.

EXAMPLE

Sinfonia

Basis for Preferred title chosen: Sinfonia eroica. Also cited in lists of Beethoven's symphonies as no. 3

6.14.2.4.1 Omissions

~~Omit from the title:~~

When recording the preferred title chosen according to 6.14.2.3, omit the following:

- a) a statement of medium of performance (even if such a statement is part of a compound word, provided that the resulting word or words is the name of a type of composition)

- b) key
- c) serial, opus, and thematic index numbers
- d) cardinal and ordinal numbers (unless they are an integral part of the title)
- e) date of composition.

[appropriate examples to be determined]

6.14.2.4.2 Preferred Title Consisting Solely of the Name of One Type of Composition

If the application of **6.14.2.4.1** results in a preferred title consisting solely of the name of one type of composition, apply the following instructions, as applicable:

choice of language (see **6.14.2.4.2.1**)

singular or plural form (see **6.14.2.4.2.2**)_±

6.14.2.4.2.1 Choice of Language

Record the accepted form of the name of the type of composition in a language preferred by the agency creating the data if:

the name has a cognate form in that language

or

the same name is used in that language.

Otherwise, record the form of the name of the type of composition in the language of the preferred title chosen according to **6.14.2.3**.

EXAMPLE

Quartet

~~Preferred title before omissions:~~ Basis for preferred title: Streichquartett 1995. ~~Preferred title after omissions:~~ Quartett. English language form recorded by as a cognate by an English-language agency in Canada ~~because it is a cognate to the German title~~

Concerti grossi

~~Preferred title before omissions:~~ Basis for preferred title: Concerti grossi con due violini, viola e violoncello di concertino obbligati, e due altri violin e basso di concerto grosso. ~~Preferred title after omissions:~~ Concerti grossi. ~~The same name for~~ of the type of composition is used in Italian and English

Pieces

~~Preferred title before omissions:~~ Basis for preferred title: Deux pièces pour hautbois et piano, op. 35. ~~Preferred title after omissions:~~ Pièces. English language form recorded as a cognate by an agency in the United States ~~because it is a cognate to the French title~~

but

Stücke

~~Preferred title before omissions:~~ Basis for preferred title: Drei Klavierstücke. ~~Preferred title after omissions:~~ Stücke. German language form recorded by an agency in Australia because there is no English cognate

Exception

For works called *étude*, *fantasia*, or *sinfonia concertante* or their cognates, record the form of the name of the type of composition in the language of the preferred title chosen according to 6.14.2.3.

EXAMPLE

Études

~~Preferred title before omissions:~~**Basis for preferred title:** Douze études pour le piano.~~Preferred title after omissions:~~ Études—French language form recorded by an agency in the United States ~~even though cognates exist in English~~**6.14.2.4.2.2 Singular or Plural Form**

Record the accepted form of the name of the type of composition in the singular form unless the composer wrote more than one work of that type with the same title.

EXAMPLE

Serenade

~~Preferred title before omissions:~~**Basis for preferred title:** Serenade for string quartet or string orchestra. ~~Preferred title after omissions:~~ Serenade—The composer wrote only one serenade

Quartets

~~Preferred title before omissions:~~**Basis for preferred title:** String quartet in A minor. ~~Preferred title after omissions:~~ Quartet—The composer wrote more than one quartet

Concertos

~~Preferred title before omissions:~~**Basis for preferred title:** Konzert a-Moll. ~~Preferred title after omissions:~~ Konzert—English language form recorded as a cognate by an agency in the United Kingdom ~~because it is a cognate to the German title~~. The composer wrote more than one concerto

Sonatas

~~Preferred title before omissions:~~**Basis for preferred title:** II. Sonate für Violine und Klavier, op. 30, Nr. 2. ~~Preferred title after omissions:~~ Sonate—English language form recorded as a cognate by an agency in the United States ~~because it is a cognate to the German title~~. The composer wrote more than one sonata

Divertimenti

~~Preferred title before omissions:~~**Basis for preferred title:** Divertimento for flute, oboe and clarinet (opus 37). ~~Preferred title after omissions:~~ Divertimento—The composer wrote more than one divertimento

Symphonies

~~Preferred title before omissions:~~**Basis for preferred title:** Sinfonia eroica. ~~Preferred title per exception to 6.14.2.4:~~ Sinfonia—English language form recorded as a cognate by an English-language agency in Canada ~~because it is a cognate to the Italian title~~, after applying the exception in 6.14.2.4. The composer wrote more than one symphony

*Clean copy***6.14.2.4 Recording the Preferred Title for a Musical Work**

Record the title chosen as the preferred title for a musical work by applying the basic instructions at **6.2.1**. Apply the additional instructions at **6.14.2.4.1-6.14.2.4.2**, as applicable.

Do not record an alternative title as part of the preferred title.

[appropriate examples to be determined]

Optional omission

For works with very long titles, record an abridged title instead of the complete title as the preferred title.

EXAMPLE

A book of psalmody containing variety of tunes

Basis for preferred title: A book of psalmody containing variety of tunes, both of the common and particular measures with chanting tunes for Te-Deum, Jubilate Deo, Magnificat, Nunc Dimittis, likewise the order of performing Divine Service by way of chanting, after the Cathedral manner, suitable for our country churches with several psalms, hymns and seventeen anthems, all set in four parts, some of them never before published

Exception

If:

the preferred title is distinctive

and

it includes the name of a type of composition

and

all of the composer's works of that type are also cited as a numbered sequence of compositions of that type

then:

record only the name of the type as the preferred title. Apply the additional instructions at **6.14.2.4.2**, as applicable.

EXAMPLE

Sinfonia

Basis for preferred title: Sinfonia eroica. Also cited in lists of Beethoven's symphonies as no. 3

6.14.2.4.1 Omissions

When recording the preferred title chosen according to **6.14.2.3**, omit the following:

- a) a statement of medium of performance (even if such a statement is part of a compound word, provided that the resulting word or words is the name of a type of composition)
- b) key
- c) serial, opus, and thematic index numbers
- d) cardinal and ordinal numbers (unless they are an integral part of the title)
- e) date of composition.

[appropriate examples to be determined]

6.14.2.4.2 Preferred Title Consisting Solely of the Name of One Type of Composition

If the application of **6.14.2.4.1** results in a preferred title consisting solely of the name of one type of composition, apply the following instructions, as applicable:

choice of language (see **6.14.2.4.2.1**)

singular or plural form (see **6.14.2.4.2.2**).

6.14.2.4.2.1 Choice of Language

Record the accepted form of the name of the type of composition in a language preferred by the agency creating the data if:

the name has a cognate form in that language

or

the same name is used in that language.

Otherwise, record the form of the name of the type of composition in the language of the preferred title chosen according to **6.14.2.3**.

EXAMPLE

Quartet

Basis for preferred title: Streichquartett 1995. **English language form recorded by as a cognate by an English-language agency in Canada**

Concerti grossi

Basis for preferred title: Concerti grossi con due violini, viola e violoncello di concertino obbligati, e due altri violin e basso di concerto grosso. **The same name of the type of composition is used in Italian and English**

Pieces

Basis for preferred title: Deux pièces pour hautbois et piano, op. 35. **English language form recorded as a cognate by an agency in the United States**

but

Stücke

Basis for preferred title: Drei Klavierstücke. **German language form recorded by an agency in Australia because there is no English cognate**

Exception

For works called *étude*, *fantasia*, or *sinfonia concertante* or their cognates, record the form of the name of the type of composition in the language of the preferred title chosen according to **6.14.2.3**.

EXAMPLE

Études

Basis for preferred title: Douze etudes pour le piano. **French language form recorded by an agency in the United States**

6.14.2.4.2.2 Singular or Plural Form

Record the accepted form of the name of the type of composition in the singular form unless the composer wrote more than one work of that type with the same title.

EXAMPLE

Serenade

Basis for preferred title: Serenade for string quartet or string orchestra. **The composer wrote only one serenade**

Quartets

Basis for preferred title: String quartet in A minor. **The composer wrote more than one quartet**

Concertos

Basis for preferred title: Konzert a-Moll. **English language form recorded as a cognate by an agency in the United Kingdom. The composer wrote more than one concerto**

Sonatas

Basis for preferred title: II. Sonate für Violine und Klavier, op. 30, Nr. 2. **English language form recorded as a cognate by an agency in the United States. The composer wrote more than one sonata**

Divertimenti

Basis for preferred title: Divertimento for flute, oboe and clarinet (opus 37). **The composer wrote more than one divertimento**

Symphonies

Basis for preferred title: Sinfonia eroica. **English language form recorded as a cognate by an English-language agency in Canada, after applying the exception in 6.14.2.4. The composer wrote more than one symphony**