

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Dave Reser, LC Representative
Subject: Alternative proposal for RDA 3.4.3.2 and RDA 3.21.2.5

We appreciate the work by the JMWG to resolve the contradiction between the second exception at 3.4.3.2 and the instruction on making a note at 3.21.2.5. We propose an alternative solution below.

In our experience, the situation of a score and part(s) bound in a single physical volume does not happen with great frequency. Altering the instructions in 3.4.3.2 to create a different practice for these score/part (or multiple parts) volumes creates an anomaly for both the cataloger and for the catalog user.

The current second exception at 3.4.3.2 calls for using the construction “1 score and X parts” followed by the subunits of the single physical volume, usually pages. The JMWG noted that in the exception at 3.4.3.2 the terms that describe the intellectual expression of the content usually also describe the physical characteristics of the resource, and users not observing the subunits might not realize that there is no one-to-one correspondence between the “content” terms and the number of physical volumes. The Library of Congress thinks the benefit of providing users with a clear indication of the intellectual expression of the content outweighs this risk. As discussions regarding extent of expression vs. extent of manifestation proceed, the JSC may reconsider this concept at a later date. Additionally, we note that the extent of notated music is a Core Element, but the note instruction at RDA 3.21.2.5 is not. Thus, we should not assume that the information from 3.21.2.5 indicates that a score and part(s) (or multiple parts) are involved would be recorded. We want the user to have this information.

For now, LC thinks the best course of action is to 1) retain the exceptions at 3.4.3.2 with some revisions, 2) rename 3.21.2.5, and 3) remove the first “if” condition in 3.21.2.5, which caused a paradox with the second exception in 3.4.3.2. Our recommendation also has the benefit of requiring no changes to 3.4.5.1. Although the Music Working Group did not propose changes to this instruction, a change would be required to accommodate the fact that they are proposing that only some resources consisting of notated music would have sub-units of pages, etc.

Recommendation for 3.4.3.2:

We recommend that the second exception of 3.4.3.2 be left generally as written with the addition of two concepts from the JMWG: 1) add reference to using 3.4.5 for instructions on recording the subunits, and 2) add an additional captioned exception for resources that consist solely of parts found in a single physical volume (thanks to the JMWG for identifying this missing category of resource). We think the separate paragraphs will result in greater clarity than trying to cover both concepts in a single paragraph.

Second exception at 3.4.3.2:

Resource consisting of a score and one or more parts in a single physical unit. If the resource consists of both a score and one or more parts in a single physical unit, record the extent in the form: 1 score and 4 parts, etc., followed by the number of volumes, pages, leaves, or columns as instructed at 3.4.5, in parentheses.

[examples unchanged from current RDA]

New third exception at 3.4.3.2:

Resource consisting of multiple parts in a single physical unit. If the resource consists of multiple parts without a score in a single physical unit, record the extent in the form: 4 parts, etc., followed by the number of volumes, pages, leaves, or columns as instructed at 3.4.5, in parentheses.

We agree with the JMWG's addition of the final sentence in the exception block, but given the distinction between "Notes on" and "Details of" we think the wording should be altered slightly:

Provide ~~details~~ in a note if considered important for identification or selection (see 3.21.2.5).

Recommendation for 3.21.2.5:

We agree with the changes proposed by the JMWG, though wonder if a less complex caption for the instruction could be used. We suggest the following, but are open to better suggestions:

3.21.2.5 Notated Music in a Single Physical Unit