

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: RDA Music Joint Working Group
Subject: Proposed revision to instruction 6.14.2.5, “Preferred Title Consisting Solely of the Name of One Type of Composition”

Background

Instruction 6.14.2.5 says to “Record the name of the type of composition as the preferred title [of a musical work] if the application of 6.14.2.3–6.14.2.4 results in a preferred title consisting solely of the name of one type of composition” and then to “Record the accepted form of that name in a language preferred by the agency creating the data.”

The equivalent rule in AACR2 (25.29A1) was almost identical, saying: “If the initial title element resulting from the application of 25.27 and 25.28 consists solely of the name of one type of composition, use the accepted English form of name if there are cognate forms in English, French, German, and Italian, or if the same name is used in all these languages.”

However, the conditional clause “if there are cognate forms in English, French, German, and Italian, or if the same name is used in all these languages” was not carried over in RDA, presumably because the list of languages was not deemed compatible with an international code. We agree that retaining these languages would reflect a Western bias that would not be appropriate in RDA. We don’t believe, however, that instructing catalogers to always give names of types of composition in a language preferred by the agency creating the data is desirable. We consider that this should be permitted only when the name has a cognate form in that language or if the same name is used in that language, and therefore recommend inserting wording to that effect, as well as adding a pair of examples of the same type of composition in two foreign languages, one of which has a cognate form in English and the other of which does not.

Rationale

The proposed revision would cause no disruption for catalogers, would serve catalog users, and would be in harmony with RDA principles and with established practice.

Translating the name of a type of composition into a language preferred by the agency creating the data generally satisfies the principle of representation (0.4.3.4) because non-distinctive titles are most often given, in reference sources and in resources embodying the work, in the language of the audience that is targeted by these sources (e.g., Pieces, instead of the French Pièces, in an English-language reference source). However, we feel that this

principle is no longer served when the forms are not cognate and therefore bear little if no resemblance at all with each other (e.g., Pieces, contrasted with the German Stücke).

On a practical level, reintroducing the notion of cognate form would meet the objective of continuity (0.4.2.4) by minimizing the number of authorized access points that will need to be changed as a result of the rule change.

LC and PCC adopted a practice that is similar (“LC practice/PCC practice: Record the accepted form of name in English if the name has an English cognate form or if the same name is used in English.”) Our recommendation is to incorporate a language-neutral version of this wording into the text of RDA.

Proposed revision

6.14.2.5 Preferred Title Consisting Solely of the Name of One Type of Composition

Record the name of the type of composition as the preferred title if the application of 6.14.2.3–6.14.2.4 results in a preferred title consisting solely of the name of one type of composition. Record the accepted form of that name in a language preferred by the agency creating the data if the name has a cognate form in that language or if the same name is used in that language. Record the name in the plural unless the composer wrote only one work of the type.

EXAMPLE

Quintets

Resource described: Quintetto VI in sol maggiore

Ballades

Resource described: Vier Balladen

Sonatas

Resource described: Sonate a violino, violone, e cembalo

Concerti grossi

Resource described: Six concerti grossi for 2 violins, viola, and violoncello soli with strings and harpsichord

Divertimenti

Resource described: Divertimento Nr. 1

Pieces

Resource described: Deux pièces pour hautbois et piano, op. 35

but

Stücke

Resource described: Vier Stücke Opus 5 für Klarinette und Klavier =
Four pieces op. 5 for clarinet and piano

Clean copy:

6.2.2.9.2 Preferred Title Consisting Solely of the Name of One Type of Composition

Record the name of the type of composition as the preferred title if the application of 6.14.2.3–6.14.2.4 results in a preferred title consisting solely of the name of one type of composition. Record the accepted form of that name in a language preferred by the agency creating the data if the name has a cognate form in that language or if the same name is used in that language. Record the name in the plural unless the composer wrote only one work of the type.

EXAMPLE

Quintets

Resource described: Quintetto VI in sol maggiore

Ballades

Resource described: Vier Balladen

Sonatas

Resource described: Sonate a violino, violone, e cembalo

Concerti grossi

Resource described: Six concerti grossi for 2 violins, viola, and violoncello soli with strings and harpsichord

Divertimenti

Resource described: Divertimento Nr. 1

Pieces

Resource described: Deux pièces pour hautbois et piano, op. 35

but

Stücke

Resource described: Vier Stücke Opus 5 für Klarinette und Klavier =
Four pieces op. 5 for clarinet and piano