To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA

From: Bill Leonard, CCC representative

Subject: **Revisions to instructions on Parts of the Bible (6.23.2.9.2–6.23.2.9.5 and 6.23.2.9.7)**

CCC thanks the Library of Congress for continuing to pursue the issues that emerged during the discussion of 6JSC/DNB/1. The current proposal is founded on the principle of internationalization which CCC definitely supports. CCC offers its qualified support for the changes in this proposal as below.

Change 1: Books of the Bible (moving the lists to the Tools tab)
Change 2: Groups of Books of the Bible (moving the lists to the Tools tab)

CCC supports these changes in part. We do not agree to the removal of the lists of books and groups of books of the Bible from chapter 6. Moving established lists out of the main body of the text of RDA could make the lists less accessible, less likely to be translated and less likely to be incorporated into printed versions of RDA. Other controlled vocabularies within RDA exist in both the Open Metadata Registry and in the text of RDA. We are not convinced of the need to remove the lists of books of the Bible and groups of books of the Bible from the text of RDA, particularly since these lists are stable.

We do support the addition of the lists of books and groups in the Tools tab, with these conditions: that the lists are treated as vocabularies; that the lists include the terms used in all translations of RDA and other languages such as Latin and Greek; that the display of the lists in the Tools tab can be controlled to show the language(s) of the users' preference; that the display of the lists in the Tools tab will allow users to see the groupings according to the preferences of one faith group or another.
We prefer that the lists of books and groups of books of the Bible in the Tools tab have dynamic functionality and improved accessibility over the static lists currently in chapter 6. Otherwise, there seems little justification for the addition of these lists to the Tools tab. The improved functionality should allow users to see the various lists of the books and groups in the languages of the expressions of RDA (English, German, French, Spanish, etc.) and more.
In addition, the improved functionality should allow users of the Tookit to select the configuration of the display of books and groups as interpreted by various faith groups.

It is hoped that the improved functionality will be able to be deployed for the treatment of the titles of sacred scriptures other than the Bible. Once the functionality, accessibility and permanence of the lists in the Tools tab is proven, CCC would reconsider the removal of the lists of books and groups of books of the Bible from chapter 6.

Change 1: Books of the Bible

CCC agrees with some of the proposed changes to 6.23.2.9.2 with the following changes. There is a typo in the word Apocrypha in the second last paragraph of 6.23.2.9.2. CCC also suggests the addition of a reference to the instruction on the Apocrypha as a group of books.

6.23.2.9.2 Books

[CCC is not suggesting the revisions proposed by LC to the first portion of this instruction]

Record a brief citation title in a language and script preferred by the agency by which the book is commonly identified in reference sources.

For apocryphal books outside of the Catholic canon or Protestant Apocrypha, see 6.23.2.6.

For the groups of books called the Apocrypha in the Protestant tradition and Deuterocanonical books in the Catholic tradition, see 6.23.2.9.4.

For a selection or selections of an individual book of the Bible, see 6.23.2.9.5 (single selections) or 6.23.2.9.7 (other selections), as applicable.

Change 2: Groups of Books

CCC proposes that *Apocrypha* and *Deuterocanonical books* be added to the list of groups of books of the Bible at 6.23.2.9.4.

Change 3: Revisions to the Apocrypha

CCC is generally supportive of these changes. We counter-propose the following changes to assist in distinguishing between the Protestant tradition's Apocrypha and the Catholic tradition's Deuterocanonical books. One needs to consider this change in concert with the CCC proposed changes to 6.23.2.9.4 (change 2 above) and 6.23.2.9.6 (Change 6 below) to account for the difference in the treatment of 1-2 Esdras and the Prayer of Manasses and to allow the recording of the titles of the two distinct groups of books as a whole.

CCC notes that the Orthodox tradition differs slightly, but has not explored whether this has further impact relevant to RDA.

6.23.2.9.4 Apocrypha and Deuterocanonical Books

Record *Apocrypha* as a subdivision of the preferred title for the Bible for the compilation known as the Apocrypha. Treat individual books that are part of the Apocrypha in the Protestant tradition (1–2 Esdras, Tobit, Judith, Rest of Esther, Wisdom of Solomon, Ecclesiasticus, Baruch, History of Susanna, Song of the Three Children, Bel and the Dragon, Prayer of Manasses, 1–2 Maccabees) or part of the Deuterocanonical books in the Catholic tradition (Tobit, Judith, Rest of Esther, Wisdom of Solomon, Ecclesiasticus, Baruch, History of Susanna, Song of the Three Children, Bel and the Dragon, 1–2 Maccabees) as parts of the Bible (see 6.23.2.9.2), according to the policy of the agency creating the data.

Alternative

Record the preferred title for each of the books in the compilation known as the Apocrypha. Apply this instruction instead of or in addition to recording *Apocrypha* as a subdivision of the preferred title for the Bible. Treat individual books that are part of

the Apocrypha in the Protestant tradition or part of the Deuterocanonical books in the Catholic tradition as apocryphal books (see 6.23.2.6).

Do not treat an edition of the Bible lacking these books as being incomplete.

~~For an individual book of the Apocrypha, see 6.23.2.9.2.~~

For apocryphal books that are not part of either the Catholic Deuterocanonical books nor of the Protestant Apocrypha, see 6.23.2.6

Change 4: Single Selection of Individual Books

CCC supports the changes to 6.23.2.9.5 but suggests the revisions below which are build on wording used in 6.23.2.6. The wording about language and script could be better placed to indicate that the reference sources themselves are in a language preferred by the agency. CCC also suggests using the definite article in the two groups of examples.

6.23.2.9.5.1 Single Selections Identified by Title

If a single selection from an individual book of the Bible is commonly identified by its own title in reference sources in a language preferred by the agency creating the data (rather than its designation as part of the Bible), record that title directly as the preferred title ~~in a language and script preferred by the agency creating the data~~.

> **EXAMPLE**
>
> The Lord's prayer
> *not* Bible. The Lord's prayer
> *not* Bible. Matthew, VI, 9–13
>
> The ten commandments
> *not* Bible. The ten commandments
> *not* Bible. Exodus. The ten commandments

Variant titles. Record as a variant title (see 6.23.3.5) the preferred title for the book followed by the chapter and verse (see 6.23.2.9.5.2).

CCC suggests that the alternative given in 6.23.2.9.5.2 could be the main instruction thereby removing the need for an alternative. That would remove any bias toward a numbering system that might demonstrate favouritism toward one tradition or another.

6.23.2.9.5.2 Single Selections Identified by Numeric Designation

If:

the resource being described is part of a book

and

it is not a single selection identified by its own title

then:

add the chapter and verse using numerals in the form preferred by the agency creating the data.

Use inclusive numbering if appropriate. Use punctuation in the form preferred by the agency creating the data to separate the name of the book, the number of the chapter, and the number of the verse or verses.

> **EXAMPLE**
> Bible. Psalms, VIII
> Preferred title recorded by an agency using the Authorized Version Bible
>
> Bible. Corinthians, 1st, XIII, 12
> Preferred title recorded by an agency using the New International Bible
>
> Bible. Ecclesiastes, 3:1–8
> Preferred title recorded by an agency using the New Revised Standard Version Bible
>
> Bible. Josue, IV–XIV
> Preferred title recorded by an agency using the Douai Bible
>
> Bible. Genesis, XI, 26–XX, 18
> Preferred title recorded by an agency using the Authorized Version Bible

Change 5: Other Selections from the Bible
CCC supports the re-structuring proposed by ALA in its response, 6JSC/LC/31/ALA response.

Change 6: Apocryphal Books instruction
CCC is generally supportive of these changes but wishes to counter-propose the following changes to allow for the difference between the composition of the Deuterocanonical books in the Catholic tradition and the Apocrypha in the Protestant tradition, specifically 1-2 Esdras and the Prayer of Manasses.

6.23.2.6 Apocryphal Books

An apocryphal book is one that is either not included in the Catholic canon ~~nor~~ or not included in the Protestant Apocrypha (see 6.23.2.9.4), according to the policy of the agency creating the data. Choose as the preferred title for an apocryphal book the title commonly found in reference sources in a language and script preferred by the agency creating the data.

> **EXAMPLE**
>
> Book of Jubilees
>
> Epistola Apostolorum
>
> Gospel according to the Hebrews

For compilations of apocryphal books, apply the instructions at 6.2.2 RDA .

Change 7: Midrashim dealing with a book of the Bible
CCC supports this change.

Change 8: Miscellaneous instructions with Bible examples needing explanations

We agree with change 8i which is required whatever is decided on change 1. The other changes are not needed if change 1 is not made.