

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Kathy Glennan, ALA Representative
Subject: Revision to RDA 2.4.1.8 (Noun Phrase Occurring with a Statement of Responsibility)

ALA thanks LC for this proposal to clarify when a noun phrase should be transcribed as part of a statement of responsibility, which we support. We found the visual examples quite helpful and concur that the layout, sequence, or typography should be the determining factor, rather than a grammatical connection.

We have several suggestions for greater clarity.

1. *2.4.1.8, 1st paragraph - Remove the “and” condition*

ALA recommends replacing the 1st paragraph of 2.4.1.8 with:

Treat a noun or noun phrase as part of the statement of responsibility if the sequence, layout, or typography on the source of information indicates the noun phrase is intended to be part of the statement of responsibility.

We believe that the inclusion of the “function performed” clause would just add to confusion when applying this instruction. For example, phrases such as “research and text by” or “maps by” do not really indicate the function performed by the person; the ISBD/AACR2 language is a bit clearer: “indicative of the role”. However, we see no reason not to rely solely on the layout, typography, or sequence to make the determination about where to record the noun phrase.

If the JSC supports retaining this clause, we would prefer broader language than just “function performed” – perhaps “indicative of the nature of the contribution”.

2. *2.4.1.8, final paragraph*

a. ALA believes that the decision about recording noun phrases normally comes down to the choice of other title information vs. statement of responsibility. Thus, we think that if any reference is included to another instruction in 2.4.1.8, it should be to 2.3.4.3, *Recording Other Title Information*, not 2.3.1.5, *Names of Persons, Families, and Corporate Bodies*.

b. In addition, we believe an “in case of doubt” instruction would be helpful.

Thus, we recommend the following instead, working from LC’s proposal:

~~For instructions on recording names appearing with noun phrases as part of the title, see 2.3.1.5.~~

If the sequence, layout, or typography on the source of information indicates the noun or noun phrase is not intended to be part of the statement of responsibility, record it as other title information (see 2.3.4.3).

In case of doubt, treat the noun or noun phrase as part of the statement of responsibility.

- c. If the JSC wishes to retain the reference to 2.3.1.5, we believe a reciprocal reference from 2.3.1.5 to 2.4.1.8 would also be in order.

3. *Comments on proposed examples in 2.4.1.8*

- a. ALA would find it helpful to have another example in the “but” section that contrasts directly with one of the examples above it. We suggest adding the following:

by John Rechy

Resource described: The life and adventures of Lyle Clemens : a novel / by John Rechy. **On the source of information** “a novel” and “by John Rechy” appear on separate lines

- b. While ALA understands that the proposed Barrère example is designed to ensure that the title proper will not be transcribed as part of the statement of responsibility, the example is difficult to parse. Perhaps an example that avoids using “by” for the composer of the concerto would be better, such as:

Anna Pasetti

Resource described: Cadenzas to Mozart's Concerto KV 299 for flute and harp / Anna Pasetti. **Flute cadenzas by Pasetti for Mozart's concerto**

- c. Correct the capitalization in the current Rechy example (page 3 and 4): “Coming” should be lower case.

4. *Changes to 2.3.4.3, Recording Other Title Information*

- a. Because we see the choice in recording noun phrases as usually deciding between other title information and statement of responsibility, ALA recommends adding the following paragraph at the end of 2.3.4.3:

If the sequence, layout, or typography on the source of information indicates that the noun phrase is intended to be part of the statement of responsibility, apply the instructions at 2.4.1.8.

If the JSC prefers retaining the second condition proposed by LC for the first paragraph of 2.4.1.8 (see #1 above), then ALA recommends adding a corresponding provision to the instructions for other title information in 2.3.4.3. If the noun phrase in a statement of responsibility is “indicative of the function performed by the person, family, or corporate body”, then the noun phrase treated as other title information is “indicative of the nature of the content”.

- b. If an “in case of doubt” instruction is added to 2.4.1.8 (see recommendation #2.b above), it should be added here as well.
- c. We also recommend adding a variation of our proposed example (in #3 above) in the first example box in 2.3.4.3:

a novel

Title proper: The life and adventures of Lyle Clemens. **Resource described:**

The life and adventures of Lyle Clemens : a novel / by John Rechy. **On the source of information “a novel” and “by John Rechy” appear on separate lines**