To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA

From: Bill Leonard, CCC representative

Subject: **Musical arrangements - Revision of RDA 6.18.4 and 6.28.3.2.1**

CCC has discussed these proposals and thanks EURIG for carefully examining the issues around musical arrangements. We agree with EURIG that RDA does not allow creating access points that uniquely identify arrangements because the elements prescribed under 6.27.3 cannot be used in conjunction with those prescribed under 6.28.3.1-6.28.3.5 in authorized access points for musical expressions. 6.28.3.1 does include a reference to 6.27.3 but it applies only to the types of musical expressions that are not covered by 6.28.3. This is an issue that was identified as problematic by the music community and listed by the RDA Music Revisions Facilitation Task Force as one of the issues that it needs to examine.

We recognize that a revision is desirable, but it should address all of the musical expressions covered by 6.28.3, not just arrangements. A more global revision that would allow using the elements prescribed under 6.27.3 would make some of the changes proposed to 6.28.3.2.1 unnecessary (e.g. adding the name of the arranger or having the optional addition).

We suggest that these revisions be deferred to the RDA Music Joint Working Group.

Proposed revision to 6.18.4

The revisions EURIG proposes for 6.18.4 are the same as proposed for the access point at 6.28.3.2.1. These revisions are not appropriate for the recorded element at 6.18.4. CCC does not support the proposed revision to 6.18.4.

The "specification of the nature of the expression" should be established as a new element or as an element sub-type. Having said that, we do not see the utility of making distinctions between types of arrangements. The distinction would be hard to make and reference sources often do not agree on what is a transcription vs. an arrangement. These two terms are sometimes used interchangeably. If specification of the nature of the expression was established a controlled vocabulary would be highly desirable.

Medium of Performance is defined in RDA as "the instrument, instruments, voice, voices, etc., for which a musical work was originally conceived" and relates therefore to the entity Work. It would not be appropriate as an element identifying the medium of performance of an arrangement. The appropriate element would be Medium of Performance of Expression, which is defined in FRAD but not in RDA. We would support creation of such an element, as well as Numeric Designation of a Musical Expression and Key of Expression, which would be useful to distinguish between musical expressions.

The name of the arranger is already provided for in RDA under the element Other Distinguishing Characteristic of the Expression. A new element is not required.

Proposed revision to 6.28.3.2.1

CCC does not support the proposed revision chiefly because it would defeat the objective of continuity with AACR2 access points and create split files without bringing tangible benefits.

It would be neither useful nor practical to determine the nature of the expression. Adding the medium of performance of the expression might be interesting to users but not all identifying elements need be included in access points, only those that are required to distinguish between two or more expressions. We note however that the elements specified in paragraphs a), b) and c) would be added systematically and not only when required to distinguish between expressions. If RDA was revised to allow using the elements prescribed under 6.27.3 when constructing access points for arrangements, cataloguers would have enough elements at their disposal to make access points unique, including the name of the arranger (as Other Distinguishing Characteristic of the Expression). The optional addition would also be unnecessary.

The nature of the expression and the medium of performance of the expression would first have to be defined as elements before being referred to in an instruction on access points. CCC would welcome the creation of a Medium of Performance of the Expression element because we can see the utility of recording the information as an element for purposes of identification and selection, especially in a scenario 1 implementation.