

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA

From: Alan Danskin, Chair, JSC

Subject: 6JSC/CCC/2: Compilations of musical works

The following comments have been received from the National Library of New Zealand.

To: Alan Danskin, Chair of the JSC  
From: National Library of New Zealand  
Subject: 6JSC/CCC/2: Compilations of musical works

---

Rule 6.14.2.8.5 contains a scope statement that is inconsistent with the examples in the second part of the rule. The first sentence of the rule says “For a compilation that consists of or purports to be **all** the works of one type ... “ However the examples in the second paragraph are clearly both cases where the compilation is not all the works of one type . Sonatas, piano, 6-10 in the first example and Symphonies, no. 1-3 by Beethoven in the second example.

Our reading is that the second paragraph of rule 6.14.2.8.5 needs clarification. It should either be referring to complete, numbered compilations and remain under 6.14.2.8.5 with new examples, or it should be removed from that rule altogether and be placed under 6.14.2.8.6 for incomplete compilations where the examples would match the scope of the rule. This second option matches the ACOC view in the *6JSC/CCC2/ACOC response (draft)*.

If the rule is changed as indicated in the second option above, there will be no need to alter rule 6.28.1.11 because sequentially numbered, incomplete, compilations of musical works will already have the numbering included as part of the preferred title.

We would like to propose the addition of examples to rule 6.28.1.11 that illustrate the situation where the medium of performance is obvious.

The text of the RDA rule is “Add to the access point representing a compilation containing works of one type, the medium of performance, **unless the medium is obvious** or unless the works are for various media.”

The AACR2 version of this instruction uses the phrase “unless the medium is implied by the title” and includes several examples where this is the case. The AACR2 instruction is much clearer than its RDA equivalent, even without the use of examples, and we would like to see it reinstated in RDA along with at least one or two examples.

AACR2 examples

Chorale prelude (*Implied medium: organ*)

Mass (*Implied medium: voices, with or without accompaniment*)

Overture (*Implied medium: orchestra*)

Songs, Lieder, etc. (*Implied medium: solo voice(s) with accompaniment for keyboard stringed instrument or, if in a "popular" idiom, solo voice(s) with instrumental and/or vocal accompaniment*)

Symphony (*Implied medium: orchestra*)