To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA

From: John Attig, (former) ALA Representative

Subject: Note on Manifestation and Item

Background

The April 2012 RDA update included a new element for Note on Expression and the revision of the element Note (in Chapters 2 and 3) to Note on Manifestation or Item. When making these changes to the RDA element sets in the Open Metadata Registry (OMR), I noted the following:

> In the RDA Element Set in OMR, the "Note" element has been split into two bound properties: "Note (Manifestation)" which has the FRBR Manifestation as its domain, and "Note (Item)" which has the FRBR Item as its domain.
>
> Because RDA treats these as a single element, I updated the label and definitions as follows:
>
>> **Note on Manifestation or Item (Manifestation)**
>> An annotation providing additional information relating to manifestation or item attributes.
>>
>> **Note on Manifestation or Item (Item)**
>> An annotation providing additional information relating to manifestation or item attributes.
>
> Because it makes sense to treat these as distinct elements in the Element Set, I would like to change the labels and definitions as follows:
>
>> **Note on Manifestation (Manifestation)**
>> An annotation providing additional information relating to manifestation attributes.
>>
>> **Note on Item (Item)**
>> An annotation providing additional information relating to item attributes.
>
> [*email to the JSC, April 9, 2012*]

Following discussion, it was agreed that the element names and definitions would remain as updated in the Registry, and that I would present a proposal to make appropriate changes to the Registry, the Element Analysis tables, and the text of RDA.

This, belatedly, is that proposal.

Changes to the RDA Element Analysis tables and the Registry

There are two issues here: (1) the label and definition for these elements, and (2) the status of the "element sub-types" included in both the Element Analysis tables and the Registry.

1. **Note on Manifestation or Item: labels and definitions**

   Proposal 1A: Define the following elements in the Registry:

   > **Note on Manifestation (Manifestation)**
   > An annotation providing additional information relating to manifestation attributes.

   > **Note on Item (Item)**
   > An annotation providing additional information relating to item attributes.

   Proposal 1B: Include the following in the Element Analysis table:

Note on manifestation	element	manifestation	literal?	plain	n/a	n/a
Note on item	element	item	literal?	plain	n/a	n/a

   Note that each of these elements appears twice in the table, based on their presence in both RDA Chapter 2 and Chapter 3. As noted below, there is a different list of sub-types in each chapter. *Question:* Is this duplication justified? Should these be consolidated?

2. **Note on Manifestation or Item: element sub-types**

   The following sub-types are currently defined for Note on Manifestation or Item in chapter 2 (all of these have manifestation as their domain):

   > Note on title
   > Note on statement of responsibility
   > Note on edition statement
   > Note on numbering of serials
   > Note on production statement
   > Note on publication statement
   > Note on distribution statement
   > Note on manufacture statement
   > Note on copyright date
   > Note on series statement
   > Note on frequency
   > Note on issue, part, or iteration used as the basis for identification of the resource

   The following sub-types are currently defined for Note on Manifestation or Item in chapter 3:

   > Note on extent of manifestation
   > Note on extent of item
   > Note on dimensions of manifestation
   > Note on dimensions of item
   > Note on changes in carrier characteristics

   Question: It is clear that these represent distinct sets of RDA instructions, but it is not equally clear that there is any advantage to treating them as formal element sub-types. Should these be retained in the element set or deleted?

If the sub-types are retained and the Chapter 2 and Chapter 3 elements are consolidated, the resulting elements would be:

Note on manifestation
    Note on title
    Note on statement of responsibility
    Note on edition statement
    Note on numbering of serials
    Note on production statement
    Note on publication statement
    Note on distribution statement
    Note on manufacture statement
    Note on copyright date
    Note on series statement
    Note on frequency
    Note on issue, part, or iteration used as the basis for identification of the resource
    Note on extent of manifestation
    Note on dimensions of manifestation
    Note on changes in carrier characteristics

Note on item
    [other sub-types to be added?]
    Note on extent of item
    Note on dimensions of item

Changes to the Outline of RDA

Note on Manifestation or Item currently appears in both Chapter 2 and Chapter 3 of RDA. Here are the relevant parts of the outline:

Chapter 2. Identifying Manifestations and Items

ATTRIBUTES OF THE MANIFESTATION

2.3 Title
…
2.16 Preferred Citation

ATTRIBUTES OF THE ITEM

2.17 Custodian History of Item
2.18 Immediate Source of Acquisition of Item
2.19 Identifier for the Item

NOTES

2.20 Note on Manifestation or Item

Chapter 3. Describing Carriers

ATTRIBUTES OF THE MANIFESTATION

3.3 Media Type

…
3.20 Equipment or System Requirement

ATTRIBUTES OF THE ITEM

3.21 Item-Specific Carrier Characteristics

NOTES

3.22 Note on Manifestation or Item

There are two options for the placement of the separate elements for Note on Manifestation and Note on Item. Option 1 makes a clean grouping of attributes of manifestation and item, but requires renumbering several sets of instructions; Option 2 requires minimal renumbering, but does not include notes in the lists of attributes of manifestation and item.

Option 1:

Chapter 2. Identifying Manifestations and Items

ATTRIBUTES OF THE MANIFESTATION

2.3 Title
…
2.16 Preferred Citation
2.17 Note on Manifestation

ATTRIBUTES OF THE ITEM

2.18 Custodian History of Item
2.19 Immediate Source of Acquisition of Item
2.20 Identifier for the Item
2.21 Note on Item

Chapter 3. Describing Carriers

ATTRIBUTES OF THE MANIFESTATION

3.3 Media Type
…
3.20 Equipment or System Requirement
3.21 Note on Manifestation

ATTRIBUTES OF THE ITEM

3.22 Item-Specific Carrier Characteristics
3.23 Note on Item

Option 2:

Chapter 2. Identifying Manifestations and Items

ATTRIBUTES OF THE MANIFESTATION

2.3 Title
…
2.16 Preferred Citation

ATTRIBUTES OF THE ITEM

2.17 Custodian History of Item
2.18 Immediate Source of Acquisition of Item
2.19 Identifier for the Item

NOTES

2.20 Note on Manifestation
2.21 Note on Item

Chapter 3. Describing Carriers

ATTRIBUTES OF THE MANIFESTATION

3.3 Media Type
…
3.20 Equipment or System Requirement

ATTRIBUTES OF THE ITEM

3.21 Item-Specific Carrier Characteristics

NOTES

3.22 Note on Manifestation
3.23 Note on Item

Note that neither option deals with the issue of the appearance of these two elements in two RDA chapters. There are two possible solutions to this: (a) merging the two sets of instructions for Note on Manifestation and Note on Item; and (b) creating separate elements for the two note elements in Chapter 2 and the two note elements in Chapter 3. Neither solution is terribly attractive. It is not clear that the appearance of an element in two chapters within RDA is a problem that needs to be solved, and therefore no solution is recommended here.

Changes to the Text of RDA

The following is a rather minimal editorial proposal for revising RDA to separate Note on Manifestation from Note on Item in Chapters 2 and 3. In order for the instruction numbers to make sense, I chose to use Option 2 above; this does not constitute a recommendation, but is merely the simpler numbering.

In the event, most of the current instructions apply specifically to either manifestations or items. Therefore, the proposal, for the most part, includes only section headings, with a note indicating that no change to the text is required. Because the changes are minimal, I have used standard mark-up, but have not included a clean copy.

The exercise raised a question concerning "missing" instructions and examples. The current instructions in Chapter 2 for specific categories (2.20.2–2.20.13) *all* deal explicitly with notes on manifestations; there are *no* instructions or examples dealing with notes on items. The proposed instructions for Note on Item, therefore, consist solely of very generic instructions based on 2.20.1. This section really needs to be developed further with appropriate examples. Almost any category of note that applies to a manifestation might also apply to an item. At the very least, some examples should be added to the new 2.21.1.3. My brief was to propose editorial changes,

and I do not feel that it is appropriate for me to propose entirely new instructions or examples, so I leave this to the Examples Group and/or future proposals from JSC constituencies.

Proposed revisions:

2.20 Note on Manifestation ~~or Item~~

2.20.1 Basic Instructions on Making Notes on Manifestations ~~or Items~~

2.20.1.1 Scope

A **note on manifestation ~~or item~~**▼ is an annotation providing additional information about manifestation ~~or item~~ attributes.

For notes on describing carriers, see **3.22**.

2.20.1.2 Sources of Information

Take information for notes on manifestation ~~or item~~ from any source.

2.20.1.3 Making Notes on Manifestation or Item

Make a note on manifestation ~~or item~~ by applying the general guidelines at **1.10**.

2.20.2 Note on Title

[No revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on manifestations]

2.20.3 Note on Statement of Responsibility

[No revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on manifestations]

2.20.4 Note on Edition Statement

[No revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on manifestations]

2.20.5 Note on Numbering of Serials

[No revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on manifestations]

2.20.6 Note on Production Statement

[No revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on manifestations]

2.20.7 Note on Publication Statement

[No revisions required; all instructions apply to notes on manifestations. Note, however, that one example may be a combination of manifestation and item information:]

> Original imprint covered by labels: on label Odeon, on container EMI Records
> **Publisher's name as transcribed from source:** Odeon

2.20.8   Note on Distribution Statement

> [No revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on manifestations]

2.20.9   Note on Manufacture Statement

> [No revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on manifestations]

2.20.10   Note on Copyright Date

> [No revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on manifestations]

2.20.11   Note on Series Statement

> [No revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on manifestations]

2.20.12   Note on Frequency

> [No revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on manifestations]

2.20.13   Note on Issue, Part, or Iteration Used as the Basis for Identification of a Resource

> [No revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on manifestations]

2.21   Note on Item

2.21.1   Basic Instructions on Making Notes on Items

2.21.1.1   Scope

A **note on item**▼ is an annotation providing additional information about item attributes.

For notes on describing carriers, see **3.23**.

2.21.1.2   Sources of Information

Take information for notes on item from any source.

2.21.1.3   Making Notes on Item

Make a note on item by applying the general guidelines at **1.10**.

3.22   Note on Manifestation ~~or Item~~

3.22.1   Basic Instructions on Making Notes on Manifestations ~~or Items~~

3.22.1.1   Scope

A **note on manifestation ~~or item~~**▼ is an annotation providing additional information about manifestation ~~or item~~ attributes.

For notes on identifying manifestations ~~and items~~, see **2.20**.

3.22.1.2   **Sources of Information**

Take information for notes on manifestation ~~or item~~ from any source.

3.22.1.3   **Making Notes on Manifestation ~~or Item~~**

Make a note on manifestation ~~or item~~ by applying the general guidelines at **1.10**.

3.22.2   **Note on Extent of Manifestation**

[No revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on manifestations]

~~**3.22.3**   **Note on Extent of Item**~~

[Delete and move to new 3.23.2.]

3.22.4~~3~~   **Note on Dimensions of Manifestation**

[No revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on manifestations]

~~**3.22.5**   **Note on Dimensions of Item**~~

[Delete and move to new 3.23.2.]

3.22.~~6~~4   **Note on Changes in Carrier Characteristics**

[No revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on manifestations]

3.23   Note on Item

3.23.1   Basic Instructions on Making Notes on Items

3.23.1.1   Scope

A **note on item**▼ is an annotation providing additional information about item attributes.

For notes on identifying items, see **2.21**.

3.23.1.2   Sources of Information

Take information for notes on item from any source.

3.23.1.3   Making Notes on Item

Make a note on item by applying the general guidelines at **1.10**.

3.23.2   Note on Extent of Item

[Formerly 3.22.3; no revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on items]

3.23.3   Note on Dimensions of Item

[Formerly 3.22.5; no revisions required; all instructions and examples apply to notes on items]