

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Dave Reser, LC Representative
Subject: Clarifying instructions for Recording Duration (RDA 7.22) and Note on Carrier (RDA 3.21)

We thank ALA for its proposal to fill the gap on “recording” instructions at 7.22, and we generally support the intent of the proposal with some suggested modifications. We have formatted our response using the numbering found in ALA’s “Summary of proposed changes.”

1. Chapter 3:

We do not agree to this change. Because duration is an attribute of expression, we believe that instructions about duration should be covered in chapter 7, not chapter 3. The chapter 7 “Details of” and “Note on” instructions and examples sometimes include manifestation information in order for them to be understood. 7.13.3.4, 7.13.4.4, 7.29.2.3.1, and other instructions all contain examples that mention manifestation attributes. We acknowledge that in the future the JSC Technical Working Group may recommend changes to the format and examples of these instructions, but for now, the JSC has continued to reaffirm a mixture of entity levels in these instructions when required for clarity.

We do support the general idea of an instruction allowing details of duration, including incorrect duration, to be recorded. Thus, we have proposed a “Details of Duration” instruction for 7.22. We also note that many of our catalogers expressed a desire to record incorrect duration stated on a resource because they felt it was important for users’ identification and selection.

2. Chapter 7:

7.22.1.1, *Scope*: We agree to ALA’s proposed change.

7.22.1.2 *Sources of Information*: We do not agree to ALA’s proposed change. The proposed wording modeled on 7.17, 7.18, and 7.19 seems to be the exception rather than the norm in chapter 7 (and we note that the wording in 7.17 may be changed by 6JSC/CILIP/4). We do not see the merit of wording in chapter 7 that says “Use evidence presented by the resource itself as the basis for recording ... resource. Take additional evidence from any source” because this seems to be a more wordy way to say “Take information on ... from any source.” We think it unlikely that catalogers would ignore accurate and useful information about duration found on the resource in favor of information from another source. Our reasoning for rejecting this change is further clarified in our response to ALA’s proposed changes to 7.22.1.3-7.22.1.5 below.

7.22.1.3, *Recording Duration* [new]: We agree to the principle of a recording instruction at 7.22.1.3, but we have suggested alternate wording for these reasons:

- a) Generally, RDA presents instructions on how to record data, then gives an alternative to do so in the form preferred by the agency creating the data. Thus an agency can document its recording practices in a policy statement if it follows the Alternative, or leave the decision to cataloger's judgment. For the few instructions when the basic instruction says to record the data in the form preferred by the agency, an agency must still document its recording practice in a policy statement, and more lengthy policy statement is required because there are no recording instructions in RDA itself. Catalogers also find the examples confusing because they present some, but not all, of the many recording possibilities.
- b) We believe that there are three basic methods for recording duration that should be applied to all sub-types: record the exact time if readily ascertainable; record the approximate time if exact time is not available; or omit the time if neither exact nor approximate time is ascertainable. We do not think there is a principled reason to exclude time approximated by the cataloger as a way to record duration for performance time. In fact, some of our catalogers thought that there was no way to omit performance time based on ALA's proposed wording. Rather than propose different instructions for different duration sub-types when they could all be covered by the same instructions, we propose to collapse the recording instructions for playing time, running time, etc. and performance time into one instruction.
- c) We believe that if an agency wanted to record time for different attributes covered in chapter 7 following the basic instructions, they would want consistency in their recording of time. We note that current references to appendix B suggest that a system of time measurement using hours, minutes, and seconds is already being implicitly prescribed by the instructions. Our recommendation is simply for clarity and not an endorsement of one clock, system of time measurement, or method of recording time over another. We would support an agency's decision to record duration using a hexadecimal clock or Hindu units of time if that form supported the agency's user needs.

7.22.1.4, *Playing Time, Running Time, Etc.*: We do not agree to these proposed changes because we feel that separate instructions for different types of duration are not needed.

7.22.1.5, *Performance Time*: We do not agree to these proposed changes because we feel that separate instructions for different types of duration are not needed.

7.22.1.6., *Duration of Individual Parts to Duration of Component Parts*: We agree to re-naming the instruction and the changes suggested to the 1st paragraph by ALA (reflected in our replacement proposal). We also suggest an alternative to record the total duration and renumber the instruction to reflect other changes we propose. We do not agree to the proposed new example because it would reflect the alternative in our proposal. We suggest reformatting the examples for the component duration to clarify that each duration

applies to an individual component and avoid the appearance of prescribing punctuation by example rather than instruction.

7.22.1.7, *Resource Containing Both Sound and/or Moving Images and Text, Still Images, Etc.*: We do not agree to these propose changes. Instead, we recommend deleting this section and incorporating the reference to 3.21.2.10 (currently 3.22.2.10 but will be replaced by reference to 3.21.2.10 in October Toolkit update) into 7.22.1.3.

3. *Glossary*:

We agree to this change.

LC's proposed replacement for 7.22.1.3-7.22.1.6

The proposed changes would replace the existing instructions at 7.22.1.3-7.22.1.6 so no mark-up is provided. Note that in our proposed changes, there would be no 7.22.1.6 because that instruction has been incorporated into 7.22.1.3.

7.22.1.3 Recording Duration

Record the duration in hours, minutes, and seconds of the twenty-four-hour clock. Abbreviate terms for units of time as instructed in appendix B (B.5.3). Use a comma to separate the units of time.

Alternative

Record duration in the form preferred by the agency creating the data.

Record the duration using one of the following methods:

- a) Record the exact time if readily ascertainable.

EXAMPLE

3 min., 23 sec.

Playing time for a film cartridge

20 min.

Performance time for a resource with notated movement

1 hr.

Performance time for a score

2 hr., 30 min., 4 sec.

Playing time for an audio disc

- b) If the exact time is not readily ascertainable, record an estimated time preceded by *approximately*.

EXAMPLE

approximately 3 hr.

Playing time for the content of an audio disc

approximately 15 min.

Performance time for a monologue

- c) If the time cannot be ascertained or estimated, omit it.

Record details of duration as instructed at 7.22.1.5

For instructions on recording the duration of a resource with component parts, see 7.22.1.4

For instructions on recording the extent of a resource containing sound and/or moving images as well as text, still images, etc., see 3.21.2.10.

7.22.1.4 Duration of Component Parts

When recording duration for a resource consisting of more than one component part, record the duration of each component part as instructed at 7.22.1.3.

EXAMPLE

17 min.

23 min.

9 min.

Alternative

Record the total duration of the resource. Apply this instruction instead of or in addition to recording the duration of the component parts.

EXAMPLE

49 min.

Total duration for a play with three acts that have durations of 17, 23, and 9 minutes

3 hr.

1 hr.

1 hr.

1 hr.

Total duration and duration of each component part recorded for a resource containing three audio files

7.22.1.5 Details of Duration

Record details of duration if considered important for identification or selection. Abbreviate terms for units of time as instructed in appendix B (B.5.3).

EXAMPLE

With tracks every 3 min. for easy bookmarking

Performance time given as 45 min. on resource

Duration stated on a resource that has a duration of 2 hours

Total track time: 2 hr., 10 min., 5 sec.

An audiocassette with 10 songs and 8 tracks

16 min. per audiocassette

Playing time for each cassette in a set of 31 audiocassettes