

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Dave Reser, LC Representative
Subject: Clarifying core element status for “not identified” elements in the Distribution and Manufacture Statements (RDA 2.9 and 2.10)

LC thanks ALA for the analysis of the situation with Distribution and Manufacture elements. At LC, we haven't experienced the same confusion on the applicability of the elements in question that has generated this proposal (i.e., the “cascading vortex of doom” has not played out in reality). Although the justification indicates that questions over the meaning of “applicable and readily ascertainable” (RDA 0.6.1) for core elements is part of the problem, we don't believe that the proposed solution has adequately addressed that concern. There are two issues that we believe are at the heart of any confusion:

- 1) the 2.9 and 2.10 instructions are *statement* elements, with three *sub-elements*, and “core element” indications at both levels;
- 2) the “core element” requirements for the sub-elements are dependent on sub-elements of *different statement elements*.

Although we understand the original reason that the conditional “core” requirements were established “as is” in RDA (continuity with certain AACR2 practices), we believe it is time to remove this dependency and treat the 2.9 and 2.10 elements as independent statements, without conditional core requirements. We believe that removing the conditional requirements will simplify the instructions without a loss to RDA principles.

Unknown Places and Alternatives

LC accepts the movement of the instructions for “unknown places” to a new “e” paragraph at 2.8.2.6 (etc.), and the new basic instruction for “Unknown Place of Publication” at 2.8.2.6.5 (etc.).

We do not agree to the “Alternative” instructions proposed for two of those new “place” instructions (2.9.2.6.5 and 2.10.2.6.5). We also do not agree to the Alternative instructions proposed for the “name” and “date” sub-elements in 2.9-2.10. The alternatives create ambiguity. Is the place, name, or date sub-element being omitted because the sub-element is “not identified” or because the larger statement that it belongs to is “not applicable” to that resource?

Possible interpretation 1: Statement is **not** applicable because there is no Distribution or Manufacture information (i.e., no statement can be made)

Conclusion: the alternative is not necessary, because 0.6.1 already addresses the situation of an element that is not applicable to the resource.

Possible interpretation 2: Statement is applicable because some, but not all, sub-elements are known

Conclusion: the Alternative could be in violation of the conditional “core” statement, and the Alternative creates an exception to a core statement that is already dependent on the absence of another element.

Response to Changes (by Instruction Number):

- 2.8.2.6: yes
- 2.8.2.6.5: yes
- 2.9.2.6: yes
- 2.9.2.6.5: partial, do not accept the Alternative
- 2.9.4.7: no, do not accept the Alternative
- 2.9.6.6: no, do not accept the Alternative
- 2.10.2.6: yes
- 2.10.2.6.5: partial, do not accept the Alternative
- 2.10.4.7: no, do not accept the Alternative
- 2.10.6.6: no, do not accept the Alternative

Proposed Solution to Alternatives

LC believes that the removal of the conditional core statements is the best solution, rendering the proposed alternatives unnecessary. We would extend this to 2.11 (Copyright Date) as well, and note that an agency could establish a policy to record any of these now optional elements if desired.

Suggested changes:

1. Remove CORE ELEMENT statements for Distribution Statement, and the three sub-elements of the Distribution Statement.
2. Remove CORE ELEMENT statements for Manufacture Statement, and the three sub-elements of the Manufacture Statement.
3. Remove CORE ELEMENT statement for Copyright Date.
4. Adjust 0.6.2 accordingly (note: dependent on outcome of 6JSC/BL/15/rev).
5. Adjust 1.3 accordingly.

Suggested Change 1: Remove CORE ELEMENT statements for Distribution Statement, and the three sub-elements of the Distribution Statement.

2.9 Distribution Statement

CORE ELEMENT

Place of distribution is a core element for a resource in a published form if the place of publication is not identified. Distributor's name is a core element for a resource in a published form if the publisher is not identified. Date of distribution is a core element for a resource in a published form if the date of publication is not identified. Other sub-elements of distribution statements are optional.

2.9.2 Place of Distribution

~~CORE ELEMENT~~

Place of distribution is a core element for a resource in a published form if the place of publication is not identified. If more than one place of distribution appears on the source of information, only the first recorded is required.

2.9.4 Distributor's Name

~~CORE ELEMENT~~

A distributor's name is a core element for a resource in a published form if the publisher's name is not identified. If more than one distributor's name appears on the source of information, only the first recorded is required.

2.9.6 Date of Distribution

~~CORE ELEMENT~~

Date of distribution is a core element for a resource in a published form if the date of publication is not identified. If the date of distribution appears on the source of information in more than one calendar, only the date in the calendar preferred by the agency preparing the description is required.

Suggested Change 2: Remove CORE ELEMENT statements for Manufacture Statement, and the three sub-elements of the Manufacture Statement.

2.10 Manufacture Statement

~~CORE ELEMENT~~

Place of manufacture is a core element for a resource in a published form if neither a place of publication nor a place of distribution is identified. Manufacturer's name is a core element for a resource in a published form if neither a publisher nor a distributor is identified. Date of manufacture is a core element for a resource in a published form if neither the date of publication, the date of distribution, nor the copyright date is identified. Other sub-elements of manufacture statements are optional.

2.10.2 Place of Manufacture

~~CORE ELEMENT~~

Place of manufacture is a core element for a resource in a published form if neither a place of publication nor a place of distribution is identified. If more than one place of manufacture appears on the source of information, only the first recorded is required.

2.10.4 Manufacturer's Name

~~CORE ELEMENT~~

Manufacturer's name is a core element for a resource in a published form if neither a publisher nor a distributor is identified. If more than one manufacturer's name appears on the source of information, only the first recorded is required.

2.10.6 Date of Manufacture

~~CORE ELEMENT~~

Date of manufacture is a core element for a resource in a published form if neither the date of publication, the date of distribution, nor the copyright date is identified. If the date of manufacture appears on the source of information in more than one calendar, only the date in the calendar preferred by the agency preparing the description is required.

Suggested Change 3: Remove CORE ELEMENT statement for Copyright Date.

2.11 Copyright Date

~~CORE ELEMENT~~

~~Copyright date is a core element if neither the date of publication nor the date of distribution is identified. If the copyright date appears on the source of information in more than one calendar, only the date in the calendar preferred by the agency preparing the description is required.~~

Suggested Change 4: Adjust 0.6.2 accordingly (note: dependent on outcome of 6JSC/BL/15/rev).

0.6.2 Section 1: Recording Attributes of Manifestation and Item

When recording data identifying and describing a manifestation or item, include as a minimum all the following elements that are applicable and readily ascertainable.

Title

Title proper

Statement of responsibility

Statement of responsibility relating to title proper (if more than one, only the first recorded is required)

Edition statement

Designation of edition

Designation of a named revision of an edition

Numbering of serials

Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part of sequence (for first or only sequence)

Chronological designation of first issue or part of sequence (for first or only sequence)

Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part of sequence (for last or only sequence)

Chronological designation of last issue or part of sequence (for last or only sequence)

Production statement

Date of production (for a resource in an unpublished form)

Publication statement

Place of publication (if more than one, only the first recorded is required)

Publisher's name (if more than one, only the first recorded is required)

Date of publication

Distribution statement

~~Place of distribution (for a published resource, if place of publication not identified; if more than one, only the first recorded is required)~~

~~Distributor's name (for a published resource, if publisher not identified; if more than one, only the first recorded is required)~~

~~Date of distribution (for a published resource, if date of publication not identified)~~

Manufacture statement

~~Place of manufacture (for a published resource, if neither place of publication nor place of distribution identified; if more than one, only the first recorded is required)~~

~~Manufacturer's name (for a published resource, if neither publisher nor distributor identified; if more than one, only the first recorded is required)~~

~~Date of manufacture (for a published resource, if neither date of publication, date of distribution, nor copyright date identified)~~

Copyright date

~~Copyright date (if neither date of publication nor date of distribution identified)~~

[text unchanged after Copyright Date]

Suggested Change 5: Adjust 1.3 accordingly.

1.3 Core Elements

When recording data identifying and describing a manifestation or item, include as a minimum all of the following elements that are applicable and readily ascertainable.

Title

Title proper

Statement of responsibility

Statement of responsibility relating to title proper (if more than one, only the first recorded is required)

Edition statement

Designation of edition

Designation of a named revision of an edition

Numbering of serials

Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part of sequence (for first or only sequence)

Chronological designation of first issue or part of sequence (for first or only sequence)

Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part of sequence (for last or only sequence)

Chronological designation of last issue or part of sequence (for last or only sequence)

Production statement

Date of production (for a resource in an unpublished form)

Publication statement

Place of publication (if more than one, only the first recorded is required)

Publisher's name (if more than one, only the first recorded is required)

Date of publication

Distribution statement

~~Place of distribution (for a published resource, if place of publication not identified; if more than one, only the first recorded is required)~~

~~Distributor's name (for a published resource, if publisher not identified; if more than one, only the first recorded is required)~~

~~Date of distribution (for a published resource, if date of publication not identified)~~

Manufacture statement

~~Place of manufacture (for a published resource, if neither place of publication nor place of distribution identified; if more than one, only the first recorded is required)~~

~~Manufacturer's name (for a published resource, if neither publisher nor distributor identified; if more than one, only the first recorded is required)~~

~~Date of manufacture (for a published resource, if neither date of publication, date of distribution, nor copyright date identified)~~

Copyright date

~~Copyright date (if neither date of publication nor date of distribution identified)~~

Series statement

Title proper of series

Numbering within series

Title proper of subseries

Numbering within subseries

Identifier for the manifestation

Identifier for the manifestation (if more than one, prefer an internationally recognized identifier if applicable)

Carrier type

Carrier type

Extent

Extent (only if the resource is complete or if the total extent is known)

Include any additional elements that are required in a particular case to differentiate the manifestation or item from one or more other manifestations or items with similar identifying information.