

TO: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
FROM: John Attig, ALA Representative
SUBJECT: Proposed Revision of RDA 16.2.2 (Preferred Name for the Place)

The following proposals deal with issues relating to recording the Preferred Name for the Place (RDA 16.2.2). The proposals are presented together because they all relate to the same sequence of RDA instructions. Further, ALA believes that there remain important unresolved problems with the RDA instructions for the use of the names of larger places for identification and disambiguation of place names; as noted under #6 below, ALA plans to continue working on these problems and will have additional proposals to present at a later date.

Background and Recommendations

1. Places in certain federations (RDA 16.2.2.9)

Among the “Issues deferred until after the first release of RDA” [6JSC/Sec/1], the American Association of Law Libraries (AALL) gave a high priority to the question of places in federations (RDA 16.2.2.9). AALL agreed to consider whether special instructions were needed for federations and whether they should be applied to all federations. They could find no empirical basis for deciding whether special instructions are needed, but rejected an all-or-nothing approach in which the instruction for certain federations would either be eliminated or applied to all federations. The idea of applying the same instruction to all federations is untenable. Wikipedia lists 25 current federations in the world, including countries like Germany, India, and Nigeria, but of course it depends to some extent on how one defines a federation. In any case, it seems unwise to expect catalogers to identify the state or other subdivision in which places in all these countries are located, and it is not obvious how this would serve the user.

The practice in AACR and RDA of treating places in certain federations under a special instruction seems to be based on customs and traditions and pragmatic considerations. In the United States, place names are almost always associated with the name of the state in which they are located. It should probably be left to representatives from Australia and Canada to say how much place names in those countries are associated with the name of the state or province, but there seems to be no compelling reason to change the long-standing cataloging practice for those countries.

Among the federations listed in 16.2.2.9 that still exist, Malaysia is the only one not represented among the authors of RDA and its predecessor AACR. Given the history of that country and the fact that the federation was formed in 1963 and Singapore withdrew two years later, it may have seemed prudent in the 1970s to give primacy to the states of Malaysia. However, several decades later, it seems safe to say that most catalog users outside that country are not familiar with the 13 states and three federal territories of Malaysia and are not well served by access points like George Town (Penang) or Ipoh (Perak). This fact is recognized by LCRI 23.4C, which calls for a reference from the name

qualified by “(Malaysia)”. Therefore, *ALA recommends that Malaysia be removed from the instructions in RDA 16.2.2.9 and be treated under the instruction for places in other jurisdictions.*

The U.S.S.R. and Yugoslavia no longer exist. The only reason to retain the U.S.S.R. and Yugoslavia in 16.2.2.9 is to provide guidance to the cataloger when describing resources from the period when those federations existed. The instructions should acknowledge that they no longer exist, so we propose adding “the former” to the instructions. Furthermore, we recommend that it be made clear that places in these former federations are covered under 16.2.2.9 in all cases (as part of the federation or not); therefore, *ALA recommends adding the phrase “a country that was a constituent republic of the former U.S.S.R. or the former Yugoslavia”.*

2. Places in the Republic of Ireland (RDA 16.2.2.10)

In the course of ALA’s deliberations on these revisions, we noted that the inclusion of the Republic of Ireland in the instructions for places in the British Isles is somewhat of an anomaly, given that (unlike the other parts of the British Isles) the Republic of Ireland is an independent country with no “larger jurisdiction”. We believe that it should be covered by the general instructions for Places in Other Jurisdictions (RDA 16.2.2.11).

Ireland was originally included in the rule for places in the British Isles under AACR2 because, in the 1978 revision, places in the British Isles (including the Republic of Ireland) were qualified by the name of the *county* in which they were located, e.g. Waterville (Kerry). After this rule was changed in the 1988 revision, the treatment in places in the Republic of Ireland was no different than places covered by the general rule for “places in other jurisdictions” — but Ireland was not removed from the rule for places in the British Isles. This is an overdue change.

ALA recommends that mention of the Republic of Ireland be removed from RDA 16.2.2.10 and the examples for places in the Republic be moved to the general instructions at the current RDA 16.2.2.11.

3. Overseas territories and insular areas [new]

The American Association of Law Libraries recommended the addition of an instruction for overseas territories and insular areas. The need for such an instruction is recognized by the LCPS for 16.2.2.4, Islands and Island Groups. Without such an instruction, one has to infer an instruction from examples like Papeete (French Polynesia), since French Polynesia is not a country. One also has to infer that the names of overseas territories like French Polynesia do not have the name of the country, e.g. (France), added as a qualifier following the instructions in the current RDA 16.2.2.11. A new instruction would also clarify the application of 16.2.2.9. The term *territory* in 16.2.2.9 should be understood as applying to territories that are integral parts of the country, such as the Nunavut territory in Canada or the Northern Territory in Australia. There is no reason why places in the U.S. Virgin Islands should be treated by one instruction (16.2.2.9.2) and places in the British Virgin Islands by another (16.2.2.11). The term *insular area* is used in the proposed new RDA 16.2.2.11

because it is a generic term used by the United States Office of Insular Affairs and defined at: http://www.doi.gov/oia/Islandpages/political_types.htm.

ALA proposes the addition of a new instruction for “places in overseas territories and insular areas” to be inserted as RDA 16.2.2.11 (current 16.2.2.11 and subsequent instructions to be renumbered), and move appropriate examples from other instructions.

4. Qualifiers for Places in China

The Council on East Asian Libraries (CEAL) asked ALA to propose a revision to include the name of the province, in addition to the name of the country, as part of the preferred name for places in China. This would result in preferred names such as Hangzhou Shi (Zhejiang Sheng, China).

In arguing for this change, CEAL noted that the territory of China is among the largest in the world, and its first-level jurisdiction is divided into 22 provinces, 5 autonomous regions, 2 special administrative regions, and 4 special municipalities directly under the Central Government. Under current RDA instructions, place names in China below the first-level administrative division are recorded directly with the qualifier “(China).” The name of the province, special administrative regions, or autonomous region is not included in the qualifier unless another place with the same romanized name exists in a different jurisdiction. Because of the size of its territory, it is often difficult to identify the exact location of a place without the name of province or its equivalent. Public services librarians in East Asian collections have expressed concern about this issue over the years. The inclusion of the name of the province or its equivalent would assist users in finding and identifying Chinese places.

After considering this proposal, ALA decided that this situation was not confined to places in China. For many users, the identity of places in many countries is strongly determined by the larger places in which they are located within the country. For instance, it was noted that for many users (including the large Hispanic population within the United States), places in Mexico are identified more with the state in which they are located than with the country. ALA recognizes that this question of identification is subjectively different for different user communities, and therefore ***ALA proposes to add an Optional Addition to the general instruction for Places in Other Jurisdictions [current 16.2.2.11, proposed 16.2.2.12] to allow the name of the first-level administrative division to be recorded preceding the name of the country as part of the preferred name of a place.***

Note: ALA received a number of suggestions for examples illustrating this optional addition, for places in China, Japan, and Mexico. These are listed at the end of the proposal. We suggest that the JSC Example Group decide which examples to include in RDA.

5. Abbreviation of Virgin Islands [question]

In the course of ALA’s deliberations, it was noted that the abbreviation “V.I.,” which appears in Appendix B and is used in examples in Chapter 16, is used for places in both the British Virgin Islands and the Virgin Islands of the United States. This results in preferred names that promote ambiguity rather than removing it. ALA would like to remove this abbreviation from Appendix B; if that is all that is needed, this can be handled as a Fast Track proposal.

On the other hand, the JSC has noted that the use of abbreviations in names of places and jurisdictions is contrary to the general tendency of RDA to minimize the use of abbreviations. In this case, the JSC retained these abbreviations primarily because of the extensive impact of such a change on existing data.

ALA now asks the JSC whether they would be interested in entertaining a proposal to delete abbreviations for place names from RDA Appendix B and to revise the relevant examples.

6. Name of larger place as part of the preferred name [future proposal]

Many of the revisions proposed above attempt to deal with the inclusion of names of larger places as qualifiers for purposes of identification and disambiguation. The fundamental problem at the root of these issues is that RDA 16.2 calls for recording the name of the larger place (or places) *as part of the preferred or valiant name*. This is contrary to the practice in most instructions for recording preferred names, where such additional information is treated as separate elements to be recorded as needed and then used in constructing authorized and variant access points. Rather than locking these place names into a predetermined, left-anchored string, the hierarchical relationships between names of larger and smaller places could be recorded, and used as needed for identification and disambiguation. This could be done in such a way as to allow different cataloging agencies to customize these access points to serve the needs of their user communities; this would be a significant step towards the internationalization of RDA instructions.

ALA feels that the instructions for recording names of places would be made simpler and more effective if:

- Instructions about recording names of larger places were removed from the instructions for recording the preferred and variant names of places.
- Separate instructions for an element for Name of Larger Place were to be added to Chapter 16. Alternatively, a relationship element for Larger/Smaller Place might be added instead.
- Instructions for constructing authorized and variant access points for names of places were added to Chapter 16.

ALA plans to continue working on these issues and to develop a proposal along the lines outlined above.

Proposed Revision

16.2.2.4 Recording the Preferred Name

Record the name of a place in the form most commonly found in gazetteers or other reference sources used in choosing the name, unless the instructions given under [16.2.2.8–16.2.2.1314](#) indicate otherwise.

Record as part of the name of a place (other than a country or a state, etc., listed in [16.2.2.9.1](#), ~~or~~ [16.2.2.10.1](#), or [16.2.2.11.1](#)) the name of the larger place in which it is located or the larger jurisdiction to which it belongs applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.9–16.2.2.1314](#).

If the place name is being used as the conventional name for a government (see [11.2.2.5.4](#)), enclose the name of the larger place in parentheses.

EXAMPLE

Budapest (Hungary)

If the place name is being used to record the location of a conference, etc., (see [11.3.2](#)), the location of the headquarters, etc., of a corporate body (see [11.3.3](#)), the place of origin of a work (see [6.5](#)), or a place associated with a person (see [9.8–9.11](#)), family (see [10.5](#)), or corporate body (see [11.3](#)), precede the name of the larger place by a comma.

EXAMPLE

Budapest, Hungary

Place name recorded as the location of the corporate body with the preferred name: Rumbach Utcai Zsinagóga

[16.2.2.5–16.2.2.8 Omitted; no change]

16.2.2.9 Places in Australia, Canada, Malaysia, the United States, the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia

Record the preferred name for a place in Australia, Canada, Malaysia, the United States, or a country that was a constituent republic of the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia, as instructed under [16.2.2.9.1](#) (states, provinces, territories, etc.) or [16.2.2.9.2](#) (places in a state, province, territory, etc.), as applicable.

16.2.2.9.1 States, Provinces, Territories, Etc.

Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the name of a state, province, territory, etc., of Australia, Canada,

Malaysia, the United States, or a country that was a constituent republic of the former U.S.S.R.⁷ or the former Yugoslavia.

EXAMPLE

Northern Territory
Prince Edward Island
Sarawak
Oregon
District of Columbia
Guam
Puerto Rico
Azerbaijan S.S.R.
Slovenia
Dakota Territory

16.2.2.9.2

Places in a State, Province, Territory, Etc.

If the place is in a state, province, territory, etc., of one of the countries listed under [16.2.2.9.1](#), record the name of the state, etc., in which it is located as part of the name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#). Abbreviate the name of the larger place as instructed in Appendix B ([B.2](#)), as applicable.

EXAMPLE

Darwin (N.T.)
Jasper (Alta.)
Calyoquot Land District (B.C.)
~~Ipoh (Perak)~~
~~Kota Kinabalu (Sabah)~~
Cook County (Ill.)
Alexandria (Va.)
Latah Soil and Water Conservation District (Idaho)
Washington (D.C.)
~~San Juan (P.R.)~~
Kiev (Ukraine)
Split (Croatia)

16.2.2.10 Places in the British Isles England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, or the Channel Islands

Record the preferred name for a place in the British Isles England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, or the Channel Islands as instructed under [16.2.2.10.1](#) (England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, and the Channel Islands) or [16.2.2.10.2](#) (other places), as applicable.

16.2.2.10.1 England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, and the Channel Islands

Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the names of the following parts of the British Isles: England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, the Channel Islands.

EXAMPLE

England

Ireland

Isle of Man

16.2.2.10.2 Other Places

If a place is located in England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, or the Channel Islands, record *England, Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, Isle of Man, or Channel Islands*, as appropriate, as part of the name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#).

EXAMPLE

Dorset (England)

~~Waterville (Ireland)~~

Bangor (Northern Ireland)

Dumfries and Galloway (Scotland)

Powys (Wales)

Ramsey (Isle of Man)

Jersey (Channel Islands)

16.2.2.11 Places in Overseas Territories and Insular Areas

Record the preferred name for a place in an overseas territory or insular area as instructed under [16.2.2.11.1](#) (overseas territories and insular areas) or [16.2.2.11.2](#) (places in an overseas territory or insular area), as applicable.

16.2.2.11.1

Overseas Territories and Insular Areas

Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the name of an overseas territory or insular area.

EXAMPLE

Guam

Puerto Rico

Guadeloupe

French Guiana

French Polynesia

16.2.2.11.2

Places in an Overseas Territory or Insular Area

If the place is in an overseas territory or insular area, record the name of the overseas territory or insular area in which it is located as part of the name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#). Abbreviate the name of the larger place as instructed in Appendix B ([B.2](#)), as applicable.

EXAMPLE

San Juan (P.R.)

Spanish Town (V.I.)

Papeete (French Polynesia)

16.2.2.11.12

Places in Other Jurisdictions

For places in jurisdictions not covered by [16.2.2.9](#) (places in Australia, Canada, Malaysia, ~~the~~ United States, ~~the former~~ U.S.S.R., or ~~the former~~ Yugoslavia), or [16.2.2.10](#) (places in ~~the British Isles~~ England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, and the Channel Islands), or [16.2.2.11](#) (Places in overseas territories and insular areas), record the name of the country in which the place is located as part of the name of the place. Abbreviate the name of the country as instructed in Appendix B ([B.2](#)), as applicable.

EXAMPLE

Formosa (Argentina)

Maputo (Mozambique)

Lucca (Italy)

Queenstown-Lakes District (N.Z.)

Madras (India)

Palawan (Philippines)

Region Sjælland (Denmark)
Paris (France)
Waterville (Ireland)
Spanish Town (V.I.)
Papeete (French Polynesia)
Far North Province (Cameroon)
Ipoh (Malaysia)
Kota Kinabalu (Malaysia)
Sarawak (Malaysia)

Optional Addition

Record the name of a state, province, or first-level administrative division preceding the name of the country.

EXAMPLE

Aba Zangzu Qiangzu Zizhizhou (Sichuan Sheng, China)

Guadalajara (Jalisco, Mexico)

Ipoh (Perak, Malaysia)

Lhasa (Tibet Autonomous Region, China)

Waterville (Kerry, Ireland)

Wiesbaden (Hesse, Germany)

16.2.2.1213 **Places with the Same Name**

If recording the name of the larger place or jurisdiction as part of the name as instructed in [16.2.2.9–16.2.2.1112](#) is insufficient to distinguish between two or more places with the same name, include as part of the name of the place a word or phrase commonly used to distinguish them.

[Examples omitted; no change]

If there is no such word or phrase, record the name of an appropriate smaller place before the name of the larger place.

[Add the following; other examples unchanged]

Qianxi Xian (Guizhou Sheng, China)

Qianxi Xian (Hebei Sheng, China)

16.2.2.1314 **Places within Cities, Etc.**

When recording the name of a place within a city, etc., record the name of the city, etc., and the larger place within which the city,

etc., is located, as prescribed in the instructions given under [16.2.2.9–16.2.2.12](#)~~13~~.

[Add the following: other examples unchanged]

Dongcheng Qu (Beijing, China)

Jiading Qu (Shanghai, China)

Seika-chō (Kyoto, Japan)

Clean copy

16.2.2.4 Recording the Preferred Name

Record the name of a place in the form most commonly found in gazetteers or other reference sources used in choosing the name, unless the instructions given under [16.2.2.8–16.2.2.14](#) indicate otherwise.

Record as part of the name of a place (other than a country or a state, etc., listed in [16.2.2.9.1](#), [16.2.2.10.1](#), or [16.2.2.11.1](#)) the name of the larger place in which it is located or the larger jurisdiction to which it belongs applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.9–16.2.2.14](#).

If the place name is being used as the conventional name for a government (see [11.2.2.5.4](#)), enclose the name of the larger place in parentheses.

EXAMPLE

Budapest (Hungary)

If the place name is being used to record the location of a conference, etc., (see [11.3.2](#)), the location of the headquarters, etc., of a corporate body (see [11.3.3](#)), the place of origin of a work (see [6.5](#)), or a place associated with a person (see [9.8–9.11](#)), family (see [10.5](#)), or corporate body (see [11.3](#)), precede the name of the larger place by a comma.

EXAMPLE

Budapest, Hungary

Place name recorded as the location of the corporate body with the preferred name: Rumbach Utcai Zsinagóga

[16.2.2.5–16.2.2.8 Omitted; no change]

16.2.2.9 Places in Australia, Canada, the United States, the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia

Record the preferred name for a place in Australia, Canada, the United States, or a country that was a constituent republic of the former U.S.S.R. or the former Yugoslavia, as instructed under [16.2.2.9.1](#) (states, provinces, territories, etc.) or [16.2.2.9.2](#) (places in a state, province, territory, etc.), as applicable.

16.2.2.9.1 States, Provinces, Territories, Etc.

Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the name of a state, province, territory, etc., of Australia, Canada, the United States, or a country that was a constituent republic of the former U.S.S.R. or the former Yugoslavia.

EXAMPLE

Northern Territory
Prince Edward Island
Oregon
District of Columbia
Azerbaijan S.S.R.
Slovenia
Dakota Territory

16.2.2.9.2 Places in a State, Province, Territory, Etc.

If the place is in a state, province, territory, etc., of one of the countries listed under [16.2.2.9.1](#), record the name of the state, etc., in which it is located as part of the name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#). Abbreviate the name of the larger place as instructed in Appendix B ([B.2](#)), as applicable.

EXAMPLE

Darwin (N.T.)
Jasper (Alta.)
Calyoquot Land District (B.C.)
Cook County (Ill.)
Alexandria (Va.)
Latah Soil and Water Conservation District (Idaho)
Washington (D.C.)
Kiev (Ukraine)
Split (Croatia)

16.2.2.10 Places in England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, or the Channel Islands

Record the preferred name for a place in England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, and the Channel Islands as instructed under [16.2.2.10.1](#) (England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, or the Channel Islands) or [16.2.2.10.2](#) (other places), as applicable.

16.2.2.10.1 England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, and the Channel Islands

Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the names of the following parts of the British Isles: England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, the Channel Islands.

EXAMPLE

England

Isle of Man

16.2.2.10.2 Other Places

If a place is located in England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, or the Channel Islands, record *England*, *Northern Ireland*, *Scotland*, *Wales*, *Isle of Man*, or *Channel Islands*, as appropriate, as part of the name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#).

EXAMPLE

Dorset (England)

Bangor (Northern Ireland)

Dumfries and Galloway (Scotland)

Powys (Wales)

Ramsey (Isle of Man)

Jersey (Channel Islands)

16.2.2.11 Places in Overseas Territories and Insular Areas

Record the preferred name for a place in an overseas territory or insular area as instructed under [16.2.2.11.1](#) (overseas territories and insular areas) or [16.2.2.11.2](#) (places in an overseas territory or insular area), as applicable.

16.2.2.11.1 Overseas Territories and Insular Areas

Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the name of an overseas territory or insular area.

EXAMPLE

Guam

Puerto Rico

Guadeloupe

French Guiana

French Polynesia

16.2.2.11.2 Places in an Overseas Territory or Insular Area

If the place is in an overseas territory or insular area, record the name of the overseas territory or insular area in which it is located as part of the name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#). Abbreviate the name of the larger place as instructed in Appendix B ([B.2](#)), as applicable.

EXAMPLE

San Juan (P.R.)

Spanish Town (V.I.)

Papeete (French Polynesia)

16.2.2.12 Places in Other Jurisdictions

For places in jurisdictions not covered by [16.2.2.9](#) (places in Australia, Canada, the United States, the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia), [16.2.2.10](#) (places in England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, and the Channel Islands), or [16.2.2.11](#) (Places in overseas territories and insular areas), record the name of the country in which the place is located as part of the name of the place. Abbreviate the name of the country as instructed in Appendix B ([B.2](#)), as applicable.

EXAMPLE

Formosa (Argentina)

Maputo (Mozambique)

Lucca (Italy)

Queenstown-Lakes District (N.Z.)

Madras (India)

Palawan (Philippines)

Region Sjælland (Denmark)

Paris (France)

Waterville (Ireland)

Far North Province (Cameroon)

Ipoh (Malaysia)
Kota Kinabalu (Malaysia)
Sarawak (Malaysia)

Optional Addition

Record the name of a state, province, or first-level administrative division preceding the name of the country.

EXAMPLE

Aba Zangzu Qiangzu Zizhizhou (Sichuan Sheng, China)
Guadalajara (Jalisco, Mexico)
Ipoh (Perak, Malaysia)
Lhasa (Tibet Autonomous Region, China)
Waterville (Kerry, Ireland)
Wiesbaden (Hesse, Germany)

16.2.2.13 Places with the Same Name

If recording the name of the larger place or jurisdiction as part of the name as instructed in [16.2.2.9–16.2.2.12](#) is insufficient to distinguish between two or more places with the same name, include as part of the name of the place a word or phrase commonly used to distinguish them.

[Examples omitted; no change]

If there is no such word or phrase, record the name of an appropriate smaller place before the name of the larger place.

[Add the following; other examples unchanged]

Qianxi Xian (Guizhou Sheng, China)
Qianxi Xian (Hebei Sheng, China)

16.2.2.14 Places within Cities, Etc.

When recording the name of a place within a city, etc., record the name of the city, etc., and the larger place within which the city, etc., is located, as prescribed in the instructions given under [16.2.2.9–16.2.2.13](#).

[Add the following: other examples unchanged]

Dongcheng Qu (Beijing, China)
Jiading Qu (Shanghai, China)
Seika-chō (Kyoto, Japan)

Candidates for additional examples for Optional Addition at RDA 16.2.2.12

China:

Dongsheng Shi (Inner Mongolia, China)
Dongxiangzu Zizhixian (Gansu Sheng, China)
Hangzhou Shi (Zhejiang Sheng, China)
Hohhot (Inner Mongolia, China)
Huangshan Shi (Anhui Sheng, China)
New Territories (Hong Kong, China)
Wutang Zhen (Fujian Sheng, China)

Japan:

Inawashiro-machi (Fukushima-ken, Japan)
Nasu-mura (Tochigi-ken, Japan)
Obama-shi (Fukui-ken, Japan)
Toyota-shi (Aichi-ken, Japan)

Mexico:

Ciudad Juárez (Chihuahua, Mexico)
Cozumel (Quintana Roo, Mexico)
Matamoros (Tamaulipas, Mexico)
Monterrey (Nuevo León, Mexico)
San Cristobal de la Casas (Chiapas, Mexico)