

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Barbara Tillett, LC Representative
Subject: Proposed Revision of RDA 16.2.2.2 (Preferred Name for the Place)

LC thanks ALA for undertaking the difficult task of resolving some long-standing problems with geographic names from AACR2 Chapter 23 that were carried over into RDA Chapter 16. LC agrees to some of the changes, but offers alternative wording for others that would satisfy the intent of the ALA proposal in what we feel is a more consistent manner. Because of the length and complexity of ALA's proposal, we give our responses at each area, retaining the numbering and headings from their "Background and Recommendations" section.

1. Places in certain federations (RDA 16.2.2.9)

LC agrees to the removal of Malaysia from this instruction, and the addition of the word "former" in front of Yugoslavia and the U.S.S.R. LC does not agree with the proposed removal of Guam and Puerto Rico from the examples in this instruction. The U.S. government¹ considers them part of the United States, so catalogers would logically look in 16.2.2.9 for instructions about these places. We have also suggested some changes in the ALA proposal at 16.2.2.11.1 to cover this situation (see 3. below).

2. Places in the Republic of Ireland (16.2.2.10)

LC agrees to the deletion of the phrase "British Isles" and the removal of the Republic of Ireland from this area of instructions. We believe that the Isle of Man and the Channel Islands should be removed for similar reasons and covered elsewhere (their relationship to the United Kingdom is different from that of the U.S. and its territories). The proposed caption for 16.2.2.10 needs to have the words "Places in" removed to avoid a circular treatment with 16.2.2.10.1 (i.e., England is not a place in England, but England itself). We have proposed some simplifications/collapsing of 16.2.2.10 and its sub-instructions to solve this problem.

3. Overseas territories and insular areas

We agree with the idea of an RDA instruction on overseas territories, but we suggest some revisions to avoid relying on the problematic term "insular area" (as used by the U.S. Office of Insular Affairs, it has a particular meaning in the U.S. context and is not a "generic" term; we have concerns that using the term would introduce an unnecessary level of legal complexity).

¹ U.S. Office of Insular Affairs, cited in ALA's proposal, describes Guam and Puerto Rico as U.S. **territories** on its website: territory: An unincorporated United States insular area, of which there are currently thirteen, three in the Caribbean (Navassa Island, Puerto Rico and the United States Virgin Islands) and ten in the Pacific (American Samoa, Baker Island, Guam, Howland Island, Jarvis Island, Johnston Atoll, Kingman Reef, Midway Atoll, the Northern Mariana Islands and Wake Atoll).

We offer alternative wording in our response to 1) add mention of the phrase “insular areas,” in the examples at 16.2.2.9, 2) internationalize language in the proposed 16.2.2.11, and 3) include a glossary definition of this term.

4. Qualifiers for Places in China

We are sympathetic to the problem of differentiating Chinese (and other) geographic names. 16.2.2.12 *Places with the Same Name* instructs that the name of a smaller place may be added before the name of the larger place in the parenthetical qualifier to distinguish two places in the same county, state, etc. with the same name. This parenthetical qualifier is considered part of the preferred name, not an addition to the name. 16.2.2.12 does not restrict this “conflict” to the context of any given authority file or any authorized access points already established. Thus LC and PCC have a longstanding practice of searching sources such as GEOnet and GNIS to determine if such an addition should be given (i.e., we predict conflict based on reference sources rather than determining if there is a conflict in the NAF). In addition to adding a smaller place before the larger place in the qualifier, a type of jurisdiction is sometimes added per 11.13.1.6 *Type of Jurisdiction*. The ALA proposal did not address 11.13.1.6, and we wonder about the effect of the optional addition on 11.13.1.6. For example, could the authorized access point for the city of Venice be “Venice (Italy)” and the authorized access point for the province of Venice be “Venice (Veneto, Italy : Province)” if the optional addition were applied to the province and not the city? Or would a cataloger think that 11.13.1.6 was not needed if the optional addition were applied only to the province resulting in the authorized access point “Venice (Veneto, Italy)” for the province and “Venice (Italy)” for the city? We would not want this to happen as the city of Venice, being within the province of Venice, is also within the region of Veneto.

Although we think the provisions of RDA already provide techniques for distinguishing places with the same name, with some reservations, LC is agreeable to the proposed optional addition. We are concerned about the potential confusion for users if the optional addition is not applied to all places within the same country, and believe it would be very difficult to provide such consistency for both legacy data and new records, given the resources that would be necessary to address the existing records. Any implementation of this optional addition would be a multiyear LC/NACO project done one country at a time and only if the implementation could be at least partially automated and responsibility shared with other contributors. In short, we can agree to the optional addition, but cannot say at this point that we would apply it.

We do not see the need to have three examples for a place within Malaysia in the proposed revision to 16.2.2.11 *Places in Other Jurisdictions*, so we suggest retaining Sarawak (Malaysia) and removing the other two. In addition, there are two places in Ireland with the name Waterville (one in Kerry and one in Limerick) so that is not an appropriate example. Likewise, two of the examples for the proposed Optional Addition are not appropriate because the smaller place would be added per the current instruction 16.2.2.12 *Places with the Same Name*—it is not an *optional* addition. Therefore, we have suggested an Irish replacement for Waterville in both example boxes, and we suggest removing Guadalajara (Jalisco, Mexico) from the optional addition examples.

We have no objection to the two examples proposed by ALA for *Places with the Same Name*, currently 16.2.2.12 (16.2.2.13 if the proposal is approved). Regarding the three additional examples proposed for *Places within Cities, Etc.*, currently 16.2.2.13 (16.2.2.14 if the LC revision is approved), we think the addition of one example for China is sufficient, and the proposed example for Seika-chô (Kyoto, Japan) is not needed because there is an existing example for Japan already—Minato-ku (Tokyo, Japan).

5. Abbreviation of Virgin Islands

We agree to ALA's question about removing the abbreviation for the Virgin Island in Appendix B and look forward to their Fast Track proposal. We also recommend that all examples qualified by "V.I." in RDA be referred to the Examples Group for correction. We will delete our LCPS for B.11.

Regarding the much larger question of using abbreviations in B.11, we are not opposed to seeing such a proposal, but we would want to see extensive discussion of the impact on RDA instructions and the LC/NACO authority files.

6. Name of larger place as part of the preferred name

We suggest to ALA that any future proposal they do in this area would need to have instructions for Chapter 37 and Appendix L, as we believe that is where the relationships between places would be addressed in RDA.

Proposed Revisions:

16.2.2.9 **Places in Australia, Canada, ~~Malaysia~~, the United States, the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia**

Record the preferred name for a place in Australia, Canada, ~~Malaysia~~, the United States, or a country that was a constituent republic of the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia, as instructed under [16.2.2.9.1](#) (states, provinces, territories, etc.) or [16.2.2.9.2](#) (places in a state, province, territory, etc.), as applicable.

16.2.2.9.1 **States, Provinces, Territories, Etc.**

Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the preferred name of a state, province, territory, etc., of Australia, Canada, ~~Malaysia~~, the United States, or a country that was a constituent republic of the former U.S.S.R. or the former Yugoslavia.

EXAMPLE

Northern Territory
Prince Edward Island
Sarawak
Oregon
District of Columbia
Guam
Insular area of the United States
Puerto Rico
Insular area of the United States
Azerbaijan S.S.R.
Slovenia
Dakota Territory

16.2.2.9.2

Places in a State, Province, Territory, Etc.

If the place is in a state, province, territory, etc., of one of the countries listed under [16.2.2.9.1](#), record the name of the state, etc., in which it is located as part of the preferred name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#). Abbreviate the name of the larger place as instructed in Appendix B ([B.2](#)), as applicable.

EXAMPLE

Darwin (N.T.)
Jasper (Alta.)
Calyoquot Land District (B.C.)
Ipoh (Perak)
Kota-Kinabalu (Sabah)
Cook County (Ill.)
Alexandria (Va.)
Latah Soil and Water Conservation District (Idaho)
Washington (D.C.)
San Juan (P.R.)
Kiev (Ukraine)
Split (Croatia)

16.2.2.10

Places in the British Isles England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, and Wales

~~Record the preferred name for a place in the British Isles England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, or the Channel~~

Islands as instructed under [16.2.2.10.1](#) (England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, and the Channel Islands) or [16.2.2.10.2](#) (other places), as applicable.

Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction (e.g., United Kingdom or Great Britain) as part of the preferred names of England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, and Wales.

EXAMPLE

England

Northern Ireland

Record the preferred name for a place in England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, or Wales applying the instructions under [16.2.2.10.1](#), as applicable.

16.2.2.10.1

Places in England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, and Wales, the Isle of Man, and the Channel Islands

~~Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the names of the following parts of the British Isles: England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, the Channel Islands.~~

EXAMPLE

England

Ireland

Isle of Man

16.2.2.10.2 **Other Places**

If a place is located in England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, or Wales, the Isle of Man, or the Channel Islands, record *England, Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, or Wales, Isle of Man, or Channel Islands*, as appropriate, as part of the preferred name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#).

EXAMPLE

Dorset (England)

Waterville (Ireland)

Bangor (Northern Ireland)

Dumfries and Galloway (Scotland)

Powys (Wales)

Ramsey (Isle of Man)

Jersey (Channel Islands)

16.2.2.11

Overseas Territories, Dependencies, Etc.

Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the preferred name of an overseas territory, dependency, etc.

EXAMPLE

Greenland

Isle of Man

Guadeloupe

For an overseas territory of the United States (e.g., Guam, Puerto Rico), see [16.2.2.9.1](#).

For jurisdictional islands, etc., that are not overseas territories, dependencies, etc. (e.g., Sicily, Corsica, Japan) see [16.2.2.4](#) or [16.2.2.12](#), as applicable.

Record the preferred name for a place in an overseas territory, dependency, etc. as instructed under [16.2.2.11.1](#), as applicable.

16.2.2.11.1

Places in Overseas Territories, Dependencies, Etc.

If the place is in an overseas territory, dependency, etc., record the name of the overseas territory, dependency, etc. in which it is located as part of the preferred name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#)

EXAMPLE

Papeete (French Polynesia)

Ramsey (Isle of Man)

Saint-Denis (Rèunion)

16.2.2.11.2

Places in Other Jurisdictions

For places in jurisdictions not covered by [16.2.2.9](#) (places in Australia, Canada, ~~Malaysia~~, the United States, the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia), or [16.2.2.10.1](#) (places in the ~~British Isles~~ England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, and Wales), or [16.2.2.11.1](#) (places in overseas territories, dependencies, etc.), record the name of the country in which the place is located as part of the preferred name of the place. Abbreviate the name of the country as instructed in Appendix B ([B.2](#)), as applicable.

EXAMPLE

Formosa (Argentina)

Maputo (Mozambique)

Lucca (Italy)

Queenstown-Lakes District (N.Z.)

Madras (India)

Palawan (Philippines)

Region Sjælland (Denmark)

Paris (France)

Urlingford (Ireland)

Spanish Town (V.I.)

Papeete (French Polynesia)

Far North Province (Cameroon)

Sarawak (Malaysia)

Optional Addition

Record the name of a state, province, or first-level administrative division preceding the name of the country.

EXAMPLE

Aba Zangzu Qiangzu Zizhizhou (Sichuan Sheng, China)

Ipoh (Perak, Malaysia)

Lhasa (Tibet Autonomous Region, China)

Urlingford (Kilkenny, Ireland)

Wiesbaden (Hesse, Germany)

16.2.2.1213 **Places with the Same Name**

If recording the name of the larger place or jurisdiction as part of the preferred name as instructed in [16.2.2.9-16.2.2.1112](#) is insufficient to distinguish between two or more places with the same name, include as part of the preferred name of the place a word or phrase commonly used to distinguish them.

[Examples omitted; no change]

If there is no such word or phrase, record the name of an appropriate smaller place before the name of the larger place.

[Add the following; other examples unchanged]

Qianxi Xian (Guizhou Sheng, China)

Qianxi Xian (Hebei Sheng, China)

16.2.2.1314 **Places within Cities, Etc.**

When recording the preferred name of a place within a city, etc., record the name of the city, etc., and the larger place within which

the city, etc., is located, as prescribed in the instructions given under [16.2.2.9–16.2.2.1213](#).

[Add the following: other examples unchanged]

Dongcheng Qu (Beijing, China)

Glossary

Insular Area: A jurisdiction of the United States that is neither one of the 50 states nor the District of Columbia.

Clean Copy:

16.2.2.9 Places in Australia, Canada, the United States, the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia

Record the preferred name for a place in Australia, Canada, the United States, or a country that was a constituent republic of the former U.S.S.R. or the former Yugoslavia, as instructed under [16.2.2.9.1](#) (states, provinces, territories, etc.) or [16.2.2.9.2](#) (places in a state, province, territory, etc.), as applicable.

16.2.2.9.1 States, Provinces, Territories, Etc.

Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the preferred name of a state, province, territory, etc., of Australia, Canada, the United States, or a country that was a constituent republic of the former U.S.S.R. or the former Yugoslavia.

EXAMPLE

Northern Territory

Prince Edward Island

Oregon

District of Columbia

Guam

Insular area of the United States

Puerto Rico

Insular area of the United States

Azerbaijan S.S.R.

Slovenia

Dakota Territory

16.2.2.9.2 Places in a State, Province, Territory, Etc.

If the place is in a state, province, territory, etc., of one of the countries listed under [16.2.2.9.1](#), record the name of the state, etc., in which it is located as part of the preferred name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#). Abbreviate the name of the larger place as instructed in Appendix B ([B.2](#)), as applicable.

EXAMPLE

Darwin (N.T.)

Jasper (Alta.)

Calyoquot Land District (B.C.)

Cook County (Ill.)

Alexandria (Va.)

Latah Soil and Water Conservation District (Idaho)

Washington (D.C.)

San Juan (P.R.)

Kiev (Ukraine)

Split (Croatia)

16.2.2.10 England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, and Wales

Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction (e.g., United Kingdom or Great Britain) as part of the preferred names of England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, and Wales.

EXAMPLE

England

Northern Ireland

Record the preferred name for a place in England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, or Wales applying the instructions under [16.2.2.10.1](#), as applicable.

16.2.2.10.1 Places in England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, and Wales

If a place is located in England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, or Wales, record *England*, *Northern Ireland*, *Scotland*, or *Wales*, as appropriate, as part of the preferred name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#).

EXAMPLE

Dorset (England)

Bangor (Northern Ireland)

Dumfries and Galloway (Scotland)

Powys (Wales)

16.2.2.11 Overseas Territories, Dependencies, Etc.

Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the preferred name of an overseas territory, dependency, etc.

EXAMPLE

Greenland

Isle of Man

Guadeloupe

For an overseas territory of the United States (e.g., Guam, Puerto Rico), see 16.2.2.9.1.

For jurisdictional islands, etc., that are not overseas territories, dependencies, etc. (e.g., Sicily, Corsica, Japan) see 16.2.2.4 or 16.2.2.12, as applicable.

Record the preferred name for a place in an overseas territory, dependency, etc. as instructed under [16.2.2.11.1](#), as applicable.

16.2.2.11.1 Places in Overseas Territories, Dependencies, Etc.

If the place is in an overseas territory, dependency, etc., record the name of the overseas territory, dependency, etc. in which it is located as part of the preferred name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#)

EXAMPLE

Papeete (French Polynesia)

Ramsey (Isle of Man)

Saint-Denis (Rèunion)

16.2.2.12 Places in Other Jurisdictions

For places in jurisdictions not covered by [16.2.2.9](#) (places in Australia, Canada, the United States, the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia), [16.2.2.10.1](#) (places in England, Northern Ireland, Scotland, and Wales), or [16.2.2.11.1](#) (places in overseas territories, dependencies, etc.), record the name of the country in which the place is located as part of the preferred name of the place. Abbreviate the name of the country as instructed in Appendix B ([B.2](#)), as applicable.

EXAMPLE

Formosa (Argentina)

Maputo (Mozambique)

Lucca (Italy)

Queenstown-Lakes District (N.Z.)

Madras (India)

Palawan (Philippines)

Region Sjælland (Denmark)

Paris (France)

Urlingford (Ireland)

Far North Province (Cameroon)

Sarawak (Malaysia)

Optional Addition

Record the name of a state, province, or first-level administrative division preceding the name of the country.

EXAMPLE

Aba Zangzu Qiangzu Zizhizhou (Sichuan Sheng, China)

Ipoh (Perak, Malaysia)

Lhasa (Tibet Autonomous Region, China)

Urlingford (Kilkenny, Ireland)

Wiesbaden (Hesse, Germany)

16.2.2.13

Places with the Same Name

If recording the name of the larger place or jurisdiction as part of the preferred name as instructed in [16.2.2.9–16.2.2.12](#) is insufficient to distinguish between two or more places with the same name, include as part of the preferred name of the place a word or phrase commonly used to distinguish them.

[Examples omitted; no change]

If there is no such word or phrase, record the name of an appropriate smaller place before the name of the larger place.

[Add the following; other examples unchanged]

Qianxi Xian (Guizhou Sheng, China)

Qianxi Xian (Hebei Sheng, China)

16.2.2.14

Places within Cities, Etc.

When recording the preferred name of a place within a city, etc., record the name of the city, etc., and the larger place within which the city, etc., is located, as prescribed in the instructions given under [16.2.2.9–16.2.2.13](#).

[Add the following: other examples unchanged]

Dongcheng Qu (Beijing, China)

Glossary

Insular Area: A jurisdiction of the United States that is neither one of the 50 states nor the District of Columbia.