

**To:** Joint Steering Committee for Revision of AACR  
**From:** Nathalie Schulz, Secretary, JSC  
**Subject:** Discrepancies identified in Delsey part I report

## **Introduction**

At the October 2001 JSC meeting the Secretary was asked to prepare a list of discrepancies in the rules that could be easily rectified as identified in “The logical structure of the Anglo-American Cataloguing Rules – Part I” by Tom Delsey (4JSC/M/446.2).

The methodology used was to examine all “notes” and “queries” in the report and document these in two categories: inconsistencies; and, other notes and queries. Comments were added relating to revisions to the rules since the report was produced.

In January 2005, the Editor of AACR3 added comments relating to the December 2004 draft of AACR3 part I (5JSC/AACR3/I). Comments from the 2002 version of the document have been updated or removed.

## **Discrepancies in the rules as identified in “The logical structure of the Anglo-American Cataloguing Rules – Part I”**

### Section A - Inconsistencies

**Entity/Object:** Class of materials

**Data Element:** General material designation

**Reference:** Tab 4, page 3

**Note:** The terms listed as general material designations in list 2 overlap with the specific material designations listed in rules 3.5B1, 8.5B1 and 10.5B1.

#### **Comments:**

- In the Amendments 2001 revision of 1.1C1 list 2, “globe” and “map” were replaced by “cartographic material”.
- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), all overlaps between the list of general material designations (A1.1C1) and specific material designations for physical units (A1.5B1 – Table 1) and designations for components (A1.5B2 – Table 2) were eliminated.

**Entity/Object:** Chief source of information

**Data Element:** Source of title proper

**Reference:** Tab 6, page 3

**Note:** Rule 2.7B3 has been revised to instruct the cataloguer to note the source for the title proper if it is a title page substitute.

**Query:** Should rule .7B3 be revised in other chapters to indicate that a note on the source for the title proper should be made in all cases where the source is one other than the source designated as

the first in order of preference as the chief source of information for the class of materials to which the item belongs.

**Comments:**

- The Amendments 2002 revision of 12.7B3 included instructions for printed and nonprint resources.
- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the rule has been generalized (A1.7B4) to indicate that a note on the source for the title proper should be made if it is a source other than the chief source of information.

**Entity/Object:** Document

**Data Element:** Version statement

**Reference:** Tab 7, page 16

**Data Element:** Statement of responsibility relating to the version

**Reference:** Tab 7, page 18

**Note:** 1. There is no reference from rule 3.2A to rule 4.2B to parallel the references from rules 5.2A2 and 8.2A2.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), a preliminary rule for the edition area incorporating rule 4.2A1 has been added as a general rule (A1.2A1), giving instructions on the application of the rules for the edition area to resources in an unpublished form regardless of the type of content or medium.

**Entity/Object:** Document

**Data Element:** Version statement

**Reference:** Tab 7, page 16

**Note:** 2. There are no specific instructions for recording a version statement for non-processed sound recordings, unedited or unpublished film or videorecordings, stock shots, unpublished computer files, unpublished artefacts, or unpublished microforms.

**Comments:**

- In the Amendments 2001, rule 9.4B2 was added: "Consider all remote access electronic resources to be published."
- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), a preliminary rule for the edition area incorporating rule 4.2A1 has been added as a general rule (A1.2A1), giving instructions on the application of the rules for the edition area to resources in an unpublished form regardless of the type of content or medium.

**Entity/Object:** Document

**Data Element:** Statement of responsibility relating to the version

**Reference:** Tab 7, page 18

**Note:** 2. There are no specific instructions for recording a statement of responsibility relating to the version for non-processed sound recordings, unedited or unpublished film or videorecordings, stock shots, unpublished computer files, unpublished artefacts, or unpublished microforms.

**Comments:**

- In the Amendments 2001, rule 9.4B2 was added: "Consider all remote access electronic resources to be published."
- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), a preliminary rule for the edition area incorporating rule 4.2A1 has been added as a general rule (A1.2A1), giving instructions on the application of the

rules for the edition area to resources in an unpublished form regardless of the type of content or medium.

**Entity/Object:** Document

**Data Element:** Edition statement

**Reference:** Tab 7, page 22

**Note:** There are inconsistencies from one class of materials to another with respect to the sources outside the chief source of information that are included as prescribed sources for the edition statement.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the general rule on sources of information for the edition area (A1.2A2) designates the chief source of information as the prescribed source for that area, regardless of the type of content or medium.

**Entity/Object:** Document

**Data Element:** Place of publication, distribution, etc.

**Reference:** Tab 7, page 29

**Note:** There are inconsistencies from one class of materials to another with respect to the sources outside the chief source of information that are included as prescribed sources for the publication, distribution, etc. area.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the general rule on sources of information for the publication, distribution, etc., area (A1.4A1) designates the chief source of information and other preliminaries as the prescribed sources for that area, regardless of the type of content or medium. The Glossary definition of “preliminaries” has been revised to apply to all types of content and media.

**Entity/Object:** Document

**Data Element:** Numeric and/or alphabetic designation

**Reference:** Tab 7, page 49

**Data Element:** Chronological designation

**Reference:** Tab 7, page 50

**Entity/Object:** Document part

**Data Element:** Numeric and/or alphabetic designation relating to document part

**Reference:** Tab 8, page 44

**Data Element:** Chronological designation relating to document part

**Reference:** Tab 8, page 45

**Note:** For nonprint serials rule 12.0B2 references subrule .0B in the relevant chapter for the class of materials to which the serial belongs for instructions on prescribed sources of information, but subrule .0B in chapters 3 through 10 contains no instructions that are relevant to the numeric and/or alphabetic, chronological, or other designation area.

**Comments:**

- In the Amendments 2002 revision of 12.0B the name of the area changed from “numeric and/or alphabetic, chronological, or other designation” to “numbering”.

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the rule on sources of information for the numbering area (A1.3A2) has been generalized to apply to all multipart resources with numbered issues or parts, regardless of the type of content or medium.

**Relationship Type:** Supplement (Item ↔ Item)

**Data Element:** Note on supplement

**Reference:** Tab 27, page 7

**Note:** The term “supplement” is omitted from the caption for rule .7B11 in subsequent chapters, and there are no explicit instructions or examples relating to supplements under that rule in subsequent chapters.

**Comments:**

- Rules 2.7B11 and 9.7B11 were revised as part of Amendments 2001, the caption was not changed.
- With the 2002 revision 12.7B11 was renumbered to 12.7B13, the caption was not changed.
- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the term “supplement” has been omitted from the caption for the both the general rule (A1.7B14) and the supplementary rule in the chapter on digital resources (C7.7B14). The text of the general rule makes reference to “minor supplements”.

**Relationship Type:** Published index/calendar (Item ↔ Item)

**Data Element:** Note on published index/calendar

**Reference:** Tab 27, page 15

**Note:** There are no references to rule 1.7B15 in any of the subsequent chapters other than chapter 4.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the rule on references to published descriptions has been made a general rule (A1.7B23). A new general rule has also been added for notes on indexes and finding aids (A1.7B22).

**Relationship Type:** Adaptation (Content ↔ Content)

**Data Element:** Note on original

**Reference:** Tab 32, page 5

**Note:** Examples of “based on ...” notes are shown variously under rules for note on statements of responsibility and rules for note on edition and history.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the two “based on” examples in 1.7B6 have been moved to the general rule for notes on edition and history (A1.7B9), and the one example in 6.7B6 has been deleted from the supplementary rule on statements of responsibility for sound (B6.7B8).

## Section B – Other Notes and Queries

**Entity/Object:** Item

**Reference:** Tab 1, page 1

**Definition:** “A document or set of documents in any physical form, published, issued, or treated as an entity, and as such forming the basis for a single bibliographic description.”—glossary

**Note:** Item is defined relative to the cataloguer’s decision in choosing an entity as the object of description. The item may equate to any one of a number of candidate entities: DOCUMENT, DOCUMENT PART, COPY, CONTENT PART, or COLLECTION.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the term “resource” has replaced the AACR2 “item” in all references to the entity that is the centre of focus for the description.

**Entity/Object:** Series

**Reference:** Tab 2, page 1

**Note:** The rules for analysis include instructions for recording the title of a multipart item in the series area when the record is for a separately catalogued part of the item or when a multipart item is described in a multilevel description.

**Entity/Object:** Type of Publication

**Attribute:** Type of publication designation

**Reference:** Tab 5, page 2

**Note:** There are no data elements defined for the type of publication designation. The type of publication is inferred from the presence or absence of data elements such as numbering and frequency.

**Entity/Object:** Document

**Data Element:** Title proper

**Reference:** Tab 7, page 5

**Note:** Specific rules normally relate to the content of the document (type of work, etc.) as opposed to the physical form of the document. As a result the specific rule may apply to more than one class of materials (e.g., the specific rule for inclusion of type of composition, etc. in titles for musical works and the specific rule for devising a title for a musical work apply both to music and to sound recordings containing music). By extension the specific rule for devising a title for a cartographic work would apply not only to cartographic documents as a class of materials but also to computer files, graphic documents, three dimensional objects, and microforms presenting cartographic information. Similarly the specific rules for devising title for manuscript texts would apply not only to such texts in manuscript or typescript but also to those recorded as computer files.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), supplementary rules pertaining to the title proper have been aligned with the type of content to which they apply (B1.1B1, B1.1B11, B2.1B11, B3.1B1, B3.1B11, B4.1B11, B6.1B1, B6.1B11, B7.1B11) or with the type of medium (C7.1B1).

**Entity/Object:** Document

**Data Element:** Parallel title

**Reference:** Tab 7, page 6

**Note:** 1. The specific rule for parallel titles of musical works applies both to music and to sound recordings containing music. By extension it would also apply to videorecordings, computer files and microforms containing music.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the supplementary rule on parallel titles for musical works has been aligned with the type of content and placed in the chapter on music (B2.1D1), with a reference from the corresponding rule in the chapter on sound (B6.1D1).

**Note:** 2. The specific rule for serials with both a common title and a section title would by extension also apply to monographs with both a common title and a section or part title.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), rules 12.1B4, 12.1B5, and 12.1B6 have been incorporated into a general rule for titles with two or more parts (A1.1B8).

**Entity/Object:** Document

**Data Element:** Statement of responsibility

**Reference:** Tab 7, page 12

**Note:** 1. Several of the specific rules relate to the nature of the participation of the person(s) or body (bodies) in the creation/production of the content of the document, not to the physical form of the document. As a result the specific rule may by extension apply to more than one class of materials (e.g., the specific rules relating to performers of music on sound recordings would also apply to performances of music in motion pictures and videorecordings).

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), supplementary rules on statements of responsibility have been aligned with the type of content to which they apply (B5.1F1, B6.1F1, B7.1F1).

**Note:** 2. The specific rule for serials with both a common title and a section or supplement title would by extension also apply to monographs with both a common title and a section or part title.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), rule 12.1F4 has been made a general rule (A1.1F7).

**Entity/Object:** Document

**Data Element:** Place of publication, distribution, etc.

**Reference:** Tab 7, page 30

**Data Element:** Name of publisher, distributor, etc.

**Reference:** Tab 7, page 33

**Data Element:** Date of publication, distribution, etc.

**Reference:** Tab 7, page 36

**Note:** A number of the specific rules for recording publication information relate to conventions associated with early printing practice, not with the specific physical form or content of the document. As a result the specific rule may apply to more than one class of material.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the special provisions in rules 2.16D and 2.16H have been incorporated into general rules (A1.4D1 and A1.4G1) as options pertaining to early printed resources. Other special provisions from rule 2.16 have been deleted.

**Entity/Object:** Document

**Data Element:** Other number

**Reference:** Tab 7, page 45

**Query:** Is the plate number for music unique to the published document *per se* or is it associated with a printing master that could be used to produce more than one document?

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), rule 5.7B19 has been aligned with the type of content to which it applies (B2.7B24).

**Entity/Object:** Document

**Data Element:** Other number for document part

**Reference:** Tab 8, page 40

**Query:** Is this a valid interpretation of restriction implied by the term “numbers borne by the item,” (2.7B19, etc.) or does the prescribed source of information for the note area (i.e., any source) take precedence?

**Comments:**

- In the 2002 revision of rule 2.7B19, etc., the phrase “borne by” was replaced by “associated with”.

**Entity/Object:** Content

**Data Element:** Statement of scale

**Reference:** Tab 9, page 20

**Data Element:** Statement of projection

**Reference:** Tab 9, page 22

**Data Element:** Statement of coordinates

**Reference:** Tab 9, page 24

**Data Element:** Statement of equinox

**Reference:** Tab 9, page 26

**Note:** There is no specific rule for recording mathematical data for graphic material, a computer file, or a three-dimensional artefact containing cartographic content.

**Comments:**

- In the Amendments 2004, area 3 was removed from chapter 9.
- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the rules for the mathematical data area have been aligned with the type of content to which they apply (B3.3).

**Entity/Object:** Content

**Data Element:** Form of composition designation

**Reference:** Tab 9, page 30

**Note:** There is no specific rule for recording form of composition for musical content in a computer file or microfilm.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), examples from rules 5.7B1 and 6.7B1 illustrating form of composition have been incorporated into the general rule for notes on nature, scope or form (A1.7B1).

**Entity/Object:** Content

**Data Element:** Medium of performance designation

**Reference:** Tab 9, page 32

**Note:** There is no specific rule for recording form of composition for musical content in a computer file or microfilm.

**Comments:**

- Should this read: “There is no specific rule for recording a medium of performance designation in a computer file or microfilm.”?

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), rule 5.7B1 has been aligned with the type of content to which it applies and placed in the chapter on music (B2.7B1), with a reference from the corresponding rule in the chapter on sound (B6.7B1).

**Entity/Object:** Content

**Data Element:** Musical presentation statement

**Reference:** Tab 9, page 34

**Note:** There is no specific rule for recording a musical presentation statement for musical content in a computer file.

**Comments:**

- In the Amendments 2004, area 3 was removed from chapter 9.
- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the rules on the musical presentation statement have been aligned with the type of content to which they apply (B2.3).

**Entity/Object:** Content

**Data Element:** Cinemagraphic form designation

**Reference:** Tab 9, page 41

**Note:** There is no specific rule for recording the form of cinemagraphic content in a computer file.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), an example from rule 7.7B1 illustrating form of cinemagraphic content has been incorporated in the general rule for notes on nature, scope or form (A1.7B1).

**Entity/Object:** Content

**Data Element:** Artistic form designation

**Reference:** Tab 9, page 45

**Note:** There is no specific rule for recording artistic form for graphic content in a computer file.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), an example from rule 8.7B1 illustrating form of graphic content has been incorporated in the general rule for notes on nature, scope or form (A1.7B1).

**Entity/Object:** Physical carrier

**Data Element:** Form of carrier designation

**Reference:** Tab 12, page 4

**Note:** Not all terms listed in .5B1 pertain to the form of physical carrier. Terms such as “map” in rule 3.5B1, “score,” etc in rule 5.5B1, “art original,” etc. in rule 8.5B1, and “art reproduction,” etc. in rule 10.5B1 pertain to an intellectual or artistic unit or form ...

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the list of terms used as specific material designations (A1.5B1 – Table 1) includes only those that pertain to the physical unit. Terms pertaining to an intellectual or artistic unit or form have been included in the list of terms used to designate components (A1.5B2 – Table 2).

**Entity/Object:** Production

**Reference:** Tab 16, page 1



**Query:** Is the concept inherent in the term “holograph” an attribute of PRODUCTION?

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the instructions from rule 4.7B1 pertaining to notes on holographs, etc., have been aligned with the type of medium to which they apply and placed in the chapter on print and graphic media (C1.7B1.1). A new rule has been added at C1.5C4.1 aligning the more general term “manuscript” with production method.

**Entity/Object:** Production

**Data Element:** Place of production

**Reference:** Tab 16, page 3

**Query:** Can we infer that place of production could also be noted for other types of documents (e.g., motion pictures and videorecordings, graphic materials, three-dimensional artefacts, etc.)?

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), rule 4.7B8 has been generalized to apply to all types of resources in an unpublished form (A1.7B12.2).

**Entity/Object:** Manufacture

**Data Element:** Method of replication designation

**Reference:** Tab 20, page 3

**Query:** Is method of replication relevant for other types of documents (e.g., three-dimensional artefacts)?

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), a general rule on method of production has been added (A1.5C4).

**Entity/Object:** Release

**Data Element:** Country of release

**Reference:** Tab 21, page 3

**Query:** Is country of release relevant for other types of documents (e.g., sound recordings)?

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the instructions in rule 7.7B9 pertaining to notes on original country of release continue to be aligned exclusively with moving image content (B7.7B9).

**Entity/Object:** Release

**Data Element:** Date of release

**Reference:** Tab 21, page 5

**Query:** Is date of release relevant for other types of documents (e.g., sound recordings, motion pictures and videorecordings)?

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the “first released” example from rule 8.7B9 has been included in the general rule on edition and history (A1.7B9).

**Entity/Object:** Edition

**Definition:** “All copies produced from essentially the same [image or master copy] and issued by the same entity.”—glossary (modified)

**Note:** The modified definition would accommodate the definitions given in the glossary for the term “edition” as it pertains to books, pamphlets, fascicles, single sheets, etc., to “other materials,” and perhaps to unpublished items, but not as it pertains to computer files.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the glossary definitions for edition have been revised to differentiate between the use of the term in relation to tangible resources and its use in relation to intangible resources.

**Entity/Object:** Collection

**Data Element:** Title of collection

**Reference:** Tab 26, page 3

**Note:** Specific rules relate to the content of the collection as opposed to the physical form of the documents in the collection. As a result the specific rule may apply to more than one class of materials.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), rules 4.1B2 and 8.1B3 have been aligned with the type of content to which each applies (B.1B11 and B4.1B11, respectively).

**Entity/Object:** Collection

**Data Element:** Shelf measure

**Reference:** Tab 26, page 8

**Note:** Shelf measure may not be appropriate to all types of cartographic material (e.g. manuscript cartographic documents).

**Relationship Type:** Reproduction (Item ↔ Item)

**Data Element:** Combined notes relating to the original

**Reference:** Tab 27, page 11

**Note:** 1. The general rules do not apply to reproductions of sound recordings, motion pictures and videorecordings, computer files, and three-dimensional artefacts and realia.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the scope of rule 1.11 has been revised to apply to all types of reproductions (A1.0J).

**Note:** 2. The examples under rule 10.7.B7 do include a note indicating a relationship between a three-dimensional artefact and the original from which it was reproduced.

**Comments:**

- In the draft of AACR3 part I (December 2004), the example from rule 10.7B7 has been moved to the general rule for notes on edition and history (A1.7B9).

**Relationship Type:** Published index/calendar (Item ↔ Item)

**Reference:** Tab 27, page 14

**Relationship Type:** Index (Item ↔ Item)

**Reference:** Tab 27, page 27

**Relationship Type:** Translation (Content ↔ Content)

**Reference:** Tab 32, page 2

**Relationship Type:** Adaptation (Content ↔ Content)

**Reference:** Tab 32, page 4

**Relationship Type:** Sequel (Content ↔ Content)

**Reference:** Tab 32, page 6

**Note:** The reciprocal relationship is not reflected in the rules.

Section C – Notes and Queries not included

Occurrences of “???”: Tab 2, page 9; Tab 7, page 44; Tab 8, page 39; Tab 21, page 1; Tab 27, page 10

Notes relating to the document itself: Tab 14, page 1