JOINT STEERING COMMITTEE FOR DEVELOPMENT OF RDA

MINUTES OF MARCH 2009 MEETING

ALA Headquarters, Chicago, USA

12-20 March 2009

[Note: does not include Executive Sessions]

TABLE of CONTENTS

Executive Session 3

End of Executive Session 3

Executive Session 4

End of Executive Session 4

Attachments A-N

Minutes: of the thirty-seventh meeting of the Committee held at ALA Headquarters, Chicago, USA, 12-20 March 2009.

Present: Margaret Stewart, Canadian Committee on Cataloguing, in the Chair
John Attig, American Library Association
Marjorie Bloss, RDA Project Manager
Alan Danskin, British Library
Tom Delsey, RDA Editor
Deirdre Kiorgaard, Australian Committee on Cataloguing
Nathalie Schulz, Secretary
Hugh Taylor, CILIP: Chartered Institute of Library and Information Professionals
Barbara Tillett, Library of Congress

Observers in attendance:
Alex Bloss
Christopher Cronin, University of Chicago
Judith Dartt, University of Chicago
Renette Davis, University of Chicago
Kathy Glennan, University of Maryland
Judith A. Kuhagen, Library of Congress
Kevin Randall, Northwestern University
Mark Scharff, Washington University, Saint Louis, Mo.
Helen Schmierer, University of Illinois at Chicago
Tracey Snyder, University of Chicago

Executive Session 1

266   Content-product issues

    266.1   Received and considered the following document:
5JSC/RDA/Editor's Guide

    266.2   [Note: included in 5JSC/M/Restricted/266-283.]

267   RDA background documents

    267.1   [Note: included in 5JSC/M/Restricted/266-283.]

268   Future updating of RDA

    268.1   [Note: included in 5JSC/M/Restricted/266-283.]

269   Strategic plan

    269.1   Received and considered the following document:
5JSC/Strategic/1/Rev/2

    269.2   [Note: included in 5JSC/M/Restricted/266-283.]

270   Collaboration with other resource description communities

    270.1   [Note: included in 5JSC/M/Restricted/266-283.]

271 **RDA Project Manager's report**

271.1 [Note: included in 5JSC/M/Restricted/266-283.]

272 **Actions arising out of the JSC Meeting April 2008**

272.1 [Note: included in 5JSC/M/Restricted/266-283.]

End of Executive Session 1

273 **Approval of the agenda**

273.1 The JSC approved the agenda (5JSC/A/8).

274 **Minutes of the previous meeting held 13-22 April 2008**

274.1 Received and considered the following documents:
5JSC/M/216-265
5JSC/M/Restricted/216-265

274.2 The minutes were accepted.

275 **RDA Full Draft**

275.1 Received and considered the following documents:
5JSC/RDA/Full draft
5JSC/RDA/Full draft/Addenda
5JSC/RDA/Full draft/Addenda/Appendix D

5JSC/RDA/Full draft/ACOC response
5JSC/RDA/Full draft/ALA response
5JSC/RDA/Full Draft/BL response
5JSC/RDA/Full draft/CCC response
5JSC/RDA/Full Draft/CILIP response
5JSC/RDA/Full Draft/LC response
5JSC/RDA/Full draft/Chair follow-up/1 [Norway]
5JSC/RDA/Full draft/Chair follow-up/2 [New Zealand]
5JSC/RDA/Full draft/Chair follow-up/3 [Spain]
5JSC/RDA/Full draft/Chair follow-up/4 [Sweden]
5JSC/RDA/Full draft/Chair follow-up/5 [ISSN]
5JSC/RDA/Full draft/Chair follow-up/6 [Germany]
5JSC/RDA/Full draft/Chair follow-up/7 [France]

275.2 **General comments on the Full Draft**

275.2.1 The JSC discussed a compilation of general comments from the constituencies on the full draft of RDA:

275.2.2 LC: "LC recommends that RDA use the term "authorized access point" in lieu of "preferred access point" to be consistent with the terminology in the final version of the IFLA *Statement of International Cataloguing Principles*."

The JSC agreed. The Editor noted that this would be done by IMT as global find and replace on XML files.
Action=Editor

275.2.3 LC: "Wording in various chapters needs to be updated to be consistent with the change in scope of a production statement and the addition of a manufacture statement in ch. 2. For example, in 4.2.0.1, "publisher or distributor" could be reworded as "publisher, distributor, or manufacturer" or as "publisher, distributor, etc.""

The JSC agreed.

Action=Editor

275.2.4 LC: "LC recommends deleting the words "above" and "below" when they are used in instructions to refer to previous or subsequent instructions because that indication of location in a text is not pertinent in an online tool when hot-linked references are present."

The Editor explained that he had already made these changes in his clean-up edit. [Post-meeting note from Editor: Deletions done only where instructions refer to specific section numbers. The terms "above" and "below" have been retained when they refer to lists or other unnumbered instructions within the same section.]

275.2.5 LC: "LC recommends replacing the term "alphanumeric string" appearing in any instruction with the term "character string.""

The JSC agreed.
Action=Editor

275.2.6 LC: "Instructions with multiple references to other RDA sections will be difficult for catalogers to use unless the reference is accompanied by a brief summary of the topic of the reference; otherwise, catalogers will need to follow links inefficiently in order to determine if the reference is relevant to their situation or not."

The Editor said that he would do this where possible. [Post-meeting note from Editor: Inserted parentheticals in the x-refs that were originally worded in the form "XXXX, XXXX, or XXXX below". For those that refer to a range of four or more sections (XXXX-XXXX), insertion of parentheticals is not feasible.]
Action=Editor

275.2.7 LC: "LC recommends deleting general instructions on sources for groups of elements on the principle that an instruction about sources of information should be given only for specific elements."

The JSC did not agree, and asked the Secretary to add this to the list for consideration after the first release.
Action= Secretary (List of issues for consideration after the first release of RDA)

275.2.8 ACOC: "There are many cases where identical or nearly identical text has been repeated under different instructions. Examples include instructions relating to facsimiles and reproductions, data elements in more than one language or script, and designations of first and last issues or parts."

See lines 126 and 127 in Attachment A. The JSC agreed that any more systematic changes would need to wait.
Action= Secretary (List of issues for consideration after the first release of RDA)

275.2.9 ACOC: "Rather than repeating the element name in the instructions, it should be possible to just say "this element""

Due to the amount of work involved, the JSC asked the Secretary to add this to the list for consideration after the first release.
Action= Secretary (List of issues for consideration after the first release of RDA)

275.2.10 ALA: "2.5.1.2: We recommend that the references to specific instructions for further guidance be added to the list on p. 71 and the list on p. 72 deleted".

The JSC agreed to remove the summary but to retain the instructions. [Post-meeting note from Editor: Text revised to read "For guidance on choosing sources of information for …, see the instructions on …."]
Action=Editor

275.2.11 ALA: "2.6.3.3, alternative on p. 96 and 2.6.5.3, alternative on p. 100: Change "numbering" to "chronological designation".

John Attig withdrew the suggestion based on the following information from the Editor: "The wording in the alternative instruction parallels the subhead for the instruction that is being referred to. I have followed that practice throughout when making cross-references to instructions found elsewhere in RDA. If JSC wants the wording of such instructions to be more specific than the subhead on the instructions being referred to, they will need to provide direction on when more specific wording should be used, and all instructions referring to instructions found elsewhere in RDA will need to be reviewed. In this particular case, if the suggestion made by ALA were followed, the alternative instructions under 2.6.2.3 on page 93 and 2.6.4.3 on page 98 would also have to be changed to replace "numbering" with "numeric and/or alphabetic designation"."

275.2.12 ALA: "2.7.1.2, etc.: ... Note also that later in this chapter, the phrase "any source within the resource" [omitting "itself"] is used; as a general matter of style, we prefer to omit "itself" and similar words."

John Attig withdrew the suggestion based on the following information from the Editor: "Every reference to 2.2.2 under a "Sources of Information" in chapter 2 uses the wording "another source within the resource itself". The instructions that simply state "Take … from any source within the resource" are all worded in that form (i.e., without "itself"). There are 34 instances of the former and 7 instances of the latter. If JSC wants both types of instructions to be worded in the same way, they will need to provide direction on which form of wording is preferred."

275.2.13 Editor: "An instruction on recording details of base material (i.e., details not reflected in the term or terms recorded to designate the base material) has been incorporated into section 3.6.1.3. The same has been done throughout chapter 3 … In chapter 7, instructions on recording details of elements have been placed in a separate section with a subhead "Recording details of …" (see 7.13.2.4, 7.13.3.4, 7.13.4.4, 7.15.1.4, 7.17.1.4, 7.19.1.4, and 7.20.1.4). Should all such instructions be presented in the same way? If so, which presentation is preferred (the presentation used in chapter 3 or that used in chapter 7)?"

The JSC decided to change chapter 3 to match chapter 7.
Action=Editor

275.2.14 LC: "LC recommends adding an indication of "element," "sub-element," and "element sub-type" in the labels for the instructions to convey this information not otherwise present in RDA. It is not possible now to know what is an element, etc., without consulting the element analysis table."; BL: "Core elements are explicitly labelled. It would be helpful if all elements, sub-elements or element sub-types were explicitly labelled."

The JSC decided not to make the change, and that the element analysis could be referred to for this information.

275.2.15 ACOC: "Although it is understood that the cross-referencing structure has been designed to provide context as needed in the online product, ACOC recommends usability testing to specifically address how the cross-referencing works for users at different levels of expertise."

The JSC decided to wait for the online product.
Action=JSC (RDA testing)

275.2.16 ACOC: "ACOC suggests that cross-references be shortened by removing the words "see the instructions given under", for example in 2.12.1.2 from *For title proper of series, see the instructions given under **2.12.2.2*** to *For title proper of series, see **2.12.2.2.***"

The JSC agreed.
Action=Editor

275.2.17 ACOC: "There are a number of lists and sets of examples within RDA that could be better displayed in the online product as an expandable link if required. This would facilitate the flow of the instruction but still allow further guidance if required at the point where the guidance would be sought. e.g., 1.3; 1.4."

The JSC agreed this would be looked at with usability testing.
Action=JSC (RDA testing)

275.2.18 ACOC rep from comments from other rule makers: "In Chs 2 and 3 the elements have been grouped according to unnumbered headings which separate the elements for manifestations from the elements for items; in Chs 6 and 7 these headings separate the elements for works from the elements for expressions. Comments show this distinction was not understood/sufficiently visible. [New Zealand Chs 6 & 7; Norway at 6.10, 7.22, 7.23; Spain at 2.17, 2.18, 2.19]"

The Editor explained that missing headings had been re-instated. The JSC decided to make changes to two element names to add "of item": Custodial history of item; Immediate source of acquisition of item.
Action=Editor

275.2.19 ALA: "The alternatives and exceptions for early printed resources throughout RDA are heavily reliant on practices in European/Western languages and countries. These instructions should be qualified to allow the application of other guidelines accepted by the agency creating the data."

The JSC did not consider this as no specific solution had been proposed, and it was not deemed to be a high priority.

275.2.20 ALA: "…recommend that there be an acknowledgment (in the General Introduction?) that RDA at this time may not be an appropriate standard for describing modern archives and manuscript collections. Inclusion of citations to more appropriate standards (DACS and comparable standards in other countries) would be helpful."

The JSC decided that no action was required and noted that the 5JSC/ALA/3/Rev list will contain information on other standards.

275.2.21 ALA: "Internationalization remains an incompletely fulfilled promise of RDA, which is not fully consistent in its inclusion of both general and specific instructions relating to language and script. Furthermore, examples in non-Latin alphabets have not been sufficiently included, particularly in Section 1. If the JSC is willing to add them, we have provided a large number of such examples in Section 3 of this response."

The JSC decided to wait to make a decision until confirming that character support was available. [Post meeting note: Character support was confirmed. The JSC decided to defer systematic inclusion of non-Latin script examples until after the first release. The CJK examples proposed by ALA will not be added to RDA.]
Action=Secretary (List of issues for consideration after the first release of RDA)

275.2.22 CCC: "Examples in chapter 19 – it was felt that the proliferation of examples of the same type tends to obscure the purpose of the chapter. "

It was noted that earlier in the meeting proposed functionality to limit the number of examples had been discussed. [Post-meeting note: It was not possible to introduce this functionality at this stage in the RDA development process. Users of RDA will be able to toggle between viewing all examples and viewing no examples.]

275.2.23 ACOC: "Definitions should appear in the body of the text, not in footnotes"; ALA: "… we once again urge that footnotes not be used."; LC: "16.0, footnote: LC recommends giving the footnote as a new 2nd paragraph in 16.0 to be consistent with similar information in ch. 11. (also applies at 9.0)"

The JSC agreed that any footnotes that match Glossary definitions should be removed (e.g., at 9.0 and 16.0). The JSC decided that in chapter 10 this paragraph will be deleted as it is the same as the definition: "Family, as used in this chapter, refers to two or more persons identified as a family unit." (Note: the definition of family was changed later in the meeting – see lines 731 and 800 in Attachment A). The JSC agreed that citations to other resources will remain in footnotes.
Action=Editor

275.2.24 The LC rep noted that both Germany and Spain had raised compliance with ICP principles as an issue.

The JSC agreed with the LC suggestion to explain that the principles are long-term goals and that ICP itself states that some principles may conflict in some situations.

275.2.25 The LC rep noted that France, Spain, and Sweden had requested more use of ISO standards, e.g., for dates, countries, currency.

The JSC asked the Secretary to add this to the list for consideration after the first release.
Action= Secretary (List of issues for consideration after the first release of RDA)

275.2.26 Both the LC rep and ACOC rep raised the issue that France, Germany, Spain, and Sweden had noted the need for harmonization with ISBD proposed area 0.

The JSC decided to wait to see what ISBD is planning to do. It was noted that RDA needs to be consistent with the RDA/ONIX framework.

275.3   **Detailed comments on the Full Draft**

275.3.1   Discussion of detailed comments on the full draft focussed on priority issues. The priority issues were those indicated as such in the constituency responses, as well as any relating to the element analysis; the definitions of elements, sub-elements, and element sub-types; and, changes to controlled lists of terms (and their definitions).

275.3.2   JSC discussion was guided by a response table, and an extract from the response table (with meeting decisions) has been included as Attachment A to these minutes.

275.3.3   In the open meeting sessions prior to the second executive session, the JSC discussed priority line numbers for the Introduction and Sections 1-5 (See Attachment A).

Executive Session 2

276   Meeting with Committee of Principals

    276.1   Received and considered the following document:
            5JSC/Annual report/2008

    276.2   [Note: included in 5JSC/M/Restricted/266-283.]

End of Executive Session 2

Executive Session 3

277   Follow-up on meeting with CoP and Co-publishers

    277.1   [Note: included in 5JSC/M/Restricted/266-283.]

End of Executive Session 3

278 **Proposed revision of RDA chap. 6, Additional instructions for musical works and expressions**

278.1 Received and considered the following documents:
5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up
5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up/ACOC response
5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up/ALA response
5JSC/LC/12/LC follow up/BL response
5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up/CCC response
5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up/CILIP response
5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up/LC response
5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up/Chair follow-up/1 [Germany]
5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up/Chair follow-up/2 [France]

5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up/2
5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up/2/ACOC response
5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up/2/ALA response
5JSC/LC/12/LC follow up/2/BL response
5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up/2/CCC response
5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up/2/CILIP response

278.2 The Chair welcomed Kathy Glennan and Mark Scharff to the meeting. Glennan is an ALA CC:DA voting member and Chair of the Music Library Association Bibliographic Control Committee. Scharff is the Music Library Association liaison to ALA CC:DA.

278.3 Barbara Tillett explained that LC had prepared some summary documents that would be used to guide the discussion. Note: the decisions below include post-meeting decisions and some corrections to examples, but not any subsequent adjustments to wording or instruction numbering. The page numbering corresponds to the full draft PDF of chapter 6. Formatting of the clean-copy instructions may not match the final formatting.

278.4 **6.15.2.3, new last paragraph (p. 60-62)**

The JSC agreed to delete the exception at 6.15.2.4 and move it to 6.15.2.3 with new wording. At 6.15.2.3 it will no longer be an exception, and will be given at the end of the instruction.

[Post-meeting note: The JSC agreed to delete the parenthetical reference "(selected according to 6.15.1.3.1-6.15.1.3.3)" as in the full draft these instructions are at 6.15.2.3 (where the new paragraph is to be added).]

Clean-copy:

If all of a composer's works with titles that include the name of a type of composition are also cited as a numbered sequence of compositions of that type, use the name of the type of composition as the preferred title.

Symphonies
Resource described: Sinfonia eroica / composta da Luigi van Beethoven.
Also cited in lists of the composer's symphonies as no. 3

278.5   **6.15.2.4, 2nd paragraph (p. 62)**

The JSC agreed to delete "g) an initial article" as it is covered by an earlier instruction in the chapter 6 draft.

278.6   **6.15.2.7 (p. 65)**

The JSC agreed to delete 6.15.2.7 (Trio sonatas) as it is covered elsewhere in the LC/12 proposals. The examples are also to be deleted and will not be moved to another instruction. The JSC decided not to delete 6.15.2.6 (Duets), based on a recommendation from ALA and CCC.

278.7   **6.15.2.8.1 (p. 65)**

The JSC agreed to revise 6.15.2.8.1. As a result, the part title will be treated as if it is distinctive, and will not be changed.

Clean-copy:

> Record the preferred title for a part of a musical work applying the instructions given under 6.15.2.4, as applicable. Apply the additional instructions given under 6.15.2.8.1.1.-6.15.2.8.1.5 below as appropriate.

278.8   **6.16.1.1 (p. 76)**

The JSC agree to change the scope of Medium of performance.

Clean-copy:

> **Medium of performance** is the instrument, instruments, voice, voices, etc., for which a musical work was originally conceived.

278.9   **6.16.1.3 (p. 76)**

The JSC agreed that no references would be added.

278.10   **6.16.1.5 (p. 78)**

The JSC agreed to change the wording, and to use the table found in 5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up/ALA response, but with the middle column label as "Instrumentation".

[Post-meeting note: The JSC agreed to some additional changes to the references to the table in the instruction.]

Clean-copy:

> For the following standard chamber music combinations, use the terms given in the table when the preferred title resulting from the application of 6.15.2.4 is *Trio, Quartet, Quintet* (or the plural):

STANDARD COMBINATION	INSTRUMENTATION	TERM RECORDED
string trio	violin, viola, violoncello	strings
string quartet	2 violins, viola, violoncello	strings
woodwind quartet	flute, oboe, clarinet, bassoon	woodwinds
wind quintet	flute, oboe, clarinet, horn, bassoon	winds
piano trio	piano, violin, violoncello	piano strings
piano quartet	piano, violin, viola, violoncello	piano strings
piano quintet	piano, 2 violins, viola, violoncello	piano strings

If the preferred title resulting from the application of 6.15.2.4 is not *Trio*, *Quartet*, or *Quintet* (or the plural), record the term for the standard combination.

If the preferred title resulting from the application of 6.15.2.4 is *Trio*, *Quartet*, or *Quintet* (or the plural), and the work is for a combination other than one listed above, record each instrument.

278.11 **6.16.1.9, 1ˢᵗ paragraph (p. 82)**

The JSC agreed to revise the wording.

[Post-meeting note: The JSC agreed to delete the 2ⁿᵈ paragraph under 6.16.1.9 in the full draft.]

Clean-copy:

For a work for one or more solo instruments and accompanying ensemble, record the term for the solo instrument or instruments and the term for the accompanying ensemble, in that order, applying the instructions given under 6.16.1.4-6.16.1.8.

> violin
> orchestra
> **Preferred title:** Rhapsodies

> piano
> orchestra
> **Preferred title:** Concertos

> harpsichord
> instrumental ensemble
> **Preferred title:** Concertos

> piano, 3 hands
> orchestra
> **Preferred title:** Concertos

> piano trio
> orchestra
> **Preferred title:** Concertos
>
> woodwind quartet
> string orchestra
> **Preferred title:** Concertos
>
> clarinets (2)
> string orchestra
> **Preferred title:** Divertimenti
>
> violin
> viola
> orchestra
> **Preferred title:** Sinfonie concertanti

278.12   **6.16.1.10, 3rd paragraph (p. 84)**

The JSC agreed to revise the wording to remove any limitations resulting from the "rule of three" (AACR2 change).

Clean-copy:

> Record one of the following terms for two or more solo voices of different ranges if no specific voice types or ranges can be ascertained.
>
> > mixed solo voices
> > men's solo voices
> > women's solo voices

278.13   **6.16.1.11 (p. 84)**

The JSC agreed to small adjustments to the wording, but did not agree to add the following paragraph: "If there is more than one part for a particular choral ensemble, record the name of the ensemble (e.g., *choruses*, *women's choruses*) and apply the instructions given under 6.16.0.14."

Clean-copy:

> Record one of the following terms, as appropriate, for a choral ensemble:
>
> > mixed voices
> > men's voices
> > women's voices
> > unison voices
>
> Record other terms (e.g., *children's voices*) as appropriate.

278.14 **6.17 (p. 86-88)**

The JSC agreed to change the scope for numeric designation and to add a new second paragraph to 6.17.1.3.1 following the existing examples. ALA volunteered to provide examples for the new paragraph (which have been included below).

The JSC agreed to delete "Record the number in the absence of, or in preference to, a serial number and/or opus number" from 6.17.1.3.3. It was agreed that to preserve current practice, 6.28.1.11 would be adjusted to use "one or more of the following". The JSC decided that no change was necessary to 6.28.1.12.

[Post-meeting note: The JSC agreed to change "bibliographer's" to "musicologist's" in 6.17.1.3.3, and to delete "and" between 6.28.1.11 b) and c).]

Clean-copies:

6.17.1.1

A **numeric designation of a musical work** is a serial number, opus number, or thematic index number assigned to a musical work by the composer, publisher, or a musicologist.

6.17.1.3.1, new 2nd paragraph:

If different works in a consecutively numbered series have different forms of numeric designation, or different words introducing the number in the sources on which the authorized access points for the individual works are based, select one of the forms to use in all the numbers in the series.

> 1st book
> **Resource described:** The first set of songs : in four parts / composed by John Dowland ; scored from the first edition, printed in the year 1597, and preceded by a life of the composer by W. Chappell

> 2nd book
> **Resource described***:* Second book of songs (1600) / John Dowland ; edited by Edmund H. Fellows ; revised by Thurston Dart

> 1o libro
> **Resource described:** Il primo libro de ricercari da cantare : a quattro voci / di Claudio Merulo da Correggio

> 3o libro
> **Resource described:** Ricercari da cantare : a quattro voci : libro terzo / di Claudio Merulo

6.17.1.3.3

In the case of certain composers, record the number assigned to a work in a recognized thematic index. Precede the number by the initial letter or letters of the

musicologist's name (e.g., K. 453[16]) or a generally accepted abbreviation (e.g., BWV 232[17]).

[16]Köchel, Ludwig. Chronologisch-thematisches Verzeichnis sämtlicher Tonwerke Wolfgang Amadé Mozarts. 8., unveränderte Aufl. Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1983, c1964.
[17]Schmieder, Wolfgang. Thematisch-systematisches Verzeichnis der musikalischen Werke von Johann Sebastian Bach; Bach-Werke-Verzeichnis (BWV). 3., unveränderte Aufl. Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel Musikverlag, 1961, c1950.

6.28.1.11 (p. 185)

If the preferred title for the work (see 6.15.2) consists solely of the name of a type, or of two or more types, of composition, add one or more of the following elements to the access point representing the work (in this order):

> a) a term indicating medium of performance (see 6.14)
> b) a numeric designation (see 6.28)
> c) key (see 6.15.2)

278.15   **6.28.1.2 (p. 175-176)**

The JSC discussed the LC suggestion to delete 6.28.1.2 as it is the same as a general instruction. The Editor explained that this instruction was the only guarantee that the work would be named using the composer. The JSC decided not to delete the instruction.

[Post-meeting note: It was clarified that what LC proposed deleting was LC/12 follow-up 6.28.1.2 which is full draft 6.28.1.4 (Writer's work set by several composers). The JSC had agreed to delete 6.28.1.4 at the meeting (see 5JSC/M/278.18 below).]

278.16   **New Collaborative works at 6.28.1.1**

The JSC did not agree with the LC suggestion to combine 6.28.1.3, 6.28.1.5, and 6.28.1.9 as one instruction captioned as "Collaborative works". (See also 5JSC/M/278.17, 5JSC/M/278.19, and 5JSC/M/278.24 below for revisions to these instructions.)

The Editor explained that the types of works covered by 6.28.1.3, 6.28.1.5, and 6.28.1.9 include both collaborative works (i.e., works created by two or more creators working together) and adaptations (i.e., works created by modifying pre-existing works). Therefore, they cannot be grouped together under the rubric "collaborative works" without totally distorting the meaning of the term "collaborative". (The first sentence at 6.28.1.1.1 in LC/12/LC follow-up contradicts the heading for 6.28.1.1 by stating that the instructions apply not just to collaborative works but to modifications of pre-existing works as well.) Moreover, constituency comments on earlier drafts indicated that the instructions should not be written in a way that requires the cataloguer to determine whether the work is in fact the result of a collaboration by two or more creators or the result of a creator modifying a pre-existing work. As a consequence, each set of instructions was written to focus on the nature of the resulting work, not how it came into being. Grouping them all under a single heading for "collaborative works" simply obscures the real focus of the instructions.

278.17 **6.28.1.3 (p. 176-178)**

The JSC agreed to change 6.28.1.3.4 to use "excerpt" instead of "song".

Clean-copy:

6.28.1.3.4 Single excerpt

If the work is a single excerpt from a pasticcio, etc., construct the access point representing the work by combining (in this order):

a) the authorized access point representing the composer of the excerpt, formulated according to the guidelines and instructions given under 9.19.1, 10.10.1, or 11.12.1, as applicable
b) the preferred title for the excerpt, formulated according to the instructions given under 6.15.2.

Handel, George Frideric, 1685–1759. Ma come amar?
Authorized access point for: Ma come amar? : duetto nel Muzio Scaevola del sigr Handel. **The other composers of the pasticcio are Amadei and Bononcini**

If the composer of the excerpt is unknown, use the preferred title for the excerpt as the authorized access point representing the work.

278.18 **6.28.1.4 (p. 178)**

The JSC agreed to delete 6.28.1.4 and the reference to this instruction at 6.28.1.1 c).

278.19 **6.28.1.5 (p. 179)**

The JSC agreed to change "musical setting" to "musical work composed for choreographic movement".

Clean-copy:

6.28.1.5 Musical Work Composed for Choreographic Movement

For a musical work composed for choreographic movement, such as a ballet, pantomime, etc., construct the authorized access point representing the work by combining (in this order):

[remainder unchanged]

278.20 **6.28.1.6 (p. 180)**

Barbara Tillett noted that the change proposed was dependant on an earlier suggestion which was not agreed to.

278.21 **6.28.1.7 (p. 181)**

The JSC agreed to change the caption from "Alternations of musico-dramatic works" to "Operas and other dramatic works with new text and title".

278.22   **6.28.1.8 (p. 182)**

The JSC agreed to revise the wording for 6.28.1.8 (Cadenzas). AACR2 practice has been preserved.

Clean-copy:

> **6.28.1.8 Cadenzas**
>
> For a cadenza, construct the authorized access point representing the work by combining (in this order):
>
> a) the authorized access point representing the composer of the cadenza, formulated according to the guidelines and instructions given under 9.19.1, 10.10.1, or 11.12.1, as applicable
> b) the preferred title for the cadenza, formulated according to the instructions given under 6.15.2.
>
> If the cadenza does not have its own title, devise a title according to the instructions given under 2.3.2.X.
>
> [examples remain the same]

(Note: 2.3.2.X will be replaced by appropriate instruction number after 2.3.2 is revised due to deletion of devised title as an element)

278.23   **New 6.28.4.2**

The JSC agreed to add a new 6.28.4.2 to allow for variant access points with the cadenza treated as a part. This practice was not present in AACR2.

Clean-copy:

> **6.28.4.2   Variant access point representing one or more cadenzas**
>
> Construct a variant access point representing one or more cadenzas written to be performed as part of one or more specific musical works by combining in this order:
>
> > a) the authorized access point for the composer of the musical work or musical works for which the cadenza or cadenzas were written, formulated according to the guidelines and instructions given under 9.19.1, 10.10.1, or 11.12.1, as applicable
> > b) the preferred title for the musical work or musical works for which the cadenza or cadenzas were written, formulated according to the instructions given under 6.15.2
> > c) the preferred title for the movement of the musical work for which the cadenza or cadenzas were written, formulated according to the instructions given under 6.15.2.8, when appropriate
> > d) the term *Cadenza* or *Cadenzas*
> > e) another distinguishing term if needed.
> >
> > > Mozart, Wolfgang Amadeus, 1756-1791. Concertos, piano, orchestra, K. 491, C minor. Allegro. Cadenza (Previn)

Authorized access point for the work: Previn, André, 1929- . Cadenza to Mozart's Piano concerto in C minor, KV. 491, 1st movement

Haydn, Joseph, 1732-1809. Concertos, harpsichord, orchestra, H. XVIII, 11, D major. Cadenzas (Badura-Skoda)
Authorized access point for the work: Badura-Skoda, Paul. Kadenzen zum Klavierkonzert in D-dur (Hoboken XVIII: 11) von Joseph Haydn

Mozart, Wolfgang Amadeus, 1756-1791. Sonatas, piano, K. 333, B ♭ major. Allegretto grazioso. Cadenzas (Landowska)
Authorized access point for the work: Landowska, Wanda. Cadenzas for the Piano sonata in B-flat major, K. 333, third movement, by W.A. Mozart

Beethoven, Ludwig van, 1770-1827. Concertos, piano, orchestra, no. 3-4. Cadenzas (Schumann)
Authorized access point for the work: Schumann, Clara, 1819-1896. Cadenzen zu Beethoven's Clavier-Concerten

278.24   **6.28.1.9 (p. 183)**

The JSC agreed to add "film, etc." to 6.28.1.9, and "etc." to the caption. ALA volunteered to provide additional examples (which have been inserted below).

Clean-copy:

6.28.1.9 Music and Incidental Music for Dramatic Works, etc.

For music or incidental music composed for a dramatic work, film, etc., construct the authorized access point representing the work by combining (in this order):

a) the authorized access point representing the composer of the music, formulated according to the guidelines and instructions given under 9.19.1, 10.10.1, or 11.12.1, as applicable
b) the preferred title for the work, formulated according to the instructions given under 6.15.2.

Beethoven, Ludwig van, 1770–1827. Egmont
Authorized access point for: Musik zu Goethes Trauerspiel Egmont : op. 84 / Ludwig van Beethoven. **A musical score**

Finzi, Gerald, 1901–1956. Love's labours lost
Authorized access point for: Love's labours lost : complete incidental music / Gerald Finzi ; edited by Jeremy Dale Roberts. **A musical score for the incidental music for Shakespeare's play**

Steiner, Max, 1888-1971. King Kong
Authorized access point for: King Kong : the complete 1933 film score / Steiner. **An audio recording**

North, Alex. Good morning, Vietnam
Authorized access point for: Good morning, Vietnam / music, Alex North.
A musical score

278.25 **6.28.1.10 (p. 184)**

The JSC agreed to delete 6.28.1.10 as librettos are not musical works. This is a change to AACR2 (21.28 footnote 7). The JSC decided to add the following reference at 6.28.1.1: "For librettos and other texts for musical works, construct the authorized access point following the instructions given under 6.27.1".

[Post-meeting note: The JSC agreed to also delete 6.19.1.7 (Librettos and Song Texts).]

278.26 **New 6.27.4.2**

The JSC agreed a new 6.27.4.2 to allow for variant access points for the libretto using the name of the composer of the original work (sometimes the current practice). The Editor said that he would add "catch-all" instructions at 6.27.4.1, 6.27.4.2, etc. The Editor also said that he would check all instruction references.

Clean-copy:

> **6.27.4.2   Variant access point representing one or more librettos or other texts for musical works**
>
> Construct a variant access point representing one or more librettos or other texts that have been used in specific musical works by combining in this order:
>
> a) the authorized access point for the composer of the musical work or musical works, formulated according to the guidelines and instructions given under 9.19.1, 10.10.1, or 11.12.1, as applicable
> b) the preferred title for the musical work or musical works, formulated according to the instructions given under 6.15.2
> c) the term *Libretto*, *Librettos*, *Text* or *Texts*, as appropriate
> d) another distinguishing term if needed.
>
>> Adams, John, 1947- . Nixon in China. Libretto
>> **Authorized access point for the work:** Goodman, Alice. Nixon in China
>>
>> Verdi, Giuseppe, 1813-1901. Ernani. Libretto. Spanish
>> **Authorized access point for the work:** Piave, Francesco Maria, 1810-1876. Ernani. Spanish
>>
>> Bellini, Vincenzo, 1801-1835. Operas. Librettos
>> **Authorized access point for the compilation:** Tutti i libretti di Bellini
>>
>> Sullivan, Arthur, 1842-1900. Operas. Librettos. Selections
>> **Authorized access point for the compilation:** Gilbert, W. S. (William Schwenck), 1836-1911. Librettos. Selections
>>
>> John, Elton. Songs. Texts. Selections

>> **Authorized access point for the compilation:** Taupin, Bernie. Lyrics. Selections

278.27 **6.28.1.11 and 6.28.1.12 (p. 185-191)**

The JSC agreed to change the caption at 6.28.1.11 to "Additions to access points representing musical works with titles that are not distinctive". The JSC agreed to change the caption at 6.28.1.12 to "Additions to access points for musical works with distinctive titles", and in the first paragraph to replace "musical work other than one covered under 6.28.1.11" with "musical work with a distinctive title".

278.28 **6.28.1.13 (p. 191)**

The JSC did not agree to delete 6.28.1.13. CCC had indicated that it would only agree to the deletion if the content was present elsewhere.

278.29 **6.28.3.4 (p. 199)**

The JSC agreed to delete "for one or more musical compositions" from 6.28.3.4. The JSC decided to use the examples as found in the full draft.

[Post-meeting note: The JSC agreed with LC suggestion to add another example ("Moore"). LC provided the following rationale for the example: This new example makes clear the word "work" in the instruction uses the RDA meaning, i.e., it can mean a compilation of works by the composer or an individual work. That is, "Sketches" may be used for whatever kind of manifestation the resource represents. Otherwise, the instruction could be taken as referring only to individual works and sets of works, or parts of individual works or sets of works, the very ambiguity in AACR2 25.35B we need to overcome.]

Clean-copy:

> **6.28.3.4 Sketches**
>
> Construct the authorized access point representing a work or part or parts of a work consisting of a composer's sketches by adding *Sketches* to the authorized access point representing the completed work.
>
>> Szymanowski, Karol, 1882-1937. Harnasie (Sketches)
>>
>> Beethoven, Ludwig van, 1770–1827. Quartets, strings, no. 1-6, op. 18 (Sketches)
>>
>> Gillis, Don, 1912-1978. Quartets, strings, no. 6. Passacaglia (Sketches)
>>
>> Moore, Douglas, 1893-1969. Works. Selections (Sketches)
>> **Resource described:** Sketches / Douglas Moore. **Sketches for various works**

278.30 **6.28.3.6**

The JSC agreed to delete 6.28.3.6, as an instruction had been added at 6.27.4.2 (23 above). It was also agreed that the reference to this instruction at 6.28.3.1 c) would be deleted.

278.31 **6.28.4.1-4.4**

The JSC agreed to change "access point" to "variant access point" in the first lines of 6.28.4.1 3rd paragraph, 6.28.4.2 3rd paragraph, 6.28.4.3 2nd paragraph, 6.28.4.4 3rd paragraph.

278.32 **6.28.4.1**

The JSC did not agree to add "if it is considered important" to the end of the second paragraph at 6.28.4.1.

278.33 **6.28.4.2**

The JSC did not agree to add "or if it is considered important" to the end of the first and second paragraphs at 6.28.4.2.

278.34 **6.16.1.13 Indeterminate Medium of Performance (p. 85-86)**

The JSC agreed to a number of changes to 6.16.1.13, based on the wording in 5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up.

Clean-copy:

If the specific medium of performance, or any part of it, is not stated in the resource or other source, record that part of the medium of performance as follows (in order of priority):

a) If only the family of instruments (see 6.16.1.7) or voices (see 6.16.1.10), or a collective term for other media, is indicated by the composer, or is available from any other source, record the family, collective term, etc.

accordion
violin
chordal instrument
Preferred title: Trio

b) If only the range or general type of instrument or voice is indicated by the composer, or is available from any other source, record the range:

low instrument
orchestra
Preferred title: Concertos

treble instrument
organ
Preferred title: Chorale preludes

melody instrument
piano
Preferred title: Suites

male voice

trombone
Preferred title: Pieces

c) If some parts of the medium are indicated by the composer, or are available from any other source, and others are unspecified or are indicated as "unspecified" or a similar term, record the individual parts of the medium as instructed under 6.16.1.4-6.16.1.12, also using "unspecified" or a similar term as appropriate.

unspecified instrument
piano
Preferred title: Carols

d) If no medium of performance is specified by the composer, and none can be ascertained from any other source, and there are two or more such works by the same composer that have the same preferred title, record the number of parts or voices. Use *voices* to designate both vocal and instrumental parts.

voices (3)
Resource described: Canzonets, or, Little short songs to three voices / published by Thomas Morley

voices (5-6)
Resource described: Canzonets, or, Little short aers to five and six voices / by Thomas Morley

voices (4)
Resource described: Fourteen canzonas for four instruments / Claudio Merulo

voices (5-6)
Resource described: Madrigals of 5 and 6 parts, apt for the viols and voices / made & published by Thomas Weelkes

e) If no medium of performance is specified by the composer, and none can be ascertained from any other source, record *unspecified*.

It was noted that the recording of "unspecified" is an AACR2 change. The Editor said that it would be very unlikely that this would be included in an access point.

278.35   **6.18 Key (p. 88-90)**

The JSC agreed to remove the distinction between pre-twentieth century and post-nineteenth century works when recording key (AACR2 change – 25.30D).

Clean-copy:

6.18.1.1 Scope

Key is the set of pitch relationships that establishes the tonal centre, or principal tonal centre, of a musical work. Key is designated by its pitch name and its mode, when it is major or minor.

6.18.1.2 Sources of Information

Take information on key from any source.

6.18.1.3 Recording Key

Record the key if one or more of the following conditions applies:

a)   it is commonly identified in reference sources
b)   it appears in the composer's original title or the title proper of the first manifestation
c)   it is apparent from the resource described (unless it is known to be transposed in the resource).

> C minor
> **Resource described:** Trio c-Moll Opus 66 für Violine, Violoncello und Klavier / Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy
>
> D major
> **Resource described:** Symphony no. 93, in D major / Haydn
>
> A major
> **Resource described:** Scherzo in A for pianoforte / Franz Reizenstein. **Mode of the key determined to be major**
>
> B♭
> **Resource described:** Symphony in B flat for concert band / Paul Hindemith. **Mode of the key determined to be neither major nor minor**
>
> F# minor
> **Resource described:** Sinfonie für Orgel solo fis-Moll, op. 143 = Symphony for organ solo in F sharp minor / Sigfrid Karg-Elert

279   **RDA Full Draft (continued)**

    279.1   The JSC discussed priority line numbers for Appendix A, Appendix B, Section 6, Section 8, Section 9, Appendix D, Appendix E, Appendix F, and Appendix I (see Attachment A).

280   **RDA Appendix J: Relationship designators: Relationships between works, expressions, manifestations, and items**

    280.1   For the discussion the JSC used a revised version of Appendix J and an edited response table for the Appendix prepared by the ALA representative. The response table (with meeting decisions) has been included as Attachment B to these minutes.

281   **RDA Full Draft (continued)**

    281.1   The JSC discussed priority line numbers for Appendix K, Appendix H, and the Glossary (see Attachment A).

281.2   At the end of the discussion of priority line numbers in the Glossary, the JSC completed discussion of the small number of remaining priority line numbers from other chapters. The Editor said that if there were any outstanding issues that would have an impact on the ER diagram he would alert the JSC as soon as possible (agenda item 44).

Executive Session 4

282   RDA Functionality

282.1   [Note: included in 5JSC/M/Restricted/266-283.]

283   JSC program of work

283.1   [Note: included in 5JSC/M/Restricted/266-283.]

End of Executive Session 4

Attachment A – Full draft response table

This attachment is derived from the response table used during discussion of 5JSC/RDA/Full draft at the March 2009 meeting. Meeting decisions have been added to the final column and those line numbers not discussed have been removed.

Notes on the response table:

- The table contains detailed comments from the constituencies on 5JSC/RDA/Full draft that were discussed at the meeting. The following comments were not included in the original table: general comments on the draft (see 5JSC/M/275.2); comments listed in Attachment C.
- The "Other" column contains the following:
    o Questions arising from the Editor's clean-up edit (see Attachment D).
    o Comments from the Chair of the second Examples Working Group (Adam Schiff - preceded by "AS") and the Secretary (Nathalie Schulz - preceded by "NS")
    o Comments from other rule makers/other countries as nominated by the JSC representatives (preceded by "OR").
    o References to extra documents (when not already linked to a constituency comment)
- The "Priority" column contains the name of the constituency which indicated in their response that the comment was a priority for discussion, and/or one of the following:
    o EA – Comment is a priority because a change is being suggested to the element name or coverage or to a controlled list of terms.
    o G – Comment is a priority because a decision will mean a change to the Glossary (there is an overlap with the EA column).
    o Editor - Comment is a priority for the Editor.
    o EditorC - Comment is a priority for the Editor (issue arose from clean-up edit).
    o Sec – Comment is a priority for the Secretary.
    o Egs – Comment is a priority because of the possible impact on examples
- The "Related comments" column was used at the meeting to ensure that all related comments were discussed at the same time. When an instruction number is given in bold this is the first occurrence of the comment by that constituency. Any related lines have the same instruction number, but not in bold.
- The "Meeting" column contains some post-meeting notes in addition to decisions made at the meeting.

Note: The changes noted in this table do not represent all changes made to the full draft text.

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	INTRODUCTION								
	0.1 Key features								
7			0.1 1st sent: delete "state of the art"						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
8			0.0 2nd sent: change "newer" to "new"						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	0.3.2 Alignment with FRBR								
13						Editor: 0.3.2: Query use of phrase "(i.e., the intellectual or artistic content)" in definition of "work"	G		Agree to add parenthetical (found in FRAD). Post-meeting note: phrase already present at 0.3.2.
	0.3.3 Alignment with FRAD								
16			0.3.3, person: reference to "human or non-human" individual is not in FRAD				CCC G		Remove (align with FRAD). Add sentence to 0.3.3: "Those entities are defined in RDA as follows:" Post-meeting note: Same sentence added at 0.3.2.
17					0.3.3 2nd para: Use "attributes of the entity work"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		0.4 Objectives and principles governing resource description and access							
		0.4.2 Objectives							
22						Editor: 0.4.2.1: There is no user task listed under 0.4.2.1 to parallel the task listed under 29.2: "find persons, families, or corporate bodies that are related to the person, family, or corporate body represented by the data retrieved in response to the user's search".	EditorC		Add task from chapter 29
		0.4.3 Principles							
25		0.4.3.4 3rd para: inconsistent with 0.4.3.7				OR Contradiction between 0.4.3.4 and 0.4.3.7 for preferred titles and preferred names. [Germany]	Editor ACOC		0.4.3.4 3rd para remove "(in order of preference)". Delete 0.4.3.7

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
28		0.4.3.7 1st para: cannot easily to resources without language content. The statement also needs to mention forms of name found in appropriate reference sources.					Editor		Withdrawn
29		0.4.3.7 2nd para: Either the first paragraph needs to include a statement about preferred titles of works, or the second paragraph should be moved to 0.4.3.4					ALA		See line 25
	0.6 Core elements								
35	0.6: Prefer that the lists give the element label only. Continue to use core element label at the element and at specific sub-elements or element subtypes				0.6: Concerns about core element label appearing at element and with sub-element or element sub-type		LC Editor	LC 2.3	Reinstate the "list subheadings" to the list. This now matches the labeling in the instructions (disagree LC).

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		0.6.1 General							
36		0.6.1: The description and rationale for the core elements needs to be revised in the light of 5JSC/Chair/15				0.6.1: See M/240.2.1 in "Decisions from the April 2008 JSC meeting not reflected in the full draft for constituency review"	ALA		Add to 0.6.1 the intent of Chair/15 middle of p.3 and top of p.4, without reference to "rating". Include the phrase "user tasks"
37	0.6.1 Concern about use of "resource"						ACOC		As a minimum a resource description for a work, expression, manifestation or item … (readily ascertainable as before). Next para: A description of an entity associated with a resource…

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	0.6.2 Section 1: Recording attributes of manifestation and item								
39	0.6.2: To give some guidance when core element data is not available on the item these instructions should explicitly say that the information is to be recorded if "readily ascertainable".						Editor	**ACOC 0.6.2**	Add "if readily ascertainable" to 1st sent of 2nd and 3rd paras of 0.6.1
40			0.6.2: Should a note be added to indicate that a Devised title is required when it is being supplied as the Title proper?		0.6.2 Devised title: make decision about status. If it remains a separate element sub-type reword 0.6.2 and 2.3.2.10. If it is removed as separate element sub-type, incorporate 2.3.11 into 2.3.2		LC EA	Editor 2.3.11.1	Will become a set of instructions under title proper. Settles core element question and no longer needs scope.
41					0.6.2 Earlier variant title and Later variant title: delete from list		LC		Agree (also at 1.3). Core element labels will be removed at 2.3.7 and 2.3.8.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
42			0.6.2 Statement of responsibility: delete "only statement of responsibility relating to the title proper is required"				CCC		Agree (also at 1.3). See also line 229 for change to element name
43					0.6.2 Statement of responsibility: revise to remove "recorded"		LC		Disagree LC (line 46)
44		0.6.2 Place of publication: add to list			0.6.2 Place of publication: add to list	OR 0.6.2: Add place of publication [France, Germany, ISSN, New Zealand, Spain, Sweden]	ALA LC		Agree. Also place of distribution and manufacture to align with what has been done for bodies and dates. Only the first is required.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
46					0.6.2 Distributor's name: revise wording		LC		Make it clear at 0.6.2, 1.3, and core label at 2.9 that it is only core "For a published resource ...". Also use at 2.9.1.1 first para "published resource". Change will apply to all distribution statement sub-elements and manufacture statement sub-elements. Disagree LC adding "required only", "distributor's name is present", and removing "recorded".
48					0.6.2 Date of distribution: add "required only"		LC		Disagree LC (line 46)
50					0.6.2 Manufacturer's name: revise wording		LC		Disagree LC (line 46)
52					0.6.2 Date of manufacture: add "required only"		LC		Disagree LC (line 46)
53					0.6.2 Copyright date: add "required only"		LC		Disagree LC (line 46)
54			0.6.2 Extent: add qualification "only if the resource is complete or if the total extent is known."				CCC		Agree to add at 0.6.2 and 1.3 to match what is at 3.4

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		0.6.3 Section 2: Recording attributes of work and expression							
55						OR 0.6: Add language as a core element [France, Germany, ISSN, New Zealand, Spain, Sweden]	ACOC CCC LC		Agree. At 0.6.3 language of expression moves up with identifier and content type.
56		0.6.3: preferred name of the creator should be a core element for identifying a work					ALA		No change required
57			0.6.3: a heading such as "Additions" to highlight elements and additions to elements with sub-headings for music, legal material, etc.		0.6.3 3rd and 5th paras: move some elements to a new 0.6.10 Differentiation		LC		Disagree LC (line 58)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
58			0.6.3: Medium of performance (for music), Numeric designation (for music) and Key (for music) should be required as additions in access points for musical works whenever the preferred title for the work consists solely of the name of a type, or two or more types of composition				CCC		Agree. These elements will need to go under a separate paragraph under the existing paragraph. "When identifying a musical work…" Always record these three elements for a title that is not distinctive, and for distinctive if needed to differentiate.
59			0.6.3: Signatory to a treaty, etc. is always required				CCC		Add a new para to 0.6.3 - for bilateral treaties need to record both signatories.
	0.6.4 Section 3: Recording attributes of person, family, and corporate body								
60	0.6.4: should explicitly say that the information is to be recorded if "readily ascertainable"						Editor	ACOC 0.6.2	Add "if readily ascertainable" to 1st sent of 2nd and 3rd paras of 0.6.1

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
61	0.6.4: elements relating to Dates should be added to the core elements for persons, families and corporate bodies						ACOC		Agree. Move under first para. The "if readily ascertainable" condition will help people not spend too much time. List at the element level only for persons. Date of conference, etc. no longer needs to be listed separately.
62					0.6.4 2nd para: move some elements to a new 0.6.10 Differentiation (see comments at 0.6.10)		LC		Disagree LC (line 58)
63			0.6.4 2nd para: The first six additional identifying elements pertain to persons; for clarity, suggest adding "of the person"				Editor EA		Use "period of activity of the person" do not change the others.
64					0.6.4 Section 4: add "preferred name of place" as a core element when naming a governmental jurisdiction		LC		Disagree. Covered by preferred name of corporate body. Remove core element labels at 16.2 and 16.2.2.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
0.6.5 Section 5: Recording primary relationships between work, expression, manifestation, and item									
65						OR 0.6 Core elements: There is confusion over which primary relationships are required. [New Zealand in general comments; Germany at 0.6.2]	ACOC		0.6.5 and 17.3 "... include as a minimum the work manifested." If there is more than one expression of the work, record the expression manifested. Then para about more than one. No change needed to 17.4.1 as it describes the transitive relationship.
66					0.6.5: use similar wording to 17.4, 2nd para and modify 17.3		LC		Covered with line 65

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
0.6.6 Section 6: Recording relationships to persons, families, and corporate bodies associated with a resource									
67					0.6.6: remove core status at 20.2 to match 0.6.6	Editor: 18.3: Should the list of core elements for section 6 under 18.3 (and in the Introduction) be revised, or should the designation of contributor as a core element in chapter 20 be deleted?	LC		Delete core element label at 20.2
0.6.7 Section 7: Recording subject relationships									
68						Editor: 0.6.7 Should the list of "elements" under 0.6.7 be replaced with a single element identified as "Subject"?	EditorC		Use "include as a minimum at least one subject relationship element"

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
69		0.6.7 include "Access point representing the manifestation" and "Access point representing the item"					ALA		Covered with 68
70					0.6.7: add "for the subject of the work"		LC		Covered with 68
0.6.8 Section 8: Recording relationships between works, expressions, manifestations, and items									
71					0.6.8: see revised wording		LC		Agree but change wording "except for the primary relationships as specified under 0.6.5"
0.8 Alternatives and options									
72			0.8 note the designation "Exception"				Editor		Agree. New Section.
0.10 Internationalization									
0.10.3 Numerals									
76					0.10.3 1st para: replace "original" with "on the source" at end of sentence				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
0.10.4 Dates									
77					0.10.4 1st para: replace "original" with "on the source" at end of sentence				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		0.10.5 Units of measurement							
78			0.10.5 3rd para: change final sentence to "However, allowance is made for recording playing speeds for analog tapes in inches per second"						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
		0.11 Encoding RDA data							
79		0.11: explicitly state that all embedded vocabularies are controlled, but not closed, vocabularies, and that terms not yet in the vocabulary may be used if appropriate					ALA		Withdrawn
80					0.11 1st para: add MADS and MODS to second sentence				Moot because not adding MODS/MADS to Appendix E
		SECTION 1 - RECORDING ATTRIBUTES OF MANIFESTATION AND ITEM							
		CHAPTER 1 GENERAL GUIDELINES ON RECORDING ATTRIBUTES OF MANIFESTATIONS AND ITEMS							
		1.1 Terminology							
		1.1.2 Resource							
81	1.1.2 1st para: delete				1.1.2 1st para: delete				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		1.1.4 Comprehensive, analytical, and hierarchical description							
83		1.1.4 comprehensive description: Begin: "A description of the resource …" The first example needs more explanation: "(e.g., a map issued in two or more discrete parts, …"[comment made at Glossary]			1.1.4, comprehensive description add: (1) a serial example such as "a periodical" in the "e.g." statement; (2) an example of a resource such as "a subseries" that is both a whole for the purposes of this paragraph and a part of a larger resource in the next paragraph; and (3) a reference to 1.5.2.		G		ALA withdraw. Agree LC (1). Disagree LC (2). LC (3): End of first para of 1.1.4 will refer to 1.5.
84		1.1.4 analytical description: Delete "that describes" [comment made at Glossary]			1.1.4 analytical description add: (1) an example whose parts can also be described by further analytical descriptions and suggests "a subseries" as that example; and (2) a reference to 1.5.3.		G		LC: See line 83 ALA: withdraw
85					1.1.4 hierarchical description: add ref to 1.5.4				See line 83

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		1.1.5 Work, expression, manifestation, and item							
88		1.1.5 def of Manifestation: clarify by stating that physical embodiments may include "intangible resources" [Comment made at Glossary]					G		ALA withdraw.
		1.5 Type of description							
		1.5.3 Analytical description							
95			1.5.3 e) add "an archive" to parallel 1.5.2.e)						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
		1.6 Changes requiring a new description							
		1.6.1 Multipart monographs							
96					1.6.1.1: See revised wording		LC		Use "Create a new description if a multipart monograph changes to a serial or an integrating resource, or if a serial or integrating resource changes to a multipart monograph."
97	See 1.6.2.2		1.6.1.2: ISSN Network rules stipulate the creation of a new description and a new ISSN assignment for a resource that has changed from CD ROM to PDF				CCC		See line 99 (any change would not apply to multipart monographs)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		1.6.2 Serials							
98					1.6.2.1: See revised wording		LC		Follow pattern at Line 96
99	1.6.2.2: Request confirmation that the requirements of ISSN are met by this instruction, specifically that only changes in media type and not changes in carrier type require a new ISSN (discussed previously, see M196.7.5)		1.6.2.2: see 1.6.1.2				CCC		Judy Kuhagen contacted the US ISSN Centre to confirm what the situation is. The manual is not explicit about what level of change in medium requires a new ISSN assignment. Based on the ISBD alignment would be difficult as a change in SMD may not be a change in carrier type. Wait to see if it the issue is brought up by the ISSN community.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
101						OR 1.6.2: Change in edition statement is a major change for serials [Germany, ISSN]. Add new instruction 1.6.2.5 "Change in the edition statement indicating a change in the subject matter" [Germany]. CCC notes that edition statement is a major change according to CONSER 16.4.2 and LCRI 21.3B	CCC LC		Agree. Use wording based on ISBD and the ISSN manual: "when the edition statement changes and indicates a significant change to the scope or coverage of the …" Add at 1.6.2 (serial) and 1.6.3 (integrating resource).
	1.6.3 Integrating resources								
102					1.6.3.1: See revised wording		LC		Follow pattern at line 96
103			1.6.3.2: see 1.6.1.2				CCC		See line 99

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
104				BL 1.6.3.3: Make clearer the distinction between "issued" and "supplied"					Moot following revision of 1.6.3.3
105		1.6.3.3: Define "re-based" and connect with FRBR concept of a distinct manifestation		BL: 1.6.3.3: Add Glossary definition for "re-based"	1.6.3.3: Add Glossary definition for "re-basing"		ALA G		Reword: "Create a new description for an integrating resource if a new set of base volumes is issued for an updating loose-leaf." No need to define re-basing in the Glossary.
	1.7 Transcription								
	1.7.3 Punctuation								
108			1.7.3: Can possible confusion with ISBD punctuation be addressed?				CCC		CCC withdrawn (already discussed by the JSC in the past)

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	1.7.4 Accents and other diacritical marks								
111	1.7.4: Change caption to "Diacritical marks and guideline to "Transcribe diacritical marks such as accents as they appear on the source of information"								Agree
	1.7.7 Letters or words intended to be read more than once								
112					1.7.7 revise to remove reference to square brackets				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	1.7.9 Inaccuracies								
113		1.7.9: dislike recording inaccuracies with no indication that they have been transcribed from the resource. It is misleading to record inaccuracies without corrections, or with the correction in a different element					ALA		ALA withdrawn (as already discussed by JSC in the past)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		1.8 Numbers expressed as numerals or as words							
115		1.8.1: Request consistent editorial policy on whether the instruction for early printed resources is an alternative or an exception					ALA		The difference is because that is how they were originally suggested - some are legitimately alternatives and some are legitimately exceptions. No change to 1.8.1.
		1.8.2 Form of numerals							
116					1.8.2 3rd para: revise wording				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
		1.8.4 Inclusive numbers							
117						1.8.4: See separate document on punctuation in serials numbering (Attachment E)	Sec		Add exceptions to allow use of a slash at 2.6.1.4 and 2.12.9.3. Note expansion of years in serials numbering as an AACR2 change.
		1.8.5 Ordinal numbers							
119					1.8.5 2nd and 3rd para: see rewording				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	1.9 Dates								
	1.9.2 Supplied dates								
121		1.9.2.5 etc.: The use of the convention of a final s to identify both decades and centuries leaves the first decade of the century ambiguous. Not convinced that the formulation "21st century" should not be used.	1.9.2.6: "1900s" does not distinguish between a probable decade 1900-1909, or the probable century 1900-1999. Suggest revert to AACR2 method	CILIP: 1.9.2.5-10: Confusion with respect to a work dated to the first decade of a century			CCC CILIP		Delete 1.9.2.5-1.9.2.10. Add examples to 1.9.2.4.
122					1.9.2.7: Reword to remove use of "s"				See line 121
123					1.9.2.10: reword to remove use of "s"				See line 121
	CHAPTER 2 IDENTIFYING MANIFESTATIONS AND ITEMS								
125	Ch 2-4: Revise chapter titles to put emphasis on "describing", or use user task for each chapter						ACOC		No change. The JSC can see the issues but cannot find an alternative that accurately describes the distinctions between the chapters.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
126	Chapter 2: Facsimiles and reproductions: include a general statement and link back to it (see wording)						ACOC		Including this in chapter 2 would mean a new 2.3, and all cross-references would need to be changed. Will be included as a new 1.11. Use ACOC possible text using "related work or manifestation". No instructions will be removed from chapter 2.
127	Chapter 2: Data elements in more than one language or script: include a general statement and link back to it (see wording)						ACOC		Disagree ACOC (Reluctantly). No assurance that there is a general principle. Linked to ISBD requirements for areas 1and 2.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
128					Chapter 2: give a list of elements to be transcribed and a list of elements to be recorded		LC		Withdrawn by LC. There are a number of elements which are a combination of recording numbers and transcribing other characters. Have been consistent at the element - will say "transcribe". LC will consider preparing a separate document.
129					Chapter 2: consider a different approach for all of the "Parallel …" elements: delete them by adding a general instruction to treat them as just another form of the element, move them all to an appendix, or code them so that catalogers can choose to suppress them.		LC		Disagree LC
130					Chapter 2: In "e.g." statements, "or" should not be used to separate words or phrases				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		2.0 Purpose and scope							
		2.1 Basis for identification of the resource							
132		2.1: There will not always be an applicable source. Add a paragraph to 2.1.2.1 saying that when there are no applicable sources of information, the cataloger may supply the information					ALA		Withdrawn. Covered by 2.2.4.
		2.1.1 General guidelines							
		2.1.2 Comprehensive description							
133			2.1.2.2: It is not clear if a label on a sound recording, or a title page on a book, identifying only the individual contents of the resource would qualify as a "source of information identifying the resource as a whole." (see comments)				CCC	ALA 2.2.2	Disagree. The source identifying the resource as a whole may not be the same as the source of the collective title.
134			2.1.2.3 1st para, last bullet: add "or appropriate"				CCC		Covered by line 135

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
135					2.1.2.3 1st para: See replacement wording		LC		Agree, but Editor to adjust wording to create full sentences. Changes: second bullet use "unnumbered or not sequentially numbered"; begin third bullet with "if the concept of sequential issuing in parts is not applicable …"
	2.2 Sources of information								
	2.2.2 Preferred source of information								
139	2.2.2: include more online examples in the parenthetic al examples						Editor		Withdrawn - no specific suggestions

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
140		2.2.2: add an instruction dealing with cases in which the application of the instructions would lead to a preferred source of information that only gives the titles of individual contents but no collective title, whereas another source (such as a container) does give a collective title. Preference should be given to a source that gives a collective title.						**ALA 2.2.2**	Too complex to resolve at meeting - add to list of deferred issues. See line 133
143					2.2.2.1 2nd-4th para: See revised wording	LC			Moot with decisions at 150-152

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
146					2.2.2.2 last two paras: replace with revised wording	OR 2.2.2.2: The second last paragraph gives no meaning. If none of the sources bears a title, why should we still choose one of them as a source? The last paragraph must be the correct one. [Norway]	LC		Change second last para to: "If none of the sources listed above bears a title, use as the preferred source of information another source within the resource that bears a title, giving preference to a source in which the information is formally presented." Retain last paragraph, use "sources specified above".
147			2.2.2.3-2.2.2.4: A provision is needed to choose a source bearing a collective title if the label or the embedded metadata doesn't			OR 2.2.2.3 Alternative: since containers and/or jackets usually carry relevant information, why prefer label to container for the preferred source of information? . [France]	CCC	ALA 2.2.2	See lines 133 and 140

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		2.2.3 More than one preferred source of information							
149					2.2.3: add explanations to the references			LC gen editorial (4)	Agree (General comments discussion)
		2.2.4 Other sources of information							
150		2.2.4: prefer to treat all containers the same. See text					ALA		Deferred issue (line 140). Change 2.2.4 b) to "a container that is not issued as part of the resource itself (e.g., a box or case made by the owner)"
151			2.2.4: 2nd and 3rd paras would be better placed under the general guidelines at 2.2.2.1						Agree
152			2.2.4 a) reword as "a) other material (e.g., a leaflet or an "about" file)"				CCC		Disagree
	2.3 Title								
153					2.3: delete core label			**LC 2.3**	Disagree LC (line 35)
	2.3.1 Basic instructions on recording titles								
155					2.3.1.1. 1st para: use "is a word, character, or group of words and/or characters …"		G	**LC 2.3.1.1**	Agree LC

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
2.3.2 Title proper									
158		2.3.2.1 suggest "An alternative title (i.e., title information preceded by or, or a similar linking word or phrase—e.g., *The tempest, or, The enchanted island*) is treated as part of the title proper."					Editor G		Use definition from ISBD. Post-meeting note: Definition revised in glossary; parenthetical deleted from 2.3.2.1
159					2.3.2.5: move last sentence to separate para				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
161					2.3.2.6 3rd para and 2nd opt add: See rewording				Agree. New sentence is a separate para following the examples "Record the collective title …"
162			2.3.2.8.1: see rewording to incorporate the notion of distinctive/non-distinctive title						Disagree, remove "Musical" from caption
2.3.3 Parallel title									
164					2.3.3: Change element name to "parallel title proper"		EA		Agree (also 2.12.3: "Parallel Title Proper of Series")
167			2.3.3.4: Correct caption and examples to remove type of musical composition						Agree

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
168					2.3.3.5.1, 1st para: change "later parallel title" to "later variant title"; change ref to 2.3.8				Covered by line 187
169					2.3.3.5.2, 1st para: change "later parallel title" to "later variant title"; change ref to 2.3.8				Covered by line 187
170					2.3.3.5.2 2nd para: change "earlier parallel title" to "earlier variant title"; change ref to 2.3.7				Covered by line 187
171					2.3.3.5.3 4th para: change "earlier parallel title" to "earlier variant title"; change ref to 2.3.7				Covered by line 187
	2.3.4 Other title information								
174					2.3.4.7.1, 1st para: change "later other title information" to "a later variant title"; change ref to 2.3.8				Covered by line 187

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
175						OR 2.3.4.7.1 (multipart monographs): Add ", and the addition or change is considered to be important for identification or access", as it is in 2.3.4.7.2. [Spain]	CCC	OR 2.3.4.7.1	Agree. Instruction will be changing to refer to variant title.
176					2.3.4.7.2, 1st para: change "later other title information" to "a later variant title"; change ref to 2.3.8				Covered by line 187
178					2.3.4.7.3, 3rd para: change "earlier other title information" to "an earlier variant title"; change ref to 2.3.7				Covered by line 187
179					2.3.4.7.3, 4th para: change "earlier other title information" to "an earlier variant title"; change ref to 2.3.7				Covered by line 187

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
180					2.3.4.7.3, 6th para: change "earlier other title information" to "an earlier variant title"; change ref to 2.3.7				Covered by line 187
		2.3.5 Parallel other title information							
181		[See also ALA comment on parallel production, etc. statements at 2.8.3.1]	2.3.5.1: use "in a language or script that differs from that of the title proper or differs from the statement that appears first" [comment made at 2.4.3.1]		2.3.5.1: use "in another language or script."		CCC	**LC 2.3.5.1**	Use "in a language and/or script different from that recorded in the other title information element"
182					2.3.5.4.1, 1st para: change "later other title information" to "a later variant title"; change ref to 2.3.8				Covered by line 187
183						OR 2.3.5.4.1 (multipart monographs): Add ", and the addition or change is considered to be important for identification or access", as it is in 2.3.4.7.2. [Spain]	CCC	**OR 2.3.4.7.1**	See line 175

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
184					2.3.5.4.2, 1st para: change "later other title information" to "a later variant title"; change ref to 2.3.8				Covered by line 187
185					2.3.5.4.3, 3rd para: change "earlier other title information" to "an earlier variant title"; change ref to 2.3.7				Covered by line 187
186					2.3.5.4.3, 4th para: change "earlier other title information" to "an earlier variant title"; change ref to 2.3.7				Covered by line 187

Comme	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	2.3.6 Variant title								
187					2.3.6: see separate document for proposal for new element sub-types for Earlier title proper and Later title proper (Attachment F)		EA		Agree LC to have element sub-titles "Earlier title proper" and "Later title proper" (Editor to adjust LC wording as necessary). Disagree with moving Variant title after the two new elements. Change first sentence of scope of Variant title to include: "Earlier title proper", "Later title proper" and "Parallel other title information", "Abbreviated title" and "Key title". Alternative title has already been deleted. No change to 2.3.6.1 a) except Tom will ensure there isn't an "e.g." and "i.e." in the same parenthetical.
187 (cont)									Agree to add g) but replace "variant titles" at the beginning with "those". Change references. Disagree with suggested text on "Recording changes in variant titles", they are just other variant titles.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
188					2.3.6.1: remove "an alternative title" add "or parallel other title information"		G		See line 187
190					2.3.6.1 a): remove "etc."				Post-meeting note: The Editor will be removing the "etc." at the end of parenthetical examples.
193					2.3.6.1 3rd para: add "or parallel other title information"				Post-meeting note: "parallel other title information" will be added to the first paragraph under 2.3.6.1, along with "earlier title proper", "later title proper", "abbreviated title", and "key title". The third and fourth paragraphs will be revised to delete "parallel titles, or other title information" and to change "earlier variant titles" in the third paragraph to "earlier titles proper" and "later variant titles" in the fourth paragraph to "later titles proper".
194					2.3.6.1 4th para: add "or parallel other title information"				See line 193

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	2.3.7 Earlier variant title								
195				BL 2.3.7: rename element as : "Earlier title proper" [comment at 0.6.2]			BL EA		See line187
196		2.3.7 Def of earlier variant title: use "… that no longer appears on the current iteration" [comment made at Glossary]					G		Disagree - it may still appear, but not be the title proper
197					2.3.7.4 1st para: remove "or that appeared in a different form on earlier iterations" use "earlier variant titles"				Covered by line 187
198					2.3.7.5 1st para: remove "or if it appeared in a different form on earlier iterations" use "earlier variant title"				Covered by line 187
199					2.3.7.6 1st para: remove "or if it appeared in a different form on earlier iterations" use "earlier variant title"				Covered by line 187

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
200					2.3.7.7 1st para: remove "or if it appeared in a different form on earlier iterations" use "earlier variant title"				Covered by line 187
	2.3.8 Later variant title								
201						OR 2.3.8 states that later variants of the title proper are a required element. But in 2.3.8.3 it is only required if it is considered to be important. What is correct? This also goes for 2.3.8.4.1 and 2.3.8.4.2. [Norway]	ACOC		No longer a core element.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
202		2.3.8 Def of Later variant title: revise the final phrase to read: "… a later issue or part of a serial or multipart monograph that differs from or was not present on the first or earliest issue or part." [Comment made at Glossary]					G		See line 196
203					2.3.8.4.1: change "variation in the title proper" to "variant title"				Covered by line 187
204					2.3.8.4.2, 1st para: use "later variant titles"				Covered by line 187
205					2.3.8.5.1: change "later parallel title" to "later variant title"				Covered by line 187
206					2.3.8.5.1: change "later parallel title" to "later variant title"				Covered by line 187
207					2.3.8.6: change "later other title information" to "a later variant title"				Covered by line 187
208					2.3.8.7: change "later parallel other title information" to "a later variant title"				Covered by line 187

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		2.3.9 Key title							
209		2.3.9 Def of Key title: use "continuing resource" [comment made at Glossary]					G		Withdrawn (previously agreed not to use continuing resource)
210				BL: 2.3.9: the key title should only be taken from an official source		OR 2.3.9.2: Sources for ISSN and Key title [ISSN] (LC doesn't agree that ISSN database should be the only source of these elements (perhaps reconsider when database is freely available)	LC		Sources of information for key title: Take the key title from the following sources (in order of preference): a) ISSN Register b) a source within the resource itself c) any other source." 2.3.9.3: "Record a key title as it appears on the source from which it is taken." See also line 391." Post-meeting note: "from which it is taken" not used.

Comme	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
210 (cont)						but would agree to saying to giving the sources in a priority order: ISSN database and then the resource and then any other source.)			

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		2.3.10 Abbreviated title							
211					2.3.10.3: delete: "from which it is taken"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
		2.3.11 Devised title							
212		2.3.11 Devised title: mention "Supplied title" or make reference in Glossary [comment made at Glossary]				Editor 2.3.11.1: Does the definition of "devised title" need to be revised to allow for the use of a devised title as the preferred title for a work when applying the alternative under 6.27.1.4 for a compilation that lacks a collective title?	G		No longer a separate element. Still want a definition in the Glossary (can stay as it is). Make a see reference from "Supplied title"
217			2.3.11.7: remove "of resources"						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
218						OR 2.3.11: A title from an incipit is not a devised title. Instead the incipit alternative [suggested by France] should be added to 2.2.2.2 as an exception as (d) with the wording: "an incipit or opening words of the text". [France with LC's suggested wording]	LC		Disagree LC. Situation is covered by revised last paragraph at 2.2.2.2.
	2.4 Statement of responsibility								
219					2.4: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	2.4.1 Basic instructions on recording statements of responsibility								
224						NS: 2.4.1.4: Is in exception needed for Editors of serials now that Statement of responsibility is a core element?	Sec		Reinstate exception present in Editor's draft (August 2007). Secretary - remove from AACR2 changes list.
	2.4.2 Statement of responsibility relating to title								
229					2.4.2: Change element name to end with "title proper"	Editor: 2.4.2: Should the name of the element be changed to "Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper" to reflect the limitation in the definition (see 2.4.2.1)?	EA		Agree
230					2.4.2.3 2nd para: delete		LC		Withdrawn. The core is the first recorded, this tells you what to record first if you are not going to record them all.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
2.4.3 Parallel statement of responsibility relating to title									
231					2.4.3: Change element name to end with "title proper"	Editor: 2.4.3: Should the name of the element be changed to "Parallel Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper" to reflect the limitation in the definition (see 2.4.3.1)?	EA		Agree
232			2.4.3.1: use "in a language or script that differs from that of the title proper or differs from the statement that appears first"		2.4.3.1: Use "a statement of responsibility relating to title proper (see 2.4.2.1) in another language or script."		CCC	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181
2.5 Edition statement									
234					2.5: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
2.5.1 Basic instructions on recording edition statements									
235						Editor 2.5.1.6.3: Is the phrase "and this change does not require a new description" appropriate in this instruction?	EditorC		This is OK based on decision at line 101.
2.5.2 Designation of edition									
236					2.5.2.1: use "is a word, character, or group of words and/or characters …"		G	LC 2.3.1.1	Agree LC (line 155)
238			2.5.2.1 3rd para: add "g) a particular voice range or music format for notated music"				CCC		Agree use: "g) a particular voice range or format for notated music"
2.5.3 Parallel designation of edition									
240					2.5.3.1: use "in another language or script."		G	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181
2.5.4 Statement of responsibility relating to the edition									
2.5.5 Parallel statement of responsibility relating to the edition									
241					2.5.5.1: use "in another language or script."		G	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	2.5.6 Designation of a named revision of an edition								
243	2.5.6-2.5.9: incorporate into Designation of edition (see wording)					ACOC			Withdrawn. Required for compatibility with ISBD. Examples are correct.
244					2.5.6.1: use "is a word, character, or group of words and/or characters …"		G	LC 2.3.1.1	Agree LC (line 155)
245					2.5.6.3: use "revision of the edition"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	2.5.7 Parallel designation of a named revision of an edition								
246					2.5.7.1: use "in another language or script."		G	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181
	2.5.8 Statement of responsibility relating to a named revision of an edition								
247					2.5.8.1: use "relating to one or more but not all named revisions of an edition"		G		Delete "being described but not to all named revisions of the edition". End with "… named revision of an edition." This provision is no longer in ISBD. 2.5.8.3 - remove parenthetical.
	2.5.9 Parallel statement of responsibility relating to a named revision of an edition								
248					2.5.9.1: use "in another language or script."		G	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181
	2.6 Numbering of serials								
249					2.6: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
250		2.6: Instead of having 2.6.6-2.6.9, reword 2.6.2-2.6.3 to have them deal with first issue/part of each sequence of numbering, and reword 2.6.4-2.6.5 to have them deal with last issue/part of each sequence of numbering		BL: In general agreement with LC	2.6: Simplify. See separate documents (Attachment G)		LC EA		See revised element analysis for changes to elements
		2.6.1 Basic instructions on recording numbering of serials							
251		2.6.1.1 2nd para: Include in Glossary as would be useful in chapter 6					ALA G		Agree also add to Numbering of Part, Numbering within series; Numbering within subseries
252	2.6.1.2: reword a)-d) as "When choosing a source of information for numbering of serials, use a source for the issue or part being described that bears the title proper."	2.6.1.2: It would be helpful to be able to take numeric and/or alphabetic and/or chronological designations from any source on the first issue or part, not just that source on the first issue or part that bears the title proper.			2.6.1.2: delete or remove first sequence of a)-d) paras		ALA		The summary sources of information instructions for Numbering at 2.6.1.2 will be deleted; the instructions will be given for each sub-element; those instructions already allow information to be taken from any source within the first issue or part (although there is an order of preference).

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
254		2.6.1.4: include a category for the numbering of the last issue or part under the new system					EA		See line 250
2.6.2 Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part									
255					2.6.2.1: merge two paras		G		Agree LC (will match Glossary)
256			2.6.2.2 b) add "on the first issue or part"					**CCC 2.6.2.2**	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
2.6.3 Chronological designation of first issue or part									
257			2.6.3.2 b) add "on the first issue or part"					CCC 2.6.2.2	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
258					2.6.3.3 alternative: move to 2.6.2.3 as an instruction	Editor 2.6.3.3: Should the alternative be an exception rather than an alternative?	EditorC		LC consider it to be numeric designation and not chronological designation. Agree to have it as an instruction at 2.6.2.3. Make a reference at 2.6.3.1: "For a designation consisting of a year and a number that is a division of the year, see 2.6.2.3."
259					2.6.3.3 opt add: remove reference to square brackets, add "Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4."		Editor	**LC 2.6.3.3**	Agree LC Post-meeting note: The JSC agreed to make the same change at 2.4.1.5 optional omission, 2.4.1.7, 2.5.2.3, and 2.8.6.4

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
			2.6.4 Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part						
260					2.6.4.1: merge two paras		G		Agree LC (will match Glossary)
261			2.6.4.2 b) add "on the last issue or part"					**CCC 2.6.4.2**	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
			2.6.5 Chronological designation of last issue or part						
263			2.6.5.2 b) add "on the last issue or part"					CCC 2.6.4.2	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
			2.6.6 Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part of first sequence						
265					2.6.6.1: merge two paras		G		Agree LC (will match Glossary)
266			2.6.6.2 b) add "on the last issue or part"					CCC 2.6.4.2	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
			2.6.7 Chronological designation of last issue or part of first sequence						
269			2.6.7.2 b) add "on the last issue or part"					CCC 2.6.4.2	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
			2.6.8 Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part of new sequence						
271					2.6.8.1: merge two paras		G		Agree LC (will match Glossary)
272			2.6.8.2 b) add "on the first issue or part"					CCC 2.6.2.2	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
274					2.6.8.3: add "Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4."			LC 2.6.3.3	Agree LC (line 259). Remove square brackets around "new series"
			2.6.9 Chronological designation of first issue or part of new sequence						
275			2.6.9.2 b) add "on the first issue or part"					CCC 2.6.2.2	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	2.7 Production statement								
277					2.7.1.1: add "in an unpublished form"		G		Agree LC
	2.7.1 Basic instructions on recording production statements								
279					2.7.1.2: delete (only give sources of information for elements)			LC gen editorial (5)	Disagree (General comments discussion)
	2.7.2 Place of production								
280					2.7.2.6: add explanations to the references			LC gen editorial (4)	Agree (General comments discussion)
	2.7.3 Parallel place of production								
283					2.7.3.1: use "in another language or script."		G	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181
	2.7.4 Producer's name								
284					2.7.4.4. opt add: Replace ref to square brackets by ""Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4."			LC 2.6.3.3	Agree LC (line 259)
	2.7.5 Parallel producer's name								
285					2.7.5.1: use "in another language or script."		G	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181
	2.7.6 Date of production								
287					2.7.6.3: Change "follow it with" to "add the corresponding"		Editor	**LC 2.7.6.3**	Agree LC

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
288					2.7.6.3 optional addition, add "Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4."			LC 2.6.3.3	Agree LC (line 259)
289					2.7.6.4 opt add: replace ref to square brackets with "Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4."			LC 2.6.3.3	Agree LC (line 259)
292			2.7.6.6 1st para: conflict with 2.7.6.5 last para						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	2.8 Publication statement								
298					2.8: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)
	2.8.1 Basic instructions on recording publication statements								
299					2.8.1.1 Add new para: "For statements about production of resources in an unpublished form, see 2.7."				Agree LC
300					2.8.1.2: delete (only give sources of information for elements)			LC gen editorial (5)	Disagree (General comments discussion)

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		2.8.2 Place of publication							
303					2.8.2.6: add explanations to references			LC gen editorial (4)	Agree (General comments discussion)
		2.8.3 Parallel place of publication							
306		2.8.3.1: change "title proper" to "place of publication". A place of publication is not a parallel place of publication when it is the only place of publication that appears.			2.8.3.1: use "in another language or script"		ALA	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181
		2.8.4 Publisher's name							
307					2.8.4.4 opt add: replace ref to square brackets with "Indicate that the addition was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4."			LC 2.6.3.3	Agree LC (line 259)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
308		2.8.4.7: The instruction does not make it clear whether the name of the distributor is to be recorded as such or as the name of the publisher. If the former, we recommend that the instructions also allow recording of the name of the producer or manufacturer.					ALA		The name of the distributor is recorded in that element. Change 2.8.4.7 to "For a resource in a published form, if no publisher is named within the resource itself, and the publisher cannot be identified from other sources as specified under 2.2.4, record *publisher not identified*." Issue with core elements, for ISBD (and MARC21), will need to suppress "Publisher not identified" if distributor's name is present. Same change will be made for Date of publication. Note AACR2 change.
309					2.8.4.7 3rd para: delete (out of scope)			**LC 2.8.4.7**	Agree LC
		2.8.5 Parallel publisher's name							
310					2.8.5.1: use "in another language or script"		G	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181
		2.8.6 Date of publication							
312					2.8.6.3: change "follow it with" to "add the corresponding"			LC 2.7.6.3	Agree LC (line 287)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
313					2.8.6.3 opt add: replace ref to square brackets with "Indicate that the addition was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4."			LC 2.6.3.3	Agree LC (line 259). Post-meeting note: Also at 2.9.6.3
317					2.8.6.6, last para: delete (out of scope)			LC 2.8.4.7	See line 309
	2.9 Distribution statement								
318					2.9: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)
	2.9.1 Basic instructions on recording distribution statements								
319					2.9.1.2: delete (only give sources of information for elements)			LC gen editorial (5)	Disagree (General comments discussion)
	2.9.2 Place of distribution								
320					2.9.2.6 1st para: add explanations to the references			LC gen editorial (4)	Agree (General comments discussion)
	2.9.3 Parallel place of distribution								
323					2.9.3.1: use "another language or script"		G	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181
	2.9.4 Distributor's name								
326					2.9.4.4 opt add: replace ref to square brackets with "Indicate that the addition was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4."			LC 2.6.3.3	Agree LC (line 259)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	2.9.5 Parallel distributor's name								
328					2.9.5.1: use "in another language or script"		G	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181
	2.9.6 Date of distribution								
329			2.9.6: provide a way of identifying dates of distribution and dates of manufacture when they are recorded as a substitute for the date of publication.					CCC	Withdrawn based on line 308.
	2.10 Manufacture statement								
332					2.10: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)
	2.10.1 Basic instructions on recording manufacture statements								
333					2.10.1.1 1st para: add "in a published form"		G		Agree LC
334					2.10.1.2: delete (give sources of information only for elements)			LC gen editorial (5)	Disagree (General comments discussion)
	2.10.2 Place of manufacture								
339					2.10.2.6 1st para: add explanations to the references			LC gen editorial (4)	Agree (General comments discussion)
	2.10.3 Parallel place of manufacture								
342					2.10.3.1: use "in another language or script"		G	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181

Comment	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	2.10.4 Manufacturer's name								
343					2.10.4 core label: add "for a resource in a published form" delete "recorded"			**LC 2.10.4**	Post-meeting note: "for a published resource" is to be added to the core element paragraph following "Manufacturer's name is a core element" (line 46)
344					2.10.4.4 opt add: replace ref to square brackets with "Indicate that the addition was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4"			LC 2.6.3.3	Agree LC (line 259)
	2.10.5 Parallel manufacturer's name								
345					2.10.5.1: use "in another language or script"		G	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181
	2.10.6 Date of manufacture								
347					2.10.6 core label: add "for a resource in a published form"			LC 2.10.4	Post-meeting note: covered by Line 46
349					2.10.6.3 opt add: Change "follow it with" to "add the corresponding"			LC 2.7.6.3	Agree LC (line 287)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
350					2.10.6.3 opt add: add "Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4."			LC 2.6.3.3	Agree LC (line 259, 288)
	2.11 Copyright date								
354		2.11: Other dates are found under "Date of …". Either rename this element or make a reference from "Date of Copyright." [comment made at Glossary]					EA		Disagree. "Copyright date" is common usage
	2.11.1 Basic instructions on recording copyright dates								
355						Editor 2.11.1.3: Should a new set of instructions on notes on copyright dates be added under 2.20, and the cross-reference under 2.11.1.3 be changed to refer to those new instructions?	EA		Agree to add new element at 2.20.10 and change cross-reference at 2.11.1.3.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	2.12 Series statement								
357					2.12: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)
	2.12.1 Basic instructions on recording series statements								
358					2.12.1.1: 1st para reword and delete 2nd para		G		Use "A series statement is a statement identifying a series to which a resource belongs and the numbering of the resource within the series. A series statement may also include information identifying one or more subseries to which the resource being described belongs." Add 2nd para to Glossary.
	2.12.4 Other title information of series								
360					2.1.2.4.3: replace "provides valuable information identifying" with "is considered to be necessary for identification of"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	2.12.5 Parallel other title information of series								
361					2.12.5.1: use "in another language or script"		G	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181
	2.12.7 Parallel statement of responsibility relating to series								
362					2.12.7.1: use "is a statement of responsibility"				Post-meeting note: Scope statements for all parallel elements will be revised as in the 2009-04-19 revised draft of the Glossary

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
363					2.12.7.1: use "in another language or script"		G	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181
	2.12.8 ISSN of series								
364		2.12.8.2: [Comment 1] We prefer that the ISSN be taken from any source, [Comment 2] and that ISSNs for both main and subseries be recorded. If necessary, an optional omission might be included to support the ISBD restrictions. **[Note: AACR2 change 1.6H7, 2.0B2 etc.]**					ALA		Comment 1: Withdrawn. This is a statement, and is transcribed. Comment 2: 2.12.8.3: turn last para into optional omission (AACR2 change). CCC rep to note for RDA/MARC Working Group as 490$x is currently not repeatable. Post-meeting note: change also made at 2.12.16.3
	2.12.9 Numbering within series								
367						Editor 2.12.9.3: Should the instruction in the third paragraph ("If the numbering consists of a year and a number ...") be labeled either as an alternative or as an exception?	EditorC		See line 258

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
368					2.12.9.4: use "date of production, publication, manufacture, or distribution"				Post-meeting note: covered by decision on LC general comments—editorial matters (1)
369					2.12.9.6: add " Indicate that the addition was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4."			LC 2.6.3.3	Agree LC (line 259). Remove square brackets around "new series"
370					2.1.2.9.8: explain references			LC gen editorial (4)	Agree (General comments discussion)
	2.12.10 Title proper of subseries								
373					2.12.10.3 1st para: delete		LC		Agree
	2.12.13 Parallel other title information of subseries								
376					2.12.13.1: use "in another language or script"		G	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181
	2.12.15 Parallel statement of responsibility relating to subseries								
377					2.12.15.1: use "in another language or script"		G	LC 2.3.5.1	See line 181
	2.13 Mode of issuance								
378		2.13: include instructions on recording mode of issuance, make reference to 1.6						ALA	1.6 does not cover the situation when you do not make a new description, i.e., when a single-unit changes to a multi-part monograph. The note on publication could be used. Add to future issues list.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
2.13.1 Basic instructions on recording modes of issuance									
379		2.13.1.3 It is not clear whether a collection containing multiple physical units falls under "single unit" or "multipart monograph"	2.13.1.3, single unit: suggest that the scope of single unit as a mode of issuance encompass an archival resource				ALA		A collection does not have a mode of issuance, as it is not issued. CCC and ALA withdrawn.
380					2.13.1.3, single unit: "A resource … " to "A complete resource …;"		G		Disagree LC
381		2.1.3.1.3, serial: suggest use "A continuing resource …" [Comment made at Glossary]					ALA G		Disagree (not using continuing resource)
382		2.1.3.1.3, integrating resource: suggest use "A continuing resource …" [Comment made at Glossary]					ALA G		Disagree (not using continuing resource) and integrating resources can be finite
383					2.13.1.3, integrating resource: change "… that do not remain discrete and are …" to "that do not remain discrete but are …"		G		Agree LC. Also change at 1.1.3. At 2.1.2.4 use "for an integrating resource" and remove "that is added to or changed by means of updates that do not remain discrete but are integrated into the whole"

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	2.14 Frequency								
384					2.14.1.1: replace "frequency of" with "schedule for"		G	**LC 2.14.1.1**	Use "Frequency is the intervals at which the issues or parts of a serial or the updates to an integrating resource are issued." (based on ISBD)
	2.15 Identifier for the manifestation								
	2.15.1 Basic instructions on recording identifiers for the manifestation								
391						OR 2.15.1.4: See OR 2.3.9.2	LC		Disagree
392			2.15.1.4: add an exception to indicate that for publishers' numbers for sound recordings, the identifier is preceded by the brand or trade name associated with it rather than the name of the agency responsible for assigning the identifier.			NS 2.15.1.4: CCC noted that examples at 2.15.2.3 and 2.15.3.3 do not contain the name of the agency. Is there any conflict with the second sentence of these instructions?	CCC		Delete "applying the basic instructions on recording identifiers for the manifestation given under 2.15.1" from first sentence at 2.15.2.3 and 2.15.3.3. 2.15.1.4 use "Precede the identifier with a trade name or the name of the agency, etc., responsible for assigning the identifier, if readily ascertainable."
393			2.15.1.4 2nd para: add an exception for notated music				CCC		Covered by line 392 and 399

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
394						OR 2.15.1.4: Remove ISRC example from 2.15.1.4, since it is not an example of an identifier for a manifestation [Sweden, France]	CCC		ISRC is at the expression level. Remove the example, move to 6.14.
395						NS: 2.15.1.4: ALA has suggested adding examples of commercial barcodes - is this appropriate?	Egs		13 digit ISBN is the same as an EAN. Instruction does not limit. Do not add examples.
397			2.15.1.7: make this an optional addition				CCC		Covered by line 392

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	2.15.2 Publisher's number for music								
399						NS: Request confirmation that 2.15.2 only covers printed music (5.7B19) as per CCC examples comment. ALA suggested sound recording and video recording examples for 2.15.2 - add these to 2.15.1.4?	Egs		ALA withdrawn. Move Nimbus example as per CCC.
	2.15.3 Plate number for music								
400				BL: 2.15.3.2: Plate numbers must be taken from the source			Editor		Disagree BL - situation is unlikely to occur to look for a plate number outside the resource. If it does, an authorized source is acceptable.
	2.20 Note								
	2.20.2 Note on title								
401					2.20.2.1: add to end " and other information relating to a title"		G		Agree

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
402						OR 2.20.2.3 does not mention sound recordings [France]. Since 2.20.2.3 refers to 2.2.2.2 and 2.2.2.3 but not to 2.2.2.4, CCC wonders if this means that any resource covered 2.2.2.4 requires a note for source of title. CCC does not feel that this is desirable.	CCC		There is no obvious standard source for sound recordings, so there is no way to write this in. No change.
	2.20.3 Note on statement of responsibility								
405					2.20.3.1 3rd para: add ", on other information related to the statement of responsibility, "				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	2.20.4 Note on edition statement								
406						Editor 2.20.2.4: Does the instruction at the end of the last paragraph ("Indicate the numbering or publication dates to which the deletion applies.") need to be broadened to cover notes on other types of title changes?	EditorC		Agree
	2.20.7 Note on publication statement								
407			2.20.7.1: add "or copyright date"				G		Covered by line 355 (now moot)
408					2.20.7.1 add ", on suspension of publication,"		G		Agree
	2.20.10 Note on series statement								
409					2.20.10.3: replace "as a structured" with "in a"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	2.20.11 Note on frequency								
410					2.20.11.1: revise to use "schedule for"		G	LC 2.14.1.1	Will be revised to reflect the instructions under 2.20.11. Disagree LC

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
411					2.20.11.3: revise to use "schedule for"			LC 2.14.1.1	Disagree LC
	2.20.12 Note on issue, part, or iteration used as the basis for identification of the resource								
413		2.20.12.5: If a note should always be made, should this not be included as a core element?			2.20.12.5: delete "always"		ALA		Agree LC (AACR2 change 9.7B22). ALA covered by LC comment
	CHAPTER 3 DESCRIBING CARRIERS								
	3.1 General guidelines on describing carriers								
	3.1.1 Sources of information								
417					3.1.1: delete (only give sources of information for elements)			LC gen editorial (5)	Disagree (General comments discussion)
	3.1.4 Resources consisting of more than one carrier								
418					Editor 3.1.4: Should the caption for 3.1.4 be revised to reflect more accurately the scope of the instructions, or should the instructions be expanded to cover resources consisting of multiple carriers of the same type?	EditorC			Agree to change caption to "Resources Consisting of More Than One Carrier Type". Also add "type" to first sentence.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
420					3.1.4 1st para: add explanation of methods			LC gen editorial (4)	Agree (General comments discussion)
	3.1.6 Change in carrier characteristics								
422					3.1.6.2: revise 2nd sentence to reflect the context of an integrating resource				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	3.3 Carrier type								
	3.3.1 Basic instructions on recording carrier type								
425		3.3.1.2: present list in a tabular form with definitions			3.3.1.2: present terms in a table		ALA		Incorporate footnotes in Glossary definitions. Did not agree to include definitions in the table (assuming will be able to click through to Glossary)
426					3.3.1.2, audio carriers list: delete "wire cylinders"		EA		Agree
427					3.3.1.2, audio carriers list: add "audio file"		EA		Withdrawn. Already in the controlled list at file type. The carrier will be online, or flash drive etc.
428					3.3.1.2, audio carriers list: add "streaming audio file"		EA		Withdrawn.
429					3.3.1.2, computer carriers list: add "USB flash drive" (see definition)		EA		Did not agree to add, will be covered by "other". Issues: terminology needs to settle down; need to seek agreement with RDA/ONIX (Alan Danskin). Add example in extent.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
430					3.3.1.2, projected image carriers: delete "Use for photographic slides only" in footnote 5		EA		Agree
431	3.3.1.2, unmediated carriers: there are too few terms, for e.g. what would be the type for a photograph?						ACOC		No change. Ambiguity between card and sheet makes it difficult to apply to photographs.
432		3.3.1.2 unmediated carriers: Add "object" to cover "realia" and other three-dimensional material					ALA EA		Agree. Alan Danskin to raise with RDA/ONIX. Margaret Stewart to raise with RDA/MARC WG. Use AACR2 definition of "object" but ending with "object" instead of "entity".
433		3.3.1.2, video carriers: add videodisc	3.3.1.2, video carriers: reinstate videodisc				ALA CCC EA		Agree

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	3.4 Extent								
	3.4.1 Basic instructions on recording extent								
437	3.4.1.5: 'Record a trade name …' at the bottom of this rule appears to be an error. These are already covered explicitly in the parenthesis in the first sentence of 3.4.1.5				3.4.1.5 last para: use "If the trade name or other similar specification was not used as the term to designate the type of unit, record that information in a note (see 3.22.2.3)."				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
438		3.4.1.7: Add a section for videodiscs with provision for recording the number of frames of still images on a videodisc (permitted as an option in AACR2 7.5B2)					Editor	Editor 3.22.2.10	Agree to add 3.4.1.7.8 for videodiscs, cartridges, etc. based on what is at 3.22.2.10. Delete 3.22.2.10. Post-meeting note: New 3.4.1.7.8 to cover videodiscs that contain only still images. 3.22.2.10 to be retained but without reference to duration and with a reference to 7.22.1.6.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
442					3.4.1.9 last para: use "Omit the total number of subunits and record only the number of units"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
443					3.4.1.10 3rd para: add ref to 3.22.2.4				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
446					3.4.1.11: add explanation of methods			LC gen editorial (4)	Agree (General comments discussion)
447			3.4.1.11.1: delete "in the collection"						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
451					3.4.1.12: add explanation of possibilities			LC gen editorial (4)	Agree (General comments discussion)
	3.4.3 Extent of notated music								
454		3.4.3.2: Consider repeating the instruction "Record the term in the singular or plural, as applicable" or otherwise make it clear that this provision of 3.4.1.3 applies here. Similarly, it would be helpful to clarify whether the option to omit the number of units (3.4.1.4) applies.					ALA		Add "Record the term in the singular or plural, as applicable." Will be added to all specialised instructions: 3.4.2.2, 3.4.3.2, 3.4.4.2, 3.4.6.2
455					3.4.3.2 1st para: repeat here the list given in 7.20.1.3				See line 708
457					3.4.3.2 2nd exception: delete		Editor		Disagree LC

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		3.4.5 Extent of text							
467					3.4.5.3 exception on p. 39: either delete or move	Editor: 3.4.5.3: The exception for early printed resources at the bottom of page 39 conflicts with the exception for early printed resources on page 38. Which exception takes precedence?	Editor		Remove "all" from exception on page 38. Suggest that in training emphasize that everything under a caption needs to be read.
471						Editor 3.4.5.10: The caption and instruction refer to both folded leaves and folded pages. Is it possible to fold a page without folding the leaf?	EditorC		3.4.5.10 Caption and instruction will refer to Folded Leaves
472		3.4.5.11: use "East Asian style"							Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
473						3.4.5.14: see separate document on leaves or pages folded accordion style (Attachment H)	ALA		Orihon will be treated as volumes (no changes to instructions at this time). Add an example at 3.22.2.11 "Leaves are joined end to end and folded accordion style"
474			3.4.5.14: clarification requested on application to sheet music with folded sheets designed to form pages				CCC		No action. 3.4.3.2 does not mention sheets when referencing 3.4.5. Would be recorded as "1 score (4 pages)"
3.5 Dimensions									
3.5.1 Basic instructions on recording dimensions									
482					3.5.1.1 3rd para: move to be 2nd para				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
484		3.5.1.4.10: There should be greater consistency between the terms used in extent and the categories used for the instructions on recording dimensions					EA ALA		It is legitimate for these to be separate. Add to list at 3.3.1.2 under Microform carriers: Microfilm roll. Add under Projected image carriers: Film roll. The Editor to define. They are consistent with the RDA/ONIX framework. Margaret Stewart to notify the RDA MARC WG.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
485					3.5.1.4.14: add " using the metric symbol mm"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
487			3.5.1.6: exception for unbound texts: use "if the text is kept folded"						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
488		3.5.1.6, exception for notated music: make ref to 7.20.1.3, not 3.4.3.2			3.5.1.6: exception for notated music: change ref to "under 7.20.1.3" [see also comment at 3.4.3.2 1st para]				LC withdrawn
	3.5.2 Dimensions of map, etc.								
489						NS: 3.5.2.6: LC suggest that the example use "folded in cover". Does this need to be included in the instruction? This would be an AACR2 change (3.5D1)	Egs		Agree to change example. No change to instruction. Not considered an AACR2 change.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	3.6 Base material								
	3.6.1 Basic instructions on recording base materials								
490					3.6.1.1: add "or the physical material of which the content is made" and delete last example		G		Change definitions to remove reference to "content": "Base material is the underlying physical material of a resource." "Applied material is a physical or chemical substance applied to a base material of a resource." "Base material for microfilm, microfiche, photographic negatives, and motion picture film is the underlying physical material of a microfilm, microfiche, photographic negative, or motion picture film resource."
	3.7 Applied material								
	3.7.2 Emulsion on microfilm and microfiche								
491				BL 3.7.2: Either generalise or supplement so can be used for other types of resources			EA		Disagree, these are separate rules in AACR2, there is a MARC 21 equivalent for recording this specific information. Add base material for sound recordings to list for future consideration.

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
3.9 Production method									
3.9.2 Production method for manuscripts									
492					3.9.2.3 3rd para: give the qualification (e.g., carbon copy) only in the singular form	NS: 3.9.2.3 LC examples comment: some should be in the singular	EA		Agree to remove "or the plural as appropriate" AACR2 change (4.7B1)
493					3.9.2.3 3rd para: delete "If a photocopy is negative, add negative" because polarity is a separate element (3.14)				Post-meeting note: agreed during discussion of Vocabularies document
3.12 Book format									
494				CILIP: "Bibliographic format" is the common term. Change name of element?			EA		Disagree. Only cataloguers need to understand it. Could be confusion with "MARC bibliographic format"
3.13 Font size									
497				CILIP: 3.13: rename as "Text characteristics" and expand scope			CILIP EA G		The Editor to look at further: Possibly expand the element to "Text characteristic". Could mean things could move out of 3.22.2.9. [Post-meeting note: element will not be expanded for first release]

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		3.13.1 Basic instructions on recording font sizes							
498					3.13.1: see rewording to expand scope				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
		3.16 Sound characteristics							
		3.16.1 Basic instructions on recording sound characteristics							
499			3.16.1.3: "medium (see 3.16.3.3)" should be added to the list						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
		3.16.2 Type of recording							
500			3.16.2: Split into two elements: "Type of encoding" and "Type of recording"				CCC EA		Withdrawn (previously decided not to make this change). Examples need to be changed, e.g. Made from an analog original. (comment: type of recording is digital)
501					3.16.2.1: delete "for playback"		G		Disagree
502					3.16.2.1 change the "i.e." statement to an "e.g." statement		G		Agree
		3.16.3 Recording medium							
503		3.16.3.3: add a new category for solid-state electrical storage. This is the type of memory used in flash drives, newer iPods, and probably Playaways.					ALA		Covered with line 429 (no action)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	3.16.5 Groove characteristic								
504				BL: 3.16.5.3: "Coarsegroove" should be the preferred term			ERD BL		Agree. Editor to check spelling in Webster's to see if one or two words or hyphenated
	3.18 Video characteristics								
	3.18.1 Basic instructions on recording video characteristics								
505			3.18.1.3: it was agreed to add resolution as an element sub-type			3.18.1.3: See 3.19.1	EA		Withdrawn. Add to list for consideration after first release.
506					3.18.1.3 2nd para: delete				Post-meeting note: The second paragraph under 3.18.1.3 was deleted as part of the clean-up edit of the PDFs in February
	3.18.2 Video format								
507					3.18.2.3: change caption to "Recording video format"				Post-meeting note: Referred to Editor
	3.19 Digital file characteristics								
	3.19.1 Basic instructions on recording digital file characteristics								
508						3.19.1 See separate document on Digital File characteristics - Resolution	EA		Agree to insert as new 3.19.5. File size to follow Encoding format. See separate document (Attachment I)
509					3.19.1.1 2nd para: add "regional encoding"				Post-meeting note: Editor will make the change

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		3.19.3 Encoding format							
510					3.19.3.3, Audio encoding formats list: change "Real audio" to "RealAudio"		G		Agree
511				CILIP: 3.19.3.3, Text encoding formats: add "Megadots"			G		Agree
512					3.19.3.3, Video encoding format list: change "Real video" to "RealVideo"		G		Agree
		3.19.4 Regional encoding							
513		3.19.4: belongs at 3.18					ALA		Withdrawn
		3.19.7 Digital representation of cartographic data							
514					3.19.7 and 7.1: change "cartographic data" to "cartographic images"		EA G		Prefer to use "data" - element analysis table will be fixed. Post-meeting note: "cartographic content" will be used.
515					3.19.7.2: change "cartographic data" to "cartographic images"				Moot see line 514
516					3.19.7.3: change "cartographic data" to "cartographic images"				Moot see line 514

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
517					3.19.7.3, object type: change "i.e." to "e.g."				Agree, Editor will also remove "or". The Editor to check whether Data type, Object type and Number of objects should be removed from the element analysis table.
	3.20 Equipment and system requirements								
	3.20.1 Basic instructions on equipment and system requirements								
518					3.20.1.1: merge two paragraphs		G		Agree
	3.21 Item-specific carrier characteristics								
519					3.21.1.1: merge two paragraphs		G		Agree
	3.21.2 Item-specific carrier characteristics of an early printed resource								
521					3.21.2.1: add wording from 3.21.2.3		G		Agree
522					3.21.2.3: remove wording				Agree
	3.22 Note								
523	3.22: The instructions should allow for notes to be made on any element covered by this chapter, not just extent and dimensions						EA		This is covered by free-text "Details of" these instructions will be given a caption in Chapter 3 (see general decision). The Editor has removed instances of "make a note" such as at 3.14.1.3.

Comme	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	3.22.2 Note on extent of manifestation								
524					3.22.2.3: change "a description of" to "additional information about"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
527					3.22.2.10: see revised wording	Editor 3.22.2.10: Which instruction should take precedence - 3.22.2.10 or 7.22.1.6?	EditorC		See line 438
	CHAPTER 4 PROVIDING ACQUISITION AND ACCESS INFORMATION								
	4.0 Purpose and scope								
532	CH. 4: cover other obtaining metadata at the item level						EA		Deferred until after first release.
	4.1 General guidelines on acquisition and access								
533					4.1.1: delete (give sources only for elements)			LC gen editorial (5)	Disagree (General comments discussion)
	4.2 Terms of availability								
534					4.2.1: change to "Terms of availability are the conditions under which the publisher, distributor, etc., will normally supply a resource or the price for a resource."		G		Agree, use "price of a resource"

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	4.6 Uniform Resource Locator								
537						OR 4.6 lacks possibility for URL for part of resource [Germany] (LC thinks such possibility was in a previous draft)	LC		German comment was to do with indicating "full text", "table of contents" etc. Defer issue until after first release.
	SECTION 2 - RECORDING ATTRIBUTES OF WORK AND EXPRESSION								
	CHAPTER 5 GENERAL GUIDELINES ON RECORDING ATTRIBUTES OF WORKS AND EXPRESSIONS								
	5.0 Scope								
539					5.0, last para: use either "have been derived" or "that has been derived"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	5.1 Terminology								
	5.1.3 Title								
540	5.1.3, title of the work: def in Glossary is clearer				5.1.3, title of the work: use "is a word, character, or group of words and/or characters …"		G	LC 2.3.1.1	Agree LC (line 155) ACOC withdrawn

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	5.1.4 Access point								
541	5.1.4: If access points include both preferred and variant access points, that should be stated	5.1.4: prefer draft ICP definition: "A name, term, code, etc. through which bibliographic or authority data is searched and identified." [comment made at Glossary]			5.1.4: use "The term access point refers to a name, term, code, etc., representing a specific work."		ACOCG		This is an explanation of use of the term in chapters 5, 6, 7. Change first sentence of 5.1.1 to: "There are a number of terms used in this chapter and in chapters 6 and 7 that carry meanings specific to their use in these chapters". Change 5.1.4 to "The term access point refers to a name, term, code, etc., representing a specific work or expression. Access points include both authorized and variant access points". Definition of Access Point in Glossary changed to: "A name, term, code, etc., under which information pertaining to a specific entity will be found."
542		5.1.4: Even in Section 2, access points are not limited to those representing works. Either use "work or expression" or "entity"							Covered by line 541

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	5.2 Functional objectives and principles								
	5.5 Preferred access points representing works and expressions								
543						OR 5.1.3 Title [of work] and at 5.5. It should be made clear that RDA does not allow for titles of expressions (not based on the title of the work). [Germany]	ACOC		No change required. In RDA there is acknowledgement that there may be a variant title that represents the expression (6.27.4.4) . FRAD removed the element for title of the expression. Titles proper for the expression could be used as variants for the title of the work.
	5.9 Cataloguer's note								
545					5.9.1.1: use "A cataloguer's note is an annotation that might be helpful to a cataloguer or to any other user of the catalogue."		G	**LC 5.9.1.1**	Disagree LC
546					5.9.1.3: replace with "Make any notes that might be helpful to a cataloguer or to any other user of the catalogue."		Editor	**LC 5.9.1.3**	Disagree LC
	CHAPTER 6 IDENTIFYING WORKS AND EXPRESSIONS								
	6.0 Purpose and scope								
549		6.0 c) Use "Differentiating between two or more works with the same title"							Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
550		6.0 last para: Delete or move to Gen Intro							Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	6.1 General guidelines on identifying works and expressions								
	6.1.3 Changes affecting the identification of a work								
553		6.1.3.3: Reword to make clear that changes require revision of the preferred access point representing the work (see wording)			6.1.3.3 1st para: make it clear that the cataloger revises the existing description		ALA		Agree ALA wording, but use "revise" rather than "change". Also make change as line 554.
554					6.1.3.3.2 delete "(major or minor)"				Agree
	6.2 Title of the work								
555					6.2: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)
	6.2.1 Basic instructions on recording titles of works								
556					6.2.1.1 1st para: use "is a word, character, or group of words and/or characters …"		G	LC 2.3.1.1	Agree LC (line 155)
557			6.2.1.6: rework instructions at 1.7.4 for inclusion here				CCC		Use ACOC wording at line 111. And include the optional addition from 1.7.4.

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		6.2.2 Preferred title for the work							
559		6.2.2: There seems to be no applicable instruction for recording a preferred title or constructing a preferred access point for a resource with a title proper devised by the cataloger.					ALA		Devised title is no longer a separate element, included with title proper. (Reference at 6.27.1.4 will change)
560	6.2.2.2: suggest Reference source. Any source from which authoritative information may be obtained, including authority files, reference works.					OR Clarify that "reference sources" includes authority files, national bibliographies, authorized databases, etc. [ISSN, Germany, Spain]	ACOC G		Use "Any source from which authoritative information may be obtained, including authority files, reference works, etc." Also Glossary. Post-meeting note: Revised Glossary definition only; no change at 6.2.2.2.
563			6.2.2.4: It is not clear that the title proper of the manifestation is the title of the work for a significant number of resources				CCC		Note as training issue

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
567						OR 6.2.2.6 List IFLA's Anonymous Classics as a preferred source for a list of uniform headings for European literature [Sweden, France]	ACOC CCC		No change. Ensure that it is in the ALA/3 list of sources.
568				CILIP 6.2.2.8: Query different instruction for incunables		OR 6.2.2.8: This section should go away- it is already covered in 6.2.2.5 (an incunable is a pre-1501 work). [France]	Editor		Delete 6.2.2.8. No need to move examples.
571		6.2.2.11.3: Request confirmation as to whether "Selections" alone would be used. If not, AACR2 change. See also 5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up/ALA response					ALA		"Selections" will not be used alone as the preferred title. Note as AACR2 change. Post-meeting note: changes required at 6.15.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		6.2.3 Variant title for the work							
574		6.2.3.3. para 2 and 4: merge							Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
576	6.2.3.4: Does "alternative linguistic form of title" need to be separately identified?						EA		Because title is an element, preferred and variant are element sub-types, the hierarchy cannot go further.
		6.3 Form of work							
578		6.3-6.6: Are elements only required to resolve conflict? Add ref to 6.27.1.9 to 6.4-6.6			6.3 core label: add "or from the name for a person, family, or corporate body"			LC gen content (2)	ALA see line 584 Agree (Line 587)
		6.4 Date of work							
579					6.4 core label: add "or from the name for a person, family, or corporate body"			LC gen content (2)	Agree (line 587)
		6.4.1 Basic instructions on recording date of work							
580		6.4.1.1 "normally the year" vs. 6.4.1.3 " by giving the year or years alone					ALA G	**ALA 6.4.1.1**	Remove "(normally the year)"
		6.5 Place of origin of the work							
583					6.5 core label: add "or from the name for a person, family, or corporate body"			LC gen content (2)	Agree (line 587)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	6.6 Other distinguishing characteristic of the work								
584	6.6: allow for this to be recorded even when not required to distinguish, per the instructions for form, date and place						Editor	**ACOC 6.6**	Covered by line 588
585					6.6 core label: add "or from the name for a person, family, or corporate body"			LC gen content (2)	Agree (line 587)
	6.6.1 Basic instructions on recording other distinguishing characteristics of works								
586					6.6.1.1: use "a characteristic other than form of work, date of work, and place of origin of work "		G		Agree
587					6.6.1.1: include "or from the name for a person, family, or corporate body"		G	LC gen content (2)	Agree
588					6.6.1.3 1st para: change to "Record other distinguishing characteristics of the work" (otherwise AACR2 change)			**LC 6.6.1.1**	Agree

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	6.7 Original language of the work								
589					6.7: remove element, no longer in FRAD			LC EA	Agree. No need to move examples to other instructions.
	6.7.1 Basic instructions on recording the original language of the work								
590	6.7.1.3: is there a version of the ISO list arranged by terms that could be referred to?							**ACOC 6.7.1.3**	Element no longer exists
	6.9 Identifier for the work								
	6.9.1 Basic instructions on recording identifiers for works								
591					6.9.1.1: include " or a surrogate for a work (e.g., an authority record)"	OR 6.9: See ACOC rep comment "m" in list of other rule maker topics	G	LC gen content (3)	Agree LC "...or with a surrogate..." OR - the ACOC rep will supply examples for chapter 2 and chapter 6
	6.10 Content type								
	6.10.1 Basic instructions on recording content type								
593					6.10.1.3 table cartographic dataset: add refs to all other terms beginning "cartographic"		G		Agree. In Glossary will be listed.
594					6.10.1.3 table still image – add reference to "cartographic image" and "tactile image"		G		Agree

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
595						OR 6.10.1.3: Change "tactile music" to "tactile notated music" to be consistent with other vocabulary [Sweden]	G		Agree
596					6.10.1.3 table three-dimensional form – add reference to "cartographic three-dimensional form" and "tactile three-dimensional form"		G		Agree
597					6.10.1.3 table two-dimensional moving image – add reference to "cartographic moving image"		G		Agree
	6.11 Date of expression								
	6.11.1 Basic instructions on recording date of expression								
598					6.11.1.1: include "(normally the year) "		G	ALA 6.4.1.1	Disagree (line 580)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	6.12 Language of expression								
	6.12.1 Basic instructions on recording language of expression								
600	6.12.1.3: is there a version of the ISO list arranged by terms that could be referred to?							ACOC 6.7.1.3	See Line 602
602		6.12.1.3: Please confirm that the ISO 639-2 term Sign Languages must be used for all sign languages or revise to allow use of terms from ISO 639-3		BL: 6.12.1.3: Add option: "If necessary to provide a more precise identification of the language, record an additional term from an alternative source."		6.12.1.3 Response from LC's Rebecca Guenther about BL's concern about languages within a group: "There is ISO 639-3, which identifies all individual languages and is more granular than 639-2.	LC		Change to ISO 639-3. It is possible to download a list by name of language (from URL provided). Change will also be made at: 0.11, 9.14.1.3, 11.7.1.3

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
602 (cont)						They are correct that some individual languages that don't meet the criteria for definition under 639-2 are assigned to group language codes. These are covered in 639-3: http://www.sil.org/iso639-3/ So it should say 639-2 or 639-3. See also French comments			

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	6.13 Other distinguishing characteristic of the expression								
603	6.13: recommend that the instructions allow for this to be recorded even when not required to distinguish							ACOC 6.6	Covered by line 607
	6.13.1 Basic instructions on recording other distinguishing characteristics of the expression								
605					6.13.1.1: use "a characteristic other than content type, language of expression, and date of expression "		G		Agree (line 586)
606					6.13.1.1: include "or from the name for a person, family, or corporate body"		G	LC gen content (2)	Agree (line 587) Post-meeting note: Change not made - Other distinguishing characteristic of an expression would only be used to differentiate one expression of a work from another expression of the same work.
607					6.13.1.3 1st para: change to "Record other distinguishing characteristics of the expression" (otherwise AACR2 change)			LC 6.6.1.1	Agree (see line 588)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	6.14 Identifier for the expression								
	6.14.1 Basic instructions on recording identifiers for expressions								
608					6.14.1.1: include " or a surrogate for an expression (e.g., an authority record)"		G	LC gen content (3)	Agree (line 591) "...or with a surrogate..."
609		6.14.1.3: concerns about use of LCCNs as expression identifiers				AS 6.14.1.3: Request guidance. In current practice, at least for translations and arrangements, we usually create expression authority records to represent multiple expressions rather than single ones.	Egs	**AS 6.14.1.3**	Add an example where an LCCN does represent a single expression.
	Additional instructions for musical works								
									See 5JSC/M/278
	Additional instructions for legal works								
	6.20 Title of a legal work								
611					6.20: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	6.20.1 Scope								
612					6.20.1 1st para: use "is a word, character, or group of words and/or characters …"		G	LC 2.3.1.1	Agree LC (line 155)
	6.20.4 Preferred title for a legal work								
614						Editor 6.20.4.4: Should the instruction also cover compilations of treaties with more than one party on each side?	EditorC		No change - matches AACR2
	6.21 Date of work								
616					6.21: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)
	6.21.1 Basic instructions on recording date of work								
617	6.21: Should this be "Date of legal work"?		6.21.1 caption: use "legal work"	BL: 6.21.1 caption: use "legal work"					Agree
618			6.21.1.1: use "legal work"	BL: 6.21.1: use "legal work"					Agree
619		6.21.1.1 "normally the year" vs. 6.21.1.3.3 "year, name of the month, number of the day"					ALA G	ALA 6.4.1.1	Remove "(normally the year)" (line 580)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	6.21.2 Date of promulgation of a law, etc.								
620					6.21.2 Add "Date of promulgation of a law, etc." to element analysis table		EA		This is not in the element analysis table because it falls into the scope of an element already defined (Date of work). Core labels and notes from 6.15-6.26 will be revised to use the name of the generic core element (if it exists).
621					6.21.2 core label: include "or from the name for a person, family, or corporate body"			LC gen content (2)	Agree (line 587)
	6.21.3 Date of signing of a treaty, etc.								
623					6.21.3 Add "Date of signing of a treaty, etc." to element analysis table		EA		See line 620
624					6.21.3 core label: include "or from the name for a person, family, or corporate body"			LC gen content (2)	Agree (line 587)
	6.22 Signatory to a treaty, etc.								
625					6.22 core label: include "or from the name for a person, family, or corporate body"			LC gen content (2)	Agree (line 587)
	Additional instructions for religious works								
	6.23 Title of a religious work								

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		6.23.1 Basic instructions on recording titles of religious works							
626					6.23.1.1 1st para: use "is a word, character, or group of words and/or characters …"		G	LC 2.3.1.1	Agree LC (line 155)
		6.23.2 Preferred title for a religious work							
627					6.23.2.4: add new para				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
632		6.23.2.9.7: The decision to use "Selections" to identify incomplete compilations should be applied to parts of the Bible – indeed, throughout RDA **[Query: does usage need to follow AACR2 25.18A9?]**			6.23.2.9.7: add new alternative on "Selections"			ALA	This instruction is about the preferred title. At 6.30.3.2 change b) to "other distinguishing characteristics of an expression of a religious work (6.25)" and remove footnote. 6.25 will be expanded to cover Selections.
634		6.23.2.16: Please charge someone familiar with the Jain canon to determine if the correct form of name for the parts of the Jain canon. Based on this, both RDA and the LC/NACO records should be revised as appropriate.						ALA	No changes required. LC/NACO may not be correct in this instance. AACR2/RDA is correct.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
6.25 Other distinguishing characteristic of the expression of a religious work									
6.25.1 Basic instructions on recording other distinguishing characteristics of the expression of a religious work									
636					6.25.1.4, 4th para: move footnote				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
Additional instructions for official communications									
6.26 Title of an official communication									
637				BL: 6.26: Define "official communications" in the Glossary			G		Withdrawn - impossible to define
638					6.26: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)
6.26.1 Basic instructions on recording titles of official communications									
639					6.26.1.1 1st para: use "is a word, character, or group of words and/or characters …"		G	LC 2.3.1.1	Agree LC (line 155)
6.26.2 Preferred title for an official communication									
640					6.26.2: add core element label				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	Access points representing works and expressions								
	6.27 Constructing access points to represent works and expressions								
	6.27.1 Preferred access point representing a work								
642	6.27.1: There needs to be a reminder of the circumstances under which a corporate body is deemed to be the creator and a link to the instructions under creators at 19.2.	6.27.1.5 and 6.27.1.6: add reference to 19.2.1.1 to make it clear when corporate bodies are creators			6.27.1.3: add new exception for corporate bodies as creators (see wording)		ACOC ALA LC		ACOC and ALA: Add reference to 19.2 at end of 6.27.1.1. LC: agree to add exception on p. 145 as first exception

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
643						OR 6.27.1.3: "first in the first source received". Suggestion that this instruction could be cataloguer's judgement instead, with a note explaining the decision [Sweden]	CCC		No action. Wording has been consistently used at this point when there is no further guidance to give.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
644					6.27.1.4: change caption to "Compilations". See separate documents (Attachment J)		LC		Delete p. 149 as covered by 6.27.1.2, 6.27.1.3. 6.27.1.4 will begin: "If the work is a compilation of works by different persons or bodies construct the preferred access point representing the work using the preferred title for the compilation, formulated according to the instructions given under 6.2.2" Instructions on lacking a collective title (and the alternative) will remain. Move Oram example to 6.27.1.3 (Post-meeting note: will stay at 6.27.1.4 but it will be shown as a title only access point.). Check examples in chapter 20 to make sure match revised instruction.

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
644 (cont)									In Appendix I, change "compiler" to "A person, family, or corporate body responsible for creating a new work (e.g., a bibliography, a dictionary) through the act of compilation, e.g., selecting, arranging, aggregating, and editing data, information, etc. For a compiler as a contributor, see editor of compilation ..."
645					6.27.1.4 1st para: reword in line with caption change				See line 644
646		6.27.1.4: Add reference to 19.2.1.1 wherever the concept of compiler as creator appears in RDA					ALA		Withdrawn

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
647			6.27.1.4: Query compiler as creator examples		6.27.1.4: suggest replacement examples for a Bibliography and an Index	AS: 6.27.1.4: The existing two examples include reproductions or reprinting of original source material that has been compiled together to form a new work. Is not each original source document a different work?	CCC		Add LC examples to 6.27.1.2 and 6.27.1.3

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
647 (cont)						The examples suggested by LC of a bibliography and a newspaper index do not seem to me to fit this instruction - they do not include different works by different persons			
648						OR 6.27.1.4: what criteria is used to determine when a compiler or an editor is a creator? Propose including definitions or wording that would clarify the instruction [Germany]	CCC		See line 644

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
649			6.27.1.5 exception: reword to avoid "commonly cited by title": "If the person, family or corporate body responsible for the adaptation or revision is unknown…"				Editor		Will no longer be an exception, and will consist of references to 6.27.1.4 and 6.27.1.8. Post-meeting note: Instruction replaced with references to 6.27.1.4 and 6.27.1.8, but remain labelled as exceptions.
	6.27.2 Preferred access point representing a part or parts of a work								
650		6.27.2.2: This instruction should be reconciled with 6.28.2.2.1 as proposed in 5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up.							No change, not covered in LC/12 follow-up discussion
651					6.27.2. Add an exception for moving image resources (see separate document)		LC		Agree LC Post-meeting note: Revised wording supplied by LC 2009-04-21 (Attachment K), modified by the Editor
	6.27.3 Preferred access point representing an expression								
653		6.27.3: examples will need to be changed based on decisions on 5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up							No change, not covered in LC/12 follow-up discussion

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
654						AS 6.27.3: Do all of the examples have to represent a specific expression?	Egs	AS 6.14.1.3	Add a specific example as suggested.
		6.28 Constructing access points to represent musical works and expressions							
									See 5JSC/M/278
		6.29 Constructing access points to represent legal works							
		6.29.1 Preferred access point representing a legal work							
658			6.29.1.15: add wording to cover situation raised in CCC/1: "to which one or more national governments is signatory"					CCC	Make change at 6.29.1.18 (Other Agreements Involving Jurisdictions). Add: For an agreement involving two or more national governments and one or more jurisdictions below the national level construct the preferred access point representing the work applying the instructions given under 6.29.1.15 (add at bottom of page 228). Post-meeting note: Added after first example on page 229.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
659						Editor 6.29.1.20.3: In the example, should the preferred access point representing the compilation be constructed using the preferred access point representing the compiler as creator of the compilation?	EditorC		Example is OK as compiler is editor
	6.29.3 Variant access point representing a legal work or expression								
662					6.29.3.1 last para: raise this instruction to the status of a four-digit instruction comparable to 6.29.3.2				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	6.30 Constructing access points to represent religious works and expressions								
	6.30.3 Preferred access point representing an expression of a religious work								
663						Editor 6.30.3.5 2nd para: suggest "If the additions listed under a), b), or c) above are insufficient to identify the variant text, add an additional term (e.g., the name of the editor)."	EditorC		Agree
	CHAPTER 7 DESCRIBING CONTENT								
666						OR Chs 6 & 7. It is not clear why some elements relating to works and expressions are given in chapter 6 and some in chapter 7. [New Zealand, Norway, Spain, Sweden]	ACOC		Explained in Purpose and scope of the two chapters. Split between identifying elements (chapter 6) and further description (chapter 7), and to accommodate current division between authority and bibliographic records. Note as training issue.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
667		Chapter 7: move the generally-applicable elements to the beginning of the chapter, and then group together the elements that deal with (for example) cartographic resources					Editor		Withdrawn on the grounds that it is not feasible at this stage.
		7.1 General guidelines on describing content							
		7.1.1 Sources of information							
670					7.1.1: delete (only give sources for elements)			LC gen editorial (5)	Disagree (General comments discussion)
		7.2 Nature of the content							
		7.2.1 Basic instructions on recording the nature of the content							
671					7.2.1.1: use "primary content". Make same change at 7.2.1.2 and 7.2.1.3		G		Agree. No need to change 7.2.1.2 and 7.2.1.3 as covered by scope.
		7.4 Coordinates of cartographic content							
		7.4.1 Basic instructions on recording coordinates of cartographic content							
672					7.4.1.3 2nd para: change "For celestial charts" to "For celestial cartographic content"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
		7.4.2 Longitude and latitude							
673					7.4.2.1 2nd and 3rd paras: reword so as not to limit to the Earth		G		Agree

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	7.4.4 Right ascension and declination								
676					7.4.4.3: see rewording to focus on content not carrier			**LC 7.4.4.3**	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	7.5 Equinox								
677					7.5.1.3: see rewording to focus on content not carrier			LC 7.4.4.3	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	7.6 Epoch								
678					7.6.1.3: see rewording to focus on content not carrier			LC 7.4.4.3	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	7.9 Dissertation or thesis information								
	7.9.2 Academic degree								
681						Editor 7.9.2.3: Should appendix B include instructions on the use of abbreviations for academic degrees?	EditorC		Change instruction to "Record a brief statement of the degree for which the author was a candidate." Covered by "Generally do not abbreviate words …" at B.5.10. Do not change examples.
	7.11 Place and date of capture								
	7.11.3 Date of capture								
682			7.11.3: The instruction to record the date of capture as year, month, day and time will not work in an international context				CCC		Withdrawn based on previous decision (5JSC/M/239.12)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
683		7.11.3.3: The instructions should allow for a range of capture dates (which is quite common in sound recording compilations).	7.11.3: see suggested additional instruction to cover complex situations				G CCC		CCC Withdrawn as combines two sub-elements. ALA - change Scope at 7.11.3.1: "Date of capture is the date or range of dates associated with the capture (i.e., recording, filming, etc.) of the content of a resource."
		7.12 Language of the content							
684					7.12: Change to "Details of the language of expression"		EA LC		Disagree LC. "Details of" are usually subordinate to an element. This would not work as subordinate to the chapter 6 "Language of expression" because that element needs to be kept clean for use in an access point. Change reference at 6.12.1.3 second last para: "For guidelines on recording details relating to the language of expression see the instructions on language of the content given under 7.12 ." Make reference at 7.12 back to 6.12.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
7.13 Form of notation									
7.13.1 Basic instructions on recording form of notation									
686					7.13.1.3: add new para d). Add new 7.13.5 for Form of notated movement		LC EA		Agree
7.13.3 Form of musical notation									
687			7.13.3.3: replace "plainsong notation" with "neumatic notation" [Note: marked as priority at Glossary]				CCC G		Agree
7.13.4 Form of tactile notation									
688				CILIP: 7.13.4.3: See suggested changes to lists of terms			G		Agree. Note as AACR2 change.
689				CILIP: 7.13.4.3 3rd para (examples): see separate document (Attachment L)			Editor		Move last para of 7.13.4.3 (and example, plus 1-2, 4th examples from CILIP using "braille code" as appropriate) to first para of 7.13.4.4.
7.16 Supplementary content									
690					7.16.1.1 1st para: move e.g. statement and reword		G		Agree

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	7.16.1 Basic instructions on recording supplementary content								
691						OR 7.16.1.3. The example for a bibliography includes page numbers. If recording supplementary content is an expression-level attribute, pagination is not appropriate as this can change between manifestations of the same expression [N.Z.]	Sec		This is where in the manifestation you would find this part of the expression. In chapter 7 are elements that would go into a scenario 2 manifestation record, but are to do with a different FRBR level.
	7.17 Colour content								
	7.17.1 Basic instructions on recording colour content								
692					7.17.1.1: move here 2nd para at 7.17.1.4				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
693						Editor 7.17.1.2: Is the parenthetical instruction under 7.17.1.2 intended to override the instructions under 2.2.1.1 and 2.2.3? If not, should it be deleted?	EditorC	**Editor 7.17.1.2**	Agree to delete parenthetical instruction
694		7.17.1.3 3rd exception: add "(other than cartographic)"			7.17.1.3 1st and 2nd exceptions: delete "(other than cartographic)"		Editor	**LC 7.17.1.3**	ALA withdrawn ALA as did not comment on 7.17.2. Agree LC.
	7.17.2 Colour of still image								
695						Editor 7.17.2.2: see 7.17.1.2	EditorC	Editor 7.17.1.2	Agree (line 693)
	7.17.3 Colour of moving images								
696						Editor 7.17.3.2: see 7.17.1.2	EditorC	Editor 7.17.1.2	Agree (line 693)
697					7.17.3.3 1st para: delete "(other than cartographic)"			LC 7.17.1.3	Agree LC (line 694)
	7.17.4 Colour of three-dimensional forms								
698						Editor 7.17.4.2: see 7.17.1.2	EditorC	Editor 7.17.1.2	Agree (line 693)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
7.17.5 Colour content of resource designed for persons with visual impairments									
700						Editor 7.17.5.2: see 7.17.1.2	EditorC	Editor 7.17.1.2	Agree (line 693)
7.18 Sound content									
7.18.1 Basic instructions on recording sound content									
701					7.18.1.1 add "other than one that consists primarily of recorded sound"		G		Agree
702					7.18.1.1: move here second sentence at 7.18.1.3				Agree, use "For sound that is not integral, see 3.1.4." Will not be included in Glossary.
703						Editor 7.18.1.2: see 7.17.1.2	EditorC	Editor 7.17.1.2	Agree (line 693)
704					7.18.1.3 1st para: delete "other than one that consists primarily of recorded sound"				See 701
705					7.18.1.3 2nd para: use "motion pictures and video recordings"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		7.19 Aspect ratio							
		7.19.1 Basic instructions on recording aspect ratio							
706		7.19.1.3 (with Examples comments): recommend that "fullscreen" be defined as an aspect ratio less than 1.5:1 and that "widescreen" be defined as an aspect ratio of 1.5:1 or greater. The aspect ratio for "fullscreen" should not be characterized as standard; this was based on the typical television monitor, which surely will no longer be typical with the advent of high-definition.					G		Change footnotes: "Full screen - use for ratios less than 1.5:1" "Wide screen - use for ratios of 1.5:1 or greater " Post-meeting note: Footnotes replaced by instructions.
		7.20 Format of notated music							
708		7.20: include terms at 3.4.3 or make ref to 3.4.3 here					Editor		Disagree ALA. Use in an online tool will be easier.
		7.20.1 Basic instructions on recording the format of notated music							
710			7.20.1.3: add "close score" to list of terms				EA		Withdrawn. Decision to remove in July 2008. Note as AACR2 change.

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	7.21 Medium of performance of musical content								
	7.21.1 Basic instructions on recording medium of performance of musical content								
711					7.21.1.1: revise def in line with 5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up		G		Revise to parallel the revisions at 6.16
713					7.21.1.3 1st para: add reference to App B and example	Editor 7.21.1.3: add instruction referring to use of Appendix B when recording two or more voices as medium of performance?	EditorC		Agree LC
714		7.21.1.3 2nd para: remove limitation **[Note: AACR2 change 5.7B1]**			7.21.1.3 2nd para: revise in line with 5JSC/LC/12/LC follow-up to remove limitation		ALA		Agree ALA, with LC wording
	7.22 Duration								
715		7.22 Def of duration: Consider adding "or movement" at the end of the second sentence [Comment made at Glossary]					G		Agree, use: "Duration also includes performance time for a resource containing notated music or notated movement (see 7.22.1.4)." Expand beginning of instruction at 7.22.1.4 to cover notated music.

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		7.22.1 Basic instructions on recording duration							
717					7.22.1.3 2nd para: Replace ref to square brackets by ""Indicate that the actual playing time was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4."			LC 2.6.3.3	Agree LC (line 259)
		7.23 Performer, narrator, and/or presenter							
718		7.23-7.24: merge, or make applicable to the same types of resources (reflect change at 2.4.1.1 4th-6th paras). If the distinction is maintained, commentators belong in 7.23			7.23.1.1: delete "dramatic or musical"		G ALA		Withdraw ALA. There are two separate fields in MARC and any print constants would be different. Agree LC.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
719	7.23: add "For instructions on recording persons, families and corporate bodies associated with the work or expression as an access point, see Chapters 19 and 20."								Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	7.24 Artistic and/or technical credits								
720	7.24: add "For instructions on recording persons, families and corporate bodies associated with the work or expression as an access point, see Chapters 19 and 20."								Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	7.24.1 Basic instructions on recording artistic and/or technical credits								
721					7.24.1.1: reword to exclude kind of contribution rather than individuals		G		Agree
722					7.24.1.3: reword to exclude kind of contribution rather than individuals				Agree
	7.28 Awards								
	7.28.1 Basic instructions on recording information on awards								

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
728					7.28.1.1: change "given to the content of a resource by" to "from"		G		Disagree. All definitions relate to the resource. Use "…formal recognition of excellence, etc., for the content of a resource given by an award- or prize-granting body".
729					7.28.1.3: change to: "Record information on awards if considered to be important."				Agree
SECTION 3 - RECORDING ATTRIBUTES OF PERSON, FAMILY, AND CORPORATE BODY									
CHAPTER 8 GENERAL GUIDELINES ON RECORDING ATTRIBUTES OF PERSONS, FAMILIES, AND CORPORATE BODIES									
8.1.2 Person, family, and corporate body									
730					8.1.2 Person: add "including a fictitious entity"		LC G	**LC 8.1.2 Person**	Will be included at 9.0, and not at 8.12 (to parallel corporate bodies). This not an AACR2 change, but a change in practice.
731					8.1.2 Family: use "two or more persons related by birth, marriage, adoption, civil union, or similar legal status, or who otherwise present themselves as a family"		LC G	**LC 8.1.2 Family**	Agree
8.1.3 Name									
733					8.1.3 Name: use "a word, character, or group of words and/or characters "		G	LC 2.3.1.1	Agree LC (line 155)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
734					8.1.3 Preferred name: add "according to instructions in chapters 9-11"		G		Withdrawn
735					8.1.3 Variant name: add "according to instructions in chapters 9-11"		G		Withdrawn
	8.1.4 Access point								
736					8.1.4 Access point: change "under which information pertaining to" to "representing"		G		Agree (see line 541)
	8.3 Core elements								
737					8.3 last para: add ref to ch 8 instructions				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	8.9 Date of usage								
740		8.9.1.3: also record date of usage for variant names associated with name changes					G		Withdrawn. This element is used when there is more than one authorized heading.

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		8.11 Undifferentiated name indicator							
741						OR 8.11: Although corporate bodies included in scope, ch. 11 lacks an instruction about undifferentiated indicator; revise 8.11 [Germany]	LC		8.11.1.1: remove reference to families and corporate bodies
		8.13 Cataloguer's note							
743					8.13.1.3 caption: change "General guidelines" to "Making cataloguer's notes"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
744		8.13.1.1: We question whether the Cataloguer's Note would be limited to access points, and not extended to all attributes of the entity being described.					ALA		Withdrawn
745					8.13.1.1: use "A cataloguer's note is an annotation that might be helpful to a cataloguer or to any other user of the catalogue."		G	LC 5.9.1.1	Disagree (line 545)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
746					8.13.1.3: replace with "Make any notes that might be helpful to a cataloguer or to any other user of the catalogue."			LC 5.9.1.3	Disagree (Line 546)
		CHAPTER 9 IDENTIFYING PERSONS							
		9.0 Purpose and scope							
747					9.0 fn Person: add "including a fictitious entity" [not in response]		G	LC 8.1.2 Person	Moot as no longer a footnote
		9.1 General guidelines on identifying persons							
		9.1.1 Sources of information							
749					9.1.1: delete (only give sources for elements)			LC gen editorial (5)	Disagree (General comments discussion)
		9.2 Name of the person							
750					9.2: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)
		9.2.1 Basic instructions on recording names of persons							
751					9.2.1.1 Name of the person: use "a word, character, or group of words and/or characters"		G	LC 2.3.1.1	Agree LC (line 155)
		9.2.2 Preferred name for the person							
753		9.2.2.5.2: It is not clear which specific instruction(s) under 9.2 are being referred to at the bottom of p. 7.							Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
754						Editor 9.2.2.5.3 footnote ref in subhead: What would be an appropriate location for this footnote? Should it be moved to the Introduction as text under 0.9 Examples?	EditorC		The Chicago Manual of Style does not allow you to footnote subheads. Agree Editor.
755					9.2.2.5.3: update URL				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
756					9.2.2.5.3 para a) 1st subpara last sentence: change "variant forms" to "different forms"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
761					9.2.2.5.4 1st para: add "choose the form resulting from an official change in orthography, or, if this does not apply, choose the predominant spelling. In case of doubt, " (Otherwise AACR2 change)		LC	**LC 9.2.2.5.4**	Note as AACR2 change.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
764						OR 9.2.2.9: Generalize the name of the section [Germany]. CCC agrees with the proposed wording from Germany, "Married person identified only by her/his married partner's name"	CCC LC		Agree 9.2.2.9.4: "Married person identified only by a partner's name" (and associated changes to instructions). Also change reference at 9.2.2.9 b)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
767						OR: Saints: Contradiction between 9.2.2.9.6 and 9.19.1.1 [Germany, Spain]. CCC notes that the use of this example (Thomas More) at both 9.2.2.9.6 and 9.19.1.1. appears to cause confusion	CCC		"Saint" is not part of the name, but it is part of the access point. Training issue - no change required.
767 (cont)						and suggests to either use a different example or to not include an example at 9.2.2.9.6 since purpose of the instruction is to send the cataloguer to 9.6.1.4.			

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
768					9.2.2.10.1 2nd para: delete				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
769						Editor 9.2.2.11.1: Should the references to appendix F be replaced with an instruction referring to IFLA's Names of Persons: National Usages for Entry in Catalogues (cf. 9.2.2.10.2)	EditorC		For consideration after the first release of RDA.
773						Editor 9.2.2.14 a) Should it be worded as follows: "uses his or her title rather than surname in resources with which he or she is associated"?	EditorC		Agree
774					9.2.2.14: move footnote number to end of b) para				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
777					9.2.2.18 3rd para: add "an integral" before "part"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
9.3 Date associated with the person									
9.3.2 Date of birth									
785		9.3.2.3: No reason to limit recording of month and day to when the name is identical to that of another. Move all such artificial limitations to the instructions on constructing access points					ALA	**ALA 9.3.2.3**	Disagree. Problems with removing restriction because of use in access point. Add to list for future consideration.
9.5 Fuller form of name									
9.5.1 Basic instructions on recording fuller forms of names									
787					9.5.1.1: add "or abbreviation"		G		Agree
9.6 Other designation associated with the person									
9.6.1 Basic instructions on recording other designations associated with persons									
788					9.6.1.1: use "Other designation associated with the person is a term other than a title associated with a person's name"		G		Agree (add scope statements that begin with "Other" will have the initial article removed)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
789		9.6.1.4: Move limitation to instruction on constructing access points. Comment made at 9.19.2.1: Designations may be used in variant access points, so delete limitation?				AS 9.19.2.1: Broad issue of whether catalogers may record data in elements that will only be used in variant access points and not in the preferred access point.	Egs	ALA 9.3.2.3	Agree in general to remove limitations on recording elements. If appropriate move limitations to access points.
	9.13 Affiliation								
791						OR 9.13: Affiliation. "Could not this be expressed in the form of a link to a corporate body?" [Sweden]	ACOC		This is handled as an element because it is an attribute in FRAD, and it is equivalent to MARC 21 X00$u.

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		9.15 Field of activity of the person							
792		9.15 and 9.16: The distinction between Field of Activity and Profession/Occupation is not sufficiently clear. Our sense is that a Field of Activity is one that a person engages in apart from his or her Profession or Occupation. We suggest adding this language to the scope of Field of Activity. We also suggest that the section on Profession or Occupation come before the section on Field of Activity.					ALA		Defer consideration until after first release and possibly consult with FRAD.
		9.18 Identifier for the person							
		9.18.1 Basic instructions on recording identifiers for persons							
793					9.18.1.1: include " or a surrogate for a person (e.g., an authority record)"		G	LC gen content (3)	Agree (line 591) "...or with a surrogate..."

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		9.19 Constructing access points to represent persons							
		9.19.1 Preferred access point representing a person							
795		9.19.1.1 2nd para and following: simplify by (a) expanding the reference in the paragraph in the middle of p. 95 to "9.19.1.2-9.19.1.7, and (b) moving the instructions that relate to specific additions to the instructions in 9.19.1.2-9.19.1.7 that deal with the particular addition in question.				ALA			A) References have been corrected in the clean-up draft. B) Withdrawn

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	CHAPTER 10 IDENTIFYING FAMILIES								
	10.0 Purpose and scope								
800					10.0 last para: use "two or more persons related by birth, marriage, adoption, civil union, or similar legal status, or who otherwise present themselves as a family"	OR ch. 10: Resolve confusion about when presence of a word indicating a familial relationship makes entity a family or a corporate body [Germany] AS Ch. 10: Query about fictitious families: Is the Partridge Family a corporate body (musical group) or/and a fictitious family?	G	LC 8.1.2 Family	Last para will no longer be present. Include the Partridge Family as an example of a corporate body (it is a fictitious family but a real corporate body). Training issue.
	10.2 Name of the family								
801					10.2: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	10.2.1 Basic instructions on recording names of families								
802					10.2.1.1 Name of the family: use "a word, character, or group of words and/or characters"		G	LC 2.3.1.1	Agree LC (line 155)
	10.2.2 Preferred name for the family								
803						Editor 10.2.2.2 footnote: Should there be an equivalent footnote under 9.2.2.2 and 11.2.2.2?	EditorC		Delete footnote
	10.6 Prominent member of the family								
	10.6.1 Basic instructions on recording a prominent member of the family								
808					10.6.1.3 1st para: delete "if it serves to differentiate the family from others with the same name"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	10.9 Identifier for the family								
809					10.9.1.1: include " or a surrogate for a family (e.g., an authority record)"		G	LC gen content (3)	Agree (line 591) "...or with a surrogate..."
	10.10.2 Variant access point representing a family								
810					10.10.2.1 last para: add "in the order listed"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	CHAPTER 11 IDENTIFYING CORPORATE BODIES								
	11.1.1 Sources of information								
811					11.1.1: delete (only give sources for individual elements)			LC gen editorial (5)	Disagree (General comments discussion)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	11.2 Name of the corporate body								
812					11.2: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)
813					11.2.1.1: use "is a word, character, or group of words and/or characters"		G	LC 2.3.1.1	Agree LC (line 155)
	11.2.1 Basic instructions on recording names of corporate bodies								
814					11.2.1.2: delete (only give sources for elements)			LC gen editorial (5)	Disagree (General comments discussion)
	11.2.2 Preferred name for the corporate body								
815					11.2.2.5.1: add "choose the form resulting from an official change in orthography, or, if this does not apply, choose the predominant spelling. In case of doubt, " (Otherwise AACR2 change)		LC	LC 9.2.2.5.4	Note as AACR2 change (see line 761)
820			11.2.2.5.4: change caption Local Churches to Local Places of Worship						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
822						Editor: 11.2.2.12: Should the instruction under 11.2.2.12 be reviewed in the context of other instructions in RDA relating to the transliteration of names (i.e., those in chapter 9)?	EditorC		Difference is intentional. No change.
825					11.2.2.15 last para: change "higher level" to "higher"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
827		11.2.2.19-11.2.2.22: add instructions on how to record the name of a ruling executive body (see wording)							Acknowledge there is a gap. The JSC is willing to consider a formal proposal after first release.
830					11.2.2.21.1 last para: remove ref to access point and simplify			**LC 11.2.2.2.1.1 last para**	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
832					11.2.2.21.2 last para: remove ref to access point and simplify			LC 11.2.2.2.1.1 last para	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
834					11.2.2.21.3 last para: remove ref to access point and simplify			LC 11.2.2.2.1.1 last para	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
837					11.2.2.22: add context to references			LC gen editorial (4)	Agree (General comments discussion) Post-meeting note: Not feasible for the x-ref in 11.2.2.22.1
843					11.2.2.29: add context to references			LC gen editorial (4)	Agree (General comments discussion)
846					11.2.2.29.1 2nd para: add sentence re punctuation				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
847					11.2.2.29.1 last para: remove ref to access point and simplify			LC 11.2.2.2.1.1 last para	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
848		11.2.2.30: Change the caption to "Subordinate Religious Bodies"				OR 11.2.2.30: add "for religious bodies" to the caption [Spain]	CCC		Agree ALA

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
850						11.2.2.31: see separate document (Attachment M)			Change third sentence in second paragraph to "Add the name of the country or region in which the delegation functions, in parentheses." Same language already used in other paragraphs. Add examples. Post-meeting note: Revised as noted in e-mail from Editor re revision of wording to 11.2.2.31 dated 2009-05-06
	11.2.3 Variant name for the corporate body								
852		11.2.3.3: The concept of multiple identities for corporate bodies (as opposed to persons) is new in RDA and is difficult to understand. Further explanation is needed. What is the difference between a separate identity and a name change?				11.2.3.3: See separate document (Attachment N)	ALA		ALA: The Editor will clean-up so it no longer refers to multiple identities. Separate document: Limit 8.9 to Persons (8.9.1.1 and 8.9.1.3).
	11.3 Place associated with the corporate body								
857					11.3: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
858			11.3.2.3: Question whether the example Pacific Harbour International Hotel is appropriate. It is not clear that providing the name of the hotel provides better identification than a local place name. This example also appears at 11.12.1.8.			AS 11.3.2.3: The comment raises the issue of what kind of research a cataloger is supposed to do to find a local place name if one is not included in the resource being cataloged?	Egs		Agree AS wording. Make similar change at 11.12.1.8.
858 (cont)						Suggest: Record the name of an institution, etc., instead of the local place name if it provides better identification, or if the local place name is not known or cannot be readily determined			

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	11.3.1 Basic instructions on recording places associated with corporate bodies								
859					11.3.1.1: replace "e.g." with "i.e."			G	Withdrawn. No change, "e.g." is appropriate.
861					11.3.1.3: add "Record the name of an institution instead of the local place name according to the instructions given under 11.3.2.3."				Post-meeting note: The change agreed at line 858 will be made under 11.3.2.3, in the exception on page 86. There is no need to revise 11.3.1.3
	11.3.2 Location of conference, etc.								
862			11.3.2.3: Question whether the example Pacific Harbour International Hotel is appropriate. It is not clear that providing the name of the hotel provides better identification than a local place name. This example also appears at 11.12.1.8.						See line 858
	11.4 Date associated with the corporate body								
865					11.4: delete core label			LC 2.3	Disagree LC (line 35)
	11.4.2 Date of conference, etc.								
870					11.4.2.3 add new para: "Record the month in the language and script preferred by the agency creating the data."				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	11.4.3 Date of establishment								

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
871					11.4.3.1: change "an organization" to "a corporate body"		G		Agree
872					11.4.3.3 1st para: delete "If the preferred name for the corporate body is the same as that recorded for another body,"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	11.4.4 Date of termination								
873					11.4.4.1: change "an organization" to "a corporate body"		G		Agree
874					11.4.4.3 1st para: delete "If the preferred name for the corporate body is the same as that recorded for another body," and "as appropriate"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		11.5 Associated institution							
875		11.5: contradiction with exception at 11.3.2.3 and 11.12.1.8 [comment made at 11.3.2.3]	11.5: How does this relate to exception at 11.3.2? See also 11.12.1.4 and exception at 11.12.1.8				ALA CCC		11.5 Core element label change first sentence to "An associated institution is required for conferences, etc., if the institution's name provides better identification than the local place name or if the local place name is unknown or cannot be readily determined" (based on revised 11.3.2.3) (Post-meeting note: Editor also added "if the institution's name provides ..." to second sentence). Add exception under 11.5.1.3 for institution associated with a conference etc. (to record the name in the normative case, etc.). Refer back to this new exception at 11.12.1.8. Move last example on page 86 to new exception at 11.5.1.3.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
11.6 Other designation associated with the corporate body									
11.6.1 Basic instructions on recording other designations associated with corporate bodies									
877						Editor 11.6.1.6: Should a separate element be defined for number of a conference, etc.?	EA		Agree, new element will be before 11.6, and it will be core.
11.7 Language of the corporate body									
11.7.1 Basic instructions on recording language of the corporate body									
878					11.7.1.3 caption: use "Recording Languages of the Corporate Body"			Editor	Editor will see if he can make captions consistent in terms of singular/plural.
11.8 Address of the corporate body									
11.8.1 Basic instructions on recording address of the corporate body									
879					11.8.1.3 caption: use "Recording Addresses of the Corporate Body"				See line 878
11.9 Field of activity of the corporate body									
11.9.1 Basic instructions on recording field of activity of the corporate body									
880					11.9.1.3 caption: use "Recording Fields of Activity of the Corporate Body"				See line 878
11.11 Identifier for the corporate body									
11.11.1 Basic instructions on recording identifiers for corporate bodies									
881					11.11.1.1: include " or a surrogate for a corporate body (e.g., an authority record)"		G	LC gen content (3)	Agree (line 591) "...or with a surrogate..."

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	11.12 Constructing access points to represent corporate bodies								
	11.12.1 Preferred access point representing a corporate body								
882					11.12.1.1: add "or the preferred name for the place (see 16.2.2)"		LC		Disagree. Place name is a surrogate for the name of the government. Instructions under 11.2.2 refer you to chapter 16
883					11.12.1.3 7th para: use "associated institution"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
884					11.12.1.4 1st para: use "associated institution"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
886			11.12.1.8: It is not clear why some of the examples (Gapapaiwa Writers' Workshop, World Series, etc.) do not include the location of a conference, etc.			AS 11.12.1.8: Issue of what to do when a local place or institution, etc. where a conference was held is not known. A local place is generally not appropriate for scientific expeditions either.	CCC		Move World Series example after exception on series of conferences on p. 126. Change 11.12.1.8 "Add to the name of a conference, etc. (including that of a conference recorded subordinately, see 11.2.2.14), in this order, if applicable and readily ascertainable:" Adjust a) to remove "if appropriate". No change needed at 11.3.2 as covered by core element condition to be "readily ascertainable"

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	SECTION 4 - RECORDING ATTRIBUTES OF CONCEPT, OBJECT, EVENT, AND PLACE								
	CHAPTER 16 IDENTIFYING PLACES								
888	Ch 16: make explicit reference where appropriate to B.11								Reference to Appendix B was added in the clean-up edit.
889						OR Ch 16. Confusion of places/jurisdictions between ch. 16 and ch. 11 [Germany] – (new suggestion from LC to move jurisdictions to ch. 16 (with reference from ch. 11) so that all places are in one place)	LC EA			No change. The place name is a surrogate for the name of the government.
	16.1 General guidelines on identifying places								
891					16.1.1: delete (only give sources of information for elements)			LC gen editorial (5)	Disagree (General comments discussion)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	16.2 Name of the place								
892					16.2.1.1 1st para: use "word, character, or group of words and/or characters"		G		Agree (line 155)
	16.2.1 Basic instructions on recording names of places								
893					16.2.1.2: delete (only give sources of information for elements)			LC gen editorial (5)	Disagree (General comments discussion)
	16.2.2 Preferred name for the place								
894					16.2.2.1 : see replacement wording		G		Agree
896		16.2.2.2, 16.2.2.6: Either delete the word "published" or give a definition that makes it clear that online resources are published.							Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
900					16.2.2.8: add context to references			LC gen editorial (4)	Agree (General comments discussion)
901					16.2.2.9: add context to references			LC gen editorial (4)	Agree (General comments discussion)
902					16.2.2.9.1 caption: change to "States, provinces, territories, etc."				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
903					16.2.2.9.2 caption: change to: "Places in a state, province, territory, etc."				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
904					16.2.2.9.2: add instruction to apply app. B.11 (no wording)				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
905					16.2.2.10 : add context to references			LC gen editorial (4)	Agree (General comments discussion)
908					16.2.2.10.2: add instruction to apply app. B.11 (no wording)				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
909					16.2.2.11: see rewording				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
910					16.2.2.12 1st para: add "in the name of the place"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	16.2.3 Variant name for the place								
912					16.2.3.7: use "Record as variant names …"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	16.6 Constructing access points to represent places								
913					16.6 add "For place names used as the conventional names of governments, see 11.12.1.1"		LC		Use "For the construction of access points using places names as conventional names for governments, see 11.12.1.1."

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
			SECTION 5 - RECORDING PRIMARY RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN WORK, EXPRESSION, MANIFESTATION, AND ITEM						
			CHAPTER 17 GENERAL GUIDELINES ON RECORDING PRIMARY RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN A WORK, EXPRESSION …						
914						OR Ch. 17: Resolve confusion with ch. 24, etc., because both refer to related work, expression, etc. [Norway] (LC suggests deleting "related" in ch. 17, because it "is" the work, etc., not "related" to another work, etc. in these situations; see Norway's comment for ch. 24 below.)	LC		Change Section 5 to "Recording primary relationships" and Chapter 17 to "General guidelines on recording primary relationships". And carry through the chapter. 17.0 first para remove "between a work, expression, manifestation, and item,". Agree to remove "related" from 17.4.2.

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
915						OR Section 5 (ch 17) and Section 8 (chs 24-28) - should these be merged? [Spain at Chapter 17]	ACOC		Disagree, see line 914
	17.1.3 Access point								
916						OR Chapter 17 and Chapter 24 definitions of preferred access point differ. [Norway]	ACOC		Fixed in clean-up edit.
	17.4.2 Conventions used to record primary relationships								
917						OR 17.4.2.3: g. Composite descriptions: add a definition to the Glossary [Spain, Germany]	G		Add definition to Glossary based on 17.4.2.3.
	17.11 Item of manifestation								
918		17.11: The phrase "item of the manifestation" is a perversion of the English language, and is precisely why "copy" is preferable to "item" as the name of this entity.					EA		Use "Exemplar of manifestation" in caption and throughout 17.11

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		17.11.1 Basic instructions on recording an item of the manifestation							
919		17.11.1.3: We question whether a call number is an appropriate identifier for an item. The same call number may be assigned to multiple copies within a library. Only the control number of the item record or the barcode number are truly item identifiers				AS 17.11.1.3: It seems clear to me that if only one copy of a manifestation is owned, the call number does indeed serve as an identifier for the item. Would an example that included a copy number in the call number be more appropriate?	Egs		ALA withdrawn. Add an example with a copy number.
		SECTION 6 - RECORDING RELATIONSHIPS TO PERSONS, FAMILIES, AND CORPORATE BODIES ASSOCIATED …							
		CHAPTER 18 GENERAL GUIDELINES ON RECORDING RELATIONSHIPS TO PERSONS, FAMILIES, AND CORPORATE …							
		18.5 Relationship designator							
920		18.5: We would like to see an instruction that allows the use of terms not in the Appendix.					ALA		Add standard phrase to extend the list. Also add to chapter 24 and chapter 29. Note that 0.11 covers using an alternative list.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		18.5 1 Basic instructions on recording relationship designators							
921		18.5.1.1: make it clear that the relationships are between persons, families, or corporate bodies and the resource being described. Use singular forms			18.5.1.1: use "… between the resource and persons ...			ALA	Fixed in Editor's clean-up edit.
		CHAPTER 19 PERSONS, FAMILIES, AND CORPORATE BODIES ASSOCIATED WITH A WORK							
		19.1.2 Recording persons, families, and corporate bodies associated with a work							
923					19.1.2 2nd para: replace "independent works by" with "works associated with"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	19.2 Creator								
924					19.2.1.1 5th para: begin with: "Corporate bodies are considered to be creators when they are …"			LC	Agree. Make similar change to 19.2.1.1 top of p. 4
		19.2.1 Basic instructions on recording creators							
925						Editor 19.2.1.1 b) Query inclusion of "constitution". Is there a potential conflict with instructions elsewhere relating to constitutions as legal works?	EditorC		Remove "constitution".

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
926					19.2.1.1, 5th para, para b) add "standards" at the end of the parenthetical statement.				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
928					19.2.1.3: update Schulz and Gikow examples now that the scope of person in RDA includes non-humans.	AS 19.2.1.3: Examples in question are for fictitious characters, not living non-humans. Does RDA allow for the establishment of access points for fictitious characters?	LC	LC 8.1.2 Person	Agree LC, change examples (line 730)
	19.3 Other person, family, or corporate body associated with a work								
	19.3.1 Basic instructions on recording other persons, families, and corporate bodies associated with a work								
929					19.3.1.1 1st para: replace "indirectly" with "other than as creators"		G		Agree
930		19.3.1.3 (examples comment): It would be helpful to show the preferred access points representing the work, i.e. of the creator(s), as well as others.				AS 19.3.1.3: if we did this here, should we do this all throughout chapter 19?	Egs		Withdrawn. The examples are for the data that would be recorded for this relationship.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	19.3.3 Other person or corporate body associated with a religious work								
932					19.3.3 caption: expand to include "Family"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
933					19.3.3 core label: expand to include "Family"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
934					19.3.3.4: change "special to the use of" to "associated with"'				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	CHAPTER 20 PERSONS, FAMILIES, AND CORPORATE BODIES ASSOCIATED WITH AN EXPRESSION								
	20.2.1 Basic instructions on recording contributors								
936					20.2.1.3: update Whitmire example now that the scope of person in RDA includes non-humans.	AS 20.2.1.3: See comment at 19.2.1.3	LC	LC 8.1.2 Person	Agree LC, change examples (line 730)

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	SECTION 8 - RECORDING RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN WORKS, EXPRESSIONS, MANIFESTATIONS, AND ITEMS								
	CHAPTER 24 GENERAL GUIDELINES ON RECORDING RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN WORKS, EXPRESSIONS …								
939						OR Ch 24 suggest changing the heading to: "General guidelines on recording relationships between related works, related expressions, related manifestations and related items" [Norway]	LC		Disagree. See line 914
	24.0 Purpose and scope								
940						Editor 24.0 1st para: should the core elements phrase be deleted?	EditorC	**Editor 24.0**	Do not delete as there is a placeholder
941					24.0 2nd para: include "identifier"				Post-meeting note: 24.0 and 29.0 will be revised to parallel the revisions made to the definitions for Related work, etc., and Related person, etc., in the revised Glossary

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	24.1.3 Related work, expression, manifestation, and item								
942			24.1.3 5th para: use "manifestation or item being described"						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	24.2 Functional objectives and principles								
943					24.2 a) use "and items"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
944						Editor 24.2 last para: use "all significant bibliographic relationships"?	EditorC	**Editor 24.2**	Agree
	24.4 Recording relationships between works, expressions, manifestations, and items								
945		24.4.3: The instruction is captioned "Description of the Related Work, Expression, Manifestation, or Item", but the actual text covers only manifestations and items. Change the caption.			24.4.3 1st para: use "related work, expression, manifestation, or item"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	24.8 Cataloguer's note								
	24.8.1 Basic instructions on making cataloguer's notes								
949					24.8.1.1: use "A cataloguer's note is an annotation that might be helpful to a cataloguer or to any other user of the catalogue."		G	LC 5.9.1.1	Disagree (line 545)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
950					24.8.1.3: replace with "Make any notes that might be helpful to a cataloguer or to any other user of the catalogue."			LC 5.9.1.3	Disagree (Line 546)
	CHAPTER 25 RELATED WORKS								
951						OR Ch 25-27: contents notes in ch. 25 and ch. 27: confusing not to have information about contents notes until this chapter [Spain] (LC agrees it is not intuitive to think of contents as being related manifestations and suggests giving contents notes in ch. 7 because Summarization of content is already there (7.10))	LC EA		At 7.10.1.1 add wording such as "For instructions on recording contents as whole-part relationships see chapters 25 and 27" The Editor to check mapping from MARC 505 tag in Appendix D. Post-meeting note: MARC 505 mapped only to related work.

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		25.1 Related work							
952					25.1.1.1 delete "represented by a preferred access point" add "being described"		G	LC 24.2 b)	Changed in clean-up edit. Scope for a related entity will include: identifier, preferred access point or description. For explanation of relationship - preferred access point and/or identifier
954		25.1.1.3: A music plate or publisher's number may be used as an identifier, but only in association with the name of the publisher.					ALA		Remove examples that use ISBN and plate number - these are incorrect as they are at the manifestation level. Review others to ensure they are at the work level. Remove plate number example in chapter 26. Remove music publisher number at 17.10.1.3. In all of the "Identifier for the ..." examples just include the identifier (only use one of the conventions).
		25.2 Explanation of relationship							
955					25.2.1.1 delete "represented by a preferred access point"		G	LC 24.2 b)	See line 952
956					25.2.1.3 caption: change to "Recording explanations of relationships"			**LC 25.2.1.3 caption**	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
957					25.2.1.3 1st para: delete "represented by a preferred access point"			LC 24.2 b)	See line 952 (Editor to do)
	CHAPTER 26 RELATED EXPRESSIONS								
	26.1 Related expression								
958					26.1.1.1 delete "represented by a preferred access point" add "being described"		G	LC 24.2 b)	See line 952
	26.2 Explanation of relationship								
959					26.2.1.1 delete "represented by a preferred access point"		G	LC 24.2 b)	See line 952
960					26.2.1.3 caption: change to "Recording explanations of relationships"			LC 25.2.1.3 caption	Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
961					26.2.1.3 1st para: delete "represented by a preferred access point"			LC 24.2 b)	See line 952 (Editor to do)
	SECTION 9 - RECORDING RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN PERSONS, FAMILIES, AND CORPORATE BODIES								
	CHAPTER 29 GENERAL GUIDELINES ON RECORDING RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN PERSONS, FAMILIES …								
	29.0 Purpose and scope								
968						Editor 29.0 1st para: should the core elements phrase be deleted?	EditorC	Editor 24.0	Do not delete as there is a placeholder

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
969					29.0, 2nd para: add "or by an identifier"				Post-meeting note: 24.0 and 29.0 will be revised to parallel the revisions made to the definitions for Related work, etc., and Related person, etc., in the revised Glossary
	29.1.2 Person, family, and corporate body								
970					29.1.2 Person: add "including a fictitious entity"		G	LC 8.1.2 Person	No, addition will be made at 8.0 (line 730)
971					29.1.2 Family: use "two or more persons related by birth, marriage, adoption, civil union, or similar legal status, or who otherwise present themselves as a family"		G	LC 8.1.2 Family	Agree (LC line 731)
	29.1.3 Related persons, families, or corporate bodies								
972					29.1.3 Related corporate body: delete "represented by a preferred access point"		G	LC 24.2 b)	See line 955
	29.2 Functional objectives and principles								
974					29.2 add "or by identifiers"				Post-meeting note: Editor will make the change

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
975						Editor 29.2 last para: use "all significant bibliographic relationships"?	EditorC	Editor 24.2	Agree (see line 944)
	29.5.1 Basic instructions on recording relationship designators								
977					29.5.1.3: delete "explicitly"				See line 1051
	29.6.1 Basic instructions on recording sources consulted								
979					29.6.1: replace "publications" with "resources"		G		Agree use: "Source consulted is a resource used in determining the relationship between persons, families, or corporate bodies." Same change at 5.8.1, 8.12.1, 24.7.1.1.
	29.7.1 Basic instructions on making cataloguer's notes								
980					29.7.1.1: use "A cataloguer's note is an annotation that might be helpful to a cataloguer or to any other user of the catalogue."		G	LC 5.9.1.1	Disagree (line 545)
981					29.7.1.3 caption change to "Making Cataloguer's Notes"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
982					29.7.1.3 1st para: replace with "Make any notes that might be helpful to a cataloguer or to any other user of the catalogue."			LC 5.9.1.3	Disagree (Line 546)
		CHAPTER 30 RELATED PERSONS							
		30.1 Related person							
983					30.1.1.1, 2nd para: add "(either alone or in collaboration with one or more other individuals)"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
		CHAPTER 31 RELATED FAMILIES							
		31.1 Related family							
984		31.1: add instruction on relationship designators (see wording)				ALA			Fixed in clean-up edit - reference to 29.4. Also fixed in chapters 30 and 32.
		CHAPTER 32 RELATED CORPORATE BODIES							
		32.1 Related corporate body							
986					32.1.1.3.3: add missing para				Post-meeting note: 32.1.1.3.1 and 32.1.1.3.2 deleted in the clean-up edit because they shouldn't have been there in the first place

Comment	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		APPENDIX A CAPITALIZATION							
		A.1 General guideline							
989					A.1: add new 3rd para or fn referring to the alternatives in 1.7.1		LC	**LC A.1**	Label as alternative: "When recording attributes of manifestations and items (see chapters 1-4), the agency creating the data may choose to use in-house guidelines, another style manual, etc. in lieu of applying the guidelines in this appendix." Post-meeting note: Revised wording to parallel alternative under 1.7.1.
		A.3.2 Other terms associated with titles of works							
990			A.3.2: The music exception contradicts A.28 as far as key is concerned. For key, the pitch name should be capitalized according to the guidelines given under A.10-A.53, as applicable to the language involved (e.g., A major but la mineur)				CCC		Remove reference to Key. Retain examples.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	A.4 Titles of manifestations								
	A.4.1 General guidelines								
991						OR A.4.1: Correct "capitalize the first word" to "capitalize the first letter of the first word" [ISSN].	CCC		No change. This is one meaning of capitalization.
	A.39 German								
995						OR Appendix A.39: Delete footnote about German policy [Germany]	LC		Agree to delete
	A.48 Serbo-Croatian (roman and Cyrillic alphabets)								
996		A.48: change to "Bosnian, Croatian, and Serbian."	A.48: Change to Serbian (Cyrillic and Roman) and add new heading and instruction for Croatian. See changes to examples				CCC		There will be three separate entries in Appendix A: Bosnian, Croatian, Serbian. The same set of instructions will be repeated. LC to separate out the examples.
	APPENDIX B ABBREVIATIONS								
	B.1 General guideline								
997					B.1: add new 3rd para or fn referring to the alternatives in 1.7.1		LC	LC A.1	See 989
	B.3 Titles of works								

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
998						Editor B.3: "Protocols, etc." is not a title of a work. Does a new element need to be defined (e.g., Other designation associated with a legal work)?	EA		No change to ERD, fits within the scope of "Other distinguishing characteristic of the work". Ideally an instruction should be added between 6.21 and 6.22 - the Editor will see if there is time available within current deadlines (renumbering implications).

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	B.5 Other elements								
	B.5.2 Extent of storage space								
999						Editor B.5.2: There is no reference under B.5.2 to the use of abbreviations when recording storage space in non-metric units of measure (see the alternative under 3.4.1.11.2). Should an instruction be added to specify that the abbreviations for units of measure listed under B.7can be used, as applicable, when applying that alternative?	EditorC		Agree
	B.11 Names of certain countries, states, provinces, territories, etc.								
1001					B.11 table: delete line for Distrito Federal				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comme	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	APPENDIX C INITIAL ARTICLES								
	C.1 General instructions								
1002					C.1 1st para: see simplification	AS C.1: Query whether there should be an instruction about omitting initial articles found in conjunction with family names.			Post meeting note from Editor: An instruction on omitting initial articles is not necessary in chapter 10
1003			C.1: use "articles in the languages"						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	C.2 Articles listed by language								
1004					C.2 add a general caution that not all words in the list of articles always function as such (e.g., "lo" in Spanish)				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
1005					C.2 Yiddish: articles have been inverted				Noted in error wiki
	C.3 Articles listed by word or words								
1006					C.3 add a general caution that not all words in the list of articles always function as such (e.g., "lo" in Spanish)				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comment	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
APPENDIX D RECORD SYNTAXES FOR DESCRIPTIVE DATA									
D.2 ISBD presentation									
D.2.1 Order of elements									
1009			D.2.1, 7. Note area add: 7.11.2 Place of capture, 7.11.3 Date of capture				CCC		This part of Appendix D only includes those elements in the Consolidated ISBD. Add these as a special case. Post-meeting note: added as 7.11 Place and Date of Capture.
D.2.2 ISBD punctuation									
1012			D.2.2.4.2: unsure about including Music Format Statement				CCC		No change. This is valid for ISBD
1014			D.2.2.6: Because additional scores, parts, etc., are not treated as accompanying material, punctuation instructions can't be provided by ISBD when the specific material designation comprises different units				CCC		No change

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
1015			D.2.2.9: explain that multiple qualifications to the same standard number are presented in a single set of parentheses separated by colons and all other variations				CCC		No change. Issue not raised by ISBD.
D.3 MARC 21 format for bibliographic data									
D.3.1 Mapping of MARC 21 bibliographic to RDA									
1016			D.3: Needs to be revised in line with changes to RDA elements and MARC 21 coding	CILIP: D.3.1: remove obsolete fields, e.g. 440?			ALA		Agree. Action BL to alert the Editor to necessary changes. Change D.3.1 to "The table below maps the variable fields and subfields defined in the MARC 21 format for bibliographic data (excluding those identified as obsolete) to the corresponding elements in RDA."
1018		D.3.1: query mapping of date of work and date of expression to subfield $f						**ALA D.3.1**	See 1038
1019		D.3.1: "Selections" needs to be added to the table, mapping to subfield $k in appropriate fields							Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
1020			D.3.1 (field 254): do not support mapping to 2.5.2-2.5.9				CCC		No change. Field 254 is still valid in MARC 21 and ISBD does have a music format statement
1021		D.3.1: Query use of field 256 need a different mapping (perhaps new elements) for File type and File size					ALA		No change. Field 256 is not obsolete in MARC 21. It is also covered in the mapping at field 500. Other communities may use field 256. It was noted that area 3 was removed from AACR2 chapter 9.
1022		3.19.3.3 and 3.19.6 should map to 300							Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
1023		D.3.1: The mapping shows 7.22 duration mapping to 306, but the examples in Appendix M use field 300 for duration. Which is correct? And to what extent should the mapping support the requirements for ISBD display?	D.3.1 (field 300, p. D-22): Duration (7.22) is missing under $a Extent. Digital file characteristics (3.19) is missing under $b Other physical details.						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit (CCC)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
1024		D.3.1: 3.16.9.3, 3.18, 3.19.4 should map to 538. It's not clear where 3.19.5 should map. Our impression was that 3.16.9.3 (Special Playback Characteristics) is considered physical description, and it only appears in 538 when notes are being combined (which is not supported by RDA)							Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
		APPENDIX E RECORD SYNTAXES FOR ACCESS POINT CONTROL DATA							
1027					App E: See concerns regarding punctuation with dates		LC		Of the LC suggestions, only the hyphen is punctuation, and will be added by the Editor. The use of "birth" and "death" are print constants.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
E.2 AACR2 presentation									
1028		E.2: Unlike the ISBD presentation in Appendix D, the AACR2 presentation of access points will presumably not be updated. This preserves a traditional practice, with no possibility of evolving to meet future needs.				NS: Agreed at April 2008 meeting to change the caption to "Presentation" (correction has been made in marked-up PDF)	ALA		No action. Issue will be dealt with when the Appendix is revised in the future.
E.2.1 Presentation of access points									
1030			E.2.1, uniform titles, additions to uniform titles: the period preceding the GMD is missing (also under See and See also references)						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
1031			E.2.1, uniform titles, additions to uniform titles: for "Selections" N/A is no longer true (also under See and See also references)		E.2.1, uniform titles, additions to uniform titles: add punctuation and RDA citations for "Selections"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
1032			E.2.1, uniform titles, additions to uniform titles for music: replace the parentheses with a period, per 5JSC/ LC/12/LC follow-up (also under See also references)						No change

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
E.2.2 Punctuation of access points									
1034		E.2.2.5: Provision needs to be made for "Selections" as part of the access point for a work or expression.	E.2.2.5: add instructions to separate designation from title of part with a comma, precede the term Selections by a full stop and a space						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit (ALA)
1036		E.2.2.5: "Enclose the year of signing of a treaty, etc., in parentheses." - the entire date should be enclosed in parentheses, not just the year							Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
E.3 MARC 21 format for authority data									
E.3.1 Mapping of MARC 21 authorities to RDA									
1037					E.3.1, Heading fields (1XX), p. 21: $u Affiliation is not in MARC21				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
1038		E.3.1: query mapping of date of work and date of expression to subfield $f				ALA	ALA D.3.1		Withdrawn. This will be an issue for the reverse mapping.
1039		E.3.1: "Selections" should be mapped to subfield $k.			E.3.1 $k Form subheadings add RDA citations				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
1040			E.3.1: 400, 410 and 411, $t Title of work should also map to 6.2.3 Variant title for the work						Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		APPENDIX F ADDITIONAL INSTRUCTIONS ON NAMES OF PERSONS							
1041						Editor App F: Given the decision to replace specific instructions on recording compound names with reference to IFLA's Names of Persons: National Uses for Entries in Catalogues, should consideration be given to doing the same with all the instructions that refer to appendix F, and eliminate the appendix altogether?	EA		See Line 769

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		APPENDIX G TITLES OF NOBILITY, TERMS OF RANK, ETC.							
1046		App G: Under Germany and Sweden, the implication is that titles of nobility would not be recorded even for pre-1918 persons who held such titles. Is that correct?							Post-meeting note: The sections on German and Swedish titles of nobility were deleted from Appendix G. Added to list of issues for consideration after the first release.
		APPENDIX H DATES IN THE CHRISTIAN CALENDAR							
		H.1 B.C. and A.D. dates							
		H.2 Conversion of dates to the Gregorian calendar							
1048		H.2: We do not find the tables useful or easy to understand; we are not sure that this is the information that a cataloger needs in order to convert Julian to Gregorian years.			H.2: Delete	Editor			Agree
1049					H.2 Table III change name to "Scotland and Colonies"				Moot (line 1048)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
APPENDIX I RELATIONSHIP DESIGNATORS: RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN A RESOURCE AND PERSONS, FAMILIES, AND …									
1051					App I: add high-level value for "Creator" and for "Contributor"		LC		Creator and contributors are elements - no relationship designator is required. Change caption at I.2: Relationship designators for persons, families and corporate bodies associated with a work. The Editor will add wording to chapter 18, 24 and 29 and appendices I-K to make clear the relationship between the designators and the element. He will change the "explicitly" wording in the chapters to make it clear that relationship designators are a way to indicate the relationship more specifically.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
1052					App I: add an explanation of the hierarchy in the appendix		LC		There will be a new section on General guidelines on use of relationship designators in each of Apps I-K (if possible existing Scope will become I.0, with general guidelines in I.1) which will cover this.
1053		App I: ALA would like to see a complete alphabetical listing of terms.			App I: add an alphabetical listing of the terms, with references from terms not used as mentioned in the definitions of the terms				The Editor will check what will be possible in RDA online.
I.1 Purpose and scope									
I.2 Relationship designators for works									
I.2.1 Relationship designators for creators									
1055			I.2.1: add radio producer and television producer (see definitions)						See line 1064
1058					I.2.1 compiler: enclose e.g. statement in parenthesis				See line 644
1059					I.2.1 praeses: delete " but having only indirect association with the content of the thesis."				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
1061					I.2.1 respondent: change "theses" to "thesis."				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
I.2.2 Relationship designators for other persons, families, or corporate bodies associated with a work									
1062					I.2.2 court governed: change the position of the opening parenthesis				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
1063					I.2.2, degree granting institution: delete wording ", based in part on the submission of a thesis, dissertation, etc."				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
1064		I.2.2, film producer, radio producer, television producer: We suggest removing the phrase "... assuring commercial success" from these definitions. Not convinced that distinguishing between film, television, and video roles is useful or important.					EA ALA		Change 21.2 to "Producer of an unpublished resource". No conflict in naming with 2.7. At I.2.2 add two broader terms "Producer" and "Director" with existing terms (e.g., firm director, radio director, television director) in I.2.2 as subordinate. Definition of "Producer" will be "A person, family, or corporate body taking responsibility for most of the business aspects of a production for screen, sound recording, television, webcast, etc. The producer is generally responsible for activities like fund raising, managing the production, hiring key personnel, arranging for distributors, etc.". No generic term is needed at I.3.1 for stage directors.
1065					I.2.2, honouree: enclose the following wording in parentheses: "e.g., the honouree of a festschrift"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
	I.3 Relationship designators for expressions								
	I.3.1 Relationship designators for contributors								
1068			I.3.1 arranger of music: change "composer" to "composition"						Agree
1070					I.3.1 art director: change "responsible for" to "contributing to an expression of a work by"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
1071					I.3.1, choreographer of additional dance; choreographer of dance components …: Condense into "choreographer (Expression)"		LC		Agree
1072					I.3.1, four terms beginning with "composer": condense to "composer (expression)"		LC		Agree
1073					I.3.1 costume designer: change "responsible for" to "contributing to an expression of a work by"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
1076					I.3.1 musical director: change "responsible for" to "contributing to an expression of a work by" and "work" to "activities"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
1077					I.3.1, dancer (in "performer" hierarchy): change "that contributes" to "contributing"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
1080					I.3.1, presenter: delete 2nd sentence				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
1081					I.3.1, writer of added text: see suggested revisions				Editor deleted "of another creator" after the meeting
I.3.2 Relationship designators for other persons, families, or corporate bodies associated with a work									
I.4 Relationship designators for manifestations									
1083					I.4: replace "producing" with "manufacturing" in each of the definitions in 1.4				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
I.4.1 Relationship designators for manufacturers									
1085					I.4.1, book designer: add "involved in manufacturing a manifestation by being"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
I.4.2 Relationship designators for publishers									
1089					I.4.2, broadcaster: use "...involved in publishing a manifestation by broadcasting to an audience…"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit " … involved in broadcasting to an audience …"

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
		I.4.3 Relationship designators for distributors							
1090					I.4.3, film distributor use "...involved in distributing a manifestation to …" [correction to response]				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
		I.5 Relationship designators for items							
		I.5.1 Relationship designators for owners							
		I.5.2 Relationship designators for other persons, families, or corporate bodies associated with an item							
1091		I.5.2, annotator and inscriber: The definitions do not distinguish these roles. If there is a distinction to be made, we believe it lies in defining inscriber as "A person who has written a statement of dedication or gift on an item."							Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
1092					I.5.2, collector (in "curator" hierarchy): change "materials" to "items"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
		APPENDIX J RELATIONSHIP DESIGNATORS: RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN WORKS, EXPRESSIONS, MANIFESTATIONS …							
									See Attachment B

Comn	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
APPENDIX K RELATIONSHIP DESIGNATORS: RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN PERSONS, FAMILIES, AND CORPORATE BODIES									
1095	App K: recommend that further work be done on this appendix prior to first release to ensure that a basic set of descriptors is included. In addition, we recommend that a group be assigned to investigate further development of the relationship designators, including the investigation of already available relationship	App I-K Appendices need significant work. If problems cannot be resolved suggest that appendices be labeled as provisional. Consider possibility of a separate editorial group for relationship designators					ALA		Add a paragraph to K.1 to indicate that the Appendix is provisional. The Editor will flag to NN that they are provisional. When these are in the Registry, they should keep the status "provisional".
1096		App K: ALA prefers the use of the indefinite article in the definitions (as is done in Appendix J)							Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
1097		App K: Most of the terms can apply to all three types of entities, yet this has not always been done.					ALA		Focus has been bibliographically significant relationships. For future development.
1098		App K: Although relationships are supposed to be reciprocal, this has not always been done.					ALA		Leave as it is since it is a provisional Appendix
	K.2 Relationship designators for related persons								
	K.2.1 Relationship designators to relate persons to other persons								
1100					K.2.1. real identity: change "other" to "alternate"				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	K.2.2 Relationship designators to relate persons to families								
1101					K.2.2: indent "progenitor" under "family" member to create a hierarchy.				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	K.4.2 Relationship designators to relate corporate bodies to families								
1102					K.4.2: change "for a corporate body (see 32.1)" to "for a related corporate body (see 32.1)."				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	K.4.3 Relationship designators to relate corporate bodies to other corporate bodies								
1103					K.4.3: change "for a corporate body (see 32.1)" to "for a related corporate body (see 32.1)."				Post-meeting note: Done by Editor in final edit
	APPENDIX M COMPLETE EXAMPLES								
1126		App M Work 2: Form of work not required				AS: See comments at 9.6.1.4	Egs	ALA 9.3.2.3	Withdrawn (line 789)

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
1127			App M Work 2: Opus number should not be included according to 6.17.1.3.3			AS: See comments at 9.6.1.4	CCC	ALA 9.3.2.3	Withdrawn (6.17.1.3.3 changed during LC/12 discussion)
		GLOSSARY - Existing terms							
1128		Glossary: Query inclusion of all elements and values in the Glossary					ALA		Understand that needs to be there
1129		Glossary: Concern about lack of variant terms					ALA		See suggestions
1130		Glossary: when there is more than one definition for a term they should be numbered [Comment made at Chart, Conference, Section]							Done in clean-up edit
1132		Glossary: Atlas: limit to cartographic atlases **Note: AACR2 change**							Used at 3.4.2.2, Change to "A volume of maps or other cartographic content with or without descriptive text."

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
1134		Glossary: Captioning: The phrase "speech and other audible information" seems to indicate that the captions are audible! Furthermore, captions may present non-audible features of the resource ("described video") and are not always "in the language of the audio content." The Glossary definition should also clarify whether captions and subtitles are the same.					ALA		Captioning: Text representing speech and other audible information that is displayed on screen in the written language of the audio element of the resource. Usually found as 'closed captions' which are encoded and must be decoded (switched on) to be made visible. There are also 'open captions' which are always visible and cannot be turned off. Excludes subtitles in a language different from the spoken content.
1135		Glossary: Card: It is unfortunate that the definition needs to invoke size; cards can be rather large.							Definition came from RDA/ONIX framework

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
1136		Glossary: Cartridge: This category is not limited to computer media; it can include audio or video cartridges, and may house tape as well as discs or chips.	Glossary: Cartridge: query definition when there are other types of cartridge. Use "computer cartridge"? **Note: "Computer cartridge" not used in RDA**						Remove Cartridge and Cassette from the Glossary
1137			Glossary: Case: Reword to include other resources that can be contained in a case such as audio discs, videocassettes, etc. **Note: Use in chapter 3 is as defined**						Withdrawn
1138			Glossary: Chorus score: see Wording				CCC ERD		Agree
1141		Glossary: Computer: Make clear that defining as Media Type. In fact, it might be useful to include an indication (phrase or code or icon) to indicate that the term being defined is an element, a sub-element, an element sub-type, or a value.					ALA		Defer as there does not seem to be anything that can be done. Use of a code is not part of the content model. Consider for the future.

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
1142		Glossary: Date of Promulgation of a Law, etc.: We suggest defining "promulgation."							Promulgation is as dictionary defined
1143		Glossary: Early Printed Resources: The scope of this category is still unclear. As written, it seems to be limited to letterpress printing, and to exclude graphic printing processes such as engraving. And technically, the hand press was a machine.							Note: definition was originally suggested in "ALA Comments on the RDA Glossary, May 2006"
1146			Glossary Graphic notation: By excluding only staff notation, the definition seems to imply that other musical notations such as mensural notation, letter notation, etc., are considered graphic notation			CCC			Use definition from LC as modified: "A type of musical notation that emerged in the mid-twentieth century that uses various suggestive lines, symbols, colour, etc., to prompt or guide the performers. It is used for music that is indeterminate in pitch, duration, temperament, etc. and also to depict electronic music in which no performer is involved."

Comnt	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
1147		Glossary: Identifier for …: suggest that a general definition of "Identifier" be given					ALA		Withdrawn
1149			Glossary: Key: see wording				CCC		See LC/12 discussion
1150			Glossary: Manuscript: see rewording				ERD		Agree. "1. In general, a text, musical score, map, etc., inscribed or written entirely by hand or the handwritten or typescript copy of a creator's work. 2. ."
1151		Glossary: Microopaque: suggest "A card bearing a number of microimages in a two-dimensional array."					ERD		"A card or sheet of opaque material bearing a number of microimages in a two-dimensional array."
1153		Glossary: Tactile Image: The significance of the phrase "in two dimensions" is unclear, and contrary to fact. Any raised image intended to be perceived through touch is in three dimensions.							No change. In table at chapter 3 distinction between two and three dimensions is made consistently.
1154			Glossary: Type of musical composition: see proposed rewording				CCC		Change to "Type of composition". Agree CCC

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
1155			Glossary: Typescript: remove "in the form in which it is submitted for publication"						Agree
1156			Glossary: Vocal score: add "or with accompaniment omitted"				CCC		Disagree as it would be an AACR2 change.
GLOSSARY - Suggestions for new terms									
1157			Glossary: Include Adaptation and Arrangement				CCC		Withdrawn. Meaning of adaptation covered by 6.28.1.6. Arrangement and Transcription covered by 6.19.1.4. Remove Transcription from Glossary.
1160		Continuing Resource: Proposed definition: "Resources issued over time."					ALA		Disagree ALA. Not used in RDA.

Comment	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
1161		Controlled Access Point: Proposed definition: "An access point recorded in an authority record. Controlled Access Points include both Preferred Access Points and Variant Access Points." Include a see also reference to "Preferred Access Point" and "Variant Access Point."					ALA		Withdrawn
1163					Distinctive title (see wording)				Use "In the context of musical works, a title that is not just a form or musical genre, tempo indication, a number of performers, or a type of liturgical text."
1167			Non-distinctive title (see wording)		Non-distinctive title (see wording)		CCC		Not required, see line 1163
1168		Numbering: Use the definition of what RDA means by numbering that appears in 2.6.1.1, second paragraph.					ALA		See line 251

Comm	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP/BL	LC	Other	Priority	Related	Meeting
1169		Publish or Published: This is a long-standing need. The concept is fundamental to many decisions made in following RDA, but there are many ambiguities. A definition would be helpful.					ALA		Withdrawn - no ALA proposal. Published is used in the normal sense of the word.
1171		Transliteration (p. 2 of the response)							Decision made in JSC Glossary wiki not to include

<u>Attachment B – Appendix J response table</u>

This response table was used during discussion of Appendix J in 5JSC/RDA/Full draft at the March 2009 meeting. Meeting decisions have been added to the final column.

Notes on the response table:

- The table contains detailed comments from ALA, CCC, and LC on the Appendix J in 5JSC/RDA/Full draft.
- The ALA representative prepared a revised version of Appendix J for discussion at the meeting. Changes made in the revised version and points for discussion are indicated in the "ALA rep actions" column in the table.
- In addition to those comments marked as priorities in the constituency responses, the ALA representative also added "discuss" to some line numbers in the "Priority" column.

Note: The changes noted in this table do not represent all changes made to the text of Appendix J in the full draft. In addition, the revised version used at the March 2009 meeting contained extensive editorial corrections.

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
	APPENDIX J RELATIONSHIP DESIGNATORS: RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN WORKS, EXPRESSIONS, MANIFESTATIONS …					
J1	App J: The text in this appendix should be reviewed and rewritten as necessary to make sure that the entity in the definition clearly refers to the correct entity for the related work, etc.			ALA	done	
J2	App J: Reviewers were confused by the use/non-use of prepositions, and wished that the terms could more explicitly indicate the direction of the relationship. **March 4: As ALA has no proposal to offer and as time is limited, ALA withdraws this comment.**					Withdrawn
J3		App J: Section is hard to use and follow. Additional presentation in chart form could help		discuss		Not possible in Appendix. Could be developed for training
J4		App J: most of the relationships in J.2 have already been covered in J.1		discuss		Comment should have said that relationships in J3 that have been covered in J2. See later LC comments
J5		App J: In J.2.2 it is particularly unclear that some of the relationships (revised as, translated as) must apply between different expressions of a single work, while most of the relationships in the list apply between expressions of different works.		ALA: Discuss		J.3.2. Training issue

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
J6			App J: Recommend identifying the relationship at the highest level possible	LC: Discuss	Relationship designators may be used with a structured description; many specific relationships are used in this way in examples in RDA.	See J5
J7			App J: add an explanation of the hierarchy in the lists	LC: Discuss		Already agreed (see line 1052 in full draft response table - Attachment A)
J8			App J: add an explanation that the element Explanation of relationship can be used with a relationship at the top level in lieu of using a more specific relationship.	LC: Discuss		Already agreed (see line 1052 in full draft response table - Attachment A)
	J.1 Purpose and scope					
J9						
	J.2 Relationship designators for related works					
J10						
	J.2.1 Related work relationships					

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
J11			J.2.1: add a general "is related to"	discuss	Wouldn't this be redundant with the Related Work element?	Will be covered in the General guidelines - but has to be linked to the entity, work etc.
	J.2.2 Derivative work relationships					
J12	J2.2, musical variations based on (work): Suggested revision: "A musical work from which melodic, thematic, or harmonic material is taken to form a discrete theme, which is repeated one or more times with subsequent modifications."				change accepted	Agree
J13	J2.2, parody of (work): Suggested revision: "A work whose style or content is imitated in the resource being described for comic effect."				change accepted; details of proposed wording not used	Agree
J14	J2.2, remake of (work): Suggested revision: "A motion picture used as the basis for a new motion picture." Whether or not the persons/bodies associated with the remake are new is irrelevant.				change accepted	Agree
J15	J2.2, abstract (work): Change "abbreviated" to "abbreviates" in the definition.				error corrected	
J16	J2.2, screenplay for the motion picture (work): The work in the phrase is a motion picture, not a screenplay. The definition is written the wrong way around; this is also a problem for the entries for "screenplay …" and "script …".				error corrected	

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
J17	Disagree.		J.2.2: Per LC's comment at J.3 below, delete the addition "(work)" in all terms except "based on," "abridgement of," and "abridged as."	discuss		See J5. In training stress that relationships should be made at the highest level.
J18			J.2.2, "based on (work)": change "… for a derivative entity" to "… for a derivative work" for clarification.		change accepted, although I'm not absolutely sure that the derivative entity would always be a work	Agree (ignore ALA Rep comment)
J19			J.2.2, "derivative work": change "… of a source entity" to "… of a source work" for clarification.		change accepted; same as line J18	Agree
J20		J.2.2: add "libretto (work)" and "libretto for (work)" see wording		CCC	Need decision on 5JSC/LC/12 treatment of librettos	Add "libretto (work)" and "libretto for (work)" to J.2.5 both under "complemented by (work)"
J21		J.2.2 libretto based on: add "or an oratorio"		CCC	change accepted, but slightly different wording	Use CCC wording

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
J22		J.2.2 Musical arrangement: these are expressions incorrect to include here and reciprocals are missing		CCC	change accepted	Agree
J23		J.2.2 musical setting of: reword: "A work that provides the text for a non-dramatic musical work, except for oratorios"		CCC	change accepted; use singular "oratorio"	Agree
J24		J.2.2 basis for libretto: add "or an oratorio"		CCC	change accepted	See J21
J25		J.2.2 musical setting: reword "A non-dramatic, musical work, except for oratorios, that uses the text for the source work."		CCC	change accepted; use singular "oratorio"	Agree
	J.2.3 Descriptive work relationships					
J26	ALA continues to believe that these are not inherently subject relationships; furthermore, when used in conjunction with a structured description, they will establish a relationship between the resource being described and the related work.		J.2.3: remove these subject relationships. If not agreed change wording	discuss		LC withdrawn. Review when FRSAR is available
	J.2.4 Whole-part work relationships					
J27	J.2.4 and J.3.4, cadenza composed for, libretto for, cadenza and libretto: CCC objected to treating cadenzas and librettos as parts of a musical work. ALA agrees; these terms and definitions should be removed from this section. See text	J.2.4: CAML strongly objects to include cadenzas and librettos in the category of whole-part work relationships		ALA CCC	Need decision on 5JSC/LC/12 treatment of librettos and cadenzas	Move to J.2.5 both under "complemented by (work)" (line J20)
	J.2.5 Accompanying work relationships					

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
J28		J.2.5: add "cadenza (work)" and "cadenza composed for (work)" see wording		CCC	Need decision on 5JSC/LC/1 2 treatment of librettos	See J27
J29	J.2.5, catalogue (work) and catalogue of (work): The definition seem to have been reversed.				error corrected	
J30	J.2.5: A reciprocal for "illustrations for (work)" may be needed for the "augmented by (work)" section.				error corrected	
J31			J.2.5, "augmented by (work)": change "... of a predominant entity" to "… of a predominant work" for clarification.		change accepted, but Aug. 2008 draft uses "augmente d" rather than "predomin ant"	See J32 - reinstate predominant
J32			J.2.5, "augmentation of (work)": use "predominant content"	discuss	Aug. 2008 draft does not use "predomin ant"	Use "augmented by (work): A work that adds to the content of a predominant work." "augmentation of (work): A predominant work whose content is added to by another work."
J33			J.2.5, "augmentation of (work)": replace "entity" with "work"		change accepted	Agree

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
J34			J.2.5, "complemented by (work): replace "entity" with "work"		change accepted	Agree
	J.2.6 Sequential work relationships					
J35			J.2.6: the more specific terms under "succeeded by (work)" are missing		errors corrected	
J36			J.2.6 "preceded by (work)": see rewording		change accepted; also made at J.3.6	Agree
J37	J.2.6, continues (work): Change definition to: "A work that is continued by the content of the resource being described."		J.2.6 "continues (work)": delete "and numbering"		change accepted; details of ALA wording not used	Agree
J38	J.2.6, continues in part (work): Change definition to: "A work that is continued in part by the content of the resource being described."		J.2.6 continues in part (work)" delete "and numbering"		change accepted; details of ALA wording not used	Agree
J39	J.2.6, prequel (work): Change definition to: "A later appearing work whose narrative is extends backwards in time from the narrative of the earlier appearing work."				error corrected; details of the ALA wording not used	
J40	J.2.6, merger of (work): Change definition to: "Two or more works which came together to form the new resource being described."				error corrected; details of the ALA wording not used	

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
J41	J.2.6, separated from (work): Change definition to: "A work that spun off part of its content into the separate resource being described."				error corrected; details of the ALA wording not used	
J42	J.2.6, supersedes (work): Remove the sentence that begins "For serials, …"		J.2.6 "supersedes (work)" and "supersedes in part" (work): delete	discuss whether to retain second sentence	deletion of first sentence accepted	No further action
J43			J.2.6 "succeeded by (work)": see revised wording		change accepted; change also made at J.3.6	Agree
J44	J.2.6, absorbed in part by (work): "The work that incorporates content that partially continues the resource being described."				change accepted; different wording	Agree
J45	J.2.6,continued by (work): Remove "and numbering" from the definition.		J.2.6 "continued by (work)" [appropriate term missing]: delete "and numbering" when appropriate term is restored		change accepted	Agree
J46	J.2.6, continued in part by (work): Remove "and numbering" from the definition		J.2.6 "continued in part by (work): [appropriate term missing]: delete "and numbering" when appropriate term is restored		change accepted	Agree

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
J47	J.2.6, prequel (work): "An earlier appearing work whose narrative is extended backwards in time by the later appearing work."				error corrected; details of the ALA wording not used	
J48	J.2.6, merged with (work): "One of two or more works that came together to form a new work."				error corrected; details of the ALA wording not used	
J49	J.2.6, separated from (work): This entry should be removed. The reciprocal of "separated from" is usually handled as "continued in part by".			discuss	Do others agree?	Information about the reciprocal in the form "Reciprocal relationship:" will be added to all terms in Apps J and K Post meeting note: Reciprocal relationships will not be added in the provisional Appendix K (See line 1098 in Attachment A)
J50	J.2.6 "superseded by (work)" and "superseded in part by (work)" : Remove the sentence that begins "For serials, …"		J.2.6 "superseded by (work)" [appropriate term missing] and "superseded in part by (work)" [appropriate term missing]: delete	discuss whether to retain second sentence	deletion of first sentence accepted	See J42
J51	J.2.6, succeeded by (work) section: add: absorbed by (work): "The work that incorporates content continuing the resource being described."				error corrected; details of the ALA wording not used	

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
J52	J.2.6, succeeded by (work) section: add: split into (work): "Two or more later works resulting from a split of the resource being described."				error corrected; details of the ALA wording not used	
	J.3 Relationship designators for related expressions					
J53						
	J.3.1 Related expression relationships					
J54						
	J.3.2 Derivative expression relationships					
J55			J.3.2: delete all specific relationships except those listed	LC: discuss	These designations are not limited to expression-to-expression relationships; a new work may be based on a particular expression and vice versa; see also line J5.	Withdrawn at J17
J56			J.3.2, "based on (expression)": change "… for a derivative entity" to "… for a derivative expression"	discuss	See line J55	Withdrawn at J17

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
J57	J.3.2, expanded version of (expression): Suggested revision: "An expression of a work used as the basis for a work that enlarges upon the content of the source work."				change accepted; details of wording not used	Agree
J58		J.3.2: musical arrangement of: when would this be used?		discuss?	This is an example of a relationship between two expressions of the same work: an arrangement of a particular expression; cf. line J5.	No action
J59		J.3.2 libretto based on: add "or an oratorio"		CCC	change accepted, but slightly different wording	See J21
J60		J.3.2 musical setting of: use "a non-dramatic musical work, except for oratorios"		CCC	change accepted; use singular "oratorio"	Agree
J61			J.3.2, "derivative expression": change "… of a source entity" to "… of a source expression"		See line J55	Withdrawn at J17

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
J62		J.3.2 basis for libretto: add "or an oratorio"		CCC	change accepted, but slightly different wording	See J21
J63		J.3.2 musical setting: use "A non-dramatic musical work, except for oratorios,…"		CCC	change accepted; use singular "oratorio"	See J23
J64		J.3.2: musical arrangement: when would this be used?			See line J58	See J58
J65		J.3.2: add "libretto (expression)" and "libretto for (expression)" see wording		CCC	Need decision on 5JSC/LC/12 treatment of librettos	Add under J.3.5 see line J27
	J.3.3 Descriptive expression relationships					
J66			J.3.3: remove these subject relationships. If not agreed change wording and delete "described in (expression)"	discuss	See line J26	See J26
	J.3.4 Whole-part expression relationships					
J67	ALA does not agree that these are all work-to-work relationships		J.3.4: delete this section	LC: discuss		Disagree LC (J17)
	J.3.5 Accompanying expression relationships					
J68	ALA does not agree that these are all work-to-work relationships		J.3.5: delete this section	LC: discuss		Disagree LC (J17)
J69	J.3.5, augmented by (work): Change the caption to "augmented by (expression)"	J.3.5 augmented by (work): Should read augmented by (expression)			error corrected	

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
J70	J.3.5, illustrations for (expression): The definition points in the wrong direction. Suggested revision: "An expression of a work that is augmented by a resource comprising pictorial content designed to elucidate or decorate that expression."				error corrected	
J71		J.3.5: add "cadenza (expression)" and "cadenza composed for (expression)" see wording		CCC	Need decision on 5JSC/LC/12 treatment of cadenzas	Add to J.3.5 see line J27
	J.3.6 Sequential expression relationships					
J72	ALA is not sure that these are all work-to-work relationships		J.3.6: delete this section	LC: discuss		Withdrawn
J73	J.3.6, preceded by (expression) and succeeded by (expression): As with the corresponding section for related works, there are copy-and-paste errors, as well as terms and definitions that point in the wrong direction. These sections should be checked against all of the comments under J.2.6.				errors corrected	
	J.4 Relationship designators for related manifestations					
J74						
	J.4.1 Related manifestation relationships					
	J.4.2 Equivalent manifestation relationships					

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
J75	J.4.2, electronic reproduction (manifestation) and digital transfer (manifestation): These categories are not distinct in practice. An analogue resource reproduced in a digital format results in a resource that is both an electronic reproduction and a digital transfer.			discuss	Tentatively agree; would prefer to retain "electronic reproduction"	Change digital transfer: "A manifestation resulting from the transfer from one digital format to another." Electronic reproduction to remain the same.
J76	J.4.2, reprint of: Change the definition to: "A manifestation used as the basis for a reissue with the same content."		J.4.2, "reprint of" and "reproduction of" as well as: Reconsider these two separate relationships. It is not clear how they differ from each other.	discuss	A distinction can be made, but the definitions do not do so; not sure that either term alone covers both cases	Subordinate "reprint of" to "reproduction of". Make clear that reprint is a print reproduction.
J77			J.4.2, "reprinted as" and "reproduction of (manifestation)": do not consider these to be two separate relationships. It is not clear how they differ from each other.	discuss	See line J76	Equivalent change to line J76
J78	J.4.2, digital transfer of (manifestation): Change the definition to: "A manifestation used as the basis for a transfer from an analog format to a digital one, or from one digital format to another."			discuss	See line J75	Use: digital transfer of (manifestation) "A manifestation transferred from one digital format to another."
	J.4.3 Descriptive manifestation relationships					

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
J79			J.2.3: remove these subject relationships. If not agreed change wording	discuss	See line J26	See line J26
	J.4.4 Whole-part manifestation relationships					
J80			J.4.4: do not agree with the identification of these relationships being at the manifestation level.	LC: discuss		Withdrawn
J81	We see a distinction, with "offprint" being a special case of a reprint; don't feel strongly about retaining		J.4.4 "offprint" and "reprinted from": do not consider these to be two separate relationships	discuss		Agree to delete "offprint"
	J.4.5 Accompanying manifestation relationships					
J82	J.4.5: Consider adding a category for "digitized with" for titles have been digitized in a single digital file; this would parallel "filmed with," and similar relationships.			discuss	"Issued with" and "filmed with" are physically inseparable; not true of "digitized with"	Disagree. Digitized is a process and is not to do with issuing.
J83			J.4.5, "accompanied by (manifestation): change "… with another entity" to "… with another manifestation"		change accepted	Agree
	J.5 Relationship designators for related items					
J84						
	J.5.1 Related item relationships					
J85						
	J.5.2 Equivalent item relationships					

Cor	ALA	CCC	LC	Priority	ALA Rep actions	Meeting
J86	J.5.2, digital transfer of (item): Change the definition to: "An item used as the basis for a transfer from an analog format to a digital one, or from one digital format to another."			discuss		See J75
	J.5.3 Descriptive item relationships					
J87			J.5.3: remove these subject relationships. If not agreed change wording	discuss	See line J26	See J26
	J.5.4 Whole-part item relationships					
J88			J.5.4: delete	LC: discuss	But notes **are** structured description s and are therefore covered by this appendix.	Withdrawn
	J.5.5 Accompanying item relationships					
J89	ALA would accept the rewording, but would like to hear from other constituencies		J.5.5, "accompanying item/accompanied by (item)" and specific relationships: see revised wording	discuss		Agree change to definition

Attachment C

Constituency comments on the RDA Full draft that are not included in the response table

ALA response

Comments not included in the response table, but referred to the Editor:

2.8.1.5.1 and 2.8.1.5.2 [editorial]: "Annotation" vs. "note".
Comment from Editor: The error will be corrected in the next round of editing.

Comments not included in the response table, because the correction has already been marked in the PDF file by the Editor:

6.2.2.11.2 and 6.2.2.11.3: The instruction at the end of 6.2.2.11.2 and that at the beginning of 6.2.2.11.3 both apply to incomplete compilations of works in a particular form, but they refer to different instruction numbers.

6.10 Need centered heading "Other Identifying Attributes of Expressions" preceding 6.10

6.13: The reference to 6.15.3 is not appropriate for music resources; change the reference to 6.19.

6.23.2.3-6.24.2.4: The references do not agree with the instructions referred to; specifically, the scope of 6.23.2.6, 6.23.2.7 are wrong, and the numbers 6.23.2.8-6.23.2.17 are incorrect.

6.23.2.8: Delete "For Jewish liturgical works, follow the instructions under 6.23.2.7." Those instructions now appear further on in 6.23.2.8 (p. 109) and the instruction intrudes between two paragraphs about Catholic liturgical works.

7.12.1.1, second paragraph: We believe that the reference to 3.21 for recording programming language is an error for 3.20, Equipment and system requirements.

9.3.4.1 2nd para: correct to refer to period of activity or dates of activity [para deleted in clean-up edit]

11.2.2.10: change "oriental language" to "East Asian language". [changed to "Asian " in clean-up edit]

18.1.2: The definition of "person" doesn't match the definition in Chapter 29 and the Glossary. Both of these include "or non-human"

D.3.1: Field 400 represents an obsolete practice that goes against the grain of RDA's separation of descriptive elements and access elements. This field should not be mapped to RDA.

Glossary: Computer disc/disk: use "disc" consistently.

BL response

Comments not included in the response table, but referred to the Editor:

2.15.2 The use of the apostrophe in the phrase "publisher's numbers" is inconsistent. Suggest all instances are replaced by, "'publisher numbers'".

Comment from Editor: All element names are given in the singular (Publisher's number). Instructions on sources of information and on recording the element generally use the plural. This case follows that general practice: the element name is in the singular (publisher's number = a number assigned by a publisher); the instruction on sources of information and recording the element use the plural (publishers' numbers = numbers assigned by publishers).

31.1.1.1
"A related family is a family who is associated with the person, family"

Suggest

"….a family that is…"

Comment from Editor: The correction has already been made in the glossary. The text in chapter 31 will be corrected in the next round of editing.

Comments not included in the response table, because the correction has already been marked in the PDF file by the Editor:

7.12.1.1: The reference to 3.21 appears to be incorrect.

24.5.1.2: Source of information is not specified

CCC response

Comments not included in the response table, because the correction has already been marked in the PDF file by the Editor:

0.9 5th para: replace ref to AACR with "…prescribed in Appendix E."

3.6.1.3 (last paragraph) vs. 3.7.1.3, 3.8.1.3 etc.: Record additional details of … vs. Record details of ….

3.19.1.3: "regional encoding (see 3.19.4.3)" should be added to the list

9.0 fn 2: The definition of person should be the same throughout RDA

18.1.2: The definition of person should be the same throughout RDA, e.g. see 29.1.2.

Glossary: Projected: Add "and three-dimensional images"

Glossary: Recording Medium: References to Reduced Score and Condensed Score added seemingly by mistake

LC response

Comments not included in the response table, but referred to the Editor:

E.3.1, footnote 1: typo: NA* should be N/A*
Comment from Editor: The correction will be made in the next round of editing.

Comments not included in the response table, because the correction has already been marked in the PDF file by the Editor:

0.9: add an explanation that the examples reflect those created by a cataloguing agency preferring English where applicable

2.13.1.3: add table name

3.16.9.3: change caption to "Recording special playback characteristics"

3.18.1.1 2nd para: delete "aspect ratio"

3.19.1.3 1st para: add "regional encoding"

6.20.5.3 2nd para: delete footnote and add same exception as at 6.2.3.3 ("Record a title appearing on a manifestation of the work as a variant title for the work …").

6.21.1.1: replace "first" with "earliest"

6.23.3.3 2nd para: delete footnote and add same exception as at 6.2.3.3 ("Record a title appearing on a manifestation of the work as a variant title for the work …").

6.24.1.1: use "is the earliest date associated with an expression of a religious work"

6.26.3.3 2nd para: delete footnote and add same exception as at 6.2.3.3 ("Record a title appearing on a manifestation of the work as a variant title for the work …").

7.28: Give element name in the singular

8.5.7: correct to apply to section 3

8.10.1.3 caption: change "Recording the status of the preferred access point" to "Recording the status of identification"

9.2.3.5: use "If the name chosen as the preferred name for a person is the name used by that person in religion, record that person's secular name as a variant name"

9.3.4.1 2nd para: correct to refer to period of activity [para deleted in clean-up edit]

11.2.2.10 3rd para: remove use of "oriental" [changed to "Asian " in clean-up edit]

18.1.6: use "… between the resource and persons ..

19.0: replace "originating bodies and others" with "jurisdictions governed, sponsoring bodies, etc." ["originating bodies" already deleted in clean-up edit]

21.4.1.2: change "publishers" to "distributors"

24.2 b) delete "represented by preferred access points"

24.5.1.2 add "from any source"

24.7.1.1 delete "represented by preferred access points"

25.2.1.3 last para: expand ref to app E

26.2.1.3 last para: expand ref to app E

29.1.3 Related person: add "or by an identifier"

29.1.3 Related family: add "or by an identifier"

29.1.3 Related corporate body: add "or by an identifier"

29.4.1 add new 2nd para: "For relationship designators, see 29.5."

29.4.2 2nd para: change to "For relationship designators, see 29.5."

29.5.1.2: add "and/or identifiers"

29.6.1: add "and/or identifiers"

30.1.1.3a add new para: "For relationship designators, see 29.5." [30.1.1.3a deleted in clean-up edit]

30.1.1.3b 2nd para: change to "For relationship designators, see 29.5." [30.1.1.3b deleted in clean-up edit]

30.1.1.3b: add missing para [30.1.1.3b deleted in clean-up edit]

31.1.1.1: add "or by an identifier"

31.1.1.3.1 add new para: "For relationship designators, see 29.5." [31.1.1.3.1 deleted in clean-up edit]

31.1.1.3: add missing para [31.1.1.3.1 deleted in clean-up edit]

31.2.1.1: add "or by an identifier"

32.1.1.1: add "or by an identifier"

32.1.1.3.1 add new para: "For relationship designators, see 29.5." [32.1.1.3.1 deleted in clean-up edit]

32.1.1.3.2 2nd para: change to "For relationship designators, see 29.5." [32.1.1.3.2 deleted in clean-up edit]

32.2.1.1: add "or by an identifier"

B.7: Add superscript "1" to: baritone, bass, soprano, tenor

App E: The presentation/punctuation sections should include a statement indicating that some types of punctuation used in access points are specified in the instructions, not the appendix.

Comments not included in the response table, because they are correct in the PDF file:

D.2.1, line for 4.4:   delete "2.10.6   Date of manufacture"

D.2.2.2, 1st paragraph: The reference should be corrected to 2.3.1.7.

D.2.2.7, 2nd paragraph: The reference should be corrected to 2.12.1.5.

D.2.3.2, 1st paragraph: The reference should be corrected to 1.5.4.

Comments from other rule makers identified by JSC reps:

Comment not included in the response table, because the correction has already been marked in the PDF file by the Editor:

ACOC: 17.4.2 says: "Record primary relationships using one or more of the described under 17.4.2.1–17.4.2.3 conventions, as applied". Comment: "...more of the described" what? Is anything lacking in this paragraph? [Norway]

Comment not included in the response table because it will be passed to the Examples Groups:

ACOC and CCC: 11.2.2.8 We are not happy with the Norwegian example "Norske Nobelinstitutt not Det Norske Nobelinstitutt". The Norwegian language uses inflections and the chosen form without the initial article makes no sense. To make it grammatically correct it should be changed to Norsk Nobelinstitutt, which is not its name! In the AACR2 Norwegian translation we have added to 24.5A: "… unless they are necessary for grammatical reasons. [Norway]

Attachment D

"Clean-up" edit of full draft

Questions for JSC

Introduction

0.3.2 Alignment with FRBR

The definition of the term "work" given under 0.3.2 includes the parenthetical phrase "(i.e., the intellectual or artistic content)". That phrase is not part of the definition of "work" in FRBR; it is taken from the definition of "work" in FRAD, which in turn is taken from the IME-ICC Statement of International Cataloguing Principles. The same definition is used in chapter 24 and in the glossary, but in chapters 5 and 6, the original FRBR definition is used. Which definition does JSC want to use?

0.4.2.1 Responsiveness to User Needs

There is no user task listed under 0.4.2.1 to parallel the task listed under 29.2: "*find* persons, families, or corporate bodies that are related to the person, family, or corporate body represented by the data retrieved in response to the user's search". Should a parallel objective be added under 0.4.2.1?

0.6 Core Elements

0.6.7 Section 7: Recording Subject Relationships

The "elements" listed ("Access point representing the work", etc.) are not defined as elements in RDA. Chapter 23 (Recording Subject Relationships) will not be developed until after the first release of RDA, and there have as yet been no elements defined to reflect subject relationships. Presumably, however, when chapter 23 is developed there will be just one element defined (i.e., Subject). Pending further development, should the list of "elements" under 0.6.7 be replaced with a single element identified as "Subject"?

Chapter 2

2.3.11 Devised Title

2.3.11.1 Scope

Does the definition of "devised title" need to be revised to allow for the use of a devised title as the preferred title for a work when applying the alternative under 6.27.1.4 for a compilation that lacks a collective title?

2.4.2 Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title

Should the name of the element be changed to "Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper" to reflect the limitation in the definition (see 2.4.2.1)?

2.4.3 Parallel Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title

Should the name of the element be changed to "Parallel Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper" to reflect the limitation in the definition (see 2.4.3.1)?

2.5.1.6 Recording Changes in Edition Statements

2.5.1.6.3 Integrating Resources

Is the phrase "and this change does not require a new description" appropriate in this instruction? There are no instructions under 1.6.3 dealing explicitly with changes in edition statements.

2.6.3.3 Recording Chronological Designation of First Issue or Part

Should the alternative be an exception rather than an alternative? See also the comment below under 2.12.9.3.

2.11.1.3 Recording Copyright Dates

The optional addition specifies making a note giving other copyright dates with a cross-reference to 2.20.7.3. The instructions under 2.20.7.3 apply to notes on publication statements. Now that copyright date has been added as a separate element, should a new set of instructions on notes on copyright dates be added under 2.20, and the cross-reference under 2.11.1.3 be changed to refer to those new instructions?

2.12.9.3 Recording Numbering Within Series

Should the instruction in the third paragraph ("If the numbering consists of a year and a number ...") be labelled either as an alternative or as an exception? See also the comment above under 2.6.3.3.

2.20.2.4 Title Variations, Inaccuracies, and Deletions

Does the instruction at the end of the last paragraph ("Indicate the numbering or publication dates to which the deletion applies.") need to be broadened to cover notes on other types of title changes? See the references to 2.20.2.4 in the third paragraph under 2.3.7.3 and 2.3.8.3.

Chapter 3

3.1.4 Resources Consisting of More Than One Carrier

The instructions under 3.1.4 only address resources consisting of more than one type of carrier. There are no instructions within 3.1.4 that address resources consisting of multiple carriers of the same type (cf. 3.4.1.3). Should the caption for 3.1.4 be revised to

reflect more accurately the scope of the instructions, or should the instructions be expanded to cover resources consisting of multiple carriers of the same type?

3.4.5.3 Unnumbered Pages, Leaves, or Columns

The exception for early printed resources at the bottom of page 39 conflicts with the exception for early printed resources on page 38. Which exception takes precedence?

3.4.5.10 Folded Leaves or Pages

The caption and instruction refer to both folded leaves and folded pages. Is it possible to fold a page without folding the leaf?

3.6.1.3 Recording Base Material

 An instruction on recording details of base material (i.e., details not reflected in the term or terms recorded to designate the base material) has been incorporated into section 3.6.1.3. The same has been done throughout chapter 3 (see 3.6.2.3, 3.7.1.3, 3.7.2.3, 3.8.1.3, 3.9.1.3, 3.9.2.3 3.9.3.3, 3.10.2.3, 3.10.3.3, 3.10.4.3, 3.10.5.3, 3.10.6.3, 3.11.1.3, 3.11.2.3, 3.11.3.3, 3.11.4.3, 3.12.1.3, 3.13.1.3, 3.14.1.3, 3.15.1.3, 3.16.1.3, 3.16.2.3, 3.16.3.3, 3.16.3.3, 3.16.4.3, 3.16.5.3, 3.16.6.3, 3.16.7.3, 3.16.8.3, 3.16.9.3, 3.17.1.3, 3.17.2.3, 3.17.3.3, 3.18.1.3, 3.18.2.3, 3.18.3.3, 3.19.1.3, 3.19.2.3, 3.19.3.3, and 3.19.7.3). In chapter 7, instructions on recording details of elements have been placed in a separate section with a subhead "Recording details of …" (see 7.13.2.4, 7.13.3.4, 7.13.4.4, 7.15.1.4, 7.17.1.4, 7.19.1.4, and 7.20.1.4). Should all such instructions be presented in the same way? If so, which presentation is preferred (the presentation used in chapter 3 or that used in chapter 7)?

3.22.2.10 Resource Containing Both Text, Still Images, etc., and Sound and/or Moving Images

The instruction under 3.22.2.10 indicates that duration would be recorded in a note on the extent of a resource containing both text, still images, etc., and sound and/or moving images. The instruction on recording duration under 7.22.1.6 (which is referred to from 3.22.2.10) indicates that the duration for such a resource would be recorded as duration. Which instruction should take precedence?

Chapter 6

6.20.4.4 [i.e., 6.20.2.8] Compilations of Treaties, etc.

The instructions under 6.20.4.4 [i.e., 6.20.2.8] cover only compilations of treaties between one party on one side and one or more other parties on the other side. Should the instruction also cover compilations of treaties with more than one party on each side?

6.29.1.20.3 Other Compilations of Treaties, etc.

In the example, should the preferred access point representing the compilation be constructed using the preferred access point representing the compiler as creator of the compilation?

6.30.3.5 Preferred Access Point Representing a Variant or Special Text of a Liturgical Work

Would it be appropriate to revise the instruction in the second paragraph of the instructions under 6.30.3.5 to read as follows: "If the additions listed under a), b), or c) above are insufficient to identify the variant text, add an additional term (e.g., the name of the editor)."

<u>Chapter 7</u>

7.9.2.3 Recording Academic Degree

The instruction under 7.9.2.3 gives "M.A." and "Ph.D." as examples of data to be recorded for this element. Should appendix B include instructions on the use of abbreviations for academic degrees?

7.17.1 Basic Instructions on Recording Colour Content

7.17.1.2 Sources of Information

The instruction under 7.17.1.2 reads as follows: "Use evidence presented by the resource itself (or on any accompanying material or container) as the basis for …." The instructions under 2.2.1.1 on preferred source of information and under 2.2.3 on other sources of information specify under what circumstances accompanying material and containers are to be treated as part of the "resource itself". Is the parenthetical instruction under 7.17.1.2 intended to override the instructions under 2.2.1.1 and 2.2.3? If not, should it be deleted?

7.17.2 Colour of Still Image

7.17.2.2 Sources of Information

Same question as under 7.17.1.2 above.

7.17.3 Colour of Moving Images

7.17.3.2 Sources of Information

Same question as under 7.17.1.2 above.

7.17.4 Colour of Three-Dimensional Forms

7.17.4.2 Sources of Information

Same question as under 7.17.1.2 above.

7.17.5 Colour of Resource Designed for Persons with Visual Impairments

7.17.5.2 Sources of Information

Same question as under 7.17.1.2 above.

7.18.1 Basic Instructions on Recording Sound Content

7.18.1.2 Sources of Information

Same question as under 7.17.1.2 above.

7.21.1.3 Basic Instructions on Recording Medium of Performance of Musical Content

Appendix B contains an instruction on using abbreviations (A, B, Bar., S, and T) when recording two or more voices as medium of performance, but there is no instruction under 7.21.1.3 referring to the use of those abbreviations. Should an instruction be added?

Chapter 9

9.2.2.5.3 Names Written in a Non-Preferred Script[4]

The *Chicago Manual of Style* specifies that footnote references should not appear within or at the end of a subhead, but should be placed at an appropriate location in the text. What would be an appropriate location for this footnote? Should it be moved to the Introduction as text under 0.9 Examples?

9.2.2.11.1 Articles and Prepositions

Should the references to appendix F under 9.2.2.11.1 be replaced with an instruction referring to IFLA's *Names of Persons: National Usages for Entry in Catalogues* (cf. 9.2.2.10.2).

9.2.2.14 General Guidelines on Recording Names Containing a Title of Nobility

Clause a) in the first paragraph under 9.2.2.14 is worded as follows: "uses his or her title rather than surname in his or her works". Is that wording too narrow? Should it be worded as follows: "uses his or her title rather than surname in resources with which he or she is associated "?

Chapter 10

10.2.2 Preferred Name for the Family

10.2.2.2 Sources of Information

The instruction under 10.2.2.2 includes the following footnote: "*Reference sources*, as used in this chapter, includes books and articles written about a family."   Should there be an equivalent footnote under 9.2.2.2 and 11.2.2.2?

Chapter 11

11.2.2.12 Transliteration

Should the instruction under 11.2.2.12 be reviewed in the context of other instructions in RDA relating to the transliteration of names (i.e., those in chapter 9)?

11.6.1.6 Number of a Conference, etc.

Should a separate element be defined for number of a conference, etc.?

Chapter 18

18.3 Core Elements

In chapter 18 (as well as in the Introduction), only creator and other person, family, or corporate body associated with a work are listed as core elements for section 6. In chapter 20, contributor is designated as a core element if the access point representing that person, family, or corporate body is used to construct the preferred access point representing the work. Should the list of core elements for section 6 under 18.3 (and in the Introduction) be revised, or should the designation of contributor as a core element in chapter 20 be deleted?

Chapter 19

19.2.1 Basic Instructions on Recording Creators

19.2.1.1 Scope

Paragraph b) on page 4 of the October 31, 2008 PDF of chapter 19 reads as follows: "official communications from a pope, patriarch, bishop, etc. (e.g., an order, decree, pastoral letter, bull, encyclical, constitution, or an official message to a council, synod, etc.)". Should "constitution" be included in this list of examples of official communications from a religious official? Is there a potential conflict with instructions elsewhere relating to constitutions as legal works?

Chapter 24

24.0 Scope

The first paragraph under 24.0 indicates that chapter 24 "specifies core elements for recording those relationships" (i.e., relationships between works, expressions, manifestations, and items). In fact, there are no core elements designated for section 8 (see 24.3). Should the phrase cited from the first paragraph under 24.0 be deleted?

24.2 Functional Objectives and Principles

The last paragraph under 24.2 states that "the data should reflect all significant relationships between works, expressions, manifestations, and items ...". Should that statement be revised to refer to "all significant <u>bibliographic</u> relationships"?

Chapter 29

29.0 Scope

The first paragraph under 29.0 indicates that chapter 29 "specifies core elements for recording those relationships" (i.e., relationships between persons, families, and corporate bodies). In fact, there are no core elements designated for section 9 (see 29.3). Should the phrase cited from the first paragraph under 29.0 be deleted?

29.2 Functional Objectives and Principles

The last paragraph under 29.2 states that "the data should reflect all significant relationships between persons, families, and corporate bodies ...". Should that statement be revised to refer to "all significant <u>bibliographic</u> relationships"?

Appendix B

B.3 Titles of Works

The instruction under B.3 refers to "Protocols, etc." in the context of abbreviations used in titles of works. "Protocols, etc." is not a title of a work. It is used as an addition in an access point representing a protocol, amendment, extension, or other ancillary agreement to a treaty, etc. (see 6.29.1.33). However, there are no instructions in chapter 6 on recording "Protocols, etc." as an element (i.e., independently of its use as an addition to an access point). Does a new element need to be defined (e.g., Other designation associated with a legal work)?

B.5.2 Extent of Storage Space

There is no reference under B.5.2 to the use of abbreviations when recording storage space in non-metric units of measure (see the alternative under 3.4.1.11.2). Should an instruction be added to specify that the abbreviations for units of measure listed under B.7can be used, as applicable, when applying that alternative?

Appendix F

Given the decision to replace specific instructions on recording compound names with reference to IFLA's *Names of Persons: National Uses for Entries in Catalogues,* should consideration be given to doing the same with all the instructions that refer to appendix F, and eliminate the appendix altogether?

Attachment E (Line 117)

Punctuation in Serials Numbering

The issue was originally raised as a CCC correction arising from the NZ comments on the full draft:

> 1.8.4: There is confusion between the use of hyphen in the first example and the use of a slash in the second example. [New Zealand].
>
> CCC notes that the first example is a multipart monograph and that the use of a slash in the second is ISBD punctuation for a serial. CCC suggests changing the wording, to give context and clarification:
> First example: "Source of information on multipart monograph reads 1967-72"
> Second example: "Designation appears on issue of serial as 1961-2"

The following examples at 2.6.3.3 also use a slash instead of a hyphen:

> 1993/1994
> Designation appears on issue as: 1993-4
>
> 1999/2000
> Designation appears on issue as: 1999-2000

There is no instruction in RDA that tells you to replace the hyphen with a slash in serials numbering. The provision for changing punctuation at AACR2 12.3C1 is not in RDA.

For numbering of serials, numbering within series, and numbering within subseries, the instructions under 1.8.2-1.8.5 apply to numbers expressed as numerals or as words; the instructions under 1.7 apply to other words, characters, or groups of words or characters within the element (see 2.6.1.4 and 2.12.9.3).

1.7.3 has:
> Transcribe punctuation as it appears on the source, omitting punctuation on the source that separates data to be recorded as one element from data to be recorded as a different element, or as a second or subsequent instance of an element.
>
> Add punctuation, as necessary, for clarity.
>
> For instructions on the use of prescribed punctuation for the display of descriptive data in ISBD form, see appendix D (D.1.2).

There is nothing about changing punctuation, and Appendix D does not specify this sort of internal punctuation.

There is a useful instruction in the CONSER Cataloguing Manual at 8.4.2b:

> AACR2 12.3B1 and 12.3C1/LCRI say to transcribe the numbering as found, with the exception of punctuation. Making such exceptions is particularly useful when transcribing compound years and double issues. Substituting a slash for the hyphen that is commonly found on such issues will produce a more intelligible designation, particularly once it is closed off. A general guideline to follow is to change the punctuation only when it will clarify the presentation of the numbering.

Comments from Laura May and Marg Stewart:

AACR2 has a provision for changing punctuation at 12.3C1 and CONSER Cataloging Manual at 8.4.2b specifically says to do so for the "sake of clarity". RDA says to record what you see; the examples at 1.8.4 as well as the examples at 2.6.3.3 do not do this. The hyphen is substituted for a slash in each of these examples. We think that there are 2 choices:

1. to allow the substitution of a slash for a hyphen for the sake of clarity in the numbering of serials, numbering within series, and numbering within subseries as an exception. We found a provision in 1998 ISBD(S) that prescribed a slash be used when an issue covers more than 1 year. However, that was dropped in IBSD(CR), published in 2002.
2. to delete the 2nd example at 1.8.4 and to change the examples at 2.6.3.3 to reflect RDA as it is presently written.

Attachment F (Line 187)

Covering email

Date: Wed, 04 Mar 2009 17:15:50 -0500
From: "Barbara B Tillett" <btil@loc.gov>
Subject: Earlier/later titles proper - as promised

Dear JSC,

As noted in an earlier message to the JSC, LC does not agree with decision to consider earlier and later titles proper as variant titles.

Attached is a proposal from LC to remove changes in titles proper from draft 2.3.6 (Variant title) and to add element sub-types for Earlier title proper (proposed 2.3.6) and Later title proper (proposed 2.3.7).

The proposed 2.3.8 is a simplification/merger of draft 2.3.6-2.3.8.

Note that LC did not include any proposed revisions given in LC's own response or in other JSC responses to the full draft wording of any existing instructions.

Background for specific instructions in the attached proposal:

   1) 2.3.8.1: The scope has been rewritten for two reasons:
     a) the concept of "differs from" is a leftover from card catalog concerns about number of added entries;
     b) the scope statement in the draft is not complete; rather than add missing information (e.g., earlier title proper), LC recommends a general statement that refers to the element analysis structure.
        [Related question: Will there be a link in the RDA online tool to the element analysis table?]

   2) 2.3.8.4: Instead of giving a general statement in 2.3.8.3 about recording changes over time, LC recommends keeping the pattern of instructions for modes of issuance to enable specific "views" of the instructions. There are two changes in this proposed wording compared to comparable wording for other change instructions in the draft; if the JSC accepts the proposed wording, the same modifications need to be made at the other changes instructions:
     a) The proposed wording for multipart monographs has the same condition of "if it is considered important ..." included for counterpart instructions for serials and integrating resources.

b) The proposed wording for integrating resources merges some of the instructions to clarify situations and actions. (For example, the 2nd sentence in the 2nd paragraph of 2.3.8.4.3 is related to the situation in the first sentence; it is not a separate situation.)

Impact on the element analysis table:
  1) Add the following element sub-types under Title:
  Earlier title proper
  Later title proper
  2) Delete the following element sub-types under Title:
  Earlier variant title
  Later variant title

- Barbara

LC proposal: element sub-types for Earlier title proper and Later title proper

[Note: double underlining not given for new 2.3.6]

2.3.6   Earlier title proper

2.3.6.1   Scope

An **earlier title proper** is a title proper appearing on an earlier iteration of an integrating resource that differs from that on the current iteration.

2.3.6.2   Sources of information

Take earlier titles proper from the source for the title proper (see 2.3.2.2).

2.3.6.3   Recording earlier titles proper

For changes in the title proper of an integrating resource, apply the instructions given under 2.3.2.11.3.

Record a title proper no longer present on the current iteration of an integrating resource as an earlier title proper if it is considered to be important for identification or access applying the basic instructions on recording titles given under 2.3.1.

Make a note on the publication dates to which the earlier title proper applies (see 2.20.2.3), or, in the case of online resources, the date the earlier title proper was viewed (see 2.20.12.5).

Alternative

If the changes have been numerous, make a general note (see 2.20.2.4).

= = = = = = = = = = = = = =

[Note: double underlining not given for new 2.3.7]

2.3.7　Later title proper

2.3.7.1　Scope

A **later title proper** is a title proper appearing on a later issue or part of a multipart monograph or serial that differs from that on the first or earliest issue or part.

2.3.7.2　Sources of information

Take later titles proper from the source for the title proper (see 2.3.2.2).

2.3.7.3　Recording later titles proper

For changes in the title proper, apply the instructions given under 2.3.2.11.1 for multipart monographs and 2.3.2.11.2 for serials.

Record a change in the title proper of a multipart monograph and a minor change in the title proper of a serial appearing on a later issue or part that is considered to be important for identification or access applying the basic instructions on recording titles given under 2.3.1.

Make a note on the numbering or publication dates to which the change in title proper applies (see 2.20.2.4).

Alternative

If the changes have been numerous, make a general note (see 2.20.2.4).

Apply the additional instructions given under 2.3.7.4.

2.3.7.4　Later titles proper on multipart monographs and serials

Record changes in the title proper appearing on later issues or parts of the resource as instructed under 2.3.7.4.1 (multipart monographs) or 2.3.7.4.2 (serials), as applicable.

2.3.7.4.1　Multipart monographs

Record a change in the title proper on a subsequent part of a multipart monograph as a later title proper if it is considered to be important for identification or access.

2.3.7.4.2　Serials

Record a minor change in the title proper on a subsequent issue or part of a serial as a later title proper if it is considered to be important for identification or access.

= = = = = = = = = = = = = = =

2.3.~~8~~<u>6</u>   Variant title

2.3.~~8~~<u>6</u>.1   Scope

A **variant title** is <u>any title not recorded as another title element sub-type</u> ~~a title associated with a resource that differs from a title recorded as the title proper, a parallel title, an alternative title, or other title information~~.

Variant titles include the following:

- a) those that appear in the resource itself ~~(e.g., on a title page, title frame, title screen, etc.; as a caption title, running title, etc.; or on a cover, spine, etc.)~~, on a jacket, sleeve, container, etc., or in accompanying material
- b) those associated with a resource through reference sources
- c) those assigned by an agency registering or preparing for a description of the resource (e.g., a title assigned by a repository, a cataloguer's translation or transliteration of the title, etc.)
- d) those assigned by the creator or by previous owners or custodians of the resource, etc.
- e) corrections to titles that appear in the resource in an incorrect form
- f) part of a title (e.g., an alternative title or a section title recorded as part of the title proper)
- <u>g) variant titles on earlier iterations of an integrating resource or later instances of a serial or multipart monograph.</u>

~~Variations in the title proper, parallel titles, or other title information appearing on an earlier iteration of an integrating resource are treated as earlier variant titles (see 2.3.7).~~

~~Variations in the title proper, parallel titles, or other title information appearing on a later issue or part of a multipart monograph or serial are treated as later variant titles (see 2.3.8.~~

2.3.~~8~~<u>6</u>.2   Sources of information

Take variant titles from any source.

2.3.~~8~~<u>6</u>.3   Recording variant titles

Record variant titles that are considered to be important for identification or access applying the basic instructions on recording titles given under 2.3.1.

Make a note on the source or basis for the variant title (see 2.20.3.3) if it is considered important for identification or access.

2.3.8.4   Recording changes in variant titles

Record changes in variant titles as instructed under 2.3.8.4.1 (multipart monographs), 2.3.8.4.2 (serials), or 2.3.8.4.3 (integrating resources) as applicable.

2.3.8.4.1 Multipart monographs

If a variant title is added or changed on a subsequent part of a multipart monograph, record the added or changed variant title if it is considered to be important for identification or access.

If a variant title is deleted on a subsequent part of a multipart monograph, make a note on the deletion (see 2.20.2.4).

Make a note on the numbering or publication dates to which the variant title applies (see 2.20.2.3) if it doesn't apply to all parts of the multipart monograph.

If the variant titles appear on scattered parts, make a general note (see 2.20.2.4).

2.3.8.4.2 Serials

If a variant title is added or changed on a subsequent issue or part of a serial, record the added or changed variant title if it is considered to be important for identification or access.

If a variant title is deleted on a subsequent issue or part of a serial, make a note on the deletion (see 2.20.2.4).

Make a note on the numbering or publication dates to which the variant title applies (see 2.20.2.3) if it doesn't apply to all issues or parts of the serial.

If the variant titles appear on scattered parts, make a general note (see 2.20.2.4).

2.3.8.4.3 Integrating resources

If a variant title is added on a subsequent iteration of an integrating resource, and the variant title is considered to be important for identification or access, record the variant title to reflect the current iteration.

If a variant title that that has been recorded is changed on a subsequent iteration, and the changed variant title is considered to be important for identification or access, record the changed variant title to reflect the current iteration. If the earlier variant title is considered to be important for identification or access, retain it as a variant title.

<u>If a variant title that has been recorded is not present on a subsequent iteration, retain it as a variant title if it is considered to important for identification or access.</u>

<u>Make a note on the publication dates to which the variant title applies (see 2.20.2.3) if it doesn't apply to all iterations of the integrating resource.</u>

2.3.~~8~~6.5   Translations or transliterations of the title proper

Record a translation or transliterated form of the title proper created by the agency preparing the description as a variant title applying the basic instructions on recording titles given under 2.3.1.

= = = = = = = = = = = = =

Delete the following instructions in the draft because the content is covered by **revised 2.3.8 Variant title** above:

2.3.7   Earlier variant title
2.3.8   Later variant title

= = = = = = = = = = = = =

[Related revision]

2.3.2.11   Recording changes in the title proper

Record a change in title proper as instructed under 2.3.2.11.1, 2.3.2.11.2, or 2.3.2.11.3 below, as applicable.

2.3.2.11.1   Multipart monographs

If there is a change in the title proper on a subsequent part of a multipart monograph, and the change is considered to be important for identification or access, record the later title as a later ~~variation in the~~ title proper (see 2.3.~~8~~7.4.1).

2.3.2.11.2   Serials

If there is a major change (as defined under 2.3.2.12.1) in the title proper on a subsequent issue or part of a serial, make a new description for the issues or parts appearing under the new title and treat the two descriptions as descriptions for related works (see 25.1).

If the change is a minor change (as defined in 2.3.2.12.2) but is considered to be important for identification or access, record the later title as a later ~~variation in the~~ title proper (see 2.3.<u>7</u>8.4.2).

2.3.2.11.3 Integrating resources

If there is a change in the title proper on a subsequent iteration of an integrating resource, change the title proper to reflect the current iteration.

If the change is considered to be important for identification or access, record the earlier title as an earlier ~~variation in the~~ title proper (see <u>2.3.6.3</u> ~~2.3.7.4~~).

= = = = = = = = = = = = = =

[Related revision]

2.3.3.5.1 Multipart monographs

If a parallel title is added or changed on a subsequent part of a multipart monograph, and the change is considered to be important for identification or access, record the added or changed parallel title as a <u>variant</u> ~~later parallel~~ title (see 2.3.8).

If a parallel title is deleted on a subsequent part, make a note on the deletion if it is considered to be important (see 2.20.2.4).

2.3.3.5.2 Serials

If a parallel title is added or changed on a subsequent issue or part of a serial, and the change is considered to be important for identification or access, record the added or changed parallel title as a <u>variant</u> ~~later parallel~~ title (see 2.3.8~~.5.2~~).

If a parallel title is deleted on a subsequent issue or part, make a note on the deletion if it is considered to be important (see 2.20.2.4).

2.3.3.5.3 Integrating resources

If a parallel title is added or changed on a subsequent iteration of an integrating resource, record the added or changed parallel title to reflect the current iteration.

If the earlier parallel title is considered to be important for identification or access, record it as <u>a variant</u> ~~an earlier parallel~~ title (see 2.3.<u>8</u>~~7.5~~).

If a parallel title is deleted on a subsequent iteration, delete the parallel title to reflect the current iteration.

If the deleted parallel title is considered to be important for identification or access, record it as <u>a variant</u> <s>an earlier parallel</s> title (see 2.3.<u>8</u><s>7.5</s>).

= = = = = = = = = = = = = =

Revisions similar to those made in 2.3.3.5.1-2.3.3.5.3 above are needed for the following instructions:

    2.3.4.7.1-2.3.4.7.3   (changes in other title information)
    2.3.5.4.1-2.3.5.4.3   (changes in parallel other title information)

= = = = = = = = = = = = = =

[Related revision]

2.20.2.3   Title source

[1st-3rd paragraphs and examples as in draft]

Make a note on the source or basis for <u>an earlier title proper, a later title proper, and/or</u> a variant title if it is considered important for identification or access.

[examples and last paragraph as in draft]

Attachment G (Line 250)

There are three parts:
- Strike-out version
- Clean-copy version
- Illustration

2.6   Numbering of serials

CORE ELEMENT

Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part, chronological designation of first issue or part, numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part, and chronological designation of last issue or part are core elements. Other numbering is optional.

2.6.1   Basic instructions on recording numbering of serials

2.6.1.1   Scope

Numbering of serials is the identification of each of the issues or parts of a serial.

Numbering can include numeric and/or alphabetic designations, chronological designations, or both, each consisting of a numeral, a letter, any other character, or the combination of these with or without an accompanying caption (volume, number, etc.).

A serial may have one sequence of numbering or more than one, with a new one generally beginning when a new system of numeric and/or alphabetic designations begins.

A serial may have more than one concurrent system of numeric and/or alphabetic designations.

For numbering within series and numbering within subseries, see the instructions given under 2.12.9 and 2.12.17, respectively.

2.6.1.2   Sources of information

When choosing a source of information for numbering of serials, apply the following general guidelines:
a)   For numeric and/or alphabetic and/or chronological designations of the first issue or part, use the source on the first issue or part that bears the title proper.
b)   For numeric and/or alphabetic and/or chronological designations of the last issue or part, use the source on the last issue or part that bears the title proper.

c) For numeric and/or alphabetic and/or chronological designations of the last issue or part of the first sequence, use the source on the last issue or part of first sequence that bears the title proper.

d) For numeric and/or alphabetic and/or chronological designations of the first issue or part of a new sequence, use the source on the first issue or part of the new sequence that bears the title proper.

For further guidance, See the instructions on sources of information for specific sub-elements of numbering of serials as follows:

a) For numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part of a sequence, see the instructions given under 2.6.2.2.

b) For chronological designation of first issue or part of a sequence, see the instructions given under 2.6.3.2.

c) For numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part of a sequence, see the instructions given under 2.6.4.2.

d) For chronological designation of last issue or part of a sequence, see the instructions given under 2.6.5.2.

e) For numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part of first sequence, see the instructions given under 2.6.6.2.

f) For chronological designation of last issue or part of first sequence, see the instructions given under 2.6.7.2.

g) For numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part of new sequence, see the instructions given under 2.6.8.2.

h) For chronological and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part of new sequence, see the instructions given under 2.6.9.2.

2.6.1.3 Facsimiles and reproductions

When describing a facsimile or reproduction that has numbering relating to the original manifestation as well as to the facsimile or reproduction, record the numbering relating to the facsimile or reproduction. Record the numbering relating to the original manifestation as numbering pertaining to a related manifestation (see 27.1).

2.6.1.4 Recording numbering of serials

Record numbers expressed as numerals or as words applying the general guidelines given under 1.8. Transcribe other words, characters, or groups of words or characters as they appear on the source of information. Apply the general guidelines on transcription given under 1.7.

Record the numbering for the first issue or part (see 2.6.2-2.6.3). When describing a serial that has ceased publication, record the numbering for both the first issue or part (see 2.6.2–2.6.3) and the last issue or part (see 2.6.4–2.6.5).

If information about the first issue or part is not available, record only the numbering of the last issue or part.

If the numbering starts a new sequence with a different system, record <u>the numbering of the first issue or part of each sequence (see 2.6.2-2.6.3) and the numbering of the last issue or part of each sequence (see 2.6.4-2.6.5). Record the numbering in a presentation that makes clear:</u>
- (a) <u>the numbering of the respective first and last issues or parts in the same sequence; and</u>
- (b) <u>the order in which different numbering sequences occurred.</u>
- ~~a) the numbering of the first issue or part under the old system (see~~ 2.6.2–2.6.3~~)~~
- ~~b) the numbering of the last issue or part under the old system (see~~ 2.6.6–2.6.7~~)~~
~~and~~
- ~~c) the numbering of the first issue or part under the new system (see~~ 2.6.8–2.6.9~~).~~

Make notes on other variations in designations that do not constitute a new sequence if the variation is considered to be important (see 2.20.5.4).

If a serial has more than one <u>concurrent</u> ~~separate~~ system of numbering, record the systems in the order in which they are presented.

2.6.2 Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part <u>of a sequence</u>

CORE ELEMENT

<u>Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part of the first or only sequence is a core element.</u>

2.6.2.1 Scope

Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part <u>of a sequence</u> is numbering (see 2.6.1.1) presented in numeric and/or alphabetic form on the first issue or part <u>of that sequence</u> of a serial.

~~**Numeric designation of first issue or part** is numbering (see~~ 2.6.1.1~~) presented in numeric form on the first issue or part of a serial.~~

~~**Alphabetic designation of first issue or part** is numbering (see~~ 2.6.1.1~~) presented in alphabetic form on the first issue or part of a serial.~~

2.6.2.2 Sources of information

Take the numeric and/or alphabetic designation of the first issue or part <u>of a sequence</u> from the following sources (in order of preference):
- a) the source on the first issue or part <u>of that sequence</u> that bears the title proper (see 2.3.2.2)
- b) another source within the <u>first issue or part of that sequence</u> ~~resource itself~~ (see 2.2.2)

c) one of the other sources of information specified under 2.2.4.

2.6.2.3 Recording numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part <u>of a sequence</u>

If the first issue or part <u>of a sequence</u> of a serial is identified by a numeric and/or alphabetic designation, record the designation applying the basic instructions on recording numbering given under 2.6.1.

If the sequence of numeric and/or alphabetic designation is continued from a previous serial, record the numeric and/or alphabetic designation of the first issue or part of the serial represented by the new description.

> <u>Alternative:</u>
>
> > <u>If the designation consists of a year and a number that is a division of the year, record the year before the number.</u>

<u>If a new sequence is accompanied by wording to differentiate the sequence, such as *new series,* include this wording.</u>

<u>If a new sequence with the same system as before is not accompanied by wording such as *new series*, supply *new series* or another appropriate term. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.</u>

If the first issue or part of a <u>sequence</u> ~~serial~~ lacks any numeric and/or alphabetic designation, but subsequent issues or parts define a numeric and/or alphabetic designation pattern, supply a numeric and/or alphabetic designation for <u>that</u> ~~the~~ first issue or part based on that pattern. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

~~If information about designations of subsequent issues or parts is not available, supply~~ ~~*Number 1* (or its equivalent in the language and script of the title proper) or a~~ ~~chronological designation for the first issue or part (see 2.6.3), as appropriate. Indicate~~ ~~that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed~~ ~~under 2.2.4.~~

If the identification of the resource is based on an issue or part other than the first <u>of that sequence</u>, supply a numeric and/or alphabetic designation for <u>that</u> ~~the~~ first issue or part if it can be readily ascertained. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

> Alternative:
>
> > Make a note on the numbering of the first issue or part <u>of that sequence</u> (see 2.20.5.3).

2.6.2.4 Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part <u>of a sequence</u> in more than one language or script

If the numeric and/or alphabetic designation of the first issue or part <u>of a sequence</u> appears on the source of information in more than one language or script, record the designation that is in the language or script of the title proper. If this criterion does not apply, record the designation that appears first.

2.6.3 Chronological designation of first issue or part <u>of a sequence</u>

CORE ELEMENT

<u>Chronological designation of first issue or part of the first or only sequence is a core element.</u>

2.6.3.1 Scope

Chronological designation of first issue or part <u>of a sequence</u> is numbering (see 2.6.1.1) presented in the form of a date (e.g., a year; year and month; month, day, and year) on the first issue or part <u>of that sequence</u> of a serial.

2.6.3.2 Sources of information

Take the chronological designation of the first issue or part <u>of a sequence</u> from the following sources (in order of preference):
   a) the source on the first issue or part <u>of that sequence</u> that bears the title proper (see 2.3.2.2)
   b) another source within the <u>first issue or part of that sequence</u> ~~resource itself~~ (see 2.2.2)
   c) one of the other sources of information specified under 2.2.4.

2.6.3.3 Recording chronological designation of first issue or part <u>of a sequence</u>

If the first issue or part <u>of a sequence</u> of a serial is identified by a chronological designation, record the designation applying the basic instructions on recording numbering given under 2.6.1.

   ~~Alternative:~~

   ~~If the designation consists of a year and a number that is a division of the year, record the year before the number.~~

   Optional addition. If the chronological designation includes dates not of the Gregorian or Julian calendar, add the corresponding dates of the Gregorian or

Julian calendar, enclosed in square brackets. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

If the first issue or part of a sequence ~~serial~~ lacks any chronological designation, but subsequent issues or parts define a chronological designation pattern, supply a chronological designation for that ~~the~~ first issue or part based on that pattern. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

~~If information about designations of subsequent issues or parts is not available, supply a chronological designation for the first issue or part, if appropriate. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.~~

If the identification of the resource is based on an issue or part other than the first of that sequence, supply a chronological designation for the first issue or part if it can be readily ascertained. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

Alternative:

Make a note on the numbering of the first issue or part of that sequence (see 2.20.5.3).

2.6.3.4   Chronological designation of first issue or part of a sequence in more than one language or script

If the chronological designation of the first issue or part of a sequence appears on the source of information in more than one language or script, record the designation that is in the language or script of the title proper. If this criterion does not apply, record the designation that appears first.

2.6.4   Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part of a sequence

CORE ELEMENT

Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part of the last or only sequence is a core element.

2.6.4.1   Scope

Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part of a sequence is numbering (see 2.6.1.1) presented in numeric and/or alphabetic form on the last issue or part of that sequence of a serial.

~~**Numeric designation of last issue or part** is numbering (see 2.6.1.1) presented in numeric form on the last issue or part of a serial.~~

Alphabetic designation of last issue or part ~~is numbering (see~~ 2.6.1.1~~) presented in alphabetic form on the last issue or part of a serial.~~

2.6.4.2   Sources of information

Take the numeric and/or alphabetic designation of the last issue or part <u>of a sequence</u> from the following sources (in order of preference):

 a) the source on the last issue or part <u>of that sequence</u> that bears the title proper (see 2.3.2.2)

 b) another source within the <u>last issue or part of that sequence</u> ~~resource itself~~ (see 2.2.2)

 c) one of the other sources of information specified under 2.2.4.

2.6.4.3   Recording numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part <u>of a sequence</u>

<u>If the last issue or part of a sequence is identified by a</u> ~~Record the~~ numeric and/or alphabetic designation<u>, record the designation</u> ~~of the last issue or part of a serial~~ applying the basic instructions on recording numbering given under 2.6.1.

 ~~Alternative:~~

  ~~If the designation consists of a year and a number that is a division of the year, record the year before the number.~~

<u>If the sequence is accompanied by wording to differentiate the sequence, such as *new series*, include this wording.</u>

<u>If a sequence with the same system as before is not accompanied by wording such as *new series*, supply *new series* or another appropriate term. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.</u>

If the last issue or part of a <u>sequence</u> ~~serial~~ lacks any numeric and/or alphabetic designation, but previous issues or parts define a numeric and/or alphabetic designation pattern, supply a numeric and/or alphabetic designation for <u>that</u> ~~the~~ last issue or part based on that pattern. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

~~If information about numeric and/or alphabetic designations of previous issues or parts is not available, supply a chronological designation for the last issue or part (see~~ 2.6.5~~), if appropriate.~~

If the identification of the resource is based on an issue or part other than the last <u>of that sequence</u>, supply a numeric and/or alphabetic designation for <u>that</u> ~~the~~ last issue or part if

it can be readily ascertained. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

> Alternative:

>> Make a note on the numbering of the last issue or part of that sequence (see 2.20.5.3).

2.6.4.4 Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part of a sequence in more than one language or script

If the numeric and/or alphabetic designation of the last issue or part of a sequence appears on the source of information in more than one language or script, record the designation that is in the language or script of the title proper. If this criterion does not apply, record the designation that appears first.

2.6.5 Chronological designation of last issue or part of a sequence

CORE ELEMENT

Chronological designation of last issue or part of the last or only sequence is a core element.

2.6.5.1 Scope

Chronological designation of last issue or part of a sequence is numbering (see 2.6.1.1) presented in the form of a date (e.g., a year; year and month; month, day, and year) on the last issue or part of that sequence of a serial.

2.6.5.2 Sources of information

Take the chronological designation of the last issue or part of a sequence from the following sources (in order of preference):
> a) the source on the last issue or part of that sequence that bears the title proper (see 2.3.2.2)
> b) another source within the last issue or part of that sequence resource itself (see 2.2.2)
> c) one of the other sources of information specified under 2.2.4.

2.6.5.3 Recording chronological designation of last issue or part of a sequence

If the last issue or part of a sequence serial is identified by a chronological designation, record the designation applying the basic instructions on recording numbering given under 2.6.1.

If the last issue or part of a ~~serial~~ <u>sequence</u> lacks any chronological designation, but previous issues or parts define a chronological designation pattern, supply a chronological designation for <u>that</u> ~~the~~ last issue or part based on that pattern. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

~~If information about chronological designations of previous issues or parts is not available, supply a chronological designation for the last issue or part, if appropriate. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.~~

If the identification of the resource is based on an issue or part other than the last <u>of that sequence</u>, supply a chronological designation for <u>that</u> ~~the~~ last issue or part if it can be readily ascertained. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

Alternative:

Make a note on the numbering of the last issue or part <u>of that sequence</u> (see 2.20.5.3).

2.6.5.4   Chronological designation of last issue or part <u>of a sequence</u> in more than one language or script

If the chronological designation of the last issue or part <u>of a sequence</u> appears on the source of information in more than one language or script, record the designation that is in the language or script of the title proper. If this criterion does not apply, record the designation that appears first.

2.6 Numbering of serials

2.6.1 Basic instructions on recording numbering of serials

2.6.1.1 Scope

Numbering of serials is the identification of each of the issues or parts of a serial.

Numbering can include numeric and/or alphabetic designations, chronological designations, or both, each consisting of a numeral, a letter, any other character, or the combination of these with or without an accompanying caption (volume, number, etc.).

A serial may have one sequence of numbering or more than one, with a new one generally beginning when a new system of numeric and/or alphabetic designations begins.

A serial may have more than one concurrent system of numeric and/or alphabetic designations.

For numbering within series and numbering within subseries, see the instructions given under 2.12.9 and 2.12.17, respectively.

2.6.1.2 Sources of information

See the instructions on sources of information for specific sub-elements of numbering of serials as follows:
a) For numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part of a sequence, see the instructions given under 2.6.2.2.
b) For chronological designation of first issue or part of a sequence, see the instructions given under 2.6.3.2.
c) For numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part of a sequence, see the instructions given under 2.6.4.2.
d) For chronological designation of last issue or part of a sequence, see the instructions given under 2.6.5.2.

2.6.1.3 Facsimiles and reproductions

When describing a facsimile or reproduction that has numbering relating to the original manifestation as well as to the facsimile or reproduction, record the numbering relating to the facsimile or reproduction. Record the numbering relating to the original manifestation as numbering pertaining to a related manifestation (see 27.1).

2.6.1.4 Recording numbering of serials

Record numbers expressed as numerals or as words applying the general guidelines given under 1.8. Transcribe other words, characters, or groups of words or characters as they

appear on the source of information. Apply the general guidelines on transcription given under 1.7.

Record the numbering for the first issue or part (see 2.6.2-2.6.3). When describing a serial that has ceased publication, record the numbering for the last issue or part (see 2.6.4–2.6.5).

If the numbering starts a new sequence with a different system, record the numbering of the first issue or part of each sequence (see 2.6.2-2.6.3) and the numbering of the last issue or part of each sequence (see 2.6.4-2.6.5). Record the numbering in a presentation that makes clear:
   (c) the numbering of the respective first and last issues or parts in the same sequence; and
   (d) the order in which different numbering sequences occurred.

Make notes on other variations in designations that do not constitute a new sequence if the variation is considered to be important (see 2.20.5.4).

If a serial has more than one concurrent system of numbering, record the systems in the order in which they are presented.

2.6.2   Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part of a sequence

CORE ELEMENT

Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part of the first or only sequence is a core element.

2.6.2.1   Scope

Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part of a sequence is numbering (see 2.6.1.1) presented in numeric and/or alphabetic form on the first issue or part of that sequence of a serial.

2.6.2.2   Sources of information

Take the numeric and/or alphabetic designation of the first issue or part of a sequence from the following sources (in order of preference):
   a)   the source on the first issue or part of that sequence that bears the title proper (see 2.3.2.2)
   b)   another source within the first issue or part of that sequence (see 2.2.2)
   c)   one of the other sources of information specified under 2.2.4.

2.6.2.3   Recording numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part of a sequence

LC's rewrite of 2.6 (clean)
Feb. 12, 2009

If the first issue or part of a sequence of a serial is identified by a numeric and/or alphabetic designation, record the designation applying the basic instructions on recording numbering given under 2.6.1.

If the sequence of numeric and/or alphabetic designation is continued from a previous serial, record the numeric and/or alphabetic designation of the first issue or part of the serial represented by the new description.

>   Alternative:
>
>   >   If the designation consists of a year and a number that is a division of the year, record the year before the number.

If a new sequence is accompanied by wording to differentiate the sequence, such as *new series*, include this wording.

If a new sequence with the same system as before is not accompanied by wording such as *new series*, supply *new series* or another appropriate term. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

If the first issue or part of a sequence lacks any numeric and/or alphabetic designation, but subsequent issues or parts define a numeric and/or alphabetic designation pattern, supply a numeric and/or alphabetic designation for that first issue or part based on that pattern. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

If the identification of the resource is based on an issue or part other than the first of that sequence, supply a numeric and/or alphabetic designation for that first issue or part if it can be readily ascertained. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

>   Alternative:
>
>   >   Make a note on the numbering of the first issue or part of that sequence (see 2.20.5.3).

2.6.2.4 Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of first issue or part of a sequence in more than one language or script

If the numeric and/or alphabetic designation of the first issue or part of a sequence appears on the source of information in more than one language or script, record the designation that is in the language or script of the title proper. If this criterion does not apply, record the designation that appears first.

2.6.3   Chronological designation of first issue or part of a sequence

CORE ELEMENT

Chronological designation of first issue or part of the first or only sequence is a core element.

2.6.3.1   Scope

Chronological designation of first issue or part of a sequence is numbering (see 2.6.1.1) presented in the form of a date (e.g., a year; year and month; month, day, and year) on the first issue or part of that sequence of a serial.

2.6.3.2   Sources of information

Take the chronological designation of the first issue or part of a sequence from the following sources (in order of preference):
   a)   the source on the first issue or part of that sequence that bears the title proper (see 2.3.2.2)
   b)   another source within the first issue or part of that sequence (see 2.2.2)
   c)   one of the other sources of information specified under 2.2.4.

2.6.3.3   Recording chronological designation of first issue or part of a sequence

If the first issue or part of a sequence of a serial is identified by a chronological designation, record the designation applying the basic instructions on recording numbering given under 2.6.1.

> *Optional addition.* If the chronological designation includes dates not of the Gregorian or Julian calendar, add the corresponding dates of the Gregorian or Julian calendar, enclosed in square brackets. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

If the first issue or part of a sequence lacks any chronological designation, but subsequent issues or parts define a chronological designation pattern, supply a chronological designation for that first issue or part based on that pattern. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

If the identification of the resource is based on an issue or part other than the first of that sequence, supply a chronological designation for the first issue or part if it can be readily ascertained. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

Alternative:

> Make a note on the numbering of the first issue or part of that sequence (see 2.20.5.3).

LC's rewrite of 2.6 (clean)
Feb. 12, 2009

2.6.3.4 Chronological designation of first issue or part of a sequence in more than one language or script

If the chronological designation of the first issue or part of a sequence appears on the source of information in more than one language or script, record the designation that is in the language or script of the title proper. If this criterion does not apply, record the designation that appears first.

2.6.4 Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part of a sequence

CORE ELEMENT

Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part of the last or only sequence is a core element.

2.6.4.1 Scope

Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part of a sequence is numbering (see 2.6.1.1) presented in numeric and/or alphabetic form on the last issue or part of that sequence of a serial.

2.6.4.2 Sources of information

Take the numeric and/or alphabetic designation of the last issue or part of a sequence from the following sources (in order of preference):
   a) the source on the last issue or part of that sequence that bears the title proper (see 2.3.2.2)
   b) another source within the last issue or part of that sequence (see 2.2.2)
   c) one of the other sources of information specified under 2.2.4.

2.6.4.3 Recording numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part of a sequence

If the last issue or part of a sequence is identified by a numeric and/or alphabetic designation, record the designation applying the basic instructions on recording numbering given under 2.6.1.

If the sequence is accompanied by wording to differentiate the sequence, such as *new series*, include this wording.

If a sequence with the same system as before is not accompanied by wording such as *new series*, supply *new series* or another appropriate term. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

If the last issue or part of a sequence lacks any numeric and/or alphabetic designation, but previous issues or parts define a numeric and/or alphabetic designation pattern, supply a numeric and/or alphabetic designation for that last issue or part based on that pattern. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

If the identification of the resource is based on an issue or part other than the last of that sequence, supply a numeric and/or alphabetic designation for that last issue or part if it can be readily ascertained. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

> Alternative:
>
>> Make a note on the numbering of the last issue or part of that sequence (see 2.20.5.3).

2.6.4.4 Numeric and/or alphabetic designation of last issue or part of a sequence in more than one language or script

If the numeric and/or alphabetic designation of the last issue or part of a sequence appears on the source of information in more than one language or script, record the designation that is in the language or script of the title proper. If this criterion does not apply, record the designation that appears first.

2.6.5 Chronological designation of last issue or part of a sequence

CORE ELEMENT

Chronological designation of last issue or part of the last or only sequence is a core element.

2.6.5.1 Scope

Chronological designation of last issue or part of a sequence is numbering (see 2.6.1.1) presented in the form of a date (e.g., a year; year and month; month, day, and year) on the last issue or part of that sequence of a serial.

2.6.5.2 Sources of information

Take the chronological designation of the last issue or part of a sequence from the following sources (in order of preference):
    a) the source on the last issue or part of that sequence that bears the title proper (see 2.3.2.2)
    b) another source within the last issue or part of that sequence (see 2.2.2)
    c) one of the other sources of information specified under 2.2.4.

2.6.5.3 Recording chronological designation of last issue or part of a sequence

If the last issue or part of a sequence is identified by a chronological designation, record the designation applying the basic instructions on recording numbering given under 2.6.1.

If the last issue or part of a sequence lacks any chronological designation, but previous issues or parts define a chronological designation pattern, supply a chronological designation for that last issue or part based on that pattern. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

If the identification of the resource is based on an issue or part other than the last of that sequence, supply a chronological designation for that last issue or part if it can be readily ascertained. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

> Alternative:
>
> > Make a note on the numbering of the last issue or part of that sequence (see 2.20.5.3).

2.6.5.4 Chronological designation of last issue or part of a sequence in more than one language or script

If the chronological designation of the last issue or part of a sequence appears on the source of information in more than one language or script, record the designation that is in the language or script of the title proper. If this criterion does not apply, record the designation that appears first.

BEGIN

| Volume 1 Number 1 — Winter 1982 | Volume 1 Number 2 — Summer 1982 | Volume 2 Number 3 — Winter 1983 | ... | Volume 4 Number 8 — Summer 1985 |

| New Series Volume 1 Number 1 — No. 9 — Jan. 1986 | New Series Volume 1 Number 2 — No. 10 — July 1986 | New Series Volume 2 Number 1 — No. 11 — Jan. 1987 | New Series Volume 2 Number 2 — No. 12 — July 1987 | ... | New Series Volume 4 Number 2 — No. 16 — July 1989 |

| Third Series Volume 1 Number 1 — No. 17 — Mar. 1990 | Third Series Volume 1 Number 2 — No. 18 — Sept. 1990 | Third Series Volume 2 Number 1 — No. 19 — Mar. 1991 | Third Series Volume 2 Number 2 — No. 20 — Sept. 1991 |

CEASE

AACR2 / ISBD:

Vol. 1, no. 1 (winter 1982)-v. 4, no. 8 (summer 1985); new ser., v. 1, no. 1 (Jan. 1986)-
new ser., v. 4, no. 2 = no. 9-no. 16; 3rd ser., v. 1, no. 1 (Mar. 1990)-3rd ser., v. 2, no. 2
(Sept. 1991) = no. 17-no. 20

RDA?:

First in sequence: volume 1, number 1
Last in sequence: volume 4, number 8

First in sequence: new series, volume 1, number 1
Last in sequence: new series, volume 4, number 2

First in sequence: third series, volume 1, number 1
Last in sequence: third series, volume 2, number 2

First in sequence: no. 9
Last in sequence: no. 16

First in sequence: no. 17
Last in sequence: no. 20

First in sequence: winter 1982
Last in sequence: summer 1985

First in sequence: Jan. 1986
Last in sequence: July 1989

First in sequence: Mar. 1990
Last in sequence: Sept. 1991

Attachment H (Line 473)

Traditional Asian Formats – Accordion style

Note from the ALA rep 3 March 2009:

Recalling that this was an issue that the JSC did not have time to resolve in time to include anything in the full draft, I requested that we see whether we can resolve it for the initial release of RDA.

Nathalie sent me the discussion document "Line 78 Chapter 3 wiki August 2008: Instructions and examples for traditional Asian formats" (attached).

I said that I would look at it and see whether I could pull out the issues that still needed discussion; having reviewed the document, I would note:

1) The question of extent and dimensions of scrolls was resolved for the full draft.

2) The question of double leaves (printed on one side, folded and bound) was resolved for the full draft.

3) The remaining issue concerns **leaves or pages folded accordion style**.

On this remaining issue, the document includes a summary of the results of JSC consultation 16 September 2008; the question was whether these should be described as sheets or as volumes.
At that time, ACOC and BL were uncertain (BL willing to accept a majority decision, ACOC wanting time to consult further); LC preferred to treat them as sheets; and ALA and CILIP preferred to treat them as volumes.

ALA further distinguished two cases: those printed on both sides (which should be described as a sheet) and those printed on one side only (the *orihon* style, which should be described as a volume).

The questions in the document, as well as the responses, as about as clear as we could make them.

Would it be possible to ask the JSC reps to consider whether their positions have changed? If not, then we clearly do not have a consensus. On the other hand, I am hopeful that we can find a solution that we can all accept. I would hate to leave this question open.

JSC reps: Be prepared to indicate at the meeting your position on this issue.

Line 78 Chapter 3 wiki August 2008

Instructions and examples for traditional Asian formats

Background:

Original comment

There was a comment in 5JSC/RDA/Part A/Chapter 3/Rev/ALA response on 3.4.0.3.1d: "It is not clear whether scrolls and resources consisting of a single long sheet accordion-folded into panels should be considered as single volumes or as single sheets. In either case, specific instructions and examples should be included. These are traditional Asian formats; the community has not expressed a preference, but requests guidance."

Wiki discussion

Please see the attached wiki discussion. The outcome of that discussion was a decision to add instructions to mirror "Descriptive cataloging of East Asian material" posted on LC's web site (http://www.loc.gov/catdir/cpso/CJKIntro.html which would imply that these materials are to be treated as sheets.

Editorial team discussion

Subsequent discussion and investigation within the Editorial team showed that there are two types of East Asian formats to be covered in the RDA instructions on Extent.

1. Double leaves. No JSC decision or change is needed to cover these; the following information is given as as background, and to distinguish these items from the other format mentioned below.

This format has leaves in a binding, the printing is only on one side of the leaf, but each leaf is doubled over so that only the printed side shows - the blank sides of the leaf face each other.

Double leaves are covered by the instruction at 3.4.4.10.1 in the July 2008 draft of chapter 3 which refers to "books in the traditional East Asian format". The instruction corresponds to AACR2 rule 2.5B11, which is in a section of rules headed "Single volume", and was therefore included in the RDA instructions on "Resources consisting of a single unit" among the instructions dealing with a single volume.

3.4.4.10.1 refers you to 3.22.1.11 to provide a note giving an explanation of the format. Here is one from the Libraries Australia database.

http://nla.gov.au/anbd.bib-an15080368
17 p.
On double leaves, oriental style.

and one from LC, but it mentions a case.

LCCN Permalink: http://lccn.loc.gov/94162221
1 v. (unpaged)
On double leaves, oriental style, in case.

Wikipedia entry:

"**Traditional Chinese bookbinding** refers to the method of bookbinding that the Chinese (as well as Koreans and Japanese) have used in recent centuries, before converting to the modern codex form. It is also called stitched binding.

Method. The method of this binding is in several stages:

- The first stage is to fold the printed paper sheets. The printing method was to print on a large sheet, then fold it in half so the text appears on both sides.

- The second stage is to gather all the folded leaves into order and assemble the back and front covers. Important or luxury edition books have a further single leaf inserted in the fold of the leaves. Front covers tend to be replaced over time if it gets damaged. For very old books, the front cover is usually not original; for facsimilies, it is most certainly not.

- The third stage is to punch holds at the spine edge, around 1 cm from the spine. Four holes are the standard. Six holes are used on important books. If the book is a quality edition, the edges of the spine side are wrapped in silk which is stuck on to protect the edges.

- The fourth stage is to stitch the whole book together using a thin double silk cord. The knot is tied and concealed in the spine.

Encasement. After a group of books are printed, they are often put in a case. This is a cloth case that is constructed from boards that have a cloth upholstering. Traditional cloth cases are a single line of boards attached together and covered by the cloth; the insides are papered. The pile of books are placed in the middle board, and the left-hand boards wrap the left side and the front of the books, and the right boards wrap the right side and on top of the left side boards. The right side front board has the title tag pasted on the top right-hand side. The rightmost edge has a lip, from which two straps with ivory or bone tallies are connected to. These straps are pulled down the left side, where there are the loops where they are inserted to secure the whole case together.

Modern cases are much like Western ones. They are basically cuboid with an opening in one side where the books slot in. The Chinese have a separate board to wrap the books before inserting into the case.

Retrieved from http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Traditional_Chinese_bookbinding"

2. Leaves or pages folded according style

We believe this is the format ALA was referring to, and is the one a JSC decision is needed on.

It is a single sheet, folded accordion or concertina style into panels. Because of its appearance - it very much looks like a volume, and may have the ends of the sheet attached to a backing board which acts as a cover - cataloguers are uncertain whether they should treat these materials as a volume or as a sheet. See also later description of Orihon from Wikipedia.

Earlier advice from NLA cataloguers (and confirmed by LC cataloguers) was that they followed http://www.loc.gov/catdir/cpso/CJKChap2.pdf, which includes the following example:

300 $a 1 folded sheet (130, 134 p.) : $b ill. ; $c 27 cm.

500 $a Each work is printed on one side of a continuous strip, with its own pagings, folded accordion style.

The 300 field in that example mirrors RDA 3.4.4.13 which treats such items as sheets.

However, investigation of catalogue records shows that they are often (but not always) catalogued as volumes, not sheets.

Here are some examples from the Libraries Australia database:

http://nla.gov.au/anbd.bib-an15682098

1 v. (unpaged)

In case, oriental style, on double leaves with pages on one continuous strip folded accordion style

http://nla.gov.au/anbd.bib-an15547265

84 p.

Leaves are joined end to end and folded accordion style

http://nla.gov.au/anbd.bib-an15571516

1 v. (unpaged

Pages on one continuous strip folded accordion style, in case

Here are some from the LC catalogue:

 LCCN Permalink: http://lccn.loc.gov/99432984

[86] p.

On double leaves, folded accordion style (orihon).

LCCN Permalink: http://lccn.loc.gov/2004638218

1 v. (unpaged)

One folded leaf, accordion style.

LCCN Permalink: http://lccn.loc.gov/2001535057
40 p.
Folded accordion style; printed on both sides.

LCCN Permalink: http://lccn.loc.gov/2006477821
1 v. (unpaged)
One folded leaf, accordion style, in case

LCCN Permalink: http://lccn.loc.gov/2004416462
1 v. (unpaged)
One folded leaf, accordion style, in case.

Wikipedia entry:

"**Orihon** (OR-ee-hon, 折本) is a book consisting of a long strip of paper that is written on one side and then compacted by folding in zig-zag fashion. The orihon format is considered a step between a scroll and a codex.[1] The style of folding is similar to that of the air bellow of a concertina or accordion, such that every written page faces another written page when the book is closed. It may therefore be opened to any page."
http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Orihon

Question to the JSC:

Should RDA treat a single sheet folded accordion style
(1) as a sheet (per RDA 3.4.4.13, and as previously agreed – see wiki) or
(2) as a volume (as suggested by what appears to be existing practice (see the NLA and
LC examples above).

Once we have consensus on which approach should be specified in RDA, the Editor will
make the appropriate revisions to the text. We could then ask for comments in the
Constituency review.

July 2008 draft of chapter 3

http://www.collectionscanada.gc.ca/jsc/workspace/editor-rda-sec1-ch3-0807.doc

Results of JSC consultation 16 Sept 2008

Uncertain

Alan: I consulted with experts in the Asian, Pacific and African Collections.
Unfortunately there was no consensus, so we will go with the majority.

Deirdre: [added directly here, not given in an email] I need some time to properly
evaluate the comments that John has made, and consult with NLA experts. I'd rather not
do that in a rush,and so would prefer to leave things as they are for the draft although I'd
be happy to work with John and/or Barbara on sorting out the issues for our responses.

Sheets

Barbara: Our Asian expert prefers these be considered as a sheet not a volume. - bt

Volumes

Hugh: I have only limited access to East Asian specialists today - after which I'm away
for a few days. So far as I can tell from the information received (it required some
interpretation on my part) they are more inclined to regard these things as volumes than
sheets. But I wouldn't set too much store by this compared to responses from those whose
practitioners are more plugged into cataloguing rules, consistency, AACR2, etc.

John: I have consulted with ALA's East Asian cataloging experts, specifically, the
Committee on Cataloging [of] Asian and African Materials and the Committee on
Technical Processing of the Council of East Asian Libraries (CEAL).

While they generally agree that leaves or pages folded accordion style should be
described as volumes rather than sheets, they offer a number of observations that may be
relevant:

1. There is a distinction typically made between sheets that are written/printed on both sides and those that are written/printed only on one side. Note that the example from *Descriptive Cataloging of East Asian Materials* (rule 2.5B14) in the Line 78 discussion document refers specifically to a resource that is written on both sides. The current practice is to describe such a resource as a single (folded) sheet and to add the pagination for each side of the sheet if there is numbering.

2. The orihon format (as is explicit in the Wikipedia entry) is printed on one side only. In *Descriptive Cataloging Guidelines for Pre-Meiji Japanese Books* (5B8, p. 26), this style is given as an example under "double leaves" and in fact the main difference between orihon and the other double-leaf styles seems to be that the orihon-style sheet is not bound -- although typically covers are attached to the ends of the sheet to form something quite close to a bound volume.

3. Soren Edgren, an expert in early Chinese printed materials, notes "An accordion-style, sutra binding (Jap. orihon) is rarely, if ever, made up of a single sheet of paper. Conceptually and historically, it is made up of multiple sheets of paper. Therefore, references to 'a single sheet', 'a continuous strip', '1 folded leaf' and 'a long strip of paper' are all misleading. The only accurate descriptive example [in the discussion paper] is 'Leaves are joined end to end and folded accordion style.' " This further argues against treating these resources as single sheets.

4. Treating orihon-style resources as volumes does not mean that they will be described as "1 volume" -- that will depend on the presence or absence of page/leaf numbering.

(later clarification: Yes, it is still a volume. My point was that if it were numbered, the extent statement would give the number of pages or leaves. John)

Based on these comments, ALA recommends that orihon-style publications be treated under the instructions for single volumes (with references to subsequent instructions for folded leaves or pages and to multiple volumes), with an instruction to explain the format in a note.

I am not sure whether explicit instructions are needed to deal with the case of resources printed on both sides of the accordion-folded sheet. I suspect that a combination of existing instructions covers this case: the rule from *Descriptive Cataloging of East Asian Materials* is much the same as RDA 3.4.4.12 [July 2008 rev.] and the example from DCEAM could be included there.

Editorial team suggestion:

Given the uncertainty and the shortage of time, we suggest that we make no further attempts to resolve this now. The issue can be addressed in responses to the draft. JSC reps may wish to consult on the possiblity of preparing a joint paper on this issue.

3.4.0.3.1 d) Text	ACOC	ALA	CCC	CILIP	LC	
78	3 Mar: seeking advice from NLA's Asian Collections staff. 7 Mar: their response: We follow what's in the "Descriptive cataloging of East Asian material" posted on LC's web site (http://www.loc.gov/catdir/cpso/CJKIntro.html). For accordion style publications, section 2.5B14 (p. 16) & 2.5D4 (p. 18) we are instructed to use "1 folded sheet" in the extent field, with accompanying general note to explain the item is folded accordion style. Agree if instructions/examples are to be added, prefer 3.4.4.1+ per LC 20 Aug: confirm	Add instructions and examples for traditional Asian formats Mar. 6: Agree LC about placement of instructions Aug. 12: Agree ACOC, CILIP	9 Mar: Agree CILIP; defer to specialists 19 Aug: Agree ACOC, CILIP	Mar 4. Will defer to specialist advice Aug 5. If NLA is happy to use the LC documentation then that's two sets of specialists agreeing, which is all the advice I need to say I agree!	1 Mar: If included, prefer in 3.4.4.1+ somewhere (line 72). 5 Aug.: Agree ACOC's 3 Mar comment.	31 July: From Editor: "ALA had suggested adding instructions and examples for Asian formats. There was agreement that such instructions should be placed under 3.4.4 rather than at 3.4.0.3.1d (which has now been replaced by a reference to 3.4.4 in any case), and ACOC cited the source used by NLA's Asian Collections staff. ALA didn't provide any instructions or examples, and it's not clear to me that the "agree" in status column indicates agreement to use the instructions in the source cited by ACOC." Comment requested. see also line 193. 25 August: Tom - please confirm you have enough information

Attachment I (Line 508)

Digital File Characteristics – Resolution

Text as agreed at March 2009 meeting (with post-meeting editorial corrections)

3.19.1.3	**Recording digital file characteristics**
3.19.1.3.1	➤ Record the following digital file characteristics, as applicable to the resource, if they are considered important for identification or selection:

a) file type (see 3.19.2)
b) encoding format (see 3.19.3)
c) file size (see 3.19.4)
d) resolution (see 3.19.5)
e) regional encoding (see 3.19.6)
f) transmission speed (see 3.19.7).

3.19.5	**RESOLUTION**

Contents

3.19.5.1 Scope
3.19.5.2 Sources of information
3.19.5.3 Recording resolution

3.19.5.1	**Scope**
3.19.5.1.1	☐ **Resolution** is the clarity or fineness of detail in a digital image, expressed by the measurement of the image in pixels, etc.

3.19.5.2	**Sources of information**
3.19.5.2.1	➤ Use evidence presented by the resource itself (or on any accompanying material or container) as the basis for recording the resolution. If desired, take additional evidence from any source.

3.19.5.3	**Recording resolution**
3.19.5.3.1	➤ Record the resolution by giving the measurements of the image in pixels, megapixels, etc., if it can be readily ascertained and is considered important for identification or selection.

```
2048 × 1536 pixels

3.1 megapixels
```

Attachment J (Line 644)

There are two parts:
- Email from Barbara Tillett 11 February 2009
- Email from Barbara Tillett 12 February 2009 (in response to an email from the Secretary)

```
Date: Wed, 11 Feb 2009 16:11:46 -0500
From: "Barbara B Tillett" <btil@loc.gov>
Subject: Compilations rewrite (6.27.1.4)
```

Dear JSC,

Nathalie contacted us last week about our recommendations for
6.27.1.4 in LC's response to the full draft. Because we had
overlooked the presence of the 3rd paragraph on compilers not being
considered creators, our justification for changing the caption at
6.27.1.4 was wrong. Nathalie agreed that the current examples for
the 1st paragraph (the "Cunliffe" and "Towns" examples on p. 149 of
the PDF) were problematic.

We told Marg and Nathalie that we still wanted to "do something"
about 6.27.1.4 in addition to offering replacement examples for the
1st paragraph because "compiler as creator" has always been a
troublesome concept for those reviewing RDA drafts. Marg then asked
us to submit a revised recommendation for 6.27.1.4 to the JSC members
before February 12 so that the members would have time to read our
revision before the March JSC meeting.

As we looked at 6.27.1.4, we saw other problems:
        1) the emphasis on this category of compilations in 6.27.1
by giving it a four-digit caption without a comparable caption for
compilations by one person/family/corporate body; yes, we know that
the latter are covered by 6.27.1.2 but a reader just searching for
compilations in 6.27 won't find 6.27.1.2;
        2) the impossibility of saying that a compiler of others'
works (an aggregation) is the creator of those works
        3) the vacuum in which the 3rd paragraph could be understood
if a reader arrives at 6.27.1.4 via a search for instructions on
compilations: just because one entity is identified on the resource
as having the role of compiler and that entity is not considered the
creator doesn't mean that another entity isn't the creator .

Our next step was to consider revising 6.27.1.4 to cover the three
possibilities:
        1) a compilation by one person/family/corporate body when
that entity is the creator: repeating the instructions at 6.27.1.2
with a reminder about 6.2.2.11 when the resource is a compilation of
works by that one person/family/corporate body
        2) a compilation by more than one person/family/corporate
body when those entities are creators: repeating the instructions at
6.27.1.3
        3) a compilation when there is no creator: taking wording
from last paragraph of 6.27.1.8/current 3rd paragraph of 6.27.1.4
about constructing the access point using the preferred title for the
compilation and referring readers to 20.2 for any entities (may or
may not be identified on the resource with role of compiler) acting
as contributors.

After we realized that the three possibilities were already addressed
appropriately in other 6.27.1 instructions, we decided that
****our recommendation to you is a simple one:

        -- delete 6.27.1.4;
        -- add LC's replacement examples (Beasley … and Bartholomew …
¦
copied below from LC response to full draft) to those in 6.27.1.2 ;
        -- add the existing Oram … example (top of p. 150 in PDF) to
those in 6.27.1.3 on p. 146 in PDF for two or more persons … having
principal responsibility for the work;
        -- give a reworked version of the 6.27.1.4 alternative as an
alternative in 6.27.1.3 (see reworked version below);
        -- move one or more of the four examples (Music …; Treaties
…; U.S. marines …; Best of Broadway) to position after last paragraph
of 6.27.1.8 and/or to 20.2;
        -- ensure that glossary definition for "compiler" (not yet in
glossary) is clear about difference in being a creator or being a
contributor.

= = = =

LC's examples to be added to 6.27.1.2:

Beasley, W. Bibliography on New Zealand-Australia free trade
agreement
     Resource described: Bibliography on New Zealand-Australia free
trade agreement / compiled by W. Beasley

Bartholomew, Gail. Index to the Maui news
     Resource described: The index to the Maui news / compiled and
edited by Gail Bartholomew with the assistance of Judy Lindstrom

= = = =

new Alternative for 6.27.1.3 to be inserted after the "If principal
responsibility for the work is not indicated …" paragraph at the
bottom of p. 146 in the PDF:

Alternative

If the work is a collaboration of many creators (e.g., an anthology)
where selecting the first-named person, family, or corporate body
might give a misleading interpretation of the content of the
collaborative work, construct the authorized access point
representing the work using the preferred title for the compilation,
formulated according to the instructions given under 6.2.2. If the
work lacks a collective title, construct the authorized access point
using a devised title, formulated according to the instructions given
under 2.3.9.

- Barbara

Date: Thu, 12 Feb 2009 08:43:16 -0500
From: "Barbara B Tillett" <btil@loc.gov>
Subject: Re: Compilations rewrite (6.27.1.4)

Those two definitions are overlapping - as "content" for a
creator/compiler can also be read as the works of others that the
editor/compiler packages. We will need to be more clear. Is it that
the editor/compiler is presenting the works of others; while the
creator/compiler is using parts of the works of others to create a
new work (not just an aggregation)??? Must be an easier way to say
this.
- bt

>>> Nathalie Schulz <N.Schulz@btopenworld.com> 2/12/2009 5:56 AM >>>
Hello everyone,

I will list this email as an "extra" document for the March meeting.

I would like to comment on this suggestion: "ensure that glossary
definition for "compiler" (not yet in glossary) is clear about
difference in being a creator or being a contributor"

I think that any Glossary definition would need to align with the
definition in Appendix I, which only has the creator meaning of
"compiler":

compiler
A person, family, or corporate body responsible for creating a work
through the act of compilation, e.g., selecting, arranging,
aggregating, and editing content. For a compiler as a contributor,
see editor of compilation ...

Compare with:

editor of compilation
A person, family, or corporate body contributing to a collective or
aggregate work by selecting and putting together the works, or parts
of works, by one or more creators. For compilations that result in
original works, see compiler ...

Something more for you to consider.

Regards,

Nathalie

Attachment K (Line 651)

As proposed by LC

Moving Image Resources. If the part is a season, episode, excerpt, etc., of a moving image work (television program, radio program, etc.), construct the preferred access point representing the part by adding the preferred title for the part (see 6.2.2.10.1) to the preferred access point representing the work as a whole (see 6.27.1.3), regardless of whether the title of the part is distinctive or not.

> ```
> Simpsons (Television program). King of the hill
>
> Buffy, the vampire slayer (Television program). Season 6
>
> Jack Benny program (Radio program). 1946-03-10
> ```

Possible rewording (2009-04-21)

Moving Image Resources, Radio Programs, etc. If the part is a season, episode, excerpt, etc., of a moving image work ~~(television program~~, radio program, etc.~~)~~, construct the preferred access point representing the part by adding the preferred title for the part (see 6.2.2.10.1) to the preferred access point representing the work as a whole (see 6.27.1.3), regardless of whether the title of the part is distinctive or not.

> ```
> Simpsons (Television program). King of the hill
>
> Buffy, the vampire slayer (Television program). Season 6
>
> Jack Benny program (Radio program). 1946-03-10
> ```

Attachment L (Line 689)

7.13.4.3 Recording Form of Tactile Notation

Question: Should the level of contraction be included in parentheses following a term from the list of controlled terms, or should it be treated as details of form of notation under 7.13.4.4?

From Ann Chapman (CILIP):

Braille represents letters and numbers using dot combinations in 'cells'. The simplest form is one cell per character - known in the US as uncontracted braille and in the UK as grade 1 braille.

A more complex version of braille includes contractions - where one cell represents a complete word (e.g. the, and, an, for) or a word suffix ('ed', 'ing'). In the US this is referred to as contracted braille, in the UK as grade 2 (there is also a grade 3 though it is not used very much). These contracted forms enables braille text to be read faster and reduces the number of pages in hard copy resources.

People always learn uncontracted/grade 1 braille first. They may then learn contracted/grade 2 braille but not everyone does. people who can read contracted braille can read uncontracted, but if you only know uncontracted braille you'll have difficulty reading contracted braille.

There are also national braille forms - French braille, German braille, Italian braille, Norwegian braille, etc. These include representations of letters and accents relevant to that language. Each of these braille codes can be in an uncontracted (grade 1) or contracted (grade 2) form. For example French braille has contractions for 'et, le, la, les' and so on. National practice varies on whether the different levels are denoted as 'uncontracted/contracted' (US practice) or 'grade 1/grade 2' (UK practice). And note that the words 'contracted' and 'grade' may well be the equivalent term in the language in question.

Also to be noted is that Moon type also has 'uncontracted/grade 1' and 'contracted/grade 2' forms.

I feel that at 7.13.4.3 the examples regarding contraction need to be expanded - at present they only illustrate US practice. My suggestions are as follows.

> braille (uncontracted)
> [Tactile system of notation for a resource in grade 1 braille described by an agency in the US.]
>
> braille (grade 1)
> [Tactile system of notation for a resource in grade 1 braille (uncontracted) described by an agency in the UK.]
>
> braille (grade 2)

[Tactile system of notation for a resource in grade 2 braille (contracted) described by an agency in the UK.]

Moon code (grade 2)
[Tactile system of notation for a resource in grade 2 Moon (contracted) described by an agency in the UK.]

Editor's comment:

A further consideration that needs to be taken into account is that if details such as contraction and grades were to be built into the list of controlled terms (which is effectively what the addition of the parenthetical does), the list itself (as a controlled vocabulary) would have to be expanded to include all possible combinations of those aspects of notation, and cataloguers would have to know exactly what they were dealing with in order to choose the appropriate term. A hierarchical list including both generic and specific terms would be problematic from a vocabulary encoding scheme perspective.

Attachment M (Line 850)

11.2.2.31 Papal Diplomatic Missions, etc.

See suggestion from Adam Schiff below:

Date: Wed, 9 Jul 2008 00:19:30 -0800 (Pacific Standard Time)
From: "Adam L. Schiff" <aschiff@u.washington.edu>
To: Deirdre Kiorgaard <Dkiorgaa@nla.gov.au>
cc: "'Tom Delsey'" <tjdelsey@sympatico.ca>,
    "'Nathalie Schulz'" <N.Schulz@btopenworld.com>
Subject: Re: Apostolic Internunciatures, Nunciatures, and Delegations

Deirdre,

For now, I'll just supply examples that show a government or other jurisdiction, but if you decide to expand the rule to reflect the Catholic Church's diplomatic missions to non-jurisdictions as well, I can use the examples that have (Central America) and (Antilles) as qualifiers.

Adam

On Wed, 9 Jul 2008, Deirdre Kiorgaard wrote:

Hi Adam,

although what you've proposed seems valid I'd rather not send this to the JSC now.

I don't think this issue fits within the priority 1-5 categories that the JSC has used to scope our present discussions on Sections 2-4, 9. We haven't yet scheduled a discussion of the many issues that didn't fall into our priorities 1-5, but we can keep this for discussion then.

Cheers,
Deirdre

-----Original Message-----
From: Adam L. Schiff
Sent: July-07-08 2:06 AM
To: Tom Delsey
Subject: RE: footnote at 11.2.11.1.1

OK, thanks Tom.

Here's another comment/suggestion:

11.2.18: in researching Apostolic Internunciatures, Nunciatures, and Delegations, I've found that internunciatures and delegations can be accredited or appointed for non-jurisdictional areas. Some headings in
OCLC:

Catholic Church. Apostolic Internunciature (Central America)

Catholic Church. Apostolic Delegation (Antilles)

Catholic Church. Apostolic Delegation (West Africa)

I verified that these were valid names by checking the
http://www.gcatholic.com/dioceses/nunciatures.htm website.

So I'm wondering if the wording of parts of this instruction would be better if worded as:

First paragraph, last sentence: "Add the name of the government or other place to which the mission is accredited, in parenthesis." [Although this raises the issue of whether a mission can be "accredited" to some place that isn't a government, I'm not sure how better to word this.]

Second paragaraph, last sentence: "Add the name of the country, other jurisdiction, or other place in which the which the delegation functions, in
parentheses." Alternatively, you could substitute "region" for "other place".

--Adam

^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^
Adam L. Schiff
Principal Cataloger
University of Washington Libraries
Box 352900
Seattle, WA 98195-2900
(206) 543-8409
(206) 685-8782 fax
aschiff@u.washington.edu
http://faculty.washington.edu/~aschiff
~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~

Attachment N (line 852)

11.2.3.3: General Guidelines on Recording Variant Names for Corporate Bodies

From 5JSC/RDA/Full draft/ ALA response:

> 11.2.3.3: The concept of multiple identities for corporate bodies (as opposed to persons) is new in RDA and is difficult to understand. Further explanation is needed. What is the difference between a separate identity and a name change?

During JSC review of the draft complete examples in June 2008 the following comment was made about the "Corporate body 1" example.

> **8.9 Date of usage**
> This could be added.

Adam Schiff made the following comment:

> AS: The instruction refers to "a particular identity established by a person, family, or corporate body." Is this actually applicable in this case? IBM did not have multiple identities at a given point in time. It's not clear to me that this element applies in the case of a corporate body that changes its name. Please advise. I think that's covered instead by 11.5.2 Date of establishment and 11.5.3 Date of termination. Please advise.

The Editor added this comment:

> TD: I think that instruction pre-dates the JSC decision to delete the instructions on families and corporate bodies with more than one identity. Conceivably, Date of usage could apply to the names of families and corporate bodies, but in most cases I think that information would be recorded as part of Family history or Corporate history. Date of establishment and Date of termination are intended primarily for use as additions to a preferred access point, and probably wouldn't be recorded in a way that would be suitable for recording information on the dates of usage of a particular name.
> I would suggest revising the scope of Date of usage either to limit it to persons (i.e., individuals with more than one identity) or change the definition to read: "… associated with the use of the name designated as the preferred name for a person, family, or corporate body who is represented by more than one preferred name (e.g., an individual who has more than one identity)."