UNITED STATES GOVERNMENT

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS

5JSC/LC/4

TO:	Joint Steering Committee for Revision of AACR	DATE: August 1, 2005
FROM:	Barbara B. Tillett, LC Representative	
	Rule proposals for musical format information (eliminating Musical presentation statement area (5.3))	

LC proposes that the optional Musical presentation statement area (5.3) be eliminated and that information about the musical format be included as an edition element to more accurately reflect its nature. Proposed revisions of 5.2 rules, addition of examples to 5.7B7, and changes to the glossary are given below as examples of the direction we would like RDA to take.

We recognize that the style and format of the rules will be adjusted by the RDA Editor and in some cases may fold into more generalized rules, depending on future drafts, and expect editorial discretion in using the agreed upon content.

(This proposal supersedes our previous recommendations to change the name, coverage, and glossary definition of this area as noted in 5JSC/AACR3/I/LC response.)

Rationale

The rules for this area as written are deficient.

• Because this information serves the "identify" function, its inclusion in the record should be mandatory rather than optional.

• Information can be included only if it is present on the chief source. However, this information often is given elsewhere on music resources. Omitting the information in those cases misrepresents such resources.

• There is no provision in the current area 3 for statements of responsibility, which are often present.

The concept for this separate area has always been a problem.

• "Musical presentation" has no literary warrant in the field of music. Although the term "format" rarely appears on music, the concept of "musical format" is generally understood by musicians; the term "format" is used in notes in bibliographic records to refer to deployment of the music or to size, as in full score, parts, choirbook, etc., format. "Format" would be meaningful to non-specialists according to the slightly broader standard dictionary definition (Web. 3: 2. General plan of physical organization or arrangement). The proposed definition below for "musical format" is less contrived than the current definition for "Musical presentation statement."

• While ISBD(PM) has always had an area 3, called "Printed Music Specific Area," the inclusion of such an area 3 in AACR2 was much debated and it didn't appear there until 1983. Though the ISBD caption doesn't introduce any new terminology, the area is part of a standard that is confined to

printed music, unlike AACR2 or RDA.

• The vocabulary this area covers, including such terms as "format," "edition," or "version," can represent both physical and intellectual attributes. These terms then tend to be used interchangeably on music resources¹. It has been difficult to figure out whether a particular statement (e.g., "in full score," "chant et piano") belongs in this area or in the Title proper and statement of responsibility area or in the Edition area. As a result, LC issued both *Music Cataloging Decisions* for this area and an *LCRI* for 5.2B1 to give guidance to catalogers, resulting in unnecessarily fine distinctions between what to put in areas 2 and 3.

LC feels that recording the musical format information as an edition element is the best approach for simplification and standardization.

• There is already overlap in the terminology used on the resources for musical format and other edition information.

• That the Edition area in AACR2 already provides for media and carriers as diverse as texts, manuscripts, computer software, art works, braille, and games suggests there is room there also for music.

• Catalogers would not take different actions depending upon the presence of a statement of responsibility with the musical format information and would not have to apply fine distinctions to determine placement of information in the bibliographic record.

• ISBD(PM) ought not necessarily to guide the practice for the future.

• Catalogers will continue to give notes about the musical format if there is not information on the resource to transcribe. Two examples for musical format are proposed for addition to the edition note (formerly AACR2 5.7B7) in the revision below.

In addition to the deletion of 5.3 and the revision of rules listed below, there is another aspect to be considered. Information appearing now in existing examples in the Title proper and statement of responsibility area would in the future be given as an edition statement/statement of responsibility related to the edition. Examples such as the one below would need to be reviewed by the examples working group.

now:

La leggenda di Sakúntale / tre atti da "Kalidasa" ; Musica di Franco Alfano ; Canto e pianoforte riduzione di Raffaele delli Ponti

would be:

La leggenda di Sakúntale / tre atti da "Kalidasa" ; Musica di Franco Alfano. – Canto e pianoforte riduzione di Raffaele delli Ponti

¹For example, 1) transposition: as in the high, medium, or low voice "edition" or "version" of a song, set of songs, or miscellaneous collection of songs with piano; 2) arrangement: as in the case of a "version" for concert band of a work originally for a different kind of band or for an entirely different medium such as orchestra; or when an original "version" of a work, such as the original 13-instrument "version" of Copland's ballet Appalachian Spring, is subsequently arranged by its composer, in this case his orchestral "version" of it; 3) a vocal score "edition" of an opera as distinct from its full version in score format. Why was this information not included in area 2 in the past?

5JSC/LC/4 August 1, 2005 p. 3

Proposals

1. Proposed deletion and generalization

a) Delete 5.3 in its entirety.

b) AACR2 5.3.B2 has the wording "If a musical presentation statement is an inseparable part of another area and is recorded as such, do not repeat it here." *Recommendation*: the rule should be generalized to deal with any element that can be connected to another element.

2. Proposed revision of 5.2B1

a) We are using the AACR2 style to convey the proposed change for simplifying the rule and including musical format.

5.2B1. Transcribe a statement relating to an edition of a work that contains differences from other editions of that work, or to a named reissue of a work the edition statement(s) as found in the resource as instructed in 1.2B. If one of the statements is for the musical format, record it last unless a different order more accurately represents the resource.

2nd ed. 2^e éd. du recueil noté 6. udg. Urtextausg. Full score <u>Vollständiger klavierauszug</u> <u>Klavierauszug zu 2 händen mit singstimme und text</u> <u>1. Aufl. ; Partitur, zugleich Orgelstimme</u> <u>1. vyd. ; partitura a hlasy</u>

Clean copy of 5.2B1

5.2B1. Transcribe the edition statement(s) as found in the resource as instructed in 1.2B. If one of the statements is for the musical format, record it last unless a different order more accurately represents the resource.

2nd ed. 2e éd. du recueil noté 6. udg. Urtextausg. Full score Vollständiger klavierauszug Klavierauszug zu 2 händen mit singstimme und text 1. Aufl. ; Partitur, zugleich Orgelstimme 1. vyd. ; partitura a hlasy

b) For displays of more than one edition statement, LC suggests separating them by a space-semicolon-space.

3. Proposed revision of 5.2C1

LC suggests the additional wording and the addition of examples to clarify that musical format information may have its own statement of responsibility.

5.2C1. Transcribe a statement of responsibility relating to one or more editions, but not to all editions, of a work <u>following the edition statement to which it applies</u>, as instructed in 1.2C and 5.1F.

Nolo mortem peccatoris [GMD] / Thomas Morley ; edited by Sylvia Townsend Warner. – Rev. ed. / by John Morehen

Piano concerto, A major, K. 414 [GMD] / Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart. – Rev. ed. / foreword by Paul Badura-Skoda

Der Rosenkavalier / Richard Strauss. - Vocal score / arrangement by Otto Singer

<u>Flower of the mountain : for soprano solo and orchestra, 1986 / Stephen Albert. –</u> <u>Piano/vocal score / by the composer</u>

Clean copy of 5.2C1

5.2C1. Transcribe a statement of responsibility relating to one or more editions, but not to all editions, of a work following the edition statement to which it applies, as instructed in 1.2C and 5.1F.

Nolo mortem peccatoris [GMD] / Thomas Morley ; edited by Sylvia Townsend Warner. – Rev. ed. / by John Morehen

Piano concerto, A major, K. 414 [GMD] / Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart. – Rev. ed. / foreword by Paul Badura-Skoda

Der Rosenkavalier / Richard Strauss. - Vocal score / arrangement by Otto Singer

Flower of the mountain : for soprano solo and orchestra, 1986 / Stephen Albert. – Piano/vocal score / by the composer

4. Proposed revision of 5.7B7

We recognize notes for edition are being separated from notes for history in RDA. However, for the purpose of presenting this proposal, we are retaining the AACR2 style. LC is suggesting only the addition of examples to convey the applicability to musical format information.

5.7B7. Edition and history. Make notes relating to the edition being described or to the bibliographic history of the work.

Reprinted from the 1712 ed.

Reprint in reduced format of the full score: Berlin : Harmonie, 1910

Rev. ed. of: Complete organ works. London : Schott, 1958

Facsim. reprint. Originally published: London : I. Walsh, [ca. 1734]

Principally in choirbook format

Parts in score format

Clean copy of 5.7B7

5.7B7. Edition and history. Make notes relating to the edition being described or to the bibliographic history of the work.

Reprinted from the 1712 ed.

Reprint in reduced format of the full score: Berlin : Harmonie, 1910

Rev. ed. of: Complete organ works. London : Schott, 1958

Facsim. reprint. Originally published: London : I. Walsh, [ca. 1734]

Principally in choirbook format

Parts in score format

5. Glossary: proposed revisions

Edition: Books, pamphlets, fascicles, single sheets, etc. <u>1</u>. All copies produced from essentially the same master (whether by direct contact or by photographic or other methods) and issued by the same entity. *See also* Facsimile reproduction, Impression, Issue, Reprint. <u>2</u>. Additionally for resources consisting of musical notation, the musical format. *See also* Musical format.

Format (Music). See Musical format.

Musical format. The musical or physical layout of a resource consisting of musical notation as indicated by a term or phrase found in the resource (e.g., in full score; parts; Klavierauszug)

Musical presentation statement. A term or phrase found in the chief source of information of a publication of printed music or a music manuscript that indicates the physical presentation of the music (e.g., score, miniature score, score and parts). This type of statement should be distinguished from one that indicates an arrangement or edition of a musical work (e.g., vocal score, 2 piano edition, version with orchestra accompaniment, chorus score).

Glossary: clean copy of proposed revisions

Edition: Books, pamphlets, fascicles, single sheets, etc. 1. All copies produced from essentially the same master (whether by direct contact or by photographic or other methods) and issued by the same entity. *See also* Facsimile reproduction, Impression, Issue, Reprint. 2. Additionally for resources consisting of musical notation, the musical format. *See also* Musical format.

Format (Music). See Musical format.

Musical format. The musical or physical layout of a resource consisting of musical notation as indicated by a term or phrase found in the resource (e.g., in full score; parts; Klavierauszug)

[Musical presentation statement. Deleted.]