

To: Joint Steering Committee for Revision of AACR
From: Deirdre Kiorgaard, ACOC representative
Subject: Rule proposals for musical format information (eliminating Musical presentation statement area (5.3))

General comments

ACOC agrees that there are problems with the Musical presentation statement area (5.3) rules, however we are not convinced that this proposal is the best way to address them.

As a matter of general principle, we would prefer not to expand the role of the edition statement as in this proposal without a reconsideration of the concept of edition as suggested previously in *4JSC/Chair/76/Chair follow-up/4/Sec follow-up/ALA response/ACOC response* and elsewhere.

1. Proposed deletion and generalization

- a) ACOC does not support this: please see our general comments.
- b) Although ACOC supports a generalised rule, we would like JSC to review instructions not to repeat information. Such instructions are a carry over from the card catalogue era and make the searching of data and sorting of results in automated systems more difficult.

2. Proposed revision of 5.2B1

ACOC does not support this: please see our general comments.

However, if the revision to 5.2B1 is agreed, we consider that the inclusion of some English language music examples would help illustrate the concept.

3. Proposed revision of 5.2C1

ACOC does not support this: please see our general comments.

4. Proposed revision of 5.7B7

ACOC does not support this: please see our general comments.

In the rationale for the proposal LC has stated on p.2. "Catalogers will continue to give notes about the musical format if there is not information on the resource to transcribe". However, by moving musical format information to the Edition area, cataloguers will now have to decide when to use a supplied edition statement, and when to use an edition and history note.

5. Glossary: proposed revisions

ACOC does not support the proposed definitions: please see our general comments.

In addition, we note that the wording of the definition of 'musical format' itself indicates that the concept does not fit easily with the concept of 'edition'.