

To: Joint Steering Committee for Revision of AACR

From: Deirdre Kiorgaard, ACOC representative

Subject: **AACR3 Area 4 Example of Simplified Rules**

In general ACOC welcomes the simplification offered by revising all the rules along the lines suggested. The addition of a statement on the purpose of the area, and the grouping of possibilities and choices make it easier to recognise the principles behind the rules.

However, we have some concerns relating the level of guidance offered on particular issues and the omission of particular rules. (In the future, it would be helpful if any proposals of this type also indicated which rules have been omitted, and the rationale for the omission, so that the constituencies can indicate whether or not they agree.)

Our specific comments on these rules follow. Any references to rules that have been omitted use the rule number from *5JSC/AACR3/I*.

A1.4A. Purpose of this area and A1.4B General rule (in Proposal)

ACOC notes that, as with *5JSC/AACR3/I*, the significant issue of publication in relation to online resources has not been addressed.

There is also a need to also record information about the creation of unpublished resources:

- To cover the full range of unpublished resources, 'Production' would need to be defined to include creation, inscription, manufacture, recording, etc.
- As noted in *5JSC/AACR3/I/ACOC response* we would like JSC to consider recording the place of production for unpublished items. ALA also noted in *5JSC/AACR3/I/ALA response* this would be consistent with other standards for similar materials e.g. CCO, VRA Core, CDWA, CIMI, and AMREMM. In line with this, we suggest that 'the place and ...' be added to A1.4A 3); and that A1.4B be revised accordingly.
- We would also prefer that the fact that an item is unpublished be explicitly recorded in the record, rather than extrapolated through the absence of data in the place of publication and publisher elements.

A1.4B General rule

Although this general rule indicates that information found in sources other than the resource itself can be recorded, subsequent rules A1.4C, A1.4D and A1.4E imply that only the place/name/date information appearing on the resource is recorded.

A1.4B4 (in 5JSC/AACR3/I)

We accept the omission of rule A1.4B4 regarding original publication details covered by a label.

A1.4C. Place of publication (in Proposal)

Local place unknown but larger jurisdiction probable. This instruction should address both known and probable larger jurisdictions. We would prefer that 'province' was reinstated in the bracketed examples 'state, country'.

A1.4C5 Two or more places (in 5JSC/AACR3/I)

Although A1.4C5 regarding more than one place of publication could be simplified, some guidance is needed.

A1.4C7 (in 5JSC/AACR3/I)

We accept the omission of optional rule A1.4C7 regarding recording a full address.

A1.4D. Name of publisher

We would prefer that the content of the following 5JSC/AACR3/I rules be incorporated at least in broad terms:

A1.4D2 regarding recording the publisher's name in the shortest form, and

A1.4D3 regarding the phrases to retain.

We consider that some specific guidance is needed as per the following 5JSC/AACR3/I rules as inconsistency in these elements may lead to record duplication:

A1.4D4 regarding recording more than one publisher, and

A1.4D5 regarding recording subsidiaries and trade names.

A1.4E. (in 5JSC/AACR3/I)

We are willing to consider omitting the option at A1.4E1 regarding the statement of function.

A1.4E Date (in Proposal) and A1.4F (in 5JSC/AACR3/I)

We note that 5JSC/AACR3/I rule A1.4F2 regarding incorrect dates is covered by the general instruction about inaccuracies in transcribed fields at A1.OF8.

We would prefer that the content of the following 5JSC/AACR3/I rules be incorporated at least in broad terms:

A1.4F9 regarding other dates.

A1.4F7 regarding the form of a supplied date. In this case the examples should be simplified and incorporated into the rule.

Editorial comments:

Some editing of the text for internal consistency is needed, e.g. use of 'if' in A1.4C vs. 'when' in A1.4D; as well as editing for consistency with other RDA rules.

A1.4E. Date. A1.4E a) i) consider replacing 'comprehensibility' with 'comprehension'.