

5JSC/AACR3/I/Discussion guide
18 April 2005

To: Joint Steering Committee for Revision of AACR
From: Tom Delsey, AACR3 Editor and Nathalie Schulz, JSC Secretary
Subject: AACR3 - Part I - Constituency Review of December 2004 Draft -
Discussion Guide

The attached discussion guide is intended for use at the April 2005 JSC meeting. It follows the format of the template issued with the draft of part I of AACR3.

Notes:

- The discussion guide should be considered a draft.
- Comments and recommendations made in the constituency responses have been given in a very brief form, with a reference made to the page number in the response.
- Sections 17-21 have been added for “other comments” on the introduction to part I, sections A, B, and C, and examples. Comments and recommendations included in the constituency responses under sections 1-14 that were considered to fall outside the intended focus of those sections have been listed under sections 17-21 as appropriate.
- Due to time constraints, in this draft of the discussion guide sections 15 and 16 do not list specific comments from constituency responses, but simply refer to the pages in the constituency responses where comments on style, typographical and grammatical errors, etc., will be found.
- Comments from the review of the draft by other rule makers have not been included.

Responses from the Constituency Review of the December 2004 Draft of AACR3 – Part I

Discussion Guide

1. Objectives and principles

General comments on the formulation or application of the objectives and principles established for part I:

- current draft doesn't go far enough to achieve stated objectives and principles – LC (p. 1)
- need wider consultation in advance on principles; greater input from the community in shaping rules – CILIP (p. 1)
- new edition must maintain some degree of continuity with its predecessor – CILIP (p. 1)

A. Scope, structure, terminology, etc.

Objectives:

Comprehensiveness

- spell out audience, scope, relationship to other standards in general introduction – ALA (section 1A: p. 3)
- rules still too tied to print/published resources; not enough attention to multi-format collections – LC (section 1A, p. 13)
- rules insufficient for most archival collections; need more references to RAD, DACS, etc. – LC (section 1A: p. 6)
- move more examples from C7.5 into A1.5 – LC (section 1A: p. 6)
- restore examples from AACR2 chapter 8 to chapter A1 – LC (section 1A: p. 6)
- delete rules from AACR2 chapter 4; replace with rules from RAD, DACS, etc. – LC (section 1A: p. 7)

Consistency

- level of treatment for archival collections needs to be consistent with level of treatment for published resources – LC (section 1A: p. 7)
- need for consistency in identifying all optional rules – ALA (section 1A: p. 4)

Clarity

- use direct style, “plain English” – BL (p. 1); LC (section 1A: p. 8)
- rules need to be introduced and presented in simpler language; less reliance on understanding technical meaning of terms and glossary definitions – CILIP (p. 1)
- summarize essentials of rule before presenting detail – LC (section 1A: p. 8)
- use more lists, tables, etc. – BL (p.1); LC (section 1A: p. 8)
- harmonize library terminology with archival terminology, etc. – LC (section 1A: p. 8)

- collocate rules for serials, monographic series, and integrating resources – LC (section 1A: p. 7)
- clarification needed in rule on sources of information – ACOC (section 9: p.9, A1.0A3)
- need clarification and validation of terms used as GMDs – ACOC (section 10: p. 10)
- question value of footnote to rule A1.2B3; need clearer guidance on what is or is not an edition statement – CILIP (section 2A: p. 5)
- additional terms needed in glossary – ALA (section 14: pp. 96-110)
- add terms used as GMDs to glossary – ACOC (section 14: p. 18)

Rationality

- add a “purpose” section for each information element – LC (section 1A: p. 8)
- question varying instructions re language of cataloguer’s interpolations – ALA (section 1A: p. 4); LC (section 2A: p. 15)
- question rationale for instructions in A1.1D3 re recording original title as parallel title – LC (section 2A: p. 16)
- arbitrary ‘rule of three’ reflected in A1.1F5 – ALA (section 1A: p. 4); ACOC (section 2A: p. 5, A1.1F5); CCC (section 2A: p. 2)
- question rationale for instructions in A1.2B2 re symbols in edition statements – CILIP (section 2A: p. 5)

Currency

- need to eliminate library jargon and model presentation and terminology on current metadata standards used in other communities – ALA (section 1A: p. 4); LC (section 1A: p. 9)
- need more aggressive changes that respond to web catalogues and future capabilities – LC (p. 1)
- general chapter needs to treat electronic resources as primary – ACOC (section 1A: p. 2)
- move more examples from C7.5 into A1.5 – LC (section 1A: p. 9)
- include persistent identifiers in area 8 – ACOC (section 2A: p. 6, A1.8B)
- add examples of a 13-digit ISBN and an ISMN in area 8; adjust instructions in A1.8B2 – ACOC (section 2A: p. 6, A1.8B); CILIP (section 2A: p. 6, A1.8B2)
- add URL to mode of access note – ACOC (section 13: p. 16, A1.7B16)
- delete rules from AACR2 chapter 4; replace with rules from RAD, DACS, etc. – LC (section 1A: p. 9)
- delete rules for obsolete materials – LC (pp. 3-4; section 1A: p. 9)

Compatibility

- explicit statement of compatibility needed in general introduction – ALA (section 1A: p. 4); ACOC (section 1A: p. 2)
- cite complementary content standards; enable linking – LC (p. 2; section 1A: p. 10)
- deconstruct AACR to fit into more structured data environment – ALA (section 1A: p. 4)
- eliminate ISBD punctuation; rely on automated tools to label and categorize data – LC (p. 3; section 17: p. 45)
- allow options for normalizing punctuation, abbreviations, capitalization, measurements, etc. – LC (p. 3; section 1A: p. 10; section 17: p. 45)

- develop a crosswalk to MARC; add examples from MARC notes fields – LC (section 1A: p. 10)
- explain concept of continuing resources and seriality in general introduction – LC (section 1A: p. 10)
- rules for resources without a collective title (A1.1B10) differ from ISBD – ALA (section 2A: p. 16)
- revisions required to bring rules in line with latest version of ISBD(E) – ACOC (section 2A: p. 6, A1.8B; section 13: p. 16, A1.7B16)
- reconsider use of non-metric vs. metric conventions for representative fractions used in statements of scale – BL (section 2B: p. 8)

Adaptability

- highlight need for adaptability to new and emerging technologies and formats – ALA (section 1A: p. 5)
- clarify intended meaning of “user communities” – ALA (section 1A: p. 5)
- other communities need set of simple guidelines arranged by resource type (thesis, digital image, etc.) – BL (p. 1)
- need an additional, more radical product; slimline, user-friendly, customizable presentation – BL (p. 1)
- adaptability constrained by complexity of rules; simplify – LC (section 1A: p. 11)
- library jargon intelligible only to those familiar with AACR2 – ALA (section 1A: p. 5)
- make prescribed punctuation optional – LC (section 1A: p. 11)

Ease and efficiency of use

- realignment makes rules more difficult to find and apply – ALA (section 1A: p. 5); LC (section 1A: p. 11)
- specialist cataloguers prefer to have all rules affecting special materials together in one place – CCC (p. 1)
- present rules in a language easily understood by cataloguing staff at all levels as well as other potential users – LC (p. 2)
- use more natural language and presentations that facilitate comprehension (e.g., tables) – LC (section 1A: p. 13)
- include more examples using images (reproductions of title pages, screen shots of OPACS, etc.) – CILIP (p. 1)
- reduce rules to essentials; mark rules to facilitate display of a subset of “concise” rules in online format – LC (p. 2)
- need some form of outline “practitioner's” view of the rules – CILIP (p. 1)
- provide an AACR2-AACR3 concordance and list of major changes – LC (p. 2; section 17: p. 46; Attachment 2); CILIP (p. 1)
- rules not well designed for those cataloguing materials under archival control – LC (section 1A: p. 13)
- integrate rules from chapters A2 and A3 into chapter A1 – LC (section 1A: p. 7)
- combine sections B and C into one section based on type of material – LC (section 1A: p. 11)
- relocate rules on sources of information, punctuation, etc. – LC (section 1A: p. 11)

Format

- print version unwieldy to use – ALA (section 1A: p. 5)

- effort needed to make rules more usable in both print and electronic form – ACOC (section 1A: p. 2)
- scepticism about functionality, availability, and affordability of electronic version - ALA (section 2: p. 11)
- rules must be produced as a Web-based tool with retrieval and navigational capabilities – LC (p. 1)
- need to address accessibility for persons with disabilities – CILIP (section 1A: p. 3)
- assess format of other metadata standards as potential models for AACR3 – LC (section 1A: p. 12)

Principles:

Generalization

- generalization may result in proliferation of house manuals for specific types of materials – BL (p. 2)
- some generalized rules too book-centric (e.g., source of information) – ALA (section 1A: p. 6)
- potential conflict between A1.1B6 and A1.1B2 as a result of generalizing instructions on abridgement from AACR2 rule on early printed books – ALA (section 2A: p. 15)
- additional instructions needed in A1.1B11 to ensure devised title is sufficiently distinctive; alternatively add instructions in section B – CILIP (section 2A: p. 5)
- generalize AACR2 rule 3.1G5 under A1.1G – ALA (section 2A: p. 16); CCC (section 2A: p. 2)
- potential problems in generalizing rules on numbering – ALA (section 2A: p. 17)
- problems with generalization of rules on extent – LC (section 1A: p. 12)
- delete second sentence in second paragraph of A1.7B24; give precedence to practice used for sound recordings as general rule – CCC (section 2A: p. 3)
- suggestions for further generalization – ACOC (section 2A: p. 4, A1.1B11; p. 5, A1.1E, A1.1F1, A1.4F9; p. 6, A2.7B5.1; section 12: p. 13, A1.5B1; p. 14, A1.5B2; p. 15, A1.5C9.2, A1.5C10, A1.5E4; section 13: p. 16, A1.7B15; p. 17, A1.7B21, A1.7B24); ALA (section 2B: p. 22, B4.1B11); CCC (section 2B: p. 4, B4.1B11, B4.7B21, B5.1F1; section 2C: p. 6, C3.5C2.1, C3.5D1, C3.7B13); LC (section 2B: p. 21, B4.7B21; section 2C: p. 27, C1.5B2.3); ALA (section 8: pp.46-47, C1.7B28.1)

Specificity

- supplement general rules with specific detailed guidelines derived from DCRBM, DACS, RAD, CONSER, etc. – LC (p. 1)
- add references to manuals of interpretation and other specialized content standards – ACOC (section 1A: p. 2)

Non-redundancy

- repetitions remain (e.g., instructions on facsimiles and reproductions, punctuation) – ALA (section 1A: p. 6)
- eliminate redundancies further by merging chapters A2 and A3 with A1 and merging sections B and C – LC (section 1A: p. 12)

Terminology

- avoid use of “version” if FRBR term or “resource” appropriate – ALA (section 1A: p. 6)

Reference structure

- references too wordy and difficult to follow – ALA (section 1A: p. 7)
- reference structure unwieldy in print format – LC (section 1A: p. 12)
- eliminate references to brief supplementary rules by moving supplementary rule into general rule – LC (section 1A: p. 12)
- inconsistency in references back to A1.0F – ALA (section 1A: p. 8)

B. Functional Requirements*Objectives:***Responsiveness to user needs**

- explain purpose and function of catalogues in general introduction – CILIP (section 1B: p. 4)
- question changes in technical description area vis-à-vis user needs – ALA (section 1B: p. 8)
- reconsider impact of removing GMDs for materials for visually impaired users – ACOC (section 10, pp. 10-11)

Cost efficiency

- clarify intent of objective – ALA (section 1B: p. 8)
- proposed changes not sufficient to improve productivity enough to offset costs of implementation – LC (section 1A: p. 13)
- added cost of measuring each map on a sheet not justified – ALA (section 1B: p. 8)
- more cost efficient to take formally recorded titles directly from content list – ACOC (section 13: p. 17, A1.7B21, comment 3)

Format independence**Suggestions for additional functional objectives**

- flexibility (i.e., use of records in different environments) – ALA (section 1B: p. 8)
- harmony (i.e., compatibility with existing records and catalogues) – ALA (section 1B: p. 8)

*Principles:***Differentiation**

- state requirement to uniquely identify the resource described at the beginning of the rules – LC (section 1B: p. 13)
- tension between manifestation-level and item-level description - CILIP (section 1A: p. 3)

Sufficiency

- delete rules that instruct cataloguer to omit information (e.g., dimensions of slides) – LC (section 1B: p. 13)

Relationships

- consider options for handling notes on relationships differently in the future – LC (section 1B: p. 13)
- limitation on recording relationships reflected in statements of responsibility – ACOC (section 2A: p. 5, A1.1F5)

Representation

- clarify wording of principle – CILIP (section 1B: p.4)
- apply principle of transcribing “what you see” for titles, statements of responsibility, edition statements, imprint, series statements, and contents notes – LC (p. 3; section 1B: p. 14)
- problems with transcription for certain categories or resources – ALA (section 1B: p. 8)
- facilitate process of automated transcription where useful – ALA (section 1B: p. 8)
- need to cover non-roman scripts and romanization in general introduction – ALA (section 1B: p. 9)
- regularize convention for correcting inaccuracies – ACOC (section 2A: p. 4, A1.0F8)
- question completion of place of publication given in abbreviated form – ACOC (section 11: p. 12, A1.4C4)
- expand rule on numbers associated with the resource to include recording of abbreviations, etc., preceding the number – ACOC (section 13: p. 17, A1.7B24)

Accuracy

Uniformity

- should not require uniformity where no required to support user tasks – LC (section 1B: p. 14)
- need to establish principles governing optional instructions – ALA (section 1B: p. 9)

Common usage

- difficulties related to “common usage” (e.g., inconsistency, variability over time) – ALA (section 1B: p. 9)
- need clarification and validation of terms used as GMDs – ACOC (section 10: pp. 10-11)
- delete instruction to add “et. al.” following mark of omission in statements of responsibility – LC (section 2A: p. 16)
- use common English term in place of s.l. and s.n. – ACOC (section 11: p. 12, A1.4C6, A14D7); LC (section 1B: p. 14)
- problematic use of “graphic” – LC (section 1B: p. 14)
- distinction between physical units and components in rules on extent violate principle of common usage – LC (section 2A: p. 17)

2. Organization of the rules

Comments on the scope and organization of the sections and chapters in part I:

- focus on essential (mandatory) elements for description – LC (p. 1; section 17: p. 46)
- replace arrangement by ISBD area with arrangement by information element (e.g., title, creator, type of material) as in FRBR, DACS, etc. – LC (p. 2; section 1A: p. 8; section 17: p. 46; Attachment 1)

- organize part I into single sequence of chapters corresponding to ISBD areas of description – ALA (section 2A: p. 10; 5JSC/ALA rep/1)
- retain current AACR2 organization by type of material – ALA (section 2: p. 11)
- merge rules from chapters A2 and A3 with rules from chapter A1 – ALA (section 2A: p. 14); LC (section 2A: p. 14)
- integrate rules for digital media into the general rules – ACOC (p. 1)
- criteria for general vs. supplementary rules not clear – ACOC (section 2A: p. 4)
- general introduction will need to cover “prominently”, etc. – CILIP (section 2: p. 5)

Section A – General rules

Scope and organization of chapter A1 – General rules for description

- finding a rule within chapter A1 can be difficult because of the bulkiness of the chapter – BL (section 2A: p. 5)
- reverse order of A1.0F7 and A1.0F8 – CCC (section 2A: p. 1)
- incorporate instructions on recording accents (AACR2 1.1B1) and separate letters and initials (AACR2 1.1B6) into A1.0F – CCC (section 2A: pp. 1-2)
- move A1.0G (resources without a collective title) to introduction – ALA (section 2A: p. 15)
- make the logic for grouping A1.0G-A1.0L clear; partial overlap with A1.0A3 – ACOC (section 2A: p. 4)
- move instructions from A1.0G-A1.0L into section on sources and what is being catalogued – LC (section 2A: p. 15)
- move rules A1.0G-A1.0L to follow A1.0D – BL (section 3: p. 11)
- separation of rules A1.1B1 and A1.1B6 makes the process of cataloguing more time-consuming – BL (section 2A: p. 5)
- potential confusion between application of A1.1B8 and A1.3A1 – ALA (section 2A: p. 15)
- incorporate instructions from AACR2 rules 13.3 and 13.4 into A1.1B9 – BL (section 2A: pp. 5-6)
- problematic placement of rules for resources without a collective title – ALA (section 2A: p. 16)
- add reference from A1.2B3 to B2.3B to differentiate between edition statements and musical presentation statements – ALA (section 2A: p. 16)
- incorporate instructions for change in edition information into A1.2F – ALA (section 2A: p. 17)
- merge A1.7B26 with A1.7A4 – ALA (section 2A: p. 20)
- incorporate provisions from AACR2 13.3 into A1.10 and A1.11 – BL (section 2A: p. 7)
- delete and replace A1.10 – LC (5JSC/LC/1)
- move A1.9 and A1.11 to an appendix referenced from A1.0 – LC (section 2A: p. 20)

Scope and organization of chapter A2 – Resources issued in successive parts

- merge rules from chapter A2 with rules in chapter A1 – LC (section 2A: p. 20)
- either expand scope of chapter A2 to include simultaneously issued multipart monographs or narrow it to include only serials – ALA (section 2: p. 15)
- reinstate instructions from AACR2 12.10A precluding the use of multilevel descriptions for sections of continuing resources – ALA (section 2A: p. 20)

- if chapter A2 is retained as a separate chapter, move rules on numbering from A1.3 to A2.3 – ALA (section 2A: p. 20)

Scope and organization of chapter A3 – Integrating resources

- separation of rules into different chapters makes the process of cataloguing too complex – ALA (section 2A: p. 20)
- merge rules from chapter A2 with rules in chapter A1 – LC (section 2A: p. 20)
- question the application of exceptional treatment of inaccuracies (A3.1B1) to integrating resources – ALA (section 2A: p. 20)

Section B – Supplementary rules applicable to specific types of content

- combine sections B and C into one section organized by type of content; weave rules pertaining to media into most relevant chapter– LC (section 2B: p. 20)

Scope and organization of chapter B1 – Text

- eliminate chapter B1; rules are obsolete; general rules are sufficient – LC (section 2B: p. 21)
- revise scope B1.0A to exclude text accompanied by musical notation – ALA (section 2B: p. 21)
- chapter title and scope do not reflect focus on unpublished resources – ACOC (section 2B: p. 7)
- move B1.4F8 to B1.4F9 – CCC (section 2B: p. 3)

Scope and organization of chapter B2 – Music

- combine relevant rules from section C with chapter B2 – LC (section 2B: p. 21)
- change chapter title to “Musical notation” or expand scope to include rules pertaining to music from chapter B6 – ACOC (section 2B: p. 7)
- replace B2.0A with scope note from MARC 21 for 007/00 value “q” – ALA (section 2B: p. 21)

Scope and organization of chapter B3 – Cartographic resources

- combine relevant rules from section C with chapter B3 – LC (section 2B: p. 21)
- replace B3.0A with scope note for AACR2 chapter 3 – CCC (section 2B: p. 3)
- suggested editorial revisions to B3.0A – ALA (section 2B: p. 21)
- reinstate AACR2 rule 3.0J1 (description of whole or part) – CCC (section 2B: p. 3)
- add subject depicted to instructions re devised titles at B3.1B11 – CCC (section 2B: p. 3)
- add subject depicted to instructions re other title information at B3.1E6 – CCC (section 2B: p. 3)
- incorporate AACR2 rule 3.1G5 either into A1.1G4 or as supplementary rule at B3.1G2 – ALA (section 2B: p. 21)
- revise caption for B3.3 to include digital graphic representation and renumber subrules – ALA (section 2B: p. 21)
- reinstate instructions from AACR2 rule 3.0D re mandatory elements for first level description at B3.3A1 – CCC (section 2B: p. 3)
- separate instructions in B3.3B6 into two rules – BL (section 2B: p. 8)
- designate B3.3D as optional – CCC (section 2B: p. 4)

Scope and organization of chapter B4 – Graphics

- replace chapter B4 with a general “graphics” (visual materials) chapter; incorporate graphics related rules from chapters C1, C6, and C7 – LC (section 2B: pp. 21-22)
- suggestions for generalization of rules would result in elimination of chapter B4 – ACOC (section 2B: p. 7); CCC (section 2B: p. 4)
- expand B4.0A to exclude moving images and refer to chapter B7 – ALA (section 2B: p. 22)
- clarify whether holograms and stereographs are included in or excluded from chapter B4 – ALA (section 2B: p. 22)
- clarify whether photographs of celestial bodies are included in chapter B4 or B3 – ALA (section 2B: p. 22)

Scope and organization of chapter B5 – Three-dimensional resources

- suggestions for generalization of rules would result in elimination of chapter B5 – ACOC (section 2B: p. 7); CCC (section 2B: p. 4)
- clarify whether holograms and stereographs are to be included within the scope of chapter B5 – ALA (section 2B: p. 22)

Scope and organization of chapter B6 – Sound

- overlap with chapters B2 (re music) and B7 (re performances) – ACOC (section 2B: p. 7)
- repeat all rules from chapter B2 applicable to music – LC (section 2B: pp. 22-25)
- add instructions re notes on narrators at B6.7B8 – CILIP (section 2B: p. 7)

Scope and organization of chapter B7 – Moving images

- overlap with chapter B6 (re performances) – ACOC (section 2B: p. 7)
- add instruction re music titles at B7.1B1 to parallel B6.1B1 – CCC (section 2B: p. 4)
- add instruction re music titles at B7.1B11 to parallel B6.1B11 – CCC (section 2B: p. 4)
- add instruction re music titles at B7.1D1 to parallel B6.1D1 – CCC (section 2B: p. 5)
- add instruction re numbers associated with videorecordings at B7.7B24 to parallel B6.7B24 – CCC (section 2B: p. 5)

Section C – Supplementary rules applicable to specific types of media

- combine sections B and C into one section organized by type of content with weave rules pertaining to media into most relevant chapter– LC (section 2B: p. 20; section 2C: p. 25)
- include only “quick reference” appendices in section C for micrographic, digital, and tactile media – LC (section 2B: p. 20)
- remove artificial restrictions on scope of individual chapters; instruct catalogue to apply all applicable chapters and provide guidance – ALA (section 2C: p. 22)

Scope and organization of chapter C1 – Print and graphic media

- break up chapter C1 into more specific categories – ALA (section 2C: p. 23)
- arbitrary division of graphics between chapters C1 and C6 confusing – ALA (section 2C: p. 23); LC (section 2C: p. 26)
- question inclusion of rules for “historic” and “unusual” media – LC (section 2C: p. 17)
- question inclusion of manuscripts in chapter C1 – ALA (section 2C: p. 23)
- delete C1.7B5.1 (covered by B1.1B11) – CCC (section 2C: p. 6)

- broaden application of C1.7B28 beyond early printed books – CCC (section 2C: p. 6)

Scope and organization of chapter C2 – Micrographic media

- clarify rationale for including some types of film in chapter C2 and others in C6 – ALA (section 2C: p. 23)

Scope and organization of chapter C3 – Tactile media

- generalize rules to eliminate chapter B5 – CCC (section 2C: p. 6)

Scope and organization of chapter C4 – Three-dimensional media

- combine globes with cartographic materials in section B – LC (section 2C: p. 27)
- clarify whether holograms and stereographs are included in or excluded from chapter C4 – ALA (section 2C: p. 24)

Scope and organization of chapter C5 – Audio media

- include all audio media in chapter C5 – ALA (section 2C: p. 24)
- reinstate AACR2 reference to recordings in other forms (wires, cylinders, etc.) – ALA (section 2C: p. 24)

Scope and organization of chapter C6 – Projected graphic, film, and video media

- create separate chapters in section B for moving and still images – LC (section 2C: p. 28)
- include all moving image media in chapter C6 – ALA (section 2C: p. 24)

Scope and organization of chapter C7 – Digital media

- prefer electronic resources to be covered in section A – ACOC (section 2C: p. 8)
- remove artificial restrictions on scope of chapter C7; provide instructions on using multiple chapters in section C – ALA (p. 1; section 2C: p. 24; section 14, p. 97)
- rules appeared to be oriented toward monographs; add references to chapters A2 and A3 – BL (section 2C: p. 9)
- add instructions re URLs – BL (section 2C: p. 9); CILIP (section 2C: p. 8)
- provide guidance on granularity – BL (section 2C: p. 9)
- add reference from C7.2B4 to A2.2B3 – BL (section 2C: p. 9)

3. Focus of the description

Comments on instructions in the Introduction and in rule A1.0A1 on focus of the description:

- relocate instructions in introductory section to a section on “How to use this manual”; incorporate workflow diagrams – BL (section 3: p. 9)
- separate the instructions in the introductory section into two processes: what is being catalogued; mode of issuance – ALA (section 3: p. 26)
- present introductory section on focus of description as numbered rules – ALA (section 3: p. 26); BL (section 3: p. 10)
- question adequacy of instructions vis-à-vis description of finite multipart resources at the volume level – BL (section 3: p. 12)
- question applicability of categories listed in introductory section to map series, single map on multiple sheets, or multiple maps on one sheet – ALA (section 3: p. 27)
- include mention of multimedia resources in introductory section on focus with a reference to A1.9 – ALA (section 3: p. 27)

- propose restructuring of A1.0A – LC (5JSC/LC/1)
- remove "Determining the focus for the description" from introduction and put at head of A1.0 – BL (section 9: p. 15)
- separate rules on the focus of the description from the rules for sources of information – ALA (section 9: p. 51)
- lack of definition of "chief source of information" at A1.0A1 is problematic, suggest repeat definition from Glossary – BL (section 9: p. 14)
- rewording of opening sentence in A1.0A1 – BL (section 3: p. 11); CCC (section 3: p. 7)
- clarify distinction in A1.0A1 between a) and b); define "single part resource in glossary – ALA (section 3: p. 27)
- question relationship between a) – g) in A1.0A1 to a) – f) in the introductory section on focus of the description – BL (section 3: p. 12; section 9: p. 15)
- clarify difference between "single part of a resource comprising two or more parts" and "separately titled component part ... within a part of a multipart resource" – ALA (section 3: p. 26)
- emphasize "a single part of a multipart resource" in A1.0A1a – BL (section 9: p. 15)
- reword first paragraph of A1.0A1b for better treatment of information relating to part and whole for multipart monographs – BL (section 9: p. 15)
- suggest no order of preference at A1.0A1b, reword i (or move to A1.0A3) and delete ii and iii – BL (section 9: p. 16)
- alter order of preference under A1.0A1 b) – ALA (section 3: p. 27)
- make it clear that the focus of the description is the whole of the resource in A1.0A1c – BL (section 9: p. 16)
- question instructions re first or earliest part in A1.0A1 c) – ALA (section 3: p. 27)
- question appropriateness of instructions in A1.0A1 c) to remote access serials – ALA (section 3: p. 27)

4. Resources in an unpublished form

Comments on the scope and placement of rules pertaining to resources in an unpublished form:

- add copyright definition to section on "resources in an unpublished form" in the introduction to part I – CCC (section 4: p. 7)

General rules (A1.1B11, A1.2A1, A1.4C8, A1.4D9, A1.4F8, A1.7B12.2, A1.7B14, A1.7B30)

- question re description of palimpsests and other manuscripts with works/redactions physically overlaid on one another – CILIP (section 4: p. 9)
- propose revision of A1.1B11 – LC (5JSC/LC/1)
- reword A1.1B11 to apply to resources lacking a title proper rather than resources lacking a chief source of information – ALA (section 4: p. 28); BL (section 2A: p. 6)
- provide instruction in A1.1B11 for making a note such as "title [supplied/devised] by cataloguer" – ALA (section 4: p. 28)
- to broaden application of A1.2A1 to cover moving images not commercially released or broadcast – ALA (section 4: p. 28)
- flag exception for unpublished in A1.4C8 and A1.4D9 at the beginning of A1.4C and A1.4D – CILIP (section 7: p. 13)
- apply A1.4C8 to all collections; delete "assembled" – LC (section 4: p. 28)

- include place of creation/production under A1.4C8 – ACOC (section 4: p. 8); ALA (section 4: p. 28)
- apply A1.4D9 to all collections; delete “assembled” – LC (section 4: p. 28)
- apply A1.4F8 to all collections; delete “assembled” – LC (section 4: p. 28)
- extend application of A1.7B12.2 to collections – LC (section 4: p. 28)
- extend A1.7B12.2 to allow note on place of production derived from another source – ALA (section 4: p. 29)
- instructions in fourth paragraph of A1.7B14 apply specifically to manuscripts; move to C1 – ALA (section 4: p. 29)

Supplementary rules applicable to text (B1.1B11, B1.1E6, B1.4F8)

- delete all rules in B1; obsolete – LC (section 4: p. 28)
- reverse order of options in B1.1B11 – ALA (section 4: p. 29)
- reword instructions on supplying titles for collections – ALA (section 4: p. 29)
- change reference in B1.4F8 to refer to A1.7B9 – ALA (section 4: p. 29)

Rules on resources in an unpublished form from AACR2 omitted from the draft of AACR3

5. Resources issued in successive parts

Comments on rules pertaining to resources issued in successive parts:

- merge rules from chapter A2 with rules in chapter A1 – ALA (section 2A: p. 13); LC (section 5: p. 29)
- combine rules in chapters A2 and A3 into a single chapter – ACOC (sections 5-6: p. 8)

Numbering area (A1.3)

- restrict application of numbering area to serials only – ALA (section 2A: p. 17)
- placement of rules for numbering in chapter A1 is unhelpful for serials cataloguers – CILIP (section 5: p. 11)
- add reference to A1.3 at A2.3 – CILIP (section 5: p.11)
- propose reorganizing rules in A1.3 – ALA (section 2A: p. 18-19)
- change caption for A1.3 to “Numbering and other material specific details” – LC (section 2A: p. 17)
- change caption for A1.3 to “Numbering”; make reference to area 3 for music and cartographic resources at the beginning of A1.3; delete last two paragraphs of A1.3A2 and A1.3A4 – CCC (section 5: p. 7)
- add references from A1.3 and A2 to A1.0A1 c) or restate A1.0A1 c) at A1.3 and A2 – CILIP (section 5: p. 11)
- restore “if cataloguing from the first and/or last issue of part” at A1.3A1 – ALA (section 2A: p. 19); CCC (section 5: p. 7)
- revise references from A1.3A1 to B2.3 and B3.3 – CCC (section 5: p. 7)
- add instructions at A1.3A4 for recording spans of numbers/dates – ALA (section 5: p. 30)
- eliminate redundancy with A1.3A3 in A1.3B1 – ALA (section 5: p. 30)
- add provision in A1.3C2 for preferring Gregorian/Julian date – ALA (section 5: p. 30)

- question punctuation separating year from number; add explicit instructions on punctuating levels of enumeration – CILIP (section 5: p. 10)
- revise A1.3E1 to give preference to volume and number system – ALA (section 5: p. 30)
- revise A1.3E1 to give preference to volume and number system only if order presented in the resource cannot be determined – CILIP (section 5: p. 10)
- revise A1.3E1 to record deepest scheme; record other schemes in a note – ALA (section 5: p. 30)
- revise caption at A1.3F and wording of A1.3F1 to include “completed” – ALA (section 5: p. 30); BL (section 5: p. 12)
- miscellaneous editorial revisions to A1.3 – LC (section 5: p. 29)

Title and statement of responsibility area (A2.1)

- limit application of A2.1B1 to serials only – CILIP (section 2A: p. 7)
- add “title” to list of elements that can be omitted – CILIP (section 5: p. 11)
- restrict application of A2.1E1 to serials – BL (section 5: p. 13)
- make provisions in A2.1E1 for recording other title information optional except for category a) – ALA (section 5: p. 31)
- reword A2.1F16 – ALA (section 5: p. 31)
- miscellaneous editorial revisions to A2.1 – LC (section 5: p. 29)

Edition area (A2.2)

- specify that second sentence of A2.2B3 applies only to serials – ALA (section 5: p. 31)
- miscellaneous editorial revisions to A2.2 – LC (section 5: p. 29)

Publication, distribution, etc., area (A2.4)

- allow multiple iterations of area 4 for serials and multipart monographs – LC (5JSC/LC/2)
- add instructions to A2.4F1 on recording multiple dates that are not Gregorian/Julian – ALA (section 5: p. 31)
- add instructions to A2.4F1 on recording dates for digitized back runs of issues – BL (section 5: p. 13)

Technical description area (A2.5)

- clarify whether units are physical or bibliographic – ALA (section 5: p. 31; section 12: p. 70)
- add “if it can be readily ascertained” to second paragraph of A2.5B1 – ALA (section 5: p. 32)
- add sentence to A2.5B1 prescribing “v.” as the SMD for printed serials – ALA (section 5: p. 32)
- delete rule A2.5D4 – ALA (section 5: p. 32)
- miscellaneous editorial revisions to A2.5 – LC (section 5: p. 29)

Series area (A2.6)

- add a rule at A2.6B1 re numbering that is integral to series title – ALA (section 5: p. 32)
- add instructions in A2.6G1 on punctuation of first and last numbers – ALA (section 5: p. 33)

- make provisions in A2.6G1 that apply to serials optional; specify that option applies only to serial analytics – CILIP (section 5: p. 11)
- miscellaneous editorial revisions to A2.6 – LC (section 5: p. 29)

Note area (A2.7)

- remove restriction to serials from A2.7B2 – ALA (section 5: p. 33)
- remove linkage to title and statement of responsibility from A2.7B2 – ALA (section 5: p. 33)
- add instructions in A2.7B2 on recording frequencies and dates in chronological order – ALA (section 5: p. 33)
- add rule at A2.7B4 on source of title proper – ALA (section 5: p. 33)
- reword rule A2.7B6.1 – ALA (section 5: p. 33)
- reword rule A2.7B8.2 – ALA (section 5: p. 34)
- repeat instructions re continuations from A1.7B9 at A2.7B9 – ALA (section 5: p. 34); CILIP (section 5: p. 12)
- add category for “issued with” to A2.7B9 – ALA (section 5: p.34)
- add instructions re beginning and ending numbering to second paragraph of A2.7B12.1 – ALA (section 5: p. 34)
- delete rule A2.7B13.1; add reference from A2.5B1 to A2.7B12.1 – ALA (section 5: p. 35); CILIP (section 5: p. 11)
- clarify significance of “other” in A2.7B13.2 – CILIP (section 5: p. 12)
- add wording to A2.7B17.2 – ALA (section 5: p. 35)
- revise caption for A2.7B27; revise rule – ALA (section 5: pp. 35-36) ; BL (section 5: p. 13); CILIP (section 5: pp. 12-13)
- miscellaneous editorial revisions to A2.7 – LC (section 5: p. 29)

6. Integrating resources

Comments on rules pertaining to integrating resources:

- merge rules from chapter A3 with rules in chapter A1 – ALA (section 2A: p. 13); LC (section 6: p. 29)
- combine rules in chapters A2 and A3 into a single chapter – ACOC (sections 5-6: p. 8)
- include replacement volume sets within the scope of chapter A3 – ALA (section 6: p. 37)

Title and statement of responsibility area (A3.1)

- reword A3.1D6, etc., to clarify applicability of “if considered to be important” – ALA (section 6: p. 37)
- question rationale for A3.1E1 c); apply A1.7B1 instead – ALA (section 6: p. 37); ACOC (section 2A; p. 5); BL (section 6: p. 13)
- reword third paragraph of A3.1E1 – ALA (section 6: pp. 37-38)
- revise A3.1E7 to allow deletion of other title information when a change occurs – ALA (section 6: p. 38)

Edition area (A3.2)

Publication, distribution, etc., area (A3.4)

- propose revisions to area 4 – LC (5JSC/LC/2)

Technical description area (A3.5)

- extend application of A3.5B1 to digital forms of updating loose-leaves – ALA (section 6: p. 38)
- question application of A3.5B1 to single-volume updating loose-leaves – CCC (section 6: p. 7)

Series area (A3.6)

Note area (A3.7)

- reword form of note in A3.7B2 to “Frequency of updates varies” – ALA (section 6: p. 38)
- revise A3.7B12.1 to make a note only on beginning/ending dates only if some kind of guess can be made – ALA (section 6: p. 38)
- question use of “issue” and “part” in A3.7B27; revise rule – CILIP (section 5: p. 12); ALA (section 6: p. 38)
- question need for A3.7B27.1 – CCC (section 6: p. 7)
- miscellaneous editorial revisions to A3.7 – LC (section 5: p. 30)

Standard number and terms of availability area (A3.8)

- question rationale for A3.8E1 – ALA (section 6: p. 38)

7. Assembled collections

Comments on the scope and placement of rules pertaining to assembled collections:

- concept of assembled collections distracting; rules to describe collections should also apply to assembled collections – LC (section 7: p. 30)
- provide general advice with pointers to DACS and RAD for in-depth advice – LC (section 7: p. 30)
- recognize collections of unpublished audio, moving image, and other multi-format collections as well – LC (section 7: p. 31)

General rules (A1.4C8, A1.4D9, A1.4F8, A1.5B5, A1.5D3)

- add option at A1.5B5 to follow instructions in A1.9B b) – LC (section 7: p. 30)
- delete “printed” from reference in A1.5D3 to C1.5D3 – ALA (section 7: p. 40; section 12: p. 75)
- differentiate between instructions applicable to multimedia resources and those applicable to assembled collections in A1.5A5, A1.5B5, A1.5D3, and A1.5E – LC (section 7: pp. 30-31)

Supplementary rules applicable to text (B1.1B11)

- reverse order of options in B1.1B11 – ALA (section 7: p. 40)
- reword instructions on supplying titles for collections – ALA (section 7: p. 40)

Supplementary rules applicable to print and graphic media (C1.5D3)

8. Early printed resources

Comments on the scope, placement, and application of rules pertaining to early printed resources:

- cataloguing early printed resources requires fuller and more precise transcription and technical description – ALA (section 8: p. 41)
- include most important points from DCRM(B); ensure AACR3 and DCRM(B) do not conflict – ALA (section 8: p. 41)
- define “early printed resources” to clarify scope – LC (section 8: p. 31)
- omit rules for medieval and Renaissance manuscripts; refer to DCRM(AMREMM) – LC (section 8: p. 31)

General rules (A1.4D1, A1.4G1)

- revise A1.4D1 to record name of publisher as on source; add option for fuller recording of details for early printed resources – ALA (section 8: pp. 41-42)
- remove “optionally” from instructions re early printed resources in A1.4D1; delete reference to A1.4D – LC (section 8: pp. 31-32)
- add option for early printed resources in A1.4D4 – ALA (section 8: p. 42; section 11: p. 58)
- remove “optionally” from instructions re early printed resources in A1.4G1 – LC (section 8: p. 32)

Supplementary rules applicable to print and graphic media (C1.5B2.1.19, C1.5D1.1, C1.7B13.2, C1.7B28.1)

- revise C1.5B2.1, C1.5B2.1.3, and C1.5B2.1.19 to align recording of pages, leaves, and columns – ALA (section 8: pp. 43-45; section 12: pp. 78-79)
- remove “optionally” from instructions re early printed resources in C1.5D1.1 – LC (section 8: p. 32)
- change caption on C1.7B13.2 to “early printed resources” – ALA (section 8: p. 45)
- revise C1.7B28.1 to apply to all early printed resources – ALA (section 8: p. 46)

Rules on early printed monographs from AACR2 omitted from the draft of AACR3

- reinstate AACR2 rule 2.14E at A1.0F – ALA (section 8: p. 48)
- add option for early printed resources at A1.2B1 – ALA (section 8: pp. 48-49)
- add option for early printed resources at A1.4B3 – ALA (section 8: p. 49; section 11: p. 56)
- delete third sentence from A1.4C5; revise examples; add option for early printed resources – ALA (section 8: pp. 49-50; section 11: p. 57)
- add option for early printed resources at A1.4F1 – ALA (section 8: p. 50; section 11: p. 58-59)

9. Sources of information

Comments on the generalization and reworking of rules on sources of information (A1.0A):

General

- propose revision of instructions on sources of information – LC (5JSC/LC/1)
- suggest elimination of concept of “chief source” but prescribe a source for the title proper – LC (section 9: p. 32)

- generalization of rules for source of information unsuccessful, recommend move rules to supplemental chapters in C or reorientate to types of content, medium, issuance – ALA (p. 1, section 9: p. 51)
- generalized preference for fullest source unworkable, recommend return to use of prescribed orders – ALA (p. 2)
- generalized rules on chief source problematic for electronic resources; add special instructions for digital media – BL (section 2A: p. 6)
- modify A1.0A to accommodate current practices for retrospective cataloguing of serials– CILIP (section 5: p. 11)
- remove ambiguity on when to give a note regarding the source of the title proper ACOC (section 9: p. 9)
- either delete second paragraph in A1.1B1 or reword to “if considered important” – CCC (section 2A: p. 2)
- suggest always give the chief source for electronic resources – BL (section 9: p. 16)

A1.0A2

- generalized preference for the formally presented, most complete, prominent source unworkable, recommend prescribed hierarchies or orders related to types of content, medium, and issuance in A1.0A2 – ALA (section 9: p. 51)
- suggest that each format also have its own list of sources – CILIP (section 9: p. 14)
- prefer retention of AACR2 approach for chief source of cartographic materials – CCC (section 9: p. 8)
- not practical to prefer the most complete source for CD-ROM serials – BL (section 9: p. 16)
- spell out some choices for the "most complete source" for ejournals – BL (section 9: p. 17)
- distinction between "unitary" and "collective" sources confusing – ALA (section 9: p. 51)
- situation in AACR2 1.0A3aiv does not appear to be addressed in the draft – CCC (section 9: p. 8)
- avoid circular reasoning with chief source of information and title proper, but make it clear that the source chosen must have a title – ACOC (section 9: p. 9)
- rule may be difficult to apply without explanations for "prominence," "completeness," and "formal presentation" – CCC (section 9: p. 8)
- add "generally" to A1.0A2, second sentence – CCC (section 9: p. 8)
- note that web sites frequently will have an "About" section with statement of responsibility information – CILIP (section 9: p. 14)
- refer to "information on the physical carrier" rather than "a label..." in A1.0A2iii – ACOC (section 9: p. 9)
- suggest placing footnotes into the main text – BL (section 9: p. 17)
- revise footnote 3 – ALA (section 9: p. 51)
- query use of "collective" in final paragraph, and also whether paragraph is accurate or necessary; and suggest replacement for first example – CCC (section 9: p. 8)

A1.0A3

- add "possible" before "chief source" or "source" in the heading and throughout the rule – ACOC (section 9: p. 9)
- reword caption and rule at A10A3c to refer to "component parts of a resource with no collective title"; remove word "work" – BL (section 9: p. 17)

- reword to refer to "manifestations of works" in A1.0A3c – CCC (section 9: p. 8)
- A1.0A3d should also be at A1.0A1 – BL (section 9: p. 17)

A1.0A4

- query re relationship of "other sources" to chief source of information – CCC (section 9: p. 8)

A1.0A5

- changes to A1.0A5 will require more frequent use of brackets, recommend that prescribed sources be tailored to types of content, medium and issuance – ALA (section 9: p. 51)
- use of chief source of information only for the edition area is too restrictive – CILIP (section 9: p. 14)
- query whether change to rule resulting in more edition information recorded in square brackets was intentional – CCC (section 9: p. 8)
- unclear when it is acceptable for the title page and verso to be considered together as the chief source of information for printed material – BL (section 9: p. 17)
- query why colophon is not longer a prescribed source of information in the Publication etc. area – CILIP (section 9: p. 14)

A1.0C

- following sentence in A1.0C1 unclear: "Precede or enclose each occurrence of an element of an area with standard punctuation prescribed at the head of each section of this chapter" – BL (section 9: p. 17)

A1.0G

- rule A1.0G better as part of rules on deciding what to describe and related to rules on focus of the description, problematic for unpublished collections. – ALA (section 9: p. 52)

Other

- question change in A1.2A2; add "or from other preliminaries or colophon" – CCC (section 2A: p. 2); CILIP (section 2A: p. 5)
- question relevance of instructions at A1.7B4 – CCC (section 2A: p. 3)

10. General material designation

Comments on the revision of rules on general material designation and the terms used as GMDs (A1.1C):

Placement in catalogue record:

- recommend GMDs be placed independent of any area in the bibliographic record – ALA (p. 2, section 10: p. 53); CCC (section 10: p. 9); LC (section 10, p. 32)
- note that the way the GMD is recorded may not be the way it is displayed – ACOC (section 10: p. 11)

GMD as optional:

- use of GMD should be made compulsory – ACOC (section 10: p. 10)
- make the GMD compulsory for electronic resources – BL (section 10: p. 18)

Terms used:

- each GMD should be defined in the Glossary – ALA (p. 2, section 10: p. 53); ACOC (section 10: p. 10)
- terms in each list should be mutually exclusive – ALA (p. 2, section 10: p. 53); ACOC (section 10: p. 11)
- problem with seemingly synonymous terms being included in both lists – ALA (section 10: p. 53)
- scope of each term should be clear – ALA (section 10: p. 53); ACOC (section 10: p. 10)
- recommend addition of guidance on when to use one or both types of terms – ALA (section 10: p. 53); – LC (section 10, p. 33)
- users desire to know the carrier up front, suggest three lists with a controlled vocabulary for carriers – CCC (section 10: p. 9)

Order of terms:

- suggest reverse order to medium-content – ACOC (section 10: p. 11)
- suggest medium be recorded in parenthesis after content – CCC (section 10: p. 9)
- suggest media terms be presented as adjectives for the content terms– LC (section 10, p. 32)

Online/Electronic resources:

- could a term signifying "online" be included in the medium list? – ACOC (section 10: p. 10)
- content of electronic resources will range across several of the terms, is it possible to retain "electronic resource"? – BL (section 10: p. 18)

Compatibility with other standards

- JSC needs to ensure that the GMD changes are communicated with the ISBD and MARC communities – ACOC (section 10: p. 10)

Specific GMD terms:

- **analog**: add to medium list – ALA (section 10: p. 53); where is analog? – CILIP (section 10: p. 14)
- **audio**: should be a content term – ALA (section 10: p. 53); How will this term be used? – ACOC (section 10: p. 10);
- **braille**: information is now in the technical details area, this will not make it easier for users to identify and retrieve these materials – ALA (section 10: p. 54); visually impaired users need information on braille etc. in results lists, for this community it would be preferable for the medium list to be SMDs and not GMDs – CILIP (section 10: p. 14-15); seek specific advice on impact of omission from visually impaired user community – ACOC (section 10: p. 11)
- **cartographic resource**: prefer retain "cartographic materials" – CCC (section 10: p. 9)
- **choreography**: change to "choreographic notation" – ALA (section 10: p. 54)
- **data**: meaning is unclear, restore AACR2 distinction between programs and data for digital resources – ALA (section 10: p. 54); will require definition or footnote – CCC (section 10: p. 9)

- **film**: either delete, replace with another term, or supply with an adjective to clarify meaning – ALA (section 10: p. 54); When would this term be used as opposed to "projected" and "video"? – ACOC (section 10: p. 10)
- **graphic**: either delete, replace with another term, or supply with an adjective to clarify meaning – ALA (section 10: p. 54); how would this be defined as a media? – ACOC (section 10: p. 11); suggest change content term to "visual material" – LC (section 10, p. 33)
- **manuscript**: suggest add to media terms – BL (section 10: p. 18); CCC (section 10: p. 9); unclear what to use for manuscript text, "graphic" would conflict with principle of common usage – CILIP (section 10: p. 15); add back in – LC (section 10, p. 34)
- **micrographic**: change back to microform – ALA (section 10: p. 54); CCC (section 10: p. 9); ACOC (section 10: p. 11); LC (section 10, p. 32)
- **mixed content/multimedia**: appear to be equivalent – ALA (section 10: p. 54); [see A1.1C4 below]
- **music**: change to "musical notation" – ALA (section 10: p. 54); ACOC (section 10: p. 11); or preferably, broaden scope to include all music – ACOC (section 10: p. 11)
- **print**: suggest "printed" – CILIP (section 10: p. 14); is this intended to cover hand produced resources? – ACOC (section 10: p. 11)
- **projected**: when would this term be used as opposed to "film" and "video"? – ACOC (section 10: p. 10)
- **realia**: reinstate term or use "object" – ALA (section 10: p. 55)
- **sound**: should have same meaning as general usage – ALA (section 10: p. 53); How will this term be used? – ACOC (section 10: p. 10); subtleties of "sound" versus "audio" do not help the end user – LC (section 10, p. 34)
- **three-dimensional**: not an indicator of content – ALA (section 10: p. 55); ACOC (section 10: p. 11)
- **video**: when would this term be used as opposed to "film" and "projected"? – ACOC (section 10: p. 10)

A1.1C

- suggest a different way to indicate optional nature of rule – CCC (section 10: p. 10)

A1.1C1

- no mention of sound items to be played as an integral part of a motion picture – ALA (section 10: p. 54)
- in the instruction "*sound* or *audio*, not both" the use of "or" makes the vocabulary less controlled – CCC (section 10: p. 9)
- revise first sentence of A1.1C1 to indicate that only one term from each list should be used – CCC (section 10: p. 10)
- suggest adding a second sentence to second paragraph of A1.1C1 – CCC (section 10: p. 10)
- seek specific advice on impact of removal of qualification to indicate that materials are for the visually impaired – ACOC (section 10: p. 11)

A1.1C3

- query what would be used for a printed map reproduced on a slide – ALA (section 10: p. 55)
- query whether there should be a heading for "Facsimiles and reproductions" – CCC (section 10: p. 10)

- suggest restructuring the sentence to give parenthetical examples as examples with explanatory text – CCC (section 10: p. 10)

A1.1C4

- use of other specific content and media terms should be encouraged over "mixed content" and "multimedia" wherever possible – ALA (section 10: p. 55)
- prefer "mixed content" and "multimedia" be used as a last resort – LC (section 10, p. 34)
- there is no notion of "predominant component part" in archival collection description – ALA (section 10: p. 55)
- need to state that GMD of the predominant component is to be used if there is a predominant component part – CCC (section 10: p. 10)
- query whether all large Web sites would have the GMD "[mixed content : digital]" – ALA (section 10: p. 55)

11. Publication, distribution, etc. area

Comments on the revision of rules pertaining to the publication, distribution, etc., area:

Elimination of the use of "s.l." and "s.n." (A1.4C6, A1.4D7)

- restore distinction between published and unpublished material – ACOC (section 11: p. 12); ALA (p. 2, section 11: pp. 60-62); BL [one reviewer] (section 11: p. 18); CCC (section 11: p. 10); CILIP (section 11: p. 15); LC (section 11: p. 34)
- reinstate "s.l." and "s.n." – ALA (p. 2)
- allow for English language equivalent – ACOC (section 11: p. 12); CCC (section 11: p. 10); LC (5JSC/LC/2);

Other comments on publication, distribution, etc.

- simplify rules on publication, distribution, etc. – LC (5JSC/LC/2)

A1.4A

- suggest new second sentence for A1.4A1 to allow repetition of data in area 4 that has already been recorded in other areas – ALA (section 11: p. 56)
- remove reference to "other preliminaries" in A1.4A1 – ALA (section 11: p. 56)
- query exclusion of colophon in A1.4A1 – ALA (section 11: p. 56)

A1.4B

- query exclusion of "Consider all remote access electronic resources to be published" – ALA (section 11: p. 56)

A1.4C

- query re inconsistency between A1.4C4 allowing for completion of the place of publication, but the name is not completed in the statement of responsibility area for unpublished materials – ACOC (section 11: p. 12)
- add an option to A1.4C6 to allow the cataloguer to supply the place of publication in the same language and script as the name of the publisher – ALA (section 11: p. 57)
- delete last sentence in A1.4C7 – ALA (section 11: p. 57)

A1.4D

- clarify "see" reference in A1.4D1 at end of option for early printed resources – ALA (section 11: p. 57)
- replace first sentence in A1.4D2 or make optional provision for early printed resources – ALA (section 11: p. 57-58)
- delete subparagraph d) in A1.4D4 – ALA (section 8: p. 42; section 11: p. 58)
- revise A1.4D5 to use the word "imprint" and simplify wording – ACOC (section 11: p. 12)

A1.4F

- reword A1.4F2 to allow for when the correct date is unknown – ALA (section 11, p. 59)
- revise A1.4F7 to allow use of “between ... and ...” for other ranges of dates – ALA (section 8: p. 42; section 11: p. 59)
- move last paragraph of A1.4F8 to A1.4F9 and change reference – CCC (section 11: p. 10)
- eliminate instruction not to record date for naturally occurring object – LC (section 2A: p. 17)
- add option to use 4-digit dates for decades, centuries, etc. – LC (section 2A: p. 17)

A1.4G

- incorporate A1.4G4 into A1.4G1; delete A1.4G4 – ALA (section 8: pp. 42-43; section 11, pp. 59-60)

12. Technical description area

Comments on the scope, placement, and application of rules pertaining to technical description:

General comments

- relationship between A1.5 and section C confusing – CCC (section 12: p. 11)
- delete almost all of A1.5 and refer to individual chapters, keep formats separate – CILIP (section 12, p. 15)
- see comments regarding content vs. carrier, cartographic materials and notated music – ALA (section 12, pp. 63-65)
- incorporate rules for digital media with general rules – ACOC (section 12: p. 13)
- when a rule is applicable to only one media category chapter A1 should serve primarily to contain the reference – ALA (section 12, p. 66)
- AACR3 needs to pay more attention to mixed/hybrid resources – ALA (p. 2, section 12, p. 65)
- return to unitary structure of the current SMDs, remove distinction between physical units and components – ALA (p. 2, section 12, p. 63)
- term "technical description" problematic – ALA (p. 2, section 12, p. 65)
- retain term "physical description" – BL [one reviewer] (section 12: p. 19)
- propose that area be called "Physical/Technical Description area" – CCC (section 12: p. 11)
- examples without rules in A1.5 not helpful – CCC (section 12: p. 11)

General rules on technical description (A1.5A)

- change usage of FRBR terms in A1.5A3 – ALA (section 12, p. 67)
- remove treatment of comma as prescribed punctuation in A1.5A6 – ALA (section 12, p. 67)
- comment re use of parentheses in the technical description – ALA (section 12, p. 67)

General rules on extent (A1.5B)

A1.5B1 and A1.5B2

- SMDs cannot be revised without reference to GMDs – ACOC (p. 1; section 12: p. 13)
- AACR3 should specify single SMD terms (with the option to use terms in common usage) – ALA (section 11, p. 68)
- remove distinction between physical units and components – ALA (section 12, p. 70)
- make physical units and components rules optional for cartographic materials – BL (section 12: pp. 19-20)
- cartographic and music groups prefer that "content" be placed before "carrier", and that Table 2 proceed Table 1 – CCC (section 12: p. 11)
- suggest that when the content of the material is the primary interest for users, state the "content" before indicating physical units – LC (section 12: p. 35)
- add guidance at A1.5B on when to record both physical units and components – LC (section 2A: p. 18, section 12: p. 35)
- do not use "sheets" as the first element of extent for cartographic materials, music or visual materials – LC (section 12: p. 35)
- include both physical units and components in examples only when quantities differ – LC (section 2A: p. 18, section 12: p. 35)
- allow option to sequence statement of extent according to language – LC (section 2A: p. 18, section 12: p. 35)
- query re technical description for scores – BL (section 12: p. 20)
- rules A2.5B1 and A3.5B1 contradict the general rule – ALA (section 12, p. 68)
- combine second and third paragraphs of A1.5B1 – ALA (section 12, p. 70)
- include AACR2 rule 3.5C4 – CCC (section 12: p. 11)
- suggest use content instead of component in A1.5B2, or use "form of expression" or "type of material" – LC (section 12: p. 36)
- change wording of A1.5B2 to allow use of other terms – ACOC (section 12: p. 14)
- revise A1.5B2 to include provisions from C6.5B2 and C7.5B2 – ACOC (section 12: p. 14)
- suggest that resources that combine different media in a single carrier be addressed at A1.9 as well – CCC (section 12: p. 11)
- query re use of "identical" at A1.5B2, 2nd paragraph – CCC (section 12: p. 11)
- add instructions to A1.5B2 for when it is not clear from the item in hand how many physical units the manifestation was originally published/released in – ALA (section 12, p. 70)

Table 1

- table is not exhaustive – CILIP (section 12, p. 15)
- rename as "Physical units" – LC (section 12: p. 35)
- remove "medium" from title bar in table 1 – LC (section 12: p. 35)
- **print and graphic column:**
 - add common physical units – LC (section 12: p. 35)

- broadside: should be a component not a physical unit – ALA (section 12, p. 68); remove from table 1 – LC (section 12: p. 35)
- pamphlet and sheet: query extension of terms for musical notation – ALA (section 12, p. 69)
- part: differing usage in tables 1 and 2 – ALA (section 12: p. 69)
- pieces: remove – LC (section 12: p. 35)
- sheet: differing definitions in footnotes to tables 1 and 2 – ALA (section 12: p. 69)
- **micrographic column:**
 - rename to microform – LC (section 12: p. 35); ALA (section 12, p. 69)
- **3-dimensional column:**
 - column contains several content terms – ALA (section 12, p. 68)
 - remove "art original" and "art reproduction" – LC (section 12: p. 35)
 - "art original", "art print", "art reproduction" do not reflect recognized usage – ALA (section 12, p. 68)
 - add "sculpture" "painting" and "drawing" – ALA (section 12, p. 68)
 - suggest add specific terms such as "sculpture" "pottery" "mobile" – LC (section 12: p. 35)
 - braille cassette: needs to be confirmed as a distinct physical medium – ALA (section 12, p. 68); query re meaning – CILIP (section 12, p. 15)
- **tactile column:**
 - treat tactile as an aspect of a resource, not the resource itself – ALA (section 12: p. 69)
- **recorded sound column:**
 - rename "audio" to parallel GMDs – LC (section 12: pp. 35-36)
 - add common physical container terms – LC (section 12: p. 36)
 - add "sound disc cartridge" – ALA (section 12: p. 69)
- **projected graphic, film and video column:**
 - rename to "moving image" – LC (section 12: p. 36)
 - don't create a category for "projected media" – LC (section 12: p. 36)
- **digital column:**
 - add "file" as a type of digital media – LC (section 12: p. 36); ALA (section 12, p. 68);

Table 2

- re-orient table 2 and align content terms with terms for content used in GMD – LC (section 2A: p. 18)
- rename table "Designations for content" – LC (section 12: p. 36)
- drop columns under "medium", keep rows based on "content" and use them as columns, list designations once for each "content" – LC (section 12: p. 36)
- add columns for choreography, data, software – LC (section 12: p. 36)
- Text [as a column]
 - add column(s), leaf/leaves – LC (section 12: p. 36)
- Music [as a column]
 - add column(s), leaf/leaves of music – LC (section 12: p. 36)
 - delete miniature score – LC (section 12: p. 36)
 - replace "piano [violin, etc.] conductor part" with "piano conductor part" and "violin conductor part" – LC (section 12: p. 36)
- note that in table 2 the list for text may apply to any bound item – CCC (section 12: p. 11)

- add an entries under "print and graphic" for "p. of music" and "leaves of music" – ALA (section 12: p. 69)
- projected graphic, film and video column: query terms included in cartographic row – ALA (section 12: p. 69)
- query re vocal score – ALA (section 12: p. 69)
- add scroll as SMD – ALA (section 12: p. 69)
- flip chart should be considered a component; the physical unit should be either sheet or volume – ALA (section 12: p. 69)
- omit "sheet" from table 2 and remove footnote – LC (section 12: p. 35); footnote not supported by Glossary definition – ALA (section 12: p. 69)
- add "globe" to content list for cartographic resources to align with glossary definition – ALA (section 13: p. 102)

Other A1.5B rules

- clarify instructions in A1.5B3 regarding overall duration, and add instructions for a stated playing time that is known to be incorrect – ALA (section 12, p. 70)
- suggest use "running time" rather than "playing time" at A1.5B3 – CILIP (section 12, p. 16)
- A1.5B4 not applicable to most cartographic resources; change cartographic resource example – ALA (section 12, p. 70)
- instructions in A1.5B5 re linear feet not appropriate for cartographic resources – LC (section 2A: p. 18)
- add separate paragraph under A1.5B5 incorporating conventions from DACS – LC (section 2A: p. 19)
- in A1.5B5 change "shelf space" to "storage space" – ALA (section 12, p. 70)

General rules on other technical details (A1.5C)

- prefer simple instruction in A1.5C1 rather than a list – ALA (section 12, p. 71)
- suggest sequence for list in A1.5C1 (and subsequent rearrangement and renumbering of rules in chapter A1 and Section C) – ALA (section 12, p. 71)
- suggest sequence for list in A1.5C1 – CCC (section 12: p. 11)
- do not treat closed captioning as a special format characteristic in A1.5C2 and change caption – ALA (section 12, p. 73)
- suggest that if examples in parentheses in A1.5C2 2nd paragraph are suggested terms for usage they be given in italics – CCC (section 12: p. 12)
- query whether "back to back" in A1.5C3 is intended to be used for all materials – ALA (section 12, p. 73)
- query removal of instructions for thermoform in A1.5C4 – ALA (section 12, p. 73)
- suggest that "manuscript" be added as an example of a production method at A1.5C4 – CCC (section 12: p. 12)
- reconcile discrepancy between A1.5C5 and C6.7B13.1.d – ALA (section 12, p. 73)
- make recording of medium in area 5 optional – LC (section 2A: p. 19)
- reconcile manuscript examples at A1.5C6 and C1.5D1.4 – ACOC (section 12: p. 15)
- add guidance to A1.5C7 on what type of material is typical for a type of manifestation – ALA (section 12, p. 74)
- rule A1.5C9 may be better suited in section B – ALA (section 12, p. 74)
- revise A1.5C9 to make it clear that it applies to resources that are not primarily images – ACOC (section 12: p. 15)
- combine A1.5C9.2 and A1.5C10 – ALA (section 12, p. 74)

- incorporate A1.5C9.2 into A1.5C10 – ACOC (section 12: p. 15)
- reword A1.5C10 to include resources which are primarily images then delete supplementary rules – ACOC (section 12: p. 15)
- delete second sentence of A1.5C10 if new rule B3.5C10 is agreed – ALA (section 12, p. 74)
- note re A1.5C10, placement of colour in order of technical details produces varying results – CCC (section 12: p. 12)
- allow option in A1.5C10 to spell out the abbreviation "col." – LC (section 12: p. 37)
- clarify A1.5C11, paragraph 3 – ALA (section 12, p. 74)
- move A1.5C11.1 to third paragraph of A1.5C11, change wording – ALA (section 12, p. 74)

General rules on dimensions (A1.5D)

- add instruction to indicate which dimension is being given if considered important – LC (section 2A: p. 19)
- add “materials under archival control” and add option not to record dimensions for those materials – LC (section 2A: p. 19)

General rules on ancillary material (A1.5E)

- restore "accompanying material" – ALA (section 12, p. 75); LC (section 12: p. 37)
- clarify scope of A1.5E1, 3rd paragraph – ALA (section 12, p. 75)
- delete A1.5E4 – ALA (section 12, p. 75)
- incorporate A1.5E4 into A1.5E1 – ACOC (section 12: p. 15)

Supplementary rules applicable to specific types of media (Section C)

- add specific instructions to apply rules from more than one chapter in section C when describing digital media – ALA (section 12, pp. 75-76)
- repeat general instruction to give the number of physical units, or the number of components, or both in each supplementary chapter in section C – ALA (section 12, p. 77)

Supplementary rules applicable to print and graphic media (C1.5)

- rewrite chapter C1 with more feedback from manuscript cataloguers – LC (section 12: p. 37)
- make explicit that "pages, leaves, etc" in C1.5B2 means "bearing text, images, etc." – CILIP (section 12, p. 16)
- question use of “volumes, etc.” in C1.5B2.1 – ACOC (section 2C: p. 7)
- suggest that C1.5B2.1.1 reflect the default that everything is one volume unless stated otherwise – CILIP (section 12, p. 16)
- add to C1.5B2 appropriate examples for significant types of material – ALA (section 12, p. 77)
- add to C1.5B2.1.6 the option to record "1 v. (unpaged)" – ALA (section 12, p. 77)
- rules C1.5B1 and C1.5B2.1.8 (re updating loose-leafs) are equivalent; eliminate redundancy – ACOC (section 2C: p. 7)
- investigate duplication between C1.5B2.1.8 and A3.8E1 – CILIP (section 12, p. 15)
- rewrite C1.5B2.1.8 – ALA (section 12, p. 77)
- add instruction and example to C1.5B2.1.11 – ALA (section 12, p. 77)
- clarify C1.5B2.1.16 – ALA (section 12, p. 77)

- revise wording of C1.5B2.2, C1.5B2.2.1, C1.5B2.2.2, C1.5B2.2.3, and C1.5B2.1.4 – LC (section 2C: pp. 25-26)
- query re expanding terms in common usage to content – ALA (section 12, p. 79)
- revise C1.5B2.4 to cover case when all segments appear on one sheet – ALA (section 12, p. 79)
- delete C1.5B2.5; refer to specialist manuals – LC (section 2C: p. 27)
- revise C1.5B2.4 – ALA (section 12, p. 79)
- differentiate between large print and giant print at C1.5C4 – CILIP (section 2C: p. 8)
- reconcile C1.5C4.1 with C1.7B1.1 – CCC (section 2C: p. 6)
- examine inconsistency in identification of "black and white" – ALA (section 12, p. 80)
- question use of "b&w" for cartographic resources at C1.5C10.1 – CCC (section 2C: p. 5)
- change "Early printed books" to "Early printed resources" in the option in C1.5D1.1 – ALA (section 12, p. 80)
- move instructions on extent statement from last paragraph of C1.5D1.3 to C1.5B1 and C1.5B2.1; reconcile C1.5D1.3 with footnote to Table 1 – ALA (section 12, p. 80)
- extend C1.5D1.3.1 to paintings and photographs – ALA (section 12, p. 80)
- add additional instructions at C1.5D1.4 – ALA (section 12, p. 80)
- remove "on" from "on sheet" in C1.5D1.4.4 – ALA (section 12, p. 80)
- add appropriate instructions for the size of maps at C1.5D1.4.5, C1.5D1.4.6, C1.5D3.1 – ALA (section 12, p. 80)

Supplementary rules applicable to micrographic media (C2.5)

- rule C2.5B2 covered by general rule – ACOC (section 12: p. 14)
- delete C2.5C10.1 (contrary to general rule) – ACOC (section 12: p. 15)
- rephrase C2.5C10.1 – ALA (section 12, p. 80)
- increase consistency between C1.5D1, C2.5D1 and C4.5D1 – ALA (section 12, p. 80)
- delete second sentence of C2.5D1 – CILIP (section 2C: p. 8)

Supplementary rules applicable to tactile media (C3.5)

Supplementary rules applicable to three-dimensional media (C4.5)

- increase consistency between C1.5D1, C2.5D1 and C4.5D1 – ALA (section 12, p. 80)

Supplementary rules applicable to audio media (C5.5)

- question use of "m. per sec." at C5.5C11.2 – CCC (section 2C: p. 6)
- do not treat "stereo" as an abbreviation at C5.5C11.6, and omit full stop – ALA (section 12, p. 81)
- add "surround" at C5.5C11.6 – CCC (section 2C: p. 6)
- change "quad" to "surround" at C5.5C11.6 – ALA (section 12, p. 81)
- add "SACD" and "DVD" at C5.5C11.7 – CCC (section 2C: p. 6)

Supplementary rules applicable to projected graphic, film, and video media (C6.5)

- add instructions re subtitles, close captioning, audio description, etc. under C6.5 – CILIP (section 2C: p. 8)
- query re application of rules on transparencies at C6.5B2 – ALA (section 12, p. 81)

- suggest use of "running time" rather than "playing time" at C6.5B3 – CILIP (section 12, p. 16)
- C6.5B3 and C6.5B2.4 covered by A1.5B3 – ACOC (section 12: p. 14)
- add instruction to C6.5C10 for when information is not succinct – ALA (section 12, p. 81)
- omit sentence from C6.5C11.1 on "silent speed" – ALA (section 12, p. 82)
- change last sentence of C6.5C12.2 – ALA (section 12, p. 82)
- query why dimensions of a stereograph are not recorded at C6.5D1.4 – ALA (section 12, p. 82)

Supplementary rules applicable to digital media (C7.5)

- additional information is required on recording the extent and other technical characteristics of digital resources that parallel print or graphic counterparts – ACOC (section 12: p. 15)
- include naming conventions for remote resources in C7.5B1– ALA (section 12, p. 82)
- optional provision in rule C7.5B2 covered by general rule – ACOC (section 12: p. 14)
- include explicit instructions at C7.5B2 and C7.5B3 on components and playing time – ALA (section 12, p. 82)
- widen option at C7.5B2 – ALA (section 12, p. 82)
- revise C7.5B2 to reflect 9.5B4 – ALA (section 12, p. 82)
- expand end of C7.5C13.1 to give an example of what would be considered important – CILIP (section 12, p. 16)

Potential for further generalization of rules on technical description (e.g., X.5C10)

- expand A1.5B1, and eliminate A2.5B1 and A3.5B1 – ACOC (section 12: p. 13)
- generalize C6.5B2 and C7.5B2 – ACOC (section 12: p. 14)
- A1.5BC encompasses C6.5B2.4 and C6.5B3, include appropriate examples – ACOC (section 12: p. 14)
- incorporate C7.5B1 in A1.5B1 – ACOC (section 12: p. 13)

13. Note area

Comments on the scope, placement, and application of rules pertaining to notes:

Comments on general rules on notes

A1.7A

- add text to A1.7A1 (or Introduction) to state the function of notes – ALA (section 13: p. 86)
- add at A1.7 statement about optionality of notes – ALA (section 13: p. 87)
- break up notes rules with separate headers – ALA (section 13: p. 87)
- expand A1.7A3 to cover integrating resources – ALA (section 13: p. 83)
- synchronize A1.7A3 and A1.7A4 – ALA (section 13: p. 87)
- make subrules with bold captions in A1.7A3 and A1.7A4 separately numbered – ALA (section 13: p. 87)
- add sentence at A1.7A3 "Order of information" – ALA (section 13: p. 87)

- add explicit instruction about hyphens to A1.7A3 "Quotations" – ALA (section 13: p. 88)
- rephrase A1.7A4, including clarification of "If this is not possible" – CILIP (section 13: p. 17)
- use part II terminology instead of "entered" at A1.7A4, 2nd paragraph – CCC (section 13: p. 12)
- move final paragraph of A1.7A4 to A1.7B – ALA (section 13: p. 87); delete second sentence as given at A1.7B26 – ALA (section 13: p. 88)

A1.7B

- reword rule on order of notes at A1.7B – ALA (section 13: p. 88)

A1.7B1

- revise A1.7B1 and add subrules to for materials under archival control (based on DACS) – LC (section 13: pp. 37-38)

A1.7B2/A2.7B2

- change wording at A1.7B2 and A2.7B2 to cover multipart monographs – ALA (section 13: p. 83)

A1.7B4

- reword A1.7B4 – ALA (section 13: p. 83)

A1.7B5

- restore to A1.7B5 text from 12.7B4.1, or change A2.7B5 – ALA (section 13: pp. 83-84); reword rule and caption – ALA (section 13: p. 88)

A1.7B8

- move much of A1.7B8 to part III, other portions apply to A1.7B9 – LC (section 13: p. 39)
- reinstate to first sentence of A1.7B8 "for identification" – ALA (section 13: p. 88)

A1.7B9

- split A1.7B9 into separate rules – ALA (section 13: pp. 88-89); LC (section 13: p. 39)
- add instructions to A1.7B9 for materials under archival control (based on DACS) – LC (section 13: p. 39)
- query re usage of "name" of another resource in A1.7B9a-d – ALA (section 13: p. 89)
- expand A1.7B9a to include making a note about a sequel to the resource being describes, and to include prequels – ALA (section 13: p. 89)
- add at A1.7B9b "if known" or "if readily available" – ALA (section 13: p. 89)
- clarify at A1.7B9c "numerous editions" – ALA (section 13: p. 89)
- resolve duplicative wording between A1.7B9d and A1.7B14 and add references – ALA (section 13: p. 84)

A1.7B10

- change caption of A1.7B10 to clarify coverage, query reference to A1.7B28 – ALA (section 13: p. 89)

A1.7B13

- make Duration a subrule at A1.7B13 and make linkage/connection to A1.5B3 – CCC (section 13: p. 12)
- clarify difference between A1.7B13 and A1.7B15 – ALA (section 13: p. 89)
- suggest transcribe duration in A1.7B13 in HH:MM:SS format (and relevant X.7B21 rules) – ALA (section 13: p. 89-90; p. 92; p. 93)

A1.7B14

- add text to A1.7B14 – ALA (section 13: p. 84)
- move 2nd paragraph of A1.7B14 to chapter A2 – ALA (section 13: p. 84); change in 2nd paragraph of A1.7B14 "a regular feature" to "a recurring feature" – ALA (section 13: p. 90)

A1.7B15

- include at A1.7B15 an instruction to identify equipment that is beyond what is normal and obvious for the medium – ALA (section 13: p. 90)

A1.7B16

- address issue of URLs at A1.7B16 – ACOC (section 13: p. 16)

A1.7B18

- replace "formal thesis statement" at A1.7B18 with "statement declaring the resource is a thesis" – LC (section 13: p. 39)

A1.7B19

- reword A1.7B19 – ALA (section 13: p. 90)

A1.7B20

- review instructions in A1.7B20 for a resource "that consists entirely or predominantly of music" – CILIP (section 13: p. 17); suggest rewording for "music" – ALA (section 13: p. 90)
- include in A1.7B20 instruction to add a summary for accessible materials – CILIP (section 13: p. 17)
- suggest add to end of A1.7B20 "if considered to be important" – ALA (section 13: p. 90)
- add new rule for Awards – ALA (section 13: pp. 90-91)

A1.7B21

- change instructions at A1.7B21 on recording titles formally – ACOC (section 13: p. 16); ALA (section 13: p. 85)
- add a general instruction to A1.7B21 on other information to be recorded – ALA (section 13: p. 85)
- add to A1.7B21 or A2.7B21 "Do not give contents notes for monographic series" – ALA (section 13: p. 85)

A1.7B22

- add general guidance on when notes are included in the shareable part of the bibliographic description (e.g. A1.7B22, A1.7B28, A1.7B29, A1.7B30) – ACOC (section 13: pp. 18)

- clarify scope of A1.7B22 – CILIP (section 13: p. 17)
- separate A1.7B22 into separate rules – ALA (section 13: p. 91)
- make A1.7B22 unequivocal re indexes – CILIP (section 13: p. 17)

A1.7B23

- expand A1.7B23 – ALA (section 13: p. 91)

A1.7B24

- add text from DACS to A1.7B24 – LC (section 13: p. 39)
- state explicitly at A1.7B24 punctuation for consecutive numbers – ALA (section 13: p. 91)

A1.7B26

- add text from DACS to A1.7B26 – LC (section 13: p. 39)
- use "original manifestation" in A1.7B26 caption and text, delete reference to A1.7A4 – ALA (section 13: p. 91)

A1.7B27

- revise A1.7B27 first paragraph to reflect terms at A1.0A1 – CCC (section 13: p. 12); remove reference to multipart monographs from A1.7B27 (already covered) – BL (section 13: p. 21)
- move first part of A1.7B27 to chapters A2 and A3 – ALA (section 13: pp. 84-85)
- query whether instructions at A1.7B27 for remote access resources should be moved to C7.7 – ALA (section 13: p. 85)

A1.7B28

- delete second paragraph of A1.7B28 as holdings outside scope – ALA (section 13: p. 91)
- add instructions to A1.7B28 for other local notes – ALA (section 13: p. 91)

A1.7B29

- split A1.7B29 into two notes and add text from DACS – LC (section 13: p. 40); split A1.7B29 into two paragraphs – ALA (section 13: pp. 91-92)
- insert new rule on "appraisal and accrual notes" – LC (section 13: p. 40)

A1.7B30

- specify in A1.7B30 whether restrictions are universally applicable or only local – ALA (section 13: p. 92)
- split A1.7B30 into separate paragraphs and add text based on DACS – LC (section 13: p. 40-41)

Potential for further generalization of rules on notes (e.g., X.7B21)

- move to A1.7B3 notes related to closed captions – ALA (section 13: p. 85)
- expand A1.7B9 to cover provisions in B6.7B9 and B7.7B9 – ACOC (section 13: p. 16)
- concern re split between A1.7B9 and A2.7B9 and A3.7B9 – ALA (section 13: p. 85)
- include at A1.7B15 text of C7.7B15 – ACOC (section 13: p. 16)
- expand A1.7B21 to cover provisions in B4.7B21 and B6.7B21; add a paragraph adapted from B3.7B21 – ACOC (section 13: p. 16)

- concern re split between A1.7B22 and A2.722 – ALA (section 13: p. 86)
- expand A1.7B24 to cover provisions in B2.7B24 and B6.7B24 – ACOC (section 13: pp. 16-17)
- query whether A1.7B25 covers 12.7B22– ALA (section 13: p. 86)

Other comments on notes

BX.7

- clarify B2.7B3 by replacing "language of vocal texts" with "textual content of the resource" – ALA (section 13: p. 92)
- add to end of B3.7B1 "unless it is apparent from the rest of the description" – ALA (section 13: p. 92)
- change at B3.7B2 "frequency varies" to "frequency of updates varies" – ALA (section 13: p. 92)
- split B3.7B11 into two subrules and revise text – ALA (section 13: p. 92)
- revise B6.7B1 to limit to recorded music – ALA (section 13: p. 92)
- restore 6.7B2 as B6.7B3 – ALA (section 13: p. 92)
- add more guidance to B6.7B21 – ALA (section 13: p. 93)

CX.7

- add rules to chapter C5 and C6 for systems requirements – ALA (section 13: p. 93)
- clarify the usage of "ms." in C1.7B1.1 and C1.5C4.1 – ALA (section 13: p. 93)
- move all or part of C1.7B1.1 to chapter B1 – ALA (section 13: p. 94)
- add "or devised" to C1.7B5.1 – ALA (section 13: p. 94)
- combine C1.7B13.5 with C1.5D1.3.1 – ALA (section 13: p. 94)
- query scope of C1.7B13.6 and suggest change to caption – ALA (section 13: p. 94)
- move C2.7B13b to a systems requirements note – ALA (section 13: p. 94)
- change caption of C2.7B13c to indicate type of information recorded – ALA (section 13: p. 94)
- add instructions on "analog in origin, digital enhanced sound" to C5.7B – CILIP (section 12, p. 16)
- change C6.7B13.1.d to record polarity information in the technical description – ALA (section 12, p. 73); reconcile C6.7B13.1d with A1.5C5 – ALA (section 13: p. 94)
- change caption of C6.7B13.3c to "Television system", change SECAM example and add examples of three major television systems – ALA (section 13: p. 94)
- add wording "if considered to be important" to first part of C7.7B13 – ALA (section 13: p. 95)
- delete "that is only available by remote access" from first sentence of C7.7B13 – ALA (section 13: p. 95)
- clarify C7.7B14 vs. C7.5A1 – ALA (section 13: p. 95)
- revise C7.7B15 to require only type of computer and name of operating system with others as optional – LC (section 13: p. 41)
- use 2nd paragraph of C7.5C13.1.2 as a general rule for .5C for all chapters of C that have specific rules at .7B13 – CCC (section 13: p. 12)

14. Glossary

Comments on the terms and definitions included in the glossary:

General

- add definitions for all GMDs – ACOC (section 14: p. 18); ALA (section 14: p. 96); LC (section 14: p. 41)
- investigate references to physical manifestations – ALA (section 14: p. 96)
- minimize the number of technical definitions – ALA (section 14: p. 96)
- include terms for both the resource as a whole and a resource excluding its ancillary material – ALA (section 14: p. 96)

Comments on specific terms:

- **Access point:** replace "identified" with "retrieved" – ALA (section 14: p. 96)
- **Added title page:** phrase does not occur in AACR3 part 1 – ALA (section 14: p. 96)
- **Aggregate resource:** address Web sites; use semicolons instead of colons – ALA (section 14: pp. 96-97)
- **Alternative title:** revise second clause to " ... the parts are often joined by ..." – ALA (section 14: p. 97)
- **Ancillary material:** prefer "Accompanying material" – ALA (section 14: p. 97)
- **Architectural rendering:** remove "before it has been built" – ALA (section 14: p. 97)
- **Art print:** add "block or screen" – ALA (section 14: p. 97)
- **Art reproduction:** change "electronically" to "digitally" – ALA (section 14: p. 97)
- **Assembled collection:** revise based on recommendation from SAA – ALA (section 14: p. 97); revise to make plain that it covers distributed collections – CILIP (section 14: p. 18); revise wording – LC (section 14: p. 41)
- **Atlas:** query scope and second sentence – ALA (section 14: p. 97); prefer AACR2 definition – LC (section 14: p. 41)
- **Audio:** add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18)
- **Audio description:** add definition – CILIP (section 14: p. 18)
- **Audio media:** clarify if MP3 files belong here or with digital media; put turntables last in list of examples; rewrite definition with clear, simple language – ALA (section 14: pp. 97-98); note that MP3 format not mentioned – CILIP (section 14: p. 18)
- **Bibliographic description:** add definition – CCC (section 14: p. 12)
- **Binder's title:** revise definition – ALA (section 14: p. 98)
- **Braille cassette:** add definition? – CILIP (section 14: p. 18)
- **Caption title:** revise definition – LC (section 14: p. 41)
- **Cartographic resource:** query inclusion of "or any imaginary place" – ALA (section 14: p. 98)
- **Case:** query use of "material" instead of "resource" – ALA (section 14: p. 98)
- **Catalog number (Sound recordings):** add see reference to "Label number" (new) – LC (section 14: p. 41)
- **Chinese style:** reference to "Oriental" may be considered offensive – ALA (section 14: p. 98)
- **Choreography:** add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18); LC (section 14: p. 41)
- **Chorus part:** add definition, wording suggested – LC (section 14: p. 42)
- **Chorus score:** revise wording – LC (section 14: p. 42)

- **Close captioning:** add definition– CILIP (section 14: p. 18)
- **Collection:** add definition, wording suggested, with see also reference to "Assembled collection" – LC (section 14: p. 41)
- **Collective title:** add second sentence – ALA (section 14: p. 98)
- **Coloured illustration:** remove closing parenthesis – ALA (section 14: p. 98); fix typo – LC (section 14: p. 42)
- **Component:** revise definition – ALA (section 14: p. 98); use an alternative term for the technical description – BL (section 14: p. 22); revise definition – LC (section 14: p. 42)
- **Component part:** clarify definition – ALA (section 14: p. 98)
- **Condensed score:** revise definition – LC (section 14: p. 42)
- **Container:** query use of "material" instead of "resource" – ALA (section 14: p. 99)
- **Content:** add definition– ALA (section 14: p. 99); LC (section 14: p. 42)
- **Continuing resources:** include multipart monographs – ALA (section 14: p. 99)
- **Copy:** consult CC:DA Task Force on FRBR Terminology response to draft of Part 1 – ALA (section 14: p. 99)
- **Data:** add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18); CCC (section 14: p. 12)
- **Dependent supplement:** add definition– ALA (section 14: p. 99); CILIP (section 14: p. 18)
- **Devised title:** query distinction between this and supplied titles [divided opinion] – ALA (section 14: p. 99)
- **Digital:** add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18)
- **Digital media:** rewrite definition with clear, simple language – ALA (section 14: p. 99); revise definition LC (section 14: p. 42)
- **Digital resource:** query whether "computer resource" or "computer-based" resource would be less ambiguous; query whether digital is appropriate for data and programs – ALA (section 14: p. 100)
- **Direct access (Digital resources):** use "digital resources" rather than "computer files"; clarify definition vs. "Remote access (Digital resources)" – ALA (section 14: p. 100)
- **Disc (Analog resources):** add see reference to "Sound disc" (new) – ALA (section 14: p. 100)
- **Disc (Digital resources):** add see also reference to "Sound disc" (new) – ALA (section 14: p. 100)
- **Double leaf:** reference to "Oriental" may be considered offensive – ALA (section 14: p. 100)
- **Early printed resource:** add definition– LC (section 14: p. 42)
- **Edition:** consult CC:DA Task Force on FRBR Terminology response to draft of Part 1 – ALA (section 14: p. 100)
- **Edition (Intangible resources):** query inclusion in Glossary – ALA (section 14: p. 100)
- **Edition (Tangible resources):** concern re loss of final sentence from AACR2 – ALA (section 14: p. 101)
- **Electronic resource:** add see reference to "Digital resource" – ALA (section 14: p. 98)
- **Entry:** query whether this definition is required – ALA (section 14: p. 101)
- **Explicit:** delete from Glossary – ALA (section 14: p. 101)
- **Extent:** query whether definition should include mention of file size – ALA (section 14: p. 101)

- **Fascicle:** use "formal component unit" instead of "formal constituent unit" – ALA (section 14: p. 101); revise last sentence – LC (section 14: p. 42)
- **File (Digital resources):** query whether 2nd sentence belongs at entry for "Digital resource" – ALA (section 14: p. 101)
- **Film:** add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18)
- **Filmstrip:** add definition– ALA (section 14: p. 101)
- **Filmstrip:** revise definition – ALA (section 14: p. 101)
- **Finding aids:** add definition– CCC (section 14: p. 13)
- **Focus:** add definition – LC (section 2A: p. 14); ALA (section 3: p. 26)
- **Focus for the description:** if used in rules, add definition – ALA (section 14: p. 101)
- **Format:** illustrate difference between this and "Medium"; revise to cover digital materials; add a see also reference to "Manifestation" – ALA (section 14: p. 101)
- **General material designation:** revise to indicate that GMD may be a composite term – ACOC (section 14: p. 18); replace "or" with "and" – ALA (section 14: p. 101); revise definition – LC (section 14: p. 42)
- **Globe:** revise definition; query inclusion of "or any imaginary place" – ALA (section 14: p. 102)
- **Half-title:** query extending concept to frames, screens, etc. – ALA (section 14: p. 102)
- **Incipit:** delete from Glossary – ALA (section 14: p. 101)
- **"In" analytic:** add definition– CCC (section 14: p. 13)
- **Integrating resource:** revise definition to include concept of replacement volume – ALA (section 14: p. 102)
- **Issue number (Sound recordings):** add see reference to "Label number" (new) – LC (section 14: p. 42)
- **Item:** consult CC:DA Task Force on FRBR Terminology response to draft of Part 1 – ALA (section 14: p. 102)
- **Japanese style:** reference to "Oriental" may be considered offensive – ALA (section 14: p. 102)
- **Key-title:** omit hyphen and include "continuing" before "resource" – ALA (section 14: p. 102)
- **Kit:** query omission – CILIP (section 2A: p. 6)
- **Label:** add definition based on AACR2 footnote in 6.0B1 – ALA (section 14: p. 102)
- **Label number:** add definition, wording suggested – LC (section 14: p. 42)
- **Libretto:** add definition, wording suggested – LC (section 14: p. 43)
- **Light box:** add definition– ALA (section 14: p. 109)
- **Machine-readable data file:** query if reference still required – ALA (section 14: p. 102)
- **Manifestation:** include that physical embodiments may include "intangible resources" – ALA (section 14: p. 103); add FRBR definition – LC (section 14: p. 43)
- **Manuscript:** clarify difference between "manuscript" and "unpublished" – ALA (section 14: p. 103); revise definition – LC (section 14: p. 43)
- **Map:** query inclusion of "or any imaginary place" – ALA (section 14: p. 103)
- **Map series:** add definition, wording suggested– ALA (section 14: p. 103)
- **Medium:** query meaning of "print" in example; expand definition – ALA (section 14: p. 103); add definition (as used in GMDs) – LC (section 14: p. 43)
- **Microform:** include need for magnification device – ALA (section 14: p. 103)

- **Micrographic:** if term is used in the rules add definition – ALA (section 14: p. 104); add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18); add definition– BL (section 14: p. 22)
- **Miniature score:** reconcile with footnote at C1.5B2.2.3 – ALA (section 14: p. 104); revise to say "*See Score*" – LC (section 14: p. 43)
- **Mixed content:** add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18)
- **Model:** remove "of a real thing" – ALA (section 14: p. 104)
- **Moon:** [tactile alphabet] add definition– CILIP (section 14: p. 18)
- **Moving image:** add definition(GMD), wording suggested – ALA (section 14: p. 104); add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18)
- **Multilevel description:** add definition– ALA (section 14: p. 104); CCC (section 14: p. 13)
- **Multimedia:** add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18)
- **Multimedia resource:** refer to first definition under "Medium"; query application of definition – ALA (section 14: p. 104); add definition (are conveyed in different media) – LC (section 14: p. 43)
- **Multipart monograph:** replace "within more than one but" with "in" – ALA (section 14: p. 104)
- **Multipart resource:** query whether definition includes serials, if so add to definition – ALA (section 14: p. 104)
- **Music:** revise parenthetical definition of "musical notation"; expand definition beyond usage as GMD – ALA (section 14: p. 105); change "Braille" to "braille" – CCC (section 14: p. 13)
- **Musical presentation statement:** query inclusion of "or musical"; query if "physical" is necessary; query inclusion of "source of information" and added clause – ALA (section 14: p. 105); rename "Musical format statement" and revise – LC (section 14: p. 43)
- **Nonprocessed sound recording:** include "field recording" – LC (section 14: p. 43)
- **Numbering:** reservations re extension to all multipart resources; revise second sentence – ALA (section 14: p. 105)
- **Optical disc (Digital resources):** include "DVD-ROM"; add see also references to "Sound disc" (new) – ALA (section 14: p. 105)
- **Other title information:** use "manifestation" rather than "resource" – ALA (section 14: p. 105)
- **Overhead projectural:** use "Overhead projector" and define it – ALA (section 14: p. 105)
- **Pamphlet:** exclude music in a notated form; query use of "independent"; query second definition – ALA (section 14: p. 105); make definition more helpful – CILIP (section 14: p. 18); revise first definition, add closing period to second definition – LC (section 14: p. 43)
- **Part:** clarify "one of two or more physical units" in definition 2; change term used to distinguish fascicles from parts; query whether definition 2 is related to individual library binding policies; use "formal component unit" instead of "formal constituent unit" – ALA (section 14: p. 106); change form of see also reference to second definition of "Issue" – CCC (section 14: p. 13); new definition required? – LC (section 14: p. 43)
- **Part (Music):** revise definition – LC (section 14: p. 43)
- **Photograph:** add definition, wording suggested – LC (section 14: p. 43)
- **Physical unit:** add definition– CCC (section 14: p. 13)

- **Piano (violin, etc.) conductor part:** delete and replace with two separate entries, wording suggested – LC (section 14: p. 43)
- **Piano reduction:** add see reference to "Piano score" – LC (section 14: p. 43)
- **Piano score:** expand definition to include all non-vocal "piano reductions" – ALA (section 14: p. 106); revise definition – LC (section 14: p. 43)
- **Piece:** notes also used in rules for pieces of a game; query whether "physical" is required" – ALA (section 14: p. 106)
- **Plate number (Music):** revise definition – LC (section 14: p. 44)
- **Preliminaries:** change comma to semicolons in three phrases; query extension of concept to other media besides printed books – ALA (section 14: p. 107)
- **Print/Printed:** add definition– ALA (section 14: p. 107); add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18)
- **Projected:** add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18)
- **Prominent:** add definition– ALA (section 14: p. 107)
- **Published:** add definition– ALA (section 14: p. 107)
- **Publisher:** add definition– BL (section 14: p. 22)
- **Publisher's number (music):** revise definition – LC (section 14: p. 44)
- **Publisher's stock number (sound recordings):** add see reference to "Label number" (new) – LC (section 14: p. 44)
- **Recto:** query re Anglo-centric bias in definition 2 – ALA (section 14: p. 107)
- **Reduced score:** add see reference to "Condensed score" – LC (section 14: p. 44)
- **Reference source:** use "resource" instead of "source" – ALA (section 14: p. 107)
- **Replacement volume set:** add definition, wording suggested – ALA (section 14: p. 107)
- **Reproduction:** add definition; or find better term – LC (section 14: p. 44)
- **Resource:** see comments – ALA (section 14: p. 108)
- **Resource, Digital:** query whether inverted see reference is necessary – ALA (section 14: p. 108)
- **Score:** revise definition – LC (section 14: p. 44)
- **Section (Cartography):** revise wording – ALA (section 14: p. 107)
- **Set of music materials:** add definition, wording suggested – LC (section 14: p. 44)
- **Sheet:** exclude music in notated form from definition; include broadside – ALA (section 14: p. 108); revise definition – LC (section 14: p. 44)
- **Single-part resource:** add definition– ALA (section 3: p. 27); LC (section 14: p. 44)
- **Study score:** add see reference to "Score" – LC (section 14: p. 44)
- **Sleeve:** revise wording – ALA (section 14: p. 108)
- **Software:** add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18)
- **Sound:** add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18)
- **Sound disc:** add definition– ALA (section 14: p. 108)
- **Sound recording:** include a cross reference to "Non-processed sound recording" – ALA (section 14: p. 108)
- **Specific material designation:** query limitation to physical unit – ALA (section 14: p. 108)
- **Standard number:** delete "uniquely" – ALA (section 14: p. 108)
- **Statement of responsibility:** use "manifestation" instead of "resource" – ALA (section 14: p. 108); extend to cover situation provided for by A1.1F14 – CILIP (section 14: p. 18)
- **Study score:** add see reference to "Score" – LC (section 14: p. 44)
- **Supplied title:** revise initial phrase – ALA (section 14: p. 108)

- **Tactile:** add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18)
- **Tactile media:** revise definition – ALA (section 14: p. 108); change "for use by the visually impaired" to "for use by visually impaired people" – CILIP (section 14: p. 18); add period to end of definition – CCC (section 14: p. 13)
- **Technical description:** add definition– ALA (section 14: p. 109)
- **Text:** broaden definition – ALA (section 14: p. 109); revise definition 2 – LC (section 14: p. 44)
- **Three-dimensional:** add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18)
- **Tinted:** add definition– ALA (section 14: p. 109)
- **Title frame:** query whether title has to be included – ALA (section 14: p. 109)
- **Title page:** clarify that analytical title page is part of the definition – ALA (section 14: p. 109)
- **Traditional format (Oriental books):** reference to "Oriental" may be considered offensive – ALA (section 14: p. 109)
- **Trailer:** delete "to be released at a later date" – ALA (section 14: p. 109)
- **Unit:** add definition, wording suggested – LC (section 14: p. 44)
- **Unpublished:** add definition– ALA (section 14: p. 107)
- **Verso:** query re Anglo-centric bias in definition 2 – ALA (section 14: p. 109)
- **Video:** add definition (GMD) – ACOC (section 14: p. 18)
- **Video media:** rewrite definition with clear, simple language – ALA (section 14: p. 109)
- **Violin conductor part:** add definition, wording suggested – LC (section 14: p. 44)
- **Vocal score:** revise definition – LC (section 14: p. 44)
- **Volume:** query electronic multipart resources coming under definition 1 only; rewording of definition 2 – ALA (section 14: pp. 109-110)
- **Work:** add definition – ACOC (section 14: p. 18); ALA (section 14: p. 110; CILIP (section 14: p. 18); BL (section 14: p. 22); add FRBR definition – LC (section 14: p. 44)

Other comments on terminology

- no use of the term metadata – ALA (section 1A: p. 6)
- avoid creation of additional jargon – LC (section 1A: p. 12)
- restrict use of the term “publication” – ALA (section 1A: p. 6)
- regularize synonymous terms for “unpublished” (e.g., “non-processed”, “unedited”) – LC (section 4: pp. 28-29)
- change “entry”/“entries” to “bibliographic description”/“bibliographic descriptions” in A1.0D and A1.0L – CCC (section 2A: p. 1)
- acknowledge different use of term “multilevel description” in archival description – LC (section 2A: p. 20)
- inconsistent use of terms “facsimile”, etc. – ALA (section 1A: p. 6)
- clarify meaning of “artefacts that are not intended primarily for communication” – ALA (section 4: p. 29)
- question varying use of “carrier” and “physical carrier” – ALA (section 1A: p. 7)
- prefer “accompanying material” to “ancillary material” – ALA (section 1A: p. 7); LC (section 2A: p. 19)
- question use of adjectival vs. other forms for chapter headings in section B – ALA (section 2B: p. 20)
- question use of “image” in scope notes referring to cartographic resources – ALA (section 2C: p. 23)

- question use of “printed” vs. “print” – ALA (section 2C: p. 23); CILIP (section 2C: p. 8)
- question use of the term “graphic” to refer to both content and media – LC (section 2C: p. 26)
- question significance of change from microform to micrographic – ALA (section 1A: p. 6; section 2C: p. 23)
- question suitability of the term “tactile material” – ALA (section 1A: p. 6)
- use of “early printed books, etc.” vs. “early printed resources” – ALA (section 1A: p. 7)
- reinstate use of “realia” – ALA (section 2B: p. 22)
- clarify meaning of “pertaining” in A1.0A1 c) – CILIP (section 5: p.11)
- question appropriateness of the term “preliminary rules” at A1.0 – BL (section 3: p. 11)
- question appropriateness of the term “supplementary instructions” – ALA (section 1A: p. 6)
- use “collections” rather than “assembled collections” – LC (section 7: p. 30)
- prefer “assembled collections” to “artificial collections” – LC (section 7: p. 30)
- substitute “storage space” for “shelf space” in A1.5B5 – ALA (section 7: p. 40; section 12: p. 70)
- question use of “resource” in footnote 1 to A1.5B5 – ALA (section 7: p. 40)
- use of “component” needs to be clarified – ALA (section 12: p. 66)
- consider usage of “the library” in A1.7B10 and other rules – CILIP (section 13: p. 17)

15. Style

Comments on matters of style:

See the following:

5JSC/AACR3/I/ACOC response – section 15: p. 19

5JSC/AACR3/I/ALA response – section 15: pp. 111-113

5JSC/AACR3/I/BL response – section 15: p. 22-23

5JSC/AACR3/I/CCC response – section 15: pp. 13-25

5JSC/AACR3/I/CILIP response – section 15: pp. 18-19

5JSC/AACR3/I/LC response – section 15: p. 45

Additional comments relating to style noted in other sections of the constituency responses are listed below:

Numbering scheme

- avoid double use of capital letters in numbering scheme – CILIP (section 2: p. 4)
- numbering conventions for the rules need to be simpler – LC (section 17: p. 46)

Tables of contents for chapters and areas

Captioning of subrules

References to related and supplementary rules

- multiplicity of references from a single rule (e.g., at A1.0D2) defeat goal of simplicity – LC (section 2A: p. 14)

- eliminate references from rules A1.0D1 and A1.0D2 to specific rules for elements of description – ALA (section 2A: p. 15)
- delete references from A1.0F8 to A2.1B1 and A3.1B1 – LC (section 2A: p. 15)
- question need for references between A1.0G, A1.1G1, and A1.1G2 (section 2A: p. 15)
- replace references to A1.0F in A1.1B1, A1.1D1, A1.1E1, etc. with references to appendices A-C.
- add reference from A1.1G to A1.1B11 – CCC (section 2A: p. 2)
- appropriate wording of references from A1.2B1 and A1.2B3 to rules in chapters A2 and A3 – ALA (section 2A: p. 16)
- add reference from A2.8 to A1.8 – CILIP (section 2A: p. 7)
- make references from rules to introduction (e.g., section on focus of the description) – BL (section 3: p. 10)
- clarify reference in second paragraph of A1.4C8 – ALA (section 4: p. 28)
- add a reference from A3.5B1 to C1.5B2.1.8 – CCC (section 6: p. 7)
- change reference in A1.5D3 to C1.5D3 from “see” to “see also” – ALA (section 7: p. 40; section 12: p. 75)
- add a reference at A1.4F7 to A2.4F1 and A3.4F1 – ALA (section 11: p. 59)
- make specific the reference from A1.5C3 to C1.5C3 – ALA (section 12, p. 73)
- make specific the reference from A1.5C4 to C1.5C4 – ALA (section 12, p. 73)
- add reference from A1.5C8 to new rule B3.5C8 – ALA (section 12, p. 74)
- add reference from A1.5C10 to new rule B3.5C10 – ALA (section 12, p. 74)
- add reference from C1.5C10.1 to new rule B3.5C10 – ALA (section 12, p. 80)
- add reference from C2.5C10.1 to new rule B3.5C10 – ALA (section 12, p. 81)
- add reference from C3.5B to other chapters for the statement of extent – ALA (section 12, p. 81)
- add reference from C3.5C10 to new rule B3.5C10 – ALA (section 12, p. 81)
- add reference from C4.5C10 to new rule B3.5C10 – ALA (section 12, p. 81)
- remove reference to subrules at C6.5B2 – ALA (section 12, p. 81)
- add reference from C6.5C10.1 to new rule B3.5C10 – ALA (section 12, p. 82)
- change reference at A1.7B11 from "see also" to "see" – ALA (section 13: p. 89)
- change reference at A1.7B28 from "early printed books, etc." to "early printed resources" – ALA (section 13: p. 91)

Clarity of instructions

- formal, academic writing style of introduction difficult to read and understand – ALA (section 3: p. 26)
- break up A1.1B11 into several shorter paragraphs – ALA (section 4: p. 28)

16. Typographical and grammatical errors, etc.

Please reference errors, etc., in the form: [page number] - [rule number] - [paragraph or example number]

See the following:

- 5JSC/AACR3/I/ACOC response – section 16: p. 19
- 5JSC/AACR3/I/ALA response – section 16: pp. 114-119
- 5JSC/AACR3/I/BL response – section 16: p. 23
- 5JSC/AACR3/I/CCC response – section 16: pp. 25-27

5JSC/AACR3/I/CILIP response – section 16: p. 19

5JSC/AACR3/I/LC response – Editorial. etc., table

17. Comments on the introduction to part I

Additional comments relating to the introduction to part I noted in other sections of the constituency responses are listed below:

- rewording of section on “scope” – ALA (section 2: p. 12); BL (section 3: pp. 9-10)
- rewording of section on “organization of the rules” – BL (section 3: p. 10)
- add explanation of taxonomy and scope of supplementary chapters – ALA (section 2: p. 12)
- clarify that where there are gaps in rule numbering in sections B and C, the general rule in section A should be applied – CCC (section 2: p. 1)
- rewording of section on “applying general and supplementary rules” – BL (section 3: p. 10)
- add instruction to apply more specific rule rather than the general rule – ALA (section 2: p. 12)
- add instruction to apply rules from more than one supplementary chapter if applicable – ALA (section 2: p. 12)
- add instructions on precedence of rules for describing multi-media materials – ALA (section 2: p. 12)
- add instructions on to review scope of chapter before applying supplementary rules – ALA (section 2: p. 13)
- rewording of section on “resources in an unpublished form” – BL (section 3: p. 11)
- rewording of section on “options and omissions” – BL (section 3: p. 11)
- question reference in section on “options and omissions” to mandatory notes; no indication of mandatory notes in rules – ALA (section 2: p. 13)

18. Other comments on Section A

See the following:

5JSC/AACR3/I/ALA response – section 17: pp. 120-129

Additional comments relating to section A noted in other sections of the constituency responses are listed below:

- delete reference to metric symbols from A1.0C – CILIP (section 3: p. 9)
- rules on levels of detail of description need to be revised in light of recent initiatives to define core data elements – ACOC (section 2A: p. 4); LC (section 2A: p. 15; p. 16, A1.1D2-A1.1D3)
- question instructions on adding diacritics in A1.0F2 – CILIP (section 2A: p. 5)
- reword A1.1B4 – CILIP (section 2A: p. 5)
- incorporate first part of A1.1B6 into A1.1B4; provide guidance on determining what is “intended” to be part of the title – CILIP (section 2A: p. 5)
- is guidance needed in A1.1B6 on what is considered a “long” title proper – CILIP (section 2A: p. 5)
- propose revision of A1.1B11 – LC (5JSC/LC/1)
- add “or devised” to last sentence of first paragraph in A1.1B11 – CCC (section 2A: p. 2)

- incorporate instructions on bracketed statements of responsibility into first paragraph of A1.1F1 – BL (section 2A: p. 6)
- add option to A1.1F1 allowing recording of “creator” information in a note instead of in statement of responsibility – LC (section 2A: p. 16)
- simplify A1.1G by deleting A1.1G1 and A1.1G3 – LC (section 2A: p. 17)
- remove instructions re optional use of edition area from A1.2A1; record information about known changes from other editions in a note – LC (section 2A: p. 17)
- combine instructions in A1.2B1 into a single sentence – CILIP (section 2A: p. 5)
- rewrite A1.2B2 to provide instructions on application of A1.0F6 to edition statements – CILIP (section 2A: p. 5)
- add instructions on recording edition statements that are inseparable from the title (AACR2 2.15B) – CCC (section 2A: p. 2)
- delete conflicting instructions re numbering for facsimiles at A1.3A3 – LC (5JSC/LC/1)
- delete second paragraph of A1.6B2; clarify relationship to A1.1B7 – CCC (section 2A: p. 3)
- reconsider instructions re “new series”, etc., in A1.6H3 – CILIP (section 2A: p. 6)
- add “key title” to caption for A1.8 – ACOC (section 2A: p. 5)
- add instructions at A1.8B1 re ISSN for electronic serials; clarify relationship between guidelines for assigning ISSNs and rules requiring a new description – CILIP (section 2A: p. 6)
- reword A1.8B1 to include “any internationally recognized standard number” – LC (section 2A: p. 19)
- add instructions to A1.8B2 to apply to the description of a single part of a multipart resource – BL (section 2A: p. 7)
- add option in A1.9B2 to use “case” or “kit” in extent, with further option to describe components in a note – CILIP (section 2A: p. 6)

19. Other comments on Section B

See the following:

5JSC/AACR3/I/ALA response – section 18: pp. 133-136

Additional comments relating to section B noted in other sections of the constituency responses are listed below:

- revise wording of B2.1B1 – LC (section 2B: p. 21)
- revise wording of B2.1D1 – LC (section 2B: p. 21)
- revise wording of B2.7B1 – LC (section 2B: p. 21)

20. Other comments on Section C

Additional comments relating to section C noted in other sections of the constituency responses are listed below:

- continue to use “ca.” as an abbreviation; add to note in C1.7B13.6 – LC (section 2C: p. 27)

21. Comments on Examples

See the following:

5JSC/AACR3/I/ACOC response – Additional comments: Examples: p. 19

5JSC/AACR3/I/ALA rep response

5JSC/AACR3/I/CCC response – Appendix: pp. 27-28

5JSC/AACR3/I/CILIP response – Appendix: pp. 19-22

5JSC/AACR3/I/LC response – Suggestions to forward to the Task Force on Examples

Additional comments relating to examples noted in other sections of the constituency responses are listed below:

- include examples under A1.0A1 – BL (section 3: p. 11)
- reinstate at A1.0F7 example from AACR2 rule – BL (section 9: p. 18)
- move examples in A1.4F8 to follow first paragraph – ALA (section 4: p. 29)
- suggest example in format "3:26" at A1.5B3 after discussion with music cataloguing community – LC (section 12: p. 36)
- add/change examples at A1.7B1, A1.7B9, A1.7B24, A1.7B26, A1.7B29, A1.7B30 for materials under archival control (if changes to rules approved) – LC (section 13: pp. 37-41)
- move second example at A1.7B17 to A2.7B17.2 – BL (section 13: p. 21)
- present examples in A2.7B9 to reflect OPAC displays – CILIP (section 5: p. 12)
- question wording of examples in A3.7B5.1 – ALA (section 6: p. 38)
- change example in C1.5.B2.2.1 – ALA (section 12: p. 79)
- examples at C1.5B2.2.3 and C1.5D1.2 inconsistent – ALA (section 12: p. 79)
- change format of examples at C1.5D1.4.5, C1.5D1.4.6, C1.5D3.1 – ALA (section 12, p. 80)
- move woodcuts example in C1.7B13.2 to second set of examples in second half of rule – ALA (section 8: p. 45)
- revise woodcuts example in C1.7B13.2; use “v” instead of “b” – ALA (section 8: pp. 45-46)
- correct superscripts in examples in C1.7B13.2 – ALA (section 8: p. 45); LC (section 8: p. 32)
- question use of comma in examples in C1.7B13.2 – LC (section 8: p. 32)
- delete second example in C1.7B13.2 – LC (section 8: p. 32)