Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
1	**Objectives and principles**						
2	**A. Scope, structure, terminology, etc.**						
3	**Objectives:**						
4	**Comprehensiveness**						
5	rules still too tied to print/published resources; not enough attention to multi-format collections	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree1A, p. 13
6	rules insufficient for most archival collections; need more references to RAD, DACS, etc.	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/3
7	delete rules from AACR2 chapter 4; replace with rules from RAD, DACS, etc.	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/3
8	**Consistency**						
9	level of treatment for archival collections needs to be consistent with level of treatment for published resources	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/3
10	need for consistency in identifying all optional rules	query	1A: p. 4	agree	Agree	agree	agree ; also see line 84
11	**Clarity**						
12	use direct style, "plain English"	agree	agree	p. 1	Agree	agree	agree
13	rules need to be introduced and presented in simpler language; less reliance on understanding technical meaning of terms and glossary definitions	agree	agree	agree	Agree	p. 1	agree
14	summarize essentials of rule before presenting detail	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree 1A: p. 8
15	use more lists, tables, etc.	agree	agree	p.1	Agree	agree	agree 1A: p. 8
16	harmonize library terminology with archival terminology, etc.	agree	agree - clarification is needed when terms mean diff. things in diff. communities.	agree, with clarification where needed	Agree	agree in principle, but may not be practical?	agree 1A: p. 8
17	**Rationality**						

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
18	add a "purpose" section for each information element	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree (Editor is doing)1A: p. 8
19	question varying instructions re language of cataloguer's interpolations	request discussion. Lines 19, 302 & 370 relate	1A: p. 4	discuss	Agree	discuss	discuss
20	propose record cataloguer's interpolations in language of cataloguing agency	query	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	agree 2A: p. 15
21	**Currency**						
22	need to eliminate library jargon and model presentation and terminology on current metadata standards used in other communities	agree	1A: p. 4	agree	Agree	agree	agree 1A: p. 9
23	need more aggressive changes that respond to web catalogues and future capabilities	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree p. 1
24	delete rules from AACR2 chapter 4; replace with rules from RAD, DACS, etc.	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/3
25	delete rules for obsolete materials	disagree. Only delete rules for materials not held in libraries	ok to delete filmstrip example for A1.5C11 - make sure rules cover all materials in principle		Disagree	agree	agree, they should follow the general rule and not need special rule pp. 3-4; 1A: p. 9
26	**Compatibility**						
27	cite complementary content standards; enable linking	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree p. 2; 1A: p. 10

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
28	allow options for normalizing punctuation, abbreviations, capitalization, measurements, etc.	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Disagree	discuss	agree p. 3; 1A: p. 10; 17: agree p. 45
29	develop a crosswalk to MARC		request discussion	discuss	Outside scope	disagree	1A: p. 10
30	reconsider use of non-metric vs. metric conventions for representative fractions used in statements of scale	request discussion	request discussion	2B: p. 8	Disagree	discuss	discuss
31	**Adaptability**						
32	highlight need for adaptability to new and emerging technologies and formats	agree	1A: p. 5	agree	Agree	agree	agree
33	clarify intended meaning of "user communities"	agree	1A: p. 5	agree	Agree	agree	agree
34	adaptability constrained by complexity of rules; simplify	request discussion. LC1 and LC2 relate.	agree in principle, needs discussion	agree in principle, needs discussion on degree of simplification	Being discussed	agree	agree 1A: p. 11
35	**Ease and efficiency of use**						
36	present rules in a language easily understood by cataloguing staff at all levels as well as other potential users	request discussion	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree p. 2
37	use more natural language and presentations that facilitate comprehension (e.g., tables)	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree 1A: p. 13
38	include more examples using images (reproductions of title pages, screen shots of OPACS, etc.)	agree	agree	agree	Agree	p. 1	agree
39	reduce rules to essentials; mark rules to facilitate display of a subset of "concise" rules in online format	request discussion	agree	discuss	Being discussed	agree	agree p. 2; see 5JSC/LC/2 as example
40	need some form of outline "practitioner's" view of the rules [issue for publishers not Editor]	request discussion	agree	agree	Agree	p. 1	discuss with Web requirements

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
41	provide an AACR2-AACR3 concordance and list of major changes	agree	agree	agree	Agree	p. 1	agree p. 2; 17: p. 46; Attachment 2
42	rules not well designed for those cataloguing materials under archival control	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/3
43	relocate rules on sources of information, punctuation, etc.	-	-	-	-	-	agree see 5JSC/LC /1/Rev
44	**Format**						
45	rules must be produced as a Web-based tool with retrieval and navigational capabilities	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agreep. 1
46	need to address accessibility for persons with disabilities [issue for publishers not Editor]	agree	agree	agree	Agree	1A: p. 3	agree
47							
48	**Principles:**						
49	**Specificity**						
50	supplement general rules with specific detailed guidelines derived from DCRBM, DACS, RAD, CONSER, etc.	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Disagree	discuss; cf 27	See 5JSC/LC/3; p. 1
51	add references to manuals of interpretation and other specialized content standards	1A: p. 2	agree	agree in principle	Agree	agree - but this assumes they will exist at the time we're writing RDA	agree
52	**Non-redundancy**						

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
53	repetitions remain (e.g., instructions on facsimiles and reproductions, punctuation)	agree, being addressed as part of new structure?	1A: p. 6	agree	Being discussed	agree	agree
54	**Terminology**						
55	avoid use of "version" if FRBR term or "resource" appropriate	agree	1A: p. 6	agree	Agree	agree	agree
56	**Reference structure**						
57	reference structure unwieldy in print format	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree 1A: p. 12
58	inconsistency in references back to A1.0F	agree	1A: p. 8	agree	Agree	agree	agree
59							
60	**B. Functional Requirements**						
61	**Objectives:**						
62	**Responsiveness to user needs**						
63	reconsider impact of removing GMDs for materials for visually impaired users	10, pp. 10-11. Also relates to CILIP comment at line 349	request discussion	discuss	Agree	discuss	to TF on type & form of content/ carrier
64	**Cost efficiency**						
65	clarify intent of objective	agree	1B: p. 8	agree	Agree	agree	agree
66	proposed changes not sufficient to improve productivity enough to offset costs of implementation	request discussion	disagree - we've already addressed this concern	being discussed	Being discussed	disagree	agree 1A: p. 13
67	added cost of measuring each map on a sheet not justified	request discussion	1B: p. 8	agree	Being discussed	agree	agree
68	**Suggestions for additional functional objectives**						
69	flexibility (i.e., use of records in different environments)	agree/ request discussion	1B: p. 8	agree	Agree	agree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
70	harmony (i.e., compatibility with existing records and catalogues)	agree/ request discussion	1B: p. 8	agree	Agree	agree	agree
71							
72	**Principles:**						
73	**Differentiation**						
74	state requirement to uniquely identify the resource described at the beginning of the rules	agree. Line 186 relates	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree 1B: p. 13
75	tension between manifestation-level and item-level description	request discussion. Also relates to line 745	agree	agree	Request discussion	1A: p. 3	add notes for item elements, per ch. 6 and ch. 5
76	**Sufficiency**						
77	delete rules that instruct cataloguer to omit information (e.g., dimensions of slides)	agree	request discussion	discuss	Agree	agree	agree 1B: p. 13
78	**Relationships**						
79	consider options for handling notes on relationships differently in the future	agree	request discussion	agree	Agree	discuss	agree (to cover in Pt. II?) 1B: p. 13
80	**Representation**						
81	apply principle of transcribing "what you see" for titles, statements of responsibility, edition statements, imprint, series statements, and contents notes	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Disagree	disagree	agree p. 3; 1B: p. 14
82	**Uniformity**						
83	should not require uniformity where not required to support user tasks	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree 1B: p. 14
84	need to establish principles governing optional instructions	request discussion. See also ACOC rep 1	1B: p. 9	agree	Agree	agree	agree (see line 10)
85	**Common usage**						
86	difficulties related to "common usage" (e.g., inconsistency, variability over time)	agree	1B: p. 9	agree	Agree	agree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
87	need clarification and validation of terms used as GMDs	10: pp. 10-11	agree	TF to do	Agree - GMD/SMD	agree	TF assignment
88	problematic use of "graphic" ["graphic" is not common usage for visual materials in the US]	agree	agree	agree - TF	Agree - GMD/SMD	agree	agree 1B: p. 14
89	distinction between physical units and components in rules on extent violate principle of common usage	request discussion	request discussion	agree	Agree - GMD/SMD	agree	agree 2A: p. 17
90							
91	**General comments**						
92	**General Introduction**						
93	spell out audience, scope, relationship to other standards in general introduction	agree	1A: p. 3	agree	Agree	agree	agree
94	explicit statement of compatibility needed in general introduction	1A: p. 2	1A: p. 4	agree	Agree	agree	agree
95	explain concept of continuing resources and seriality in general introduction	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree 1A: p. 10
96	explain purpose and function of catalogues in general introduction	request discussion about appropriate place to record this	request discussionagree with ACOC comment	agree	Agree	1B: p. 4	agree
97	need to cover non-roman scripts and romanization in general introduction	agree	1B: p. 9	agree	Agree	agree	agree
98							
99	**Resources in an unpublished form**						
100	add copyright definition to section on "resources in an unpublished form" in the introduction to part I	agree	agree	agree	4: p. 7	agree	agree (or handle with forthcoming Disc. Paper self-descr./not self-descr.

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
101	question re description of palimpsests and other manuscripts with works/redactions physically overlaid on one another	no opinion. Depends on level of simplificatio n for RDA	request discussion - too specific for inclusion in RDA	discuss	No opinion	4: p. 9	See LC's Archival rule proposal?
102	delete all rules in B1; obsolete	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/3
103							
104	**Integrating resources**						
105	merge rules from chapter A3 with rules in chapter A1	agree	agree	agree	Agree*	agree	agree6: p. 29
106	include replacement volume sets within the scope of chapter A3	agree	6: p. 37	agree	Agree*	agree	agree6: p. 29
107							
108	**Assembled collections**						
109	concept of assembled collections distracting; rules to describe collections should also apply to assembled collections	request discussion. Uncertain what other type of collections LC is referring to.	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	agree 7: p. 30
110	provide general advice with pointers to DACS and RAD for in-depth advice	request discussion	agree	agree	Agree	agree	See 5JSC/LC/3; 7: p. 30
111	recognize collections of unpublished audio, moving image, and other multi-format collections as well	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	See 5JSC/LC/3; 7: p. 31
112	differentiate between instructions applicable to multimedia resources and those applicable to assembled collections in A1.5A5, A1.5B5, A1.5D3, and A1.5E	request discussion	agree	agree	Agree	agree	See 5JSC/LC/3; 7: pp. 30-31
113							
114	**Early printed resources**						

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
115	cataloguing early printed resources requires fuller and more precise transcription and technical description	agree	8: p. 41	agree	Agree	disagree with basic point - but agree 116 which may produce same end result	disagree (local decision/levels of descr)
116	include most important points from DCRM(B); ensure AACR3 and DCRM(B) do not conflict	agree	8: p. 41	agree	Agree	agree	agree (would help to identify asap to negotiate with the SCRM(B) folks in July 2005)
117	define "early printed resources" to clarify scope	request discussion. Lines 117, 545, 682, 786, 890, 1049 are related	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree	agree8: p. 31

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
118	omit rules for medieval and Renaissance manuscripts; refer to DCRM(AMREMM)	agree	agree	disagree - agree with CILIP	Agree	disagree - cover at basic level, as for other ms/archive stuff, but refer outside for detailed guidance	agree8: p. 31
119							
120	**Comments by Rule**						
121	**Introduction to part I**						
122	rewording of section on "scope"	agree. Also relates to line 141	2: p. 12	agree	Agree	agree	agree
123	rewording of section on "scope"	agree	ALA supports approach in LC1rev instead	3: pp. 9-10	Agree	agree	agree
124	rewording of section on "scope"	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree Ed. table
125	rewording of section on "organization of the rules"	agree, new structure address?	already covered in reorg of RDA	3: p. 10	Agree*	agree	agree
126	rewording of section on "organization of the rules"	agree	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree	agree Ed. table

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
127	add explanation of taxonomy and scope of supplementary chapters	being addressed as part of new structure	2: p. 12	n/a	Agree*	n/a	not applicable with restructured RDA
128	add instruction to apply more specific rule rather than the general rule	request discussion: apply both, specific if differ	2: p. 12	agree	Agree	agree, if still relevant	not applicable with restructured RDA
129	add instructions on precedence of rules for describing multi-media materials	request discussion: prefer to avoid contradictory rules	2: p. 12	agree	Agree	agree, if still relevant	disagree
130	add instructions to review scope before applying supplementary rules	agree	2: p. 13	agree	Agree	agree	not applicable with restructured RDA
131	rewording of section on "resources in an unpublished form"	agree	agree	3: p. 11	Agree	agree	See forthcoming LC Disc. Paper on Self-describ./not self-descr.
132	rewording of section on "options and omissions"	superceded	agree	3: p. 11	Agree*	agree, if still relevant	not applicable with restructured RDA

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
133	question reference in section on "options and omissions" to mandatory notes; no indication of mandatory notes in rules	agree. Relates to ACOC rep 1	2: p. 13	agree	Agree	agree	agree
134							
135	**Preliminary rules**						
136	revisions to A1.0A1-A1.0A5	-	-	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
137	clarify meaning of "pertaining" in A1.0A1 c)	agree	agree	agree	Agree*	5: p.11	agree
138	reword A2.0A1	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agreeEd. table
139	reword sentence on metric unit symbols in A1.0C	agree	17, p. 120	agree	Agree	agree	agree
140	revise A1.0D to have two levels	being addressed	being addressed	discuss	Being discussed	agree	agree (ACOC proposal) 2A: p. 15
141	change "entry"/"entries" to "bibliographic description"/"bibliographic descriptions" in A1.0D and A1.0L	A1.0D see ACOC rep 1. A1.0L agree. Also relates to line 122	agree	agree	2A: p. 1	agree	agree
142	eliminate references from rules A1.0D1 and A1.0D2 to specific rules for elements of description	agree. Relate to ACOC rep 1	2A: p. 15	agree	Agree*	agree	agree
143	multiplicity of references from a single rule (e.g., at A1.0D2) defeat goal of simplicity	request discussion	request discussion	defer to Web spec	Agree*	agree	defer to Web specs 2A: p. 14

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
144	reinstate AACR2 rule 2.14E at A1.0F	request discussion	8: p. 47-48	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	disagree except as for a.e.; prefer to transcribe what you see for the statement and make added access for "corrected" text - keep instructions as suggestions for added access pts.
145	delete A1.0F2 (at odds with principle of representation)	agree, but request discussion of affect on retrieval	17, p. 121	discuss	Request discussion	disagree	agree; take what you see; need Unicode agreements on what characters to treat as same
146	question instructions on adding diacritics in A1.0F2	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	2A: p. 5	disagree
147	potential problems in generalizing A1.0F7 rule for letters or words intended to be read more than once	request discussion	17, p. 121	discuss	Agree	agree	disagree; transcribe what you see; liberal a.e.'s

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
148	regularize convention for correcting inaccuracies in A1.0F8	2A: p. 4	request discussion	discuss	Agree	discuss	disagree; transcribe what you see; liberal a.e.'s
149	replace references to A1.0F in A1.1B1, A1.1D1, A1.1E1, etc. with references to appendices A-C.	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree 2A: p. 16
150	delete A1.0G; A1.0J, A1.0K, A1.0L	-	-	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
151	reconsider placement of rules A1.0G-A1.0L	2 , p.4	request discussion	3, p.11	Agree	agree	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
152	overlap with focus of the description, A1.0G	2, p.4	2, p. 15	3, p.11	Agree	agree	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
153	question need for references between A1.0G, A1.1G1, and A1.1G2	request discussion	2A: p. 15	agree	Agree*	agree	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
154	regularize use of terms "facsimile(s)" and "reproduction(s)" in A1.0J and elsewhere	agree	17, p. 121	agree	Agree	agree	agree, see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
155	question scope and placement (prominence) of rules for reproductions A1.0J, A1.2A3, A1.3A3, A1.4A2, A1.5A4, A1.6A2, A1.8A2	agree	17, p. 122	agree	Agree*	agree	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
156							
157	**Title and statement of responsibility**						
158	reword instruction in A1.1A1	agree	16: p. 115	agree	Agree-CCC wording (p. 20)	agree	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
159							
160	**Title proper**						

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
161	limit application of A2.1B1 to serials only	disagree	request discussion	discuss	Agree	2A: p. 7	agree to allow exception for serials (would prefer to renegotiate, but too difficult)
162	question the application of exceptional treatment of inaccuracies (A3.1B1) to integrating resources	agree	2A: p. 20	agree	Agree	agree	agree
163	revise wording of B2.1B1	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree 2B: p. 21
164	can delete A1.1B2 if add punctuation instruction for alternative title to A1.1A2 (i.e. new App.) and capitalization instruction to that App.	agree	agree	agree	Agree*	agree	agree Ed. table at A1.1A2 (modified)
165	delete A1.1B3	-	-	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC /1/Rev
166	reword A1.1B4	agree	agree	agree	Agree	2A: p. 5	agree (to be covered by new structure)
167	add "in case of doubt" clause in A1.1B6 [was A1.1B5]	request discussion. Needs to also be related to A1.7B5 variations in title proper	17, p. 123	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
168	incorporate first part of A1.1B6 into A1.1B4	request discussion	agree	discuss	Request discussion	2A p.5	discuss

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
169	provide guidance in A1.1B6 on determining what is "intended" to be part of the title	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	2A: p. 5	discuss
170	is guidance needed in A1.1B6 on what is considered a "long" title proper	disagree. Prefer not to specify	request discussion	discuss	Disagree	2A: p. 5	discuss
171	potential conflict between A1.1B6 and A1.1B2 as a result of generalizing instructions on abridgement from AACR2 rule on early printed books	request discussion	2A: p. 15	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
172	add in A2.1B6 "title" to list of elements that can be omitted [in very specific circumstances]	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	5: p. 11	discuss
173	delete A1.1B7	-	-	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
174	prominence on title page needs to be a factor in application of A1.1B7	request discussion. Current wording does include layout	17, p. 123	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
175	potential confusion between application of A1.1B8 and A1.3A1	no opinion	2A: p. 15	agree	Agree*	agree	agree with exception for cartographic per April discussion
176	reword instruction in A1.1B8	agree	16: p. 115	agree	Agree*	agree	agree (if keep)
177	repeat at A1.1B8 instruction and example from A1.6H3	agree	agree	agree	Agree*	agree	agreeEd. table
178	change "unnumbered series" in second line of A2.1B8 to "unnumbered monographic series"	agree	agree	agree	Agree*	agree	agree Ed. table

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
179	A1.1B10 problematic placement of rules for resources without a collective title	request discussion to also cover supplied titles which may be collective titles	2A: p. 16	agree	Agree*	agree	agree; does this go away with new structure?
180	rules for resources without a collective title (A1.1B10) differ from ISBD	request discussion	2A: p. 16	discuss	Agree*	discuss	discuss
181	propose revision of A1.1B11	-	-	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
182	reword A1.1B11 to apply to resources lacking a title proper rather than resources lacking a chief source of information	agree	prefer ALA approach on line 183	2A: p. 6	Agree	agree	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
183	reword A1.1B11 to apply to resources lacking a title proper rather than resources lacking a chief source of information	agree	4: p. 28;	agree	Agree	agree	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
184	provide instruction in A1.1B11 for making a note such as "title [supplied/devised] by cataloguer"	request discussion. Prefer to alays include	4: p. 28	agree	Agree	agree	discuss (also LC's archival rule proposal)
185	break up A1.1B11 into several shorter paragraphs	agree	4: p. 28	agree	Agree	agree	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
186	additional instructions needed in A1.1B11 to ensure devised title is sufficiently distinctive; alternatively add instructions in section B	agree. Line 74 relates	agree	agree	Agree	2A: p. 5	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
187	reverse order of options in B1.1B11	no opinion	4: p. 29; 7: p. 40	no opinion	No opinion	agree	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
188	reword instructions in B1.1B11 on supplying titles for collections using similar wording to A1.1B11	agree	4: p. 29; 7: p. 40	agree	Agree	agree	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
189	delete B1.1B11, B2.1B11, B3.1B11, B4.1B11, B6.1B11, B7.1B11	-	-	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
190	generalize B4.1B11	2A: p. 4	2B: p. 22	agree	2B: p. 4	agree	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
191	reword A2.1B12a	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree Ed table
192							
193	**Parallel titles**						
194	revise wording of B2.1D1	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree2B: p. 21
195	revise A1.1D2 : In a second-level description always give the first parallel title and optionally, the other parallel titles without regard to whether title proper and first parallel title are in a nonroman script	being discussed as part of ACOC rep 1	-	discuss	Being discussed	agree	agree 2A: p. 16
196	revise A1.1D3:: Record the parallel title as a parallel title even when there is no text in the language of the parallel title	being discussed as part of ACOC rep 1	-	discuss	Being discussed	agree	agree 2A: p. 16
197	add "if considered to be important" to A1.1D5	agree	17, p. 123	agree	Agree	agree	agree
198	reword A3.1D6, etc., to clarify applicability of "if considered to be important"	agree	6: p. 37	agree	Agree	agree	agree
199							
200	**Other title information**						
201	A2.1E1 and A3.1E1 duplicate rules in A1.1	2A; p. 5	taken care of in new arrangement	agree	Agree*	agree	agree ; covered by new strcuture of RDA
202	expand A1.1E to provide for the treatment of other title information relating to currency	2A; p. 5	request discussion	discuss	Disagree	disagree	discuss (also with line 204, 206, and 207)
203	restrict application of A2.1E1 to serials	agree	request discussion	5: p. 13	Agree	agree	agree to serials (& integrating resources) as exception

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
204	divide A2.1E1 into sections for serials and multipart monographs	agree	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree	agree Ed. table
205	make provisions in A2.1E1 for recording other title information optional except for category a)	agree	5: p. 31	discuss	Disagree	agree	disagree - this is addressed by levels of description; ties in with the harmonization work with ISBD(CR)
206	question rationale for A3.1E1 c); apply A1.7B1 instead	agree	6: p. 37	discuss	Disagree	agree	discuss
207	reword third paragraph of A3.1E1	agree	6: pp. 37-38	discuss	Disagree	agree	discuss
208	add instructions for trailers to B7.1E6	request discussion. Agree in principle, but note that such a title is in effect a controlled access point	17, p. 135	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
209	revise A3.1E7 to allow deletion of other title information when a change occurs	agree	6: p. 38	agree	Agree	agree	agree
210							
211	**Statements of responsibility**						
212	incorporate instructions on bracketed statements of responsibility into first paragraph of A1.1F1	agree	ALA supports approach in LC1rev instead	2A: p. 6	Agree	agree	agree (covered in new RDA structure?)

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
213	add option to A1.1F1 allowing recording of "creator" information in a note instead of in statement of responsibility	request discussion	request discussion	agree	Request discussion	agree	agree (or as access pt with relator term) 2A: p. 16
214	revise first sentence of A1.1F1	query	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree	agree Ed. table
215	add rule B4.1F1, reinstate from AACR2	agree	17, p. 134	discuss	Agree	discuss	discuss - can it be generalized?
216	delete rule B5.1F1, and move examples to A1.1F1	2B: p, 5	agree	agree	2B: p. 4	agree	agree
217	reinstate provision at B6.1F1 regarding persons or bodies with a major role in creating the intellectual content	agree	17, p. 135	agree	Agree	agree	agree
218	revise wording of B6.1F1	query. Can't relate wording in table to rule	agree	agree	Disagree	agree	Ed. table
219	regularize use of terms "motion picture", "videorecording" and "film" in B7.1F1 and elsewhere	agree	17, p. 135	agree	Agree	agree	agree
220	arbitrary 'rule of three' reflected in A1.1F5	2A: p. 5	1A: p. 4	agree	2A: p. 2	agree	agree
221	delete instruction in A1.1F5 to add "et. al." following mark of omission in statements of responsibility	agree	depends on rule of 3 as option discussion	agree	Agree	agree	agree 2A: p. 16
222	rules A1.1F12 and A1.1F13 too complex for use by metadata providers	request discussion. Need A1.1F12, consider deleting A1.1F13 as why not record it?	17: p. 124	discuss	Agree	discuss	discuss

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
223	reword A1.1F13	if retained, agree with suggestion for wording at p. 124 of ALA	16: p. 115	agree	Agree	discuss	discuss
224	revise A1.1F14	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/3
225	reword A2.1F16	agree	5: p. 31	agree to reword	Disagree	agree	agree
226	give separate instructions at A2.1F16 to match A2.1B12	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree Ed. table
227							
228	**Resources without a collective title**						
229	generalize AACR2 rule 3.1G5 under A1.1G	request discussion on order of rules on collective titles	2A: p. 16	agree	Agree	agree	agree (also LC proposal)
230	if 3.1G5 not generalized under A1.1G, incorporate as supplementary rule at B3.1G2	request discussion on order of rules on collective titles	2B: p. 21	disagree	Disagree	disagree	not applicable with new RDA structure
231	add reference from A1.1G to A1.1B11	agree	request discussion	agree	2A: p. 2	agree	see 5JSC/LC /1/Rev
232	simplify A1.1G by deleting A1.1G1 and A1.1G3	request discussion on best way to simplify	request discussion	discuss	Agree	discuss	agree 2A: p. 17

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
233	change instruction in A1.1G2 from two spaces to one space	agree	request discussion - remove all punctuation references	agree	Agree	agree	agree Ed. table
234							
235	**Edition information**						
236	remove instructions re optional use of edition area from A1.2A1; record information about known changes from other editions in a note	agree. Address later if needed in raltion to expression identifier	request discussion - related to levels of description	agree	Agree	agree	agree 2A: p. 17
237	broaden application of A1.2A1 to cover moving images not commercially released or broadcast	agree	4: p. 28	agree	Agree	agree	agree
238	delete A1.2A3	-	-	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC /1/Rev
239	add option for early printed resources at A1.2B1	request discussion on whether to add as only an option?	8: pp. 48-49	discuss	Request discussion	agree	discuss - LC still prefers the general rule to be trascribe what you see & make limited exceptions from there
240	question rationale for instructions in A1.2B2 re symbols in edition statements	agree	request discussion	agree	Request discussion	2A: p. 5	agree
241	question value of footnote to rule A1.2B3; need clearer guidance on what is or is not an edition statement	agree	request discussion	agree	Agree	2A: p. 5	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
242	combine instructions in A1.2B1 into a single sentence	agree	agree	agree	Agree	2A: p. 5	agree - see 5JSC/LC /1/Rev
243	rewrite A1.2B2 to provide instructions on application of A1.0F6 to edition statements	agree	same as #240?	same as 240?	Agree	2A: p. 5	agree
244	add instructions on recording edition statements that are inseparable from the title (AACR2 2.15B)	agree	17, p. 125	agree	2A: p. 2	agree	agree
245	condense A2.2B1, A2.2B3	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree Ed. table
246	specify that second sentence of A2.2B3 applies only to serials	disagree, presume that all sentences in a paragraph will always apply subject to scope specified in 1st sentence.	5: p. 31	disagree	Agree	disagree	disagree per ACOC
247	incorporate instructions for change in edition information into A1.2F	agree	2A: p. 17	agree	Agree	agree	agree
248	give separate instructions at A2.2F1 to match A2.1B12	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree Ed. table
249							
250	**Material (or type of publication) specific details**						
251	Numbering						
252	delete A1.3A3	-	-	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC /1/Rev
253	add reference to A1.3 at A2.3	being discussed as part of new structure?	agree with ACOC	being discussed ?	Agree*	5: p11	see 5JSC/LC /1/Rev

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
254	add references from A1.3 and A2 to A1.0A1 c) or restate A1.0A1 c) at A1.3 and A2	being discussed as part of new structure?	agree with ACOC	being discussed?	Agree*	5: p. 11	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
255	restore "if cataloguing from the first and/or last issue or part" at A1.3A1	agree	2A: p. 19	disagree	5: p. 7	agree	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
256	add instructions at A1.3A4 for recording spans of numbers/dates	request discussion. Relates to line 262	5: p. 30	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss; relates to punctuation decisions (and see 260 below)
257	eliminate redundancy with A1.3A3 in A1.3B1	agree	5: p. 30	disagree	Agree	agree	agree
258	revise A1.3B1	-	-	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
259	add provision in A1.3C2 for preferring Gregorian/Julian date	no opinion	5: p. 30	disagree	Agree	disagree	disagree; should be option - consider Arabic world
260	question punctuation separating year from number; add explicit instructions on punctuating levels of enumeration	agree	request discussion	agree	Agree	5: p. 10	discuss; relates to punctuation decisions (and see 256 above)
261	consider deleting second paragraph of A1.3C4	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Disagree	agree - but there may be resulting access issue to be dealt with	agree Ed. table

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
262	revise A1.3E1 to give preference to volume and number system	request discussion. Relates to line 256, 264	5: p. 30	discuss	Disagree	discuss	discuss
263	revise A1.3E1 to give preference to volume and number system only if order presented in the resource cannot be determined	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Disagree	5: p. 10	discuss
264	revise A1.3E1 to record deepest scheme; record other schemes in a note	request discussion. Relates to line 256, 262	5: p. 30	discuss	Disagree	discuss	discuss
265	revise caption at A1.3F and wording of A1.3F1 to include "completed"	agree	5: p. 30	agree	Agree	agree	agree; but do we need this?
266	revise caption at A1.3F to give greater emphasis to multipart monographs	agree	agree - covered in RDA reorg	5: p. 12	Agree*	agree	agree
267	remove reference to A1.6G1 in second paragraph of A1.3G1	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	agree	agree Ed. table
268	delete conflicting instructions re numbering for facsimiles at A1.	-	17, p.126	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC /1/Rev
269							
270	**Musical presentation statement**						
271	revise B2.3	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/4
272	add sentence to B2.3A1	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	disagree	agree Ed. Table at B2.3A2
273							
274	**Mathematical and other material specific details**						

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
275	revise caption for B3.3 to include digital graphic representation and renumber subrules	request discussion	2B: p. 21	agree	Agree	agree	discuss - no more areas, but need name for element
276	revise wording of B3.3D2	agree	17, p. 134	agree	Agree	agree	agree
277	revise B3.3E1 to cover multiple kinds of digital data and file type	request discussion of repetition of data elements in general	17, p. 134	agree	Agree	discuss	discuss
278							
279	**Publication and distribution information**						
280	**Elimination of the use of "s.l." and "s.n."(A1.4C6, A1.4D7)**						
281	restore distinction between published and unpublished material	11: p. 12	p. 2, 11: pp. 60-62	11: p. 18	11: p. 10	11: p. 15	See forthcoming LC Disc. Paper on self-descr./not self-descr. 11: p. 34
282	introduce concept of self-describing resources		agree in principle, needs discussion	discuss		discuss, if not resolved by LC paper	new; See forthcoming LC Disc. Paper on self-descr./not self-descr.
283	allow for English language equivalent	11: p. 12	-	-	11: p. 10	-	see 5JSC/LC/2
284							
285	**Other comments on publication, distribution, etc.**						
286	simplify rules on publication, distribution, etc.	-	-	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC/2

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
287	delete A2.4 and A3.4	-	-	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC/2
288	allow multiple iterations of area 4 for serials and multipart monographs	-	-	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC/2
289							
290	**Preliminary rule**						
291	suggest new second sentence for A1.4A1 to allow repetition of data in area 4 that has already been recorded in other areas	agree	11: p. 56	disagree	Disagree	disagree	see 5JSC/LC/2
292	remove reference to "other preliminaries" in A1.4A1	being discussed as part of Editor follow-up/LC1	11: p. 56	being discussed	Being discussed	being discussed	see 5JSC/LC/2
293	query exclusion of colophon in A1.4A1	being discussed as part of Editor follow-up/LC1	11: p. 56	being discussed	Being discussed	being discussed	see 5JSC/LC/2
294							
295	**General rule**						
296	query exclusion of "Consider all remote access electronic resources to be published" at A1.4B	request discussion	11: p. 56	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	see 5JSC/LC/2
297	add option for early printed resources at A1.4B3	agree	8: p. 49; 11: p. 56	agree	Agree	agree	see 5JSC/LC/2
298							
299	**Place of publication, distribution, etc.**						
300	query re inconsistency between A1.4C4 allowing for completion of the place of publication, but the name is not completed in the statement of responsibility area for unpublished materials	11: p. 12	request discussion	disagree	Request discussion	disagree; allow the inconsistency	see 5JSC/LC/2

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
301	delete third sentence from A1.4C5; revise examples; add option for early printed resources	agree	8: pp. 49-50; 11: p. 57	agree	Request discussion	agree	see 5JSC/LC/2
302	add an option to A1.4C6 to allow the cataloguer to supply the place of publication in the same language and script as the name of the publisher	request discussion. Lines 19, 302 & 370 relate	11: p. 57	agree	Request discussion	agree	see 5JSC/LC/2
303	delete last sentence in A1.4C7	request discussion re rationale	11: p. 57	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	see 5JSC/LC/2
304	flag exception for unpublished in A1.4C8 and A1.4D9 at the beginning of A1.4C and A1.4D	agree. Being discussed in responses to LC2	agree	agree	Agree	7: p. 13	see 5JSC/LC/2
305	apply A1.4C8 to all collections; delete "assembled"	disagree	request discussion	discuss	Disagree	disagree	discuss 4: p. 28see 5JSC/LC/2 and Archival rule proposal (and 317 and 327 below)
306	include place of creation/production under A1.4C8	4: p. 8	4: p. 28	agree	Agree	agree	see 5JSC/LC/2
307	clarify reference in second paragraph of A1.4C8	agree	4: p. 28	agree	Agree	agree	see 5JSC/LC/2
308							
309	**Name of publisher, distributor, etc.**						
310	See line 313 [was: revise A1.4D1 to record name of publisher as on source; add option for fuller recording of details for early printed resources]	unable to locate	8: pp. 41-42			agree	see 313
311	remove "optionally" from instructions re early printed resources in A1.4D1; delete reference to A1.4D	agree	request discussion	agree	Agree	disagree	agree 8: pp. 31-32

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
312	clarify "see" reference in A1.4D1 at end of option for early printed resources	agree	11: p. 57	agree	Agree	agree	see 5JSC/LC/2
313	replace first sentence in A1.4D2 or make optional provision for early printed resources	request discussion	11: p. 57-58	discuss	Request discussion	agree	see 5JSC/LC/2
314	delete subparagraph d) in A1.4D4	request discussion	8: p. 42; 11: p. 58	discuss	Request discussion	agree	see 5JSC/LC/2
315	add option for early printed resources in A1.4D4	agree	8: p. 42; 11: p. 58	agree	Agree	agree	see 5JSC/LC/2
316	revise A1.4D5 to use the word "imprint" and simplify wording	11: p. 12	disagree	agree	Disagree	agree	disagree
317	apply A1.4D9 to all collections; delete "assembled"	disagree	disagree	discuss; see 305, 327	Disagree	disagree	discuss 4: p. 28 see also 305 above and 327 below
318							
319	**Date of publication, distribution, etc.**						
320	add option for early printed resources at A1.4F1	agree	8: p. 50; 11: p. 58-59	agree	Agree	agree	disagree, see 5JSC/LC/2
321	add instructions to A2.4F1 on recording multiple dates that are not Gregorian/Julian	no opinion	5: p. 31	no opinion	No opinion	agree	see 5JSC/LC/2
322	add instructions to A2.4F1 on recording dates for digitized back runs of issues	request discussion General discussion on dates is needed.	agree	5: p. 13	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
323	reword A1.4F2 to allow for when the correct date is unknown	agree	11, p. 59	agree	Agree	agree	disagree, see 5JSC/LC/2
324	revise A1.4F7 to allow use of "between … and …" for other ranges of dates	agree	8: p. 42; 11: p. 59	agree	Agree	agree	disagree, see 5JSC/LC/2

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
325	add option to A1.4F7 to use 4-digit dates for decades, centuries, etc.	agree	agree	agree	Agree	disagree	2A: p. 17
326	eliminate instruction in A1.4F8 not to record date for naturally occurring object	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	discuss 2A: p. 17
327	apply A1.4F8 to all collections; delete "assembled"	disagree	request discussion	discuss	Disagree	disagree	discuss 4: p. 28, see 305 and 317 above
328	change reference in B1.4F8 to refer to A1.7B9	request discussion on dates	4: p. 29	agree	Agree	agree	discuss with self-descr/not self-descr.
329	expand A1.4B9 to cover B6.4F1 and B7.4F1	2B: p.5	agree	agree	Agree	agree	
330							
331	**Place of manufacture, name of manufacturer, date of manufacture**						
332	remove "optionally" from instructions re early printed resources in A1.4G1	agree	request discussion	agree	Agree	disagree	8: p. 32, see 5JSC/LC/2
333	incorporate A1.4G4 into A1.4G1; delete A1.4G4	agree	8: pp. 42-43; 11, pp. 59-60	agree	Disagree	agree	see 5JSC/LC/2
334							
335	**Technical description**						
336	**General comments**						
337	question changes in technical description area vis-à-vis user needs	agree	1B: p. 8	agree	Being discussed	agree	agree
338	relationship between A1.5 and C confusing	being addressed as part of new structure	already covered in reorg of RDA	n/a	12: p. 10-11	n/a	not applicable with new RDA structure
339	delete almost all of A1.5 and refer to individual chapters, keep formats separate	Request discussion in relation to new structure	already covered in reorg of RDA	n/a	Being discussed	12, p. 15	not applicable with new RDA structure

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
340	see comments regarding content vs. carrier, cartographic materials and notated music	request discussion	12, pp. 63-65	discuss - TF	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	discuss	discuss following report from TF on type & form of content/ carrier
341	AACR3 needs to pay more attention to mixed/hybrid resources	agree	p. 2, 12, p. 65	agree	Agree	agree	agree
342	return to unitary structure of the current SMDs, remove distinction between physical units and components	request discussion	p. 2, 12, p. 63	discuss - TF	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	discuss	discuss following report from TF on type & form of content/ carrier
343	term "technical description" problematic	request discussion	p. 2, 12, p. 65	disagree	Request discussion	disagree	disagree (we like the new name)
344	retain term "physical description"	request discussion	disagree	12: p. 19	Request discussion	disagree	disagree (we like the new name)
345	propose that area be called "Physical/Technical Description area"	request discussion	disagree	disagree	12: p. 11	disagree	not applicable with new RDA structure
346	examples without rules in A1.5 not helpful	agree	agree	agree	12: p. 11	agree	agree (no action needed?)
347	add specific instructions to apply rules from more than one chapter in C when describing digital media	being discussed as part of new structure?	12, pp. 75-76	n/a	Being discussed	n/a	not applicable with new RDA structure

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
348	rewrite chapter C1 with more feedback from manuscript cataloguers	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/3
349	add instructions re subtitles, close captioning, audio description, etc. under C6.5	agree. Also relates to ACOC comment at line 63	disagree	agree	Agree	2C: p. 8	agree
350	additional information is required on recording the extent and other technical characteristics of digital resources that parallel print or graphic counterparts	12: p. 15	agree	agree	Agree	agree	discuss
351							
352	**Preliminary rule**						
353	change usage of FRBR terms in A1.5A3	agree	12, p. 67	agree	Agree	agree	agree
354	delete A1.5A4	-	-	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
355	remove treatment of comma as prescribed punctuation in A1.5A6	agree	12, p. 67	agree	Agree*	agree	agree
356	comment re use of parentheses in the technical description	agree	12, p. 67	agree	Agree*	agree	agree
357							
358	**Extent (A1.5B)**						
359	add reference at C3.5B to other chapters for the statement of extent	Disagree (The rules & refs in A are sufficient)	12, p. 81 (rule C3.5D1)	agree	Agree*	agree	agree in principle, but situation will change with new RDA structure
360	problems with generalization of rules on extent	request discussion	request discussion	agree	Agree	discuss	discuss1A: p. 12
361	SMDs cannot be revised without reference to GMDs	p. 1; 12: p. 13	agree	agree	Agree-GMD/SMD	agree	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
362	AACR3 should specify single SMD terms (with the option to use terms in common usage)	being discussed GMD/SMD	12, p. 68	agree	Agree-GMD/SMD	agree	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
363	remove distinction between physical units and components	request discussion	12, p. 70	discuss	Agree-GMD/SMD	discuss	discuss
364	make physical units and components rules optional for cartographic materials	request discussion	request discussion	12: pp. 19-20	Agree-GMD/SMD	discuss	not applicable with new RDA structure
365	cartographic and music groups prefer that "content" be placed before "carrier", and that Table 2 proceed Table 1	being discussed GMD/SMD	request discussion	discuss	12: p. 11	discuss	not applicable with new RDA structure
366	suggest that when the content of the material is the primary interest for users, state the "content" before indicating physical units	request discussion. Isn't content always of primary interest?	request discussion	discuss	Agree-GMD/SMD	discuss	12: p. 35, perhaps not applicable with new RDA structure?
367	add guidance at A1.5B on when to record both physical units and components	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	2A: p. 18, 12: p. 35, perhaps not applicable with new RDA structure?
368	do not use "sheets" as the first element of extent for cartographic materials, music or visual materials	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	12: p. 35, perhaps not applicable with new RDA structure?

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
369	include both physical units and components in examples only when quantities differ	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	2A: p. 18, 12: p. 35, perhaps not applicable with new RDA structure?
370	allow option to sequence statement of extent according to language patterns familiar to users	request discussion. Lines 19, 302 & 370 relate	request discussion	discusss	Request discussion	discuss	2A: p. 18, 12: p. 35, perhaps not applicable with new RDA structure?
371	query re technical description for scores	request discussion	request discussion	12: p. 20	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
372	include AACR2 rule 3.5C4	agree	agree	agree	12: p. 11	agree	agree
373	suggest that resources that combine different media in a single carrier be addressed at A1.9 as well	agree	agree	agree	12: p. 11	agree	agree
374	**Number of physical units (A1.5B1)**						
375	combine second and third paragraphs of A1.5B1	agree	12, p. 70	agree	Agree	agree	agree in principle, but the new RDA structure makes this moot
376	delete third paragraph of A1.5B1	agree	prefer ALA approach line 375	agree ALA	Agree	agree ALA	Ed. Table, agree in principle, but the new RDA structure makes this moot
377	**A1.5B1- Table 1**						

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
378	table is not exhaustive	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	12, p. 15	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
379	rename as "Physical units"	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	12: p. 35, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
380	remove "medium" from title bar in table 1	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	12: p. 35, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
381	print and graphic column:						
382	o add common physical units	agree being discussed GMD/SMD	agree being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	12: p. 35, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
383	o broadside: should be a component not a physical unit	request discussion re sheets	12, p. 68	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	discuss	12: p. 35, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
384	o pamphlet and sheet: query extension of terms for musical notation	request discussion re sheets	12, p. 69	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
385	o part: differing usage in tables 1 and 2	request discussion	12: p. 69	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	discuss	

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
386	o pieces: remove	disagree	disagree	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	12: p. 35, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
387	o sheet: differing definitions in footnotes to tables 1 and 2	request discussion re sheets	12: p. 69	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	discuss	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
388	micrographic column:						
389	o rename to microform	agree	12, p. 69	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	agree 12: p. 35
390	3-dimensional column:						
391	o column contains several content terms	agree	12, p. 68	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
392	o remove "art original" and "art reproduction"	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	12: p. 35, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
393	o "art original", "art print", "art reproduction" do not reflect recognized usage	being discussed GMD/SMD	12, p. 68	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
394	o add "sculpture" "painting" and "drawing"	being discussed GMD/SMD	12, p. 68	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
395	o suggest add specific terms such as "sculpture" "pottery" "mobile"	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	12: p. 35, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
396	o braille cassette: query re meaning	being discussed GMD/SMD	delete from table - not a separate type of carrier	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	12, p. 15	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
397	tactile column:						
398	o treat tactile as an aspect of a resource, not the resource itself	agree	12: p. 69	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
399	recorded sound column:						
400	o rename "audio" to parallel GMDs	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	12: pp. 35-36, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
401	o add common physical container terms	agree	agree	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	12: p. 36, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
402	o add "sound disc cartridge"	being discussed GMD/SMD	12: p. 69	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
403	projected graphic, film and video column:			being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
404	o rename to "moving image"	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discusse d	agree, 12: p. 36, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
405	o don't create a category for "projected media"	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discusse d	agree, 12: p. 36, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
406	digital column:						
407	o add "file" as a type of digital media	being discussed GMD/SMD	12, p. 68	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discusse d	agree, 12: p. 36, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
408	**XX.5B1**						
409	expand A1.5B1, and eliminate A2.5B1 and A3.5B1	12: p. 13	already covered in new structure of RDA	agree	Agree*	agree	disagree, will change with new RDA structure (also see 419)
410	rules A2.5B1 and A3.5B1 contradict the general rule	agree	12, p. 68	agree	Agree*	agree	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
411	add "if it can be readily ascertained" to second paragraph of A2.5B1	agree although not certain this is needed	5: p. 32	agree ACOC	Agree	agree ACOC	agree with ACOC

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
412	add sentence to A2.5B1 prescribing "v." as the SMD for printed serials	agree although not certiain this is needed	5: p. 32	agree, although still hate "v." as SMD for anything	Agree	agree	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
413	revise A2.5B1: delete "physical" and reword	request discussion. Current wording does not force counting issues of a serial	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	agree	Ed. table
414	revise A2.5B1: delete "loose-leaf" example	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
415	revise A2.5B1: "parts" instead of "volume" in third paragraph	agree	agree	agree	Request discussion	agree	Ed. table
416	extend application of A3.5B1 to digital forms of updating loose-leafs	agree	6: p. 38	agree	Agree	agree	agree, the principle should apply regardless (also applies to e-serials)
417	question application of A3.5B1 to single-volume updating loose-leafs	agree	agree	agree	6: p. 7	agree	agree
418	add a reference from A3.5B1 to C1.5B2.1.8	agree	agree	agree	6: p. 7	agree	agree in principle, but not applicable with new RDA structure

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
419	incorporate C7.5B1 in A1.5B1	12: p. 13	agree	agree	Agree*	agree	agree in principle, but not applicable with new RDA structure (also see 409)
420	include naming conventions for remote resources in C7.5B1	query	12, p. 82	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
421	**Number of components (A1.5B2)**						
422	suggest use content instead of component in A1.5B2, or use "form of expression" or "type of material"		request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	12: p. 36, no longer applicable with new RDA structure
423	revise A1.5B2: change wording to allow use of other terms	12: p. 14	agree	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
424	revise A1.5B2: include provisions from C6.5B2 and C7.5B2	12: p. 14	agree	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
425	query re use of "identical" at A1.5B2, second paragraph	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	12: p. 11	discuss	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
426	add instructions to A1.5B2 for when it is not clear from the item in hand how many physical units the manifestation was originally published/released in	agree	12, p. 70	agree	Agree	agree	agree
427	**A1.5B2 - Table 2**						

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
428	re-orient table 2 and align content terms with terms for content used in GMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	2A: p. 18, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
429	rename table "Designations for content"	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	12: p. 36, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
430	drop columns under "medium", keep rows based on "content" and use them as columns, list designations once for each "content"	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	12: p. 36, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
431	add columns for choreography, data, software	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	12: p. 36, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
432	Text [as a column]	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed		being discussed	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
433	o add column(s), leaf/leaves	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	12: p. 36, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
434	Music [as a column]	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed		being discussed	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
435	o add column(s), leaf/leaves of music	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	12: p. 36, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
436	o delete miniature score	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	12: p. 36, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
437	o replace "piano [violin, etc.] conductor part" with "piano conductor part" and "violin conductor part"	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	12: p. 36, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
438	note that in table 2 the list for text may apply to any bound item	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	12: p. 11	being discussed	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
439	add an entries under "print and graphic" for "p. of music" and "leaves of music"	being discussed GMD/SMD	12: p. 69	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
440	projected graphic, film and video column: query terms included in cartographic row	being discussed GMD/SMD	12: p. 69	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
441	projected graphic, film and video column: query blank rows	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	Ed. Table, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
442	query re vocal score	being discussed GMD/SMD	12: p. 69	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
443	add scroll as SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	12: p. 69	being discussed	Being discussed- GMD/SMD	being discussed	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
444	flip chart should be considered a component; the physical unit should be either sheet or volume	being discussed GMD/SMD	12: p. 69	being discussed	Being discussed- GMD/SMD	being discussed	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
445	omit "sheet" from table 2 and remove footnote	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed GMD/SMD	being discussed	Being discussed- GMD/SMD	being discussed	12: p. 35, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
446	sheet: footnote not supported by Glossary definition	being discussed GMD/SMD	12: p. 69	being discussed	Being discussed- GMD/SMD	being discussed	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
447	add "globe" to content list for cartographic resources to align with glossary definition	being discussed GMD/SMD	13: p. 102	being discussed	Being discussed- GMD/SMD	being discussed	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
448	**XX.5B2**						
449	make explicit that "pages, leaves, etc" in C1.5B2 means "bearing text, images, etc."	query	agree	agree	Request discussion	12, p. 16	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
450	question use of "volumes, etc." in C1.5B2.1	2C: p. 7	agree	agree	Agree	agree	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
451	suggest that C1.5B2.1.1 reflect the default that everything is one volume unless stated otherwise	agree	request discussion	agree	Agree	12, p. 16	disagree
452	revise C1.5B2.1, C1.5B2.1.3, and C1.5B2.1.19 to align recording of pages, leaves, and columns	agree	8: pp. 43-45; 12: pp. 78-79	agree	Agree	disagree	disagree (contradicts 451)

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
453	add to C1.5B2.1.6 the option to record "1 v.(unpaged)"	agree	12, p. 77	discuss	Agree	disagree	disagree (contradicts 451)
454	rules C1.5B1 and C1.5B2.1.8 (re updating loose-leafs) are equivalent; eliminate redundancy	2C: p. 7	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree Ed. table
455	investigate duplication between C1.5B2.1.8 and A3.8E1	agree	disagree	agree	Agree	12, p. 16	agree, but will go away with new RDA structure
456	rewrite C1.5B2.1.8	query	12, p. 77	agree	Agree-CCC wording (p. 23)	agree	agree
457	add instruction and example to C1.5B2.1.11	no opinion	12, p. 77	no opinion	Agree	disagree	disagree about adding instruction; leave to examples TF
458	clarify C1.5B2.1.16	agree	12, p. 77	agree	Request discussion	agree	stay with current practice
459	query if in C1.5B2.1.16 concept of bibliographic vs. physical only applicable to print and graphic media? If not, replace "volume" with "unit" and move to A1.5B	agree	agree	agree	Request discussion	agree	Ed. Table, prefer to stay with current practice
460	query re expanding terms in common usage to content (C1.5B2.2)	request discussion	12, p. 79	being discussed	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	being discussed	have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier
461	revise wording of rules in C1.5B2.2	agree	See 5JSC/ AACR3/I /LC resp/ ALA resp	discuss	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	discuss	2C: pp. 25-26, have TF on Type & form of content/ carrier

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
462	delete C1.5B2.3 and move one example to A1.5B2	agree	covered by new arrangement	agree	Request discussion	agree	2C: p. 27
463	revise C1.5B2.4 to cover case when all segments appear on one sheet	request discussion. Not sure rule is intended to only apply to 1 sheet	12, p. 79	discuss	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	discuss	discuss
464	delete C1.5B2.5; refer to specialist manuals	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	2C: p. 27
465	generalize C6.5B2 and C7.5B2	12: p. 14	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree
466	remove reference to subrules at C6.5B2	agree	12, p. 81	agree	Agree-CCC wording (p. 24)	agree	agree
467	query re application of rules on transparencies at C6.5B2	request discussion	12, p. 81	discuss	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree LC	prefer covered by general rule
468	optional provision in rule C7.5B2 covered by general rule	12: p. 14	already covered in new structure of RDA	discuss	Request discussion	agree	agree, per above
469	widen option at C7.5B2	agree	12, p. 82	agree	Agree	agree	agree to generalize
470	revise C7.5B2 to reflect 9.5B4	agree	12, p. 82	agree	Agree	agree	agree
471							
472	**Playing time**						
473	A1.5B3 encompasses C6.5B2.4 and C6.5B3, include appropriate examples	12: p. 14	agree	agree	Agree-CCC comment (p. 20)	agree	agree no need for suppl. Rule

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
474	clarify instructions in A1.5B3 regarding overall duration, and add instructions for a stated playing time that is known to be incorrect	agree	12, p. 70	agree	Agree	agree	agree
475	suggest use "running time" rather than "playing time" at A1.5B3	request discussion. Consider duration	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	12, p. 16	agree
476	suggest example in format "3:26" at A1.5B3 (and throughout C5) [NB: see also ALA comment at A1.7B13]	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	12: p. 36
477	See line 475 [was: suggest use of "running time" rather than "playing time" at C6.5B3]	~~request discussion. Consider duration~~	~~request discussion~~		~~Request discussion~~	~~12, p. 16~~	~~same as 475 above - delete one~~
478	include explicit instructions at C7.5B2 and C7.5B3 on components and playing time for remote resources	agree	12, p. 82	agree	Agree	agree	agree
479							
480	**Component parts**						
481	A1.5B4 not applicable to most cartographic resources; change cartographic resource example	agree	12, p. 70	agree	Agree	agree	agree, but for TF Examples
482							
483	**Assembled collections**						
484	instructions in A1.5B5 re linear feet not appropriate for cartographic resources	request discussion. What is G&M? allow recording in either linear feet, or approximate no. of items or both	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	agree	2A: p. 18, G&M Is Geography & Map Division at LC

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
485	add separate paragraph under A1.5B5 incorporating conventions from DACS	agree	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	agree	2A: p. 19
486	See line 188 [was: reword instructions in A1.5B5 on supplying titles for collections]	~~unable to locate~~	~~4: p. 29, 7: p. 40~~			~~agree~~	~~duplicates 188 - delete here~~
487	add option at A1.5B5 to follow instructions in A1.9B b)	agree	can't find A1.9B b); maybe A1.9B2 b)? If so, agree	agree? (also can't find A1.9B b)	Agree	agree	7: p. 30
488	substitute "storage space" for "shelf space" in A1.5B5	agree	7: p. 40; 12: p. 70	agree	Agree	agree	agree
489	question use of "resource" in footnote 1 to A1.5B5	agree	7: p. 40	agree	Agree	agree	agree
490							
491	**Other technical details**						
492	prefer simple instruction in A1.5C1 rather than a list	disagree. The list provides a good overview of a long section	12, p. 71	disagree	Disagree	disagree	disagree, we like the list approach
493	suggest sequence for list in A1.5C1 (and subsequent rearrangement and renumbering of rules in chapter A1 and Section C)	agree. Sequence suggested by ALA and CCC are the same	12, p. 71	agree	Agree	agree	agree (combine with 494 below)

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
494	suggest sequence for list in A1.5C1	agree. Sequence suggested by ALA and CCC are the same	agree - same as ALA suggestion on line 493	agree	12: p. 11	agree	agree (combine with 493 above)
495	**Special format characteristics**						
496	do not treat closed captioning as a special format characteristic in A1.5C2 and change caption	request discussion in relation to how best to serve needs of the physically impaired. Relates to line 621	12, p. 73	agree	Agree	agree	agree
497	suggest that if examples in parentheses in A1.5C2 second paragraph are suggested terms for usage they be given in italics	agree	agree	agree	12: p. 12	agree	agree
498	generalize C3.5C2.1 to A1.5C2	agree	already covered in new structure of RDA	agree	2C: p. 6	agree	agree
499	**Layout**						
500	query whether "back to back" in A1.5C3 is intended to be used for all materials	agree	12, p. 73	agree	Agree	agree	agree; applies to many types of material, but prefer to explain in note
501	**Production method**						

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
502	query removal of instructions for thermoform in A1.5C4	agree	12, p. 73	disagree	Agree	disagree	disagree; rule shows e.g. and example is of an old type - it's ok
503	suggest that "manuscript" be added as an example of a production method at A1.5C4	request discussion	request discussion	disagree	12: p. 12	disagree	disagree; rule shows e.g. and example is one type - it's ok
504	Indicate where items are in large or giant print and the actual font size at C1.5C4	request discussion on how best to record. Relates to ACOC line 63 and CILIP line 349	request discussion	agree	Request discussion	2C: p. 8	discuss
505	reconcile C1.5C4.1 with C1.7B1.1	agree	agree	agree	2C: p. 6	agree	agree
506	**Polarity**						
507	reconcile discrepancy between A1.5C5 and C6.7B13.1.d	agree	12, p. 73	agree	Agree	agree	agree
508	**Medium**						
509	make recording of medium in area 5 optional	disagree	request discussion	disagree	Request discussion	disagree	2A: p. 19
510	reconcile manuscript examples at A1.5C6 and C1.5D1.4	12: p. 15	agree	agree	Agree	agree	
511	**Physical material**						

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
512	add guidance to A1.5C7 on what type of material is typical for a type of manifestation	request discussion. Don't agree that any further guidance on what is typical is needed, but words to the effect of recording the material if there is no typical would be good	12, p. 74	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss, will this go away with new RDA structure?
513	**Illustrative matter**						
514	rule A1.5C9 may be better suited in section B	request discussion. Relates to ACOC's comments at lines 515, 518, 520	12, p. 74	agree	Agree*	agree	agree in priciple, but will change with new RDA structure
515	revise A1.5C9 to make it clear that it applies to resources that are not primarily images	12: p. 15	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree, but may change with new RDA structure
516	query category of information in A1.5C9.1 third paragraph	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Agree	agree	Ed. table

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
517	combine A1.5C9.2 and A1.5C10	request discussion. Relates to ACOC's comments at lines 515, 518, 520	12, p. 74	agree	Request discussion	agree LC	agree (combine with 518 below)
518	incorporate A1.5C9.2 into A1.5C10	12: p. 15	agree	agree	Agree	agree LC	agree (combine with 517 above)
519	**Colour**						
520	reword A1.5C10 to include resources which are primarily images then delete supplementary rules	12: p. 15	agree	agree	Request discussion	agree	agree
521	reinstate 3.5C5 to reflect cartographic material cataloging practice for color	disagree. Already covered by A1.5C10	new	discuss	Request discussion	disagree	disagree, A1.5C10 is for cartographic material
522	note re A1.5C10, placement of colour in order of technical details produces varying results	agree	agree	agree	12: p. 12	agree	agree
523	allow option in A1.5C10 to spell out the abbreviation "col."	agree	agree	disagree	Disagree	disagree, as isolated option	12: p. 37
524	examine inconsistency in identification of "black and white" (C1.5C10.1)	agree	12, p. 80	agree	Agree	agree	agree, needs review
525	question use of "b&w" for cartographic resources at C1.5C10.1	agree	request discussion	agree	2C: p. 5	agree	agree, see above
526	rephrase C2.5C10.1	agree	12, p. 81	agree	Agree	agree	agree
527	add instruction to C6.5C10 for when information is not succinct	agree	12, p. 81	agree	Agree	agree	agree
528	**Sound characteristics**						
529	clarify A1.5C11, paragraph 3	query	12, p. 74	agree	Disagree	agree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
530	move A1.5C11.1 to third paragraph of A1.5C11, change wording	agree	12, p. 74	agree	Request discussion	agree	agree (combine with 531 below)
531	query A1.5C11.1 as a separate rule	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. Table (combine with 530 above)
532	omit sentence from C6.5C11.1 on "silent speed"	agree	12, p. 82	agree	Agree	agree	agree
533	do not treat "stereo" as an abbreviation at C5.5C11.6, and omit full stop	agree	12, p. 81	agree	Agree	agree	agree
534	add "surround" at C5.5C11.6	agree	agree	agree	2C: p. 6	agree	agree
535	change "quad" to "surround" at C5.5C11.6	query. Do the terms mean the same thing?	12, p. 81	query	Disagree	query	query
536	add "SACD" and "DVD" at C5.5C11.7	agree	agree	agree	2C: p. 6	agree	agree (will the TF on type & form of content/ carrier address this?)
537	**Projection characteristics**						
538	change last sentence of C6.5C12.2	agree	12, p. 82	agree	Request discussion	agree	agree
539	**Other digital characteristics**						

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
540	expand end of C7.5C13.1 to give an example of what would be considered important	disagree. General statement equating considered to be important with use of the resource would be preferable	request discussion	discuss	Disagree	12, p. 16	disagree, agree ACOC
541							
542	**Dimensions**						
543	add instruction to indicate which dimension is being given if considered important	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	2A: p. 19
544	add "materials under archival control" and add option not to record dimensions for those materials	agree	agree	agree	Request discussion	agree	2A: p. 19
545	change "Early printed books" to "Early printed resources" in the option in C1.5D1.1	request discussion. Lines 117, 545, 682, 786, 890, 1049 are related	12, p. 80	agree	Request discussion	agree	agree in principle, but obviously the rule will move with the new RDA structure
546	remove "optionally" from instructions re early printed resources in C1.5D1.1	agree	request discussion	agree	Agree	disagree	8: p. 32
547	move instructions on extent statement from last paragraph of C1.5D1.3 to C1.5B1 and C1.5B2.1; reconcile C1.5D1.3 with footnote to Table 1	agree	12, p. 80	agree	Agree	agree	agree in principle, but obviously the rule will move with the new RDA structure

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
548	extend C1.5D1.3.1 to paintings and photographs	agree. Relates to line 683	12, p. 80	agree	Agree	agree	agree
549	add additional instructions at C1.5D1.4	request discussion	12, p. 80	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
550	remove "on" from "on sheet" in C1.5D1.4.4	query	12, p. 80	query	Agree	agree	query, does this go away with new RDA structure?
551	query why dimensions of a stereograph are not recorded at C6.5D1.4	agree	12, p. 82	agree	Agree	agree	query, does this go away with new RDA structure?
552	add appropriate instructions for the size of maps at C1.5D1.4.5, C1.5D1.4.6, C1.5D3.1	query. ALA's suggestions seem to differ as to whether the sheet or map dimensions appear first	12, p. 80	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	prefer to stick to current practice
553	increase consistency between C1.5D1, C2.5D1 and C4.5D1	agree	12, p. 81	agree	Agree	agree	agree
554	delete second sentence of C2.5D1	agree	agree	agree	Disagree	2C: p. 8	agree
555	rule C3.5D1 is just a reference back to general rules	agree. Addressed as part of new structure?	agree	agree	2C: p. 6	agree	agree, moot with new RDA structure?
556	delete "printed" from reference in A1.5D3 to C1.5D3	agree	7: p. 40; 12: p. 75	agree	Disagree	agree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
557	delete rule A2.5D4	agree	5: p. 32	agree	Agree*	agree	agree
558							
559	**Ancillary material**						
560	restore "accompanying material"	agree s/a lines 560, 842, 1042	12, p. 75	agree	Agree	agree	12: p. 37
561	clarify scope of A1.5E1, third paragraph	agree	12, p. 75	agree	Agree	agree	agree
562	include A1.5E3 at A1.5C11	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table at A1.5C11
563	delete A1.5E4	request discussion	12, p. 75	agree	Agree	agree	agree; same as 564 below
564	incorporate A1.5E4 into A1.5E1	12: p. 15	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. Table at A1.5E1
565							
566	**Series**						
567	delete A1.6A2	-	-	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev
568	add a rule at A2.6B1 re numbering that is integral to series title	agree add rule, suggested text of rule is unclear.	5: p. 32	agree	Agree	agree	agree add rule, need better wording
569	delete second paragraph of A1.6B2; clarify relationship to A1.1B7	agree	agree	agree	2A: p. 3	agree	agree; see 5JSC/LC/1/rev.
570	revise A1.6F1: add "of a monographic series"	agree	agree	agree	Request discussion	agree	Ed. table
571	revise A1.6F1: query re incorrect ISSN/standard number	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
572	consider deleting second paragraph of A1.6G1	agree	request discussion	agree	Disagree	can't identfy point	Ed. table

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
573	add instructions in A2.6G1 on punctuation of first and last numbers	agree	5: p. 33	agree	Agree*	agree	agree in principle; but discuss what to do with punctuation
574	make provisions in A2.6G1 that apply to serials optional; specify that option applies only to serial analytics	query	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	5: p. 12	agree
575	rewrite A1.6G1 to restore "in the terms given in the item" and to take out normalization in second paragraph	agree	17, p. 127	agree	Agree	agree	agree
576	reconsider instructions re "new series", etc., in A1.6H3	agree	request discussion	agree	Request discussion	2A: p. 6	disagree; discuss 12.3G
577	revise A1.6H7: add "of a monographic series"	agree	agree	agree	Request discussion	agree	Ed. table
578	revise A1.6H7: query re incorrect ISSN/standard number	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
579	delete second paragraph of A1.6K1 as covered by previous rule	agree	agree	agree	Disagree	agree	Ed. table
580	add to A2.6K1 reference to A1.6J1	agree	covered by new arrangement	agree	Agree*	agree	Ed. table
581							
582	**Notes**						
583	**Preliminary rule**						
584	add text to Introduction to state the function of notes	agree	13: p. 86	agree	Disagree	agree	agree (part of new RDA structure)
585	add at A1.7 statement about optionality of notes	request discussion	13: p. 87	discuss	Request discussion	disagree	disagree, part of levels of description
586	break up notes rules with separate headers	agree	13: p. 87	agree	Agree	agree	not applicable with new RDA structure

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
587	expand A1.7A3 to cover integrating resources	agree	13: p. 83	agree	Agree*	agree	agree
588	synchronize A1.7A3 and A1.7A4	agree	13: p. 87	agree	Agree	agree	agree need for consistency, prefer "citation"
589	make subrules with bold captions in A1.7A3 and A1.7A4 separately numbered	agree	13: p. 87	agree	Agree	agree	agree with concept to make cpations and separate numbers in new RDA structure and numbering
590	add sentence at A1.7A3 "Order of information"	disagree as unnecessary	13: p. 87	disagree	Disagree	disagree	disagree (not necessary)
591	add explicit instruction about hyphens to A1.7A3 "Quotations"	request discussion about punctuation within elements	13: p. 88	disagree	Request discussion	disagree	disagree; see no need to be prescriptive about this punctuation
592	reword "Combining notes" at A1.7A3	agree. Query effect of rule on MARC records with separate fields	agree	agree	Request discussion	agree	agree, Ed. table

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
593	rephrase A1.7A4, including clarification of "If this is not possible"	query. Uncertain what CILIP response means	request discussion	agree	Agree	13: p. 17	agree need language to be clearer
594	use part II terminology instead of "entered" at A1.7A4, second paragraph	agree	agree	agree	13: p. 12	agree	agree
595	move final paragraph of A1.7A4 to A1.7B	agree	13: p. 87	agree	Agree	agree	agree
596	delete second sentence of A1.7A4 final paragraph as given at A1.7B26	agree	13: p. 88	agree	Agree	agree	agree
597	reword rule on order of notes at A1.7B	agree	13: p. 88	agree	Query	agree	agree
598							
599	**Nature, scope, or form**						
600	revise A1.7B1 and add subrules to for materials under archival control (based on DACS)	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/3
601	revise wording of B2.7B1	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	2B: p. 21
602	add to end of B3.7B1 "unless it is apparent from the rest of the description"	agree	13: p. 92	agree	Agree	agree	agree
603	revise B6.7B1 to limit to recorded music	agree	13: p. 92	disagree (agree LC)	Agree	disagree (agree LC)	disagree; only need to change caption to: "Medium of performance for music"
604	reword rule B6.7B1	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
605	clarify the usage of "ms." in C1.7B1.1 and C1.5C4.1	agree	13: p. 93	agree	Agree	agree	agreee
606							
607	**Frequency**						
608	change wording at A1.7B2 and A2.7B2 to cover multipart monographs	agree	13: p. 83	agree	Agree*	agree	agree (see 610 below)
609	revise A1.7B2: change "integrating resources" to "updates to integrating resources"	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
610	See line 608 [was: revise A1.7B2: include "multipart monographs"]	agree	agree		Agree*	agree	Ed. table

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
611	remove restriction to serials from A2.7B2	agree	5: p. 33	agree	Agree*	agree	Ed. Table (repeated in line 614 below)
612	remove linkage to title and statement of responsibility from A2.7B2	agree	5: p. 33		Agree*	agree	agree
613	add instructions in A2.7B2 on recording frequencies and dates in chronological order	agree	5: p. 33	agree	Agree	agree	agree
614	See line 611 [was: revise A2.7B2: delete "for serials"]	~~agree~~	~~agree~~		~~Agree*~~	~~agree~~	~~Ed. Table (aleady in 611 above)~~
615	revise A2.7B2: reword	agree	agree	agree	Agree*	agree	Ed. table
616	reword form of note in A3.7B2 to "Frequency of updates varies"	agree	6: p. 38	agree	Agree	agree	agree
617	reword A3.7B2	agree	agree	agree	Disagree	agree	Ed. Table (combine with line 618 below)
618	change at B3.7B2 "frequency varies" to "frequency of updates varies"	agree	13: p. 92	agree	Agree	agree	agree in priciple (see LC's wording line 617 above)
619							
620	**Language and script**						
621	move to A1.7B3 notes related to closed captions	request discussion in relation to how best to serve needs of the physically impaired. Relates to line 496	13: p. 85	agree	Agree	agree	won't this be covered in new RDA structure?

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
622	clarify B2.7B3 by replacing "language of vocal texts" with "textual content of the resource"	agree	13: p. 92	agree	Agree	agree	agree
623	restore 6.7B2 as B6.7B3	agree	13: p. 92	agree	Request discussion	agree	agree
624							
625	**Source of title proper**						
626	reword A1.7B4	request discussion. Depends on outcome of LC1/Editor follow-up. ACOC prefer increased use of source of title notes	13: p. 83	being discussed	Being discussed	discuss	discuss; see 5JSC/LC /1/Rev.
627	add rule at A2.7B4 on source of title proper	agree	5: p. 33	being discussed	Being discussed	agree	agree
628							
629	**Variations in title**						
630	restore to A1.7B5 text from 12.7B4.1, or change A2.7B5	agree	13: pp. 83-84	agree	Agree	agree	agree
631	reword A1.7B5 and caption	agree	13: p. 88	disagree	Agree	disagree	disagree, unnecessarily fine distinction, moot with new RDA structure

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
632	combine both parts of A2.7B5.1	2A: p. 6	request discussion	agree	Disagree	agree	agree to combine, but needs reworking
633	add "or devised" to C1.7B5.1	agree	13: p. 94	agree	Agree	agree	disagree, LC doesn't like "devised" titles (unnecessary fine distinction)
634							
635	**Parallel titles**						
636	reword rule A2.7B6.1	agree	5: p. 33	agree	Agree	agree	discuss parallel titles with RDA restructure of ISBD elements
637	change in A2.7B6.1 and subsequent rules "a general statement may be made" to "make a general note"	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
638	change in A3.7B6.1 and subsequent rules "a general statement may be made" to "make a general note"	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
639							
640	**Statements of responsibility**						
641	in A1.7B8 delete first and third sentences of first paragraph; and second paragraph and examples as they belong in part III	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	disagree	Ed. table
642	revise second sentence in first paragraph of A1.7B8	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
643	reinstate to first sentence of A1.7B8 "for identification"	agree	13: p. 88	agree	Agree	agree	agree in principle - like stating FRBR user task

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
644	reword rule A2.7B8.2	agree	5: p. 34	agree	Agree	agree	disagree; will change with new RDA structure
645							
646	**Edition and history**						
647	split A1.7B9 into separate rules	agree	13: pp. 88-89	agree	Agree	agree	13: p. 39
648	add instructions to A1.7B9 for materials under archival control (based on DACS)	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/3
649	query re usage of "name" of another resource in A1.7B9a-d	request discussion in relation to parts 2 & 3	13: p. 89	agree	Agree	agree	agree, prefer citation
650	expand A1.7B9a to include making a note about a sequel to the resource being described, and to include prequels	request discussion in relation to parts 2 & 3	13: p. 89	agree	Agree	agree	agree
651	add at A1.7B9b "if known" or "if readily available"	agree.add to whole rule?	13: p. 89	agree	Agree	agree	agree with ACOC
652	problems with word "edition" in A1.7B9b and A1.7B9c	request discussion	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
653	clarify at A1.7B9c "numerous editions"	agree	13: p. 89	agree	Agree	agree	agree
654	resolve duplicative wording between A1.7B9d and A1.7B14 and add references	agree	13: p. 84	agree	Agree	agree	agree; new RDA structure may solve

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
655	expand A1.7B9 to cover provisions in B6.7B9 and B7.7B9 [this rule may require further revision when the rules for added entries are revised]	13: p. 16	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree	agree, but want to allow access points without "jusitifation" in notes
656	add category for "issued with" to A2.7B9	agree	5: p.34	agree	Request discussion	agree	agree
657	move A2.7B9 and A3.7B9 to A1.7B9	agree	covered by new arrangement	agree	Agree*	agree	Ed. table, see A1.7B9, A2.7B9, A3.7B9
658							
659	**Manifestations in other formats**						
660	change caption of A1.7B10 to clarify coverage, query reference to A1.7B28	agree	13: p. 89	agree	Agree	agree	agree
661	consider usage of "the library" in A1.7B10 and other rules	agree	agree	agree	Agree	13: p. 17	agree
662							
663	**Material (or type of publication) specific details**						
664	change reference at A1.7B11 from "see also" to "see"	agree	13: p. 89	agree	Agree-CCC (p. 17)	agree	agree, but this may change with new RDA structure
665	revise wording of B2.7B11	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
666	change caption at B3.7B11	request discussion. Current terminology seems more inclusive	2B: p. 21	agree	Agree	disagree	agree (see line 667 comment below)

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
667	split B3.7B11 into two subrules and revise text	query. Not certain needed. Will accept JSC decision	13: p. 92	agree	Disagree	agree	agree, or RDA won't this be separate data elements?
668							
669	**Publication, distribution, etc.**						
670	add instructions re beginning and ending numbering to second paragraph of A2.7B12.1	agree	5: p. 34	agree	Disagree	agree	agree to including the idea in RDA
671	revise A3.7B12.1 to make a note only on beginning/ending dates only if some kind of guess can be made	agree	6: p. 38	agree	Disagree	agree	
672	extend application of A1.7B12.2 to collections	request discussion. 'Resource' includes collections. Also being discussed in relation to LC2: place of creation for unpublished resources	request discussion	discuss	Agree	discuss	4: p. 28
673	extend A1.7B12.2 to allow note on place of production derived from another source	agree	4: p. 29	agree	Agree	agree	agree
674							
675	**Technical description**						
676	make Duration a subrule at A1.7B13 and make linkage/connection to A1.5B3	agree	agree	agree	13: p. 12	agree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
677	clarify difference between A1.7B13 and A1.7B15	agree	13: p. 89	agree	Agree	agree	agree
678	fourth paragraph of A1.7B13 duplicates third paragraph of A1.7B14	agree	request discussion	agree	Request discussion	agree	Ed. table
679	suggest transcribe duration in A1.7B13 in HH:MM:SS format (and relevant X.7B21 rules) [NB: see also LC comment at A1.5B3]	request discussion	13: p. 89-90; p. 92; p. 93	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
680	delete rule A2.7B13.1; add reference from A2.5B1 to A2.7B12.1	agree	5: p. 35	agree	Agree	5: p. 12	agree
681	clarify significance of "other" in A2.7B13.2	agree	agree	agree	Agree	5: p. 12	agree
682	change caption on C1.7B13.2 to "early printed resources"	request discussion. Lines 117, 545, 682, 786, 890, 1049 are related	8: p. 45	agree	Request discussion	agree	agree
683	combine C1.7B13.5 with C1.5D1.3.1	agree relates to line 548	13: p. 94	agree	Disagree	agree	agree
684	query scope of C1.7B13.6 and suggest change to caption	agree	13: p. 94	agree	Agree	agree	agree
685	continue to use "ca." as an abbreviation; add to note in C1.7B13.6	no opinion	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree	2C: p. 27
686	move C2.7B13b to a systems requirements note	agree. Relates to other comment (unable to locate) on what belongs in system requirements notes	13: p. 94	agree	Agree	agree	agree
687	change caption of C2.7B13c to indicate type of information recorded	agree	13: p. 94	agree	Agree	agree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
688	make C3.7B13 a subpart of A1.7B13	agree	already covered in reorg of RDA	agree	2C: p. 6	agree	agree
689	add instructions on "analog in origin, digital enhanced sound" to C5.7B	agree. New instructions not needed, but extra example may be helpful	agree with ACOC	agree	Agree	12, p. 16	agree
690	change C6.7B13.1.d to record polarity information in the technical description	agree	12, p. 73; 13: p. 94	agree	Agree	agree	agree
691	change caption of C6.7B13.3c to "Television system", change SECAM example and add examples of three major television systems	agree	13: p. 94	agree	Agree	agree	agree
692	add wording "if considered to be important" to first part of C7.7B13	agree	13: p. 95	agree	Agree	agree	agree (or leave to levels of descr.)
693	delete "that is only available by remote access" from first sentence of C7.7B13	agree	13: p. 95	agree	Agree	agree	agree in principle
694	use second paragraph of C7.5C13.1.2 as a general rule for .5C for all chapters of C that have specific rules at .7B13	agree	agree	agree	13: p. 12	agree	agree
695							
696	**Ancillary material**						
697	add text to A1.7B14	agree	13: p. 84	agree	Agree	agree	agree
698	move second paragraph of A1.7B14 to chapter A2	request discussion	13: p. 84	discuss	Agree	agree	discuss
699	change in second paragraph of A1.7B14 "a regular feature" to "a recurring feature"	agree	13: p. 90	agree	Agree	agree	agree
700	change "regular feature" wording in second paragraph of A1.7B14	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
701	clarify C7.7B14 vs. C7.5A1	agree	13: p. 95	agree	Agree	agree	agree need to simplify these rules and clarify
702							
703	**System requirements**						
704	include at A1.7B15 an instruction to identify equipment that is beyond what is normal and obvious for the medium	agree	13: p. 90	agree	Agree	agree	agree (maybe part of defining the element)
705	add rules to chapter C5 and C6 for systems requirements	agree	13: p. 93	agree	Agree	agree	not applicalbe with new RDA structure
706	include at A1.7B15 text of C7.7B15	13: p. 16	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree
707	revise C7.7B15 to require only type of computer and name of operating system with others as optional	agree	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree - or maybe allow catalogue judgment?	13: p. 41
708							
709	**Mode of access**						
710	address issue of URLs at A1.7B16 or otherwise address in the rules	13: p. 16	ALA supports approach in Editor's follow-up	agree	Agree	agree (& disagree LC)	LC consideres URLs to be item level information

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
711	revisions required to bring rules in line with latest version of ISBD(ER)	13: p. 16	ALA supports approach in Editor's follow-up	agree	Agree	agree	agree to allowing more URLs, but perhaps as option or at higher level of description to avoid necessity for such non-persistent info
712							
713	**Series**						
714	add "For serials" to A2.7B17.1	no opinion	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
715	delete A3.7B17.1	no opinion	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
716	add wording to A2.7B17.2	agree, prefer LC wording	5: p. 35	agree	Disagree	agree LC	agree, (combine with line 717 below)
717	add wording to A2.7B17.2	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
718							
719	**Dissertations**						
720	replace "formal thesis statement" at A1.7B18 with "statement declaring the resource is a thesis"	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	13: p. 39
721	in first paragraph of A1.7B18 add "or an appropriate equivalent" after (master's))	agree, consider rule needs rewording to simplify	agree with ACOC	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
722							
723	**Audience**						

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
724	reword A1.7B19	agree, prefer 1st re-wording	13: p. 90	agree	Agree	agree	agree in principle, work on wording
725							
726	**Summary**						
727	review instructions in A1.7B20 for a resource "that consists entirely or predominantly of music"	agree re removing exception. Example in CILIP reponse may be considered a related reource note.	request discussion	agree	Agree	13: p. 17	agree retaining for accessible materials and indicate reason for including summary
728	suggest rewording for "music" in A1.7B20	disagree, prefer delete bracketed instruction, if ALA suggestion adopted perhaps just add 'recorded' before music.	13: p. 90	disagree	Disagree	disagree	disagree
729	include in A1.7B20 instruction to add a summary for accessible materials	agree	agree	agree	Agree	13: p. 17	agree
730	suggest add to end of A1.7B20 "if considered to be important"	agree	13: p. 90	agree	Agree	agree	agree, but can't this be part of levels of descr.?

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
731	add new rule for Awards	agree. A similar case could be made for exhibitions. Suggest we check MARC21 for notes not covered by AACR3	13: pp. 90-91	agree	Agree	agree	agree (again would like discussion of "if considered to be important" in light of levels of description)
732							
733	**Contents**						
734	revise A1.7B21: to cover provisions in B4.7B21 and B6.7B21	13: p. 17	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree in principle, but would result in needing LCRI to exclude extent - can we leave that out or make more optional?
735	revise A1.7B21: add a paragraph adapted from B3.7B21	13: p. 17	agree	agree	Agree	agree	agree in principle, but needs work on wording
736	revise A1.7B21: change instructions on recording titles formally	13: p. 17	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree	agree in principle, but needs work on wording

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
737	change instructions at A1.7B21 on recording titles formally	agree, prefer ACOC wording or combination of both	13: p. 85	agree	Agree	agree LC	agree in principle, but need to assure machine-derived capture of contents info from publisher or any other source (as would be cited)
738	add a general instruction to A1.7B21 on other information to be recorded	agree, prefer ACOC wording	13: p. 85	agree	Agree	agree	agree; ACOC wording presents problems with "on the head of a part…"
739	add to A1.7B21 or A2.7B21 "Do not give contents notes for monographic series"	query	13: p. 85	disagree	Agree	disagree	disagree; to cover in levels of descr. (prefer to avoid "do not" rules")
740	fold B4.7B21 into A1.7B21, or move relevant example	agree	agree	agree	2B: p. 4	agree	2B: p. 21
741	change end of second sentence of B4.7B21	agree, suggest revise ACOC suggestion in line 734	agree with ACOC	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
742	add more guidance to B6.7B21	request discussion, prefer to add guidance using a general statement referring to the recording of these details elsewhere in the description, plus provide e.g.s	13: p. 93	discuss	Agree	disagree	disagree; already addressed the HH:MM:SS format and otherwise the format of a contents note sholud be open; especially to allow capture from other cited sources
743							
744	**Indexes and finding aids**						
745	add general guidance on when notes are included in the shareable part of the bibliographic description (e.g. A1.7B22, A1.7B28, A1.7B29, A1.7B30)	13: pp. 18	request discussion	discuss	Agree	agree	will this be covered in levels of descr?
746	clarify scope of A1.7B22	query	agree	agree	Agree	13: p. 17	agree in principle
747	separate A1.7B22 into separate rules	request discussion. Depends on degree of simplification for RDA	13: p. 91	agree	Agree	discuss	disuss

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
748	make A1.7B22 unequivocal re indexes	request discussion. Revise rule to say make notes if known, not if important	request discussion	agree	Agree	13: p. 17	disagree; prefer to leave this to levels of description
749	revise wording of A1.7B22	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
750							
751	**Reference to published descriptions**						
752	expand A1.7B23	agree	13: p. 91	agree	Agree	agree	agree
753							
754	**Numbers associated with the resource**						
755	add text from DACS to A1.7B24	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/3
756	state explicitly at A1.7B24 punctuation for consecutive numbers	agree, could cover by general instruction plus examples	13: p. 91	agree	Agree*	agree	agree with offering suggested structure/ punctuation (part of "display/ presentation" appendix?)
757	delete second sentence in second paragraph of A1.7B24; give precedence to practice used for sound recordings as general rule	agree	request discussion	discuss	2A: p. 3	discuss	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
758	expand A1.7B24 to include recording of abbreviations, etc., preceding the number	13: p. 17	agree	agree	Agree	disagree	LC prefers to take what you see (transcribe what you see); also not prescribe punctuation other than in Appendix on display
759	expand A1.7B24 to cover provisions in B2.7B24 and B6.7B24	13: pp. 17-18	agree	agree	Agree	agree	What's the principle here? Why not leave to levels of description and take what you see?
760	use of "volumes" in A1.7B24 problematic	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
761	reword second paragraph of B2.7B24	request discussion. OK to printed	request discussion	discuss	Disagree	disagree	Ed. table
762							
763	**"With" notes**						
764	query whether A1.7B25 covers 12.7B22	agree	13: p. 86	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	agree
765	simplify "if" clause in A1.7B25	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
766							
767	**Details of the original**						
768	add text from DACS to A1.7B26	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/3

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
769	use "original manifestation" in A1.7B26 caption and text, delete reference to A1.7A4	agree	13: p. 91	agree	Agree	agree	agree
770	merge A1.7B26 with A1.7A4	agree, but if not merge, place together	2A: p. 20	agree	Agree	agree	agree, to be covered with new RDA structure?
771							
772	**Issue, iteration, or part described**						
773	revise A1.7B27 first paragraph to reflect terms at A1.0A1	disagree. Terms are used are correct	request discussion	discuss	13: p. 12	disagree	see 5JSC/LC /1/Rev
774	remove reference to multipart monographs from A1.7B27 (already covered)	disagree	request discussion	13: p. 21	Disagree	agree	disagree
775	correct wording of A1.7B27	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
776	revise caption for A2.7B27 to remove "iteration"	request discussion. Should caption use term from intro, e.g. 'basis of description'?	5: pp. 35-36; 16: p. 118	discuss	Agree*	5: p. 12	not applicable with new RDA structure; when have general rule, then covers all modes of issuance
777	revise instructions in A2.7B27.1 re combining notes	request discussion	5: pp. 35-36	discuss	Disagree	5: p. 12	discuss
778	reword A2.7B27.1b and c	agree	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
779	revise A2.7B27.1c	request discussion	request discussion	5: p. 13	Disagree	disagree	not applicable with new RDA structure; makes moot

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
780	revise caption for A3.7B27 to remove "issue" and "part"	agree	6: p. 39; 16: p. 118	agree	Agree*	5: p. 12	agree
781	question need for A3.7B27.1	agree	agree	agree	6: p. 7	agree	not applicable with new RDA structure; makes moot
782							
783	**Item being described and library's holdings**						
784	delete second paragraph of A1.7B28 as holdings outside scope	request discussion as per ACOC comment at line 745	13: p. 91	discuss	Disagree	discuss	discuss
785	add instructions to A1.7B28 for other local notes	agree, relates to ACOC comment at line 745	13: p. 91	agree	Agree	agree	agree, see response line 784
786	change reference at A1.7B28 from "early printed books, etc." to "early printed resources"	request discussion. Lines 117, 545, 682, 786, 890, 1049 are related	13: p. 91	agree	Request discussion	agree	agree
787	expand C1.7B28.1 to apply to all printed resources	agree, however note this relates to ACOC comment at line 745	8: p. 46	agree	Agree	agree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
788	generalize C1.7B28.1 to apply beyond print and graphic media	request discussion	8: p. 46-47	agree	Agree	agree	agree
789							
790	**Donor, source, etc., and previous owner(s)**						
791	split A1.7B29 into two notes and add text from DACS	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/3
792	split A1.7B29 into two paragraphs	agree	13: pp. 91-92	discuss LC proposal	Wait for LC proposal	wait for LC	See 5JSC/LC/3
793	insert new rule on "appraisal and accrual notes"	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/3
794							
795	**Restrictions on access and use**						
796	specify in A1.7B30 whether restrictions are universally applicable or only local	agree, relates to ACOC comment at line 745	13: p. 92	discuss	Agree	discuss	agree need to clarify when universally applicable restriction or local only
797	split A1.7B30 into separate paragraphs and add text based on DACS	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/3
798							
799	**Standard number and terms of availability**						
800	add "key title" to caption for A1.8	2A: p. 5	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree	agree
801	delete A1.8A2	-	-	-	-	-	see 5JSC/LC/1/Rev

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
802	add instructions at A1.8B1 re ISSN for electronic serials	query. Part of work of examples group?	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	2A: p. 6	query, isn't this a matter for the ISSN community to resolve giving an ISSN for electronic versions?
803	clarify relationship between guidelines for assigning ISSNs and rules requiring a new description	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	2A: p. 6	query, isn't this an ISSN issue and we'd just record what they provide?
804	revise A1.8B1to include persistent identifiers in line with ISBD(ER)	2A: p. 6	ALA supports approach in Editor's follow-up	discuss	Request discussion	agree	agree
805	reword A1.8B1 to include "any internationally recognized standard number"	query, suggestion appears to reflect existing wording	agree	agree	Request discussion	agree with ACOC; wording could be tidied anyway	2A: p. 19
806	revise A1.8B1: add reference to A1.7B24 and delete A1.8B3	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
807	revise A1.8B1: delete explanation for third example	agree	agree	Examples Group	Examples Group	agree	Ed. table
808	revise A1.8B1: include examples of other standard numbers e.g. ISRC, ISMN	2A: p. 6	agree	Examples Group	Examples Group	agree	Ed. table
809	add examples of a 13-digit ISBN in area 8	2A: p. 6	agree	Examples Group	Examples Group	2A: p. 6	agree, for the TF on Examples

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
810	add instructions to A1.8B2 to apply to the description of a single part of a multipart monograph	agree with re-wording	agree	2A: p. 7	Agree	agree	agree
811	at A1.8C1 consider giving the key-title even if no ISSN	agree	agree	discuss	Request discussion	agree	Ed. table
812	question rationale for A3.8E1	agree	6: p. 39	agree	Agree	agree	discuss - why not just give for consistency with past practice?
813							
814	**Multimedia resources**						
815	change label at A1.9	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
816	clarify scope of A1.9 to include multimedia resources that are in a single part	request discussion	17, p. 128	agree	Agree	agree	discuss
817	add option in A1.9B2 to use "case" or "kit" in extent, with further option to describe components in a note	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	2A: p. 6	discuss
818	in A1.9B2b change "on a separate line" to "separately"	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	Ed. table
819							
820	**"In" Analytics**						
821	in A1.10A change "numbering" in lists of elements to "material (or type of publication) specific details"	agree	17, p. 128-129	agree	Agree	agree	agree
822	in A1.10A second paragraph change parenthetical after "numbering"	agree	request discussion	moot?	Agree	dead?	now moot - cancel Ed. table
823	in A1.10A third paragraph revise wording in list of elements for "numbering …"	agree	request discussion	moot?	Agree	dead?	now moot - cancel Ed. table
824							
825	**Multilevel description**						
826	don't use term "level" in A1.11A (confusing with levels of description)	agree	17, p. 129	agree	Agree	agree	agree, but see 5JSC/LC/1/rev.

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
827	change in third line of A1.11A "relating to the resource as a whole" to "relating to the aggregate resource"	query	request discussion	disagree	Request discussion	disagree	Ed. table
828							
829	**Glossary**						
830	**General**	New note: need to re-consider after guidelines for revised glossary agreed	agree	agree			
831	add definitions for all GMDs	14: p. 18	14: p. 96	agree	Agree	agree - unless there are signfiicant no of additions	14: p. 41
832	investigate references to physical manifestations	agree	14: p. 96	agree	Agree	agree	agree
833	minimize the number of technical definitions	agree	14: p. 96	agree	Agree	agree	agree
834	include terms for both the resource as a whole and a resource excluding its ancillary material	agree	14: p. 96	agree	Agree	agree	agree
835							
836	**Comments on specific terms:**						
837	Access point: replace "identified" with "retrieved"	agree	14: p. 96	discuss	Disagree	agree	agree
838	Added title page: phrase does not occur in AACR3 part 1	agree	14: p. 96	agree	Agree	agree	agree
839	Aggregate resource: address Web sites	agree	14: pp. 96-97	agree	Agree	agree	agree
840	Aggregate resource: use semicolons instead of colons	agree	14: pp. 96-97	agree	Agree	agree	agree
841	Alternative title: revise second clause to " … the parts are often joined by …"	agree	14: p. 97	agree	Agree	agree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
842	Ancillary material: prefer "Accompanying material"	agree s/a lines 560, 842, 1042	14: p. 97	agree	Agree	agree	agree
843	Architectural rendering: remove "before it has been built"	agree	14: p. 97	agree	Agree	agree	agree
844	Art print: add "block or screen"	agree	14: p. 97	agree	Agree	agree	agree, but do we need "etc." in case of others?
845	Art reproduction: change "electronically" to "digitally"	agree	14: p. 97	agree	Agree	agree	agree
846	Assembled collection: revise based on recommendation from SAA	agree, prefer LC wording as per line 848	14: p. 97	agree	Agree	agree	agree
847	Assembled collection: revise to make plain that it covers distributed collections	agree	request discussion	agree	Agree	14: p. 18	agree
848	Assembled collection: revise wording	agree	request discussion	agree	Agree	prefer ALA wording (846)	14: p. 41
849	Atlas: query scope and second sentence	agree	14: p. 97	agree	Agree	agree	agree
850	Atlas: prefer AACR2 definition	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	14: p. 41
851	Audio description: add definition	query. CILIP comment unclear	request discussion	discuss	Query	14: p. 18	discuss, not sure what this is
852	Audio media: clarify if MP3 files belong here or with digital media	agree. Clarify if needed	14: pp. 97-98	agree	Agree	agree	agree
853	Audio media: note that MP3 format not mentioned	agree. Clarify if needed	agree	agree	Agree	14: p. 18	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
854	Audio media: put turntables last in list of examples	no opinion	14: pp. 97-98	agree	Agree	agree	agree, but it's not crucial
855	Audio media: rewrite definition with clear, simple language	agree	14: pp. 97-98	agree	Agree	agree	agree
856	Bibliographic description: add definition	agree	request discussion	agree	14: p. 12	agree	agree
857	Binder's title: revise definition	agree	14: p. 98	agree	Agree	agree	agree
858	Braille cassette: add definition?	agree	disagree - prefer to delete from table	discuss	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	14: p. 18	agree
859	Caption title: revise definition	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	14: p. 41
860	Cartographic resource: query inclusion of "or any imaginary place"	disagree, although uncommon it would otherwise not be clear they should be treated as cartographic	14: p. 98	disagree	Disagree	disagree	disagree
861	Case: query use of "material" instead of "resource"	agree	14: p. 98	agree	Agree	agree	agree
862	Catalog number (Sound recordings): add see reference to "Label number" (new)	agree addition of reference, should be catalogue number	agree	agree	Agree	agree	14: p. 41
863	Chinese style: reference to "Oriental" may be considered offensive	agree	14: p. 98	discuss	Disagree	disagree	agree
864	Chorus part: add definition, wording suggested	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	14: p. 42

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
865	Chorus score: revise wording	agree	See 5JSC/ AACR3/I /LC resp/ ALA resp	wait for ALA	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	wait for ALA	14: p. 42
866	Closed captioning: add definition [was: close captioning]	agree. Define 'closed captioning if used in the rules	agree	agree	Agree	14: p. 18	agree, 'closed'
867	Collection: add definition, wording suggested, with see also reference to "Assembled collection"	request discussion, re relationship with published collections. Issue both in glossary and rules	agree with ACOC	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	14: p. 41
868	Collective title: add second sentence	agree	14: p. 98	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	agree, except say "supplied by a cataloger"
869	Component: revise definition	request discussion	14: p. 98	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
870	Component: use an alternative term for the technical description	request discussion	request discussion	14: p. 22	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
871	Component: revise definition	disagree	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	14: p. 42

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
872	Component part: clarify definition	disagree	14: p. 98	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
873	Condensed score: revise definition	no opinion	See 5JSC/ AACR3/I /LC resp/ ALA resp	discuss	Being discussed- GMD/SMD	wait for ALA	14: p. 42
874	Container: query use of "material" instead of "resource"	agree	14: p. 99	agree	Agree	agree	agree
875	Content: add definition	disagree, dictionary definition. To be discussed as part of Glossary policy revision	14: p. 99	discuss	Agree	disagree	14: p. 42
876	Continuing resources: include multipart monographs	agree	14: p. 99	agree	Agree	agree	agree
877	Copy: consult CC:DA Task Force on FRBR Terminology response to draft of Part 1	agree	14: p. 99	agree	Agree	agree	agree
878	Data: add definition	disagree, dictionary definition. To be discussed as part of Glossary policy revision	disagree	disagree	14: p. 12	disagree	disagree, unless we decide to define all the terms for types of content
879	Dependent supplement: add definition	agree. define if used in the rules	14: p. 99	agree	Agree	14: p. 18	agree
880	Devised title: query distinction between this and supplied titles [divided opinion]	request discussion	14: p. 99	discuss	Agree	maintain distinctio n	we don't like the fine distinction

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
881	Digital media: rewrite definition with clear, simple language	request discussion	14: p. 99	agree	Agree	agree	agree
882	Digital media: revise definition	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	14: p. 42
883	Digital resource: query whether "computer resource" or "computer-based" resource would be less ambiguous	request discussion	14: p. 100	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
884	Digital resource: query whether digital is appropriate for data and programs	request discussion	14: p. 100	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
885	Direct access (Digital resources): use "digital resources" rather than "computer files"	agree	14: p. 100	agree	Agree	agree	agree
886	Direct access (Digital resources): clarify definition vs. "Remote access (Digital resources)"	agree	14: p. 100	agree	Agree	agree	agree
887	Disc (Analog resources): add see reference to "Sound disc" (new)	agree	14: p. 100	agree	Agree	agree	agree
888	Disc (Digital resources): add see also reference to "Sound disc" (new)	agree	14: p. 100	agree	Agree	agree	agree
889	Double leaf: reference to "Oriental" may be considered offensive	agree	14: p. 100	discuss	Disagree	disagree	agree
890	Early printed resource: add definition	request discussion. Lines 117, 545, 682, 786, 890, 1049 are related	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	14: p. 42
891	Edition: consult CC:DA Task Force on FRBR Terminology response to draft of Part 1	agree	14: p. 100	agree	Agree	agree	agree
892	Edition (Intangible resources): query inclusion in Glossary	request discussion	14: p. 100	agree	Request discussion	agree	agree
893	Edition (Tangible resources): concern re loss of final sentence from AACR2	agree	14: p. 101	agree	Agree	agree	agree
894	Electronic resource: add see reference to "Digital resource"	agree	14: p. 98	agree	Agree	agree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
895	Entry: query whether this definition is required	request discussion	14: p. 101	agree	Request discussion	agree	agree
896	Explicit: delete from Glossary	agree, not used in rules. To be discussed as part of Glossary policy revision	14: p. 101	agree	Agree	agree	agree
897	Extent: query whether definition should include mention of file size	agree	14: p. 101	agree	Agree	agree	agree
898	Fascicle: use "formal component unit" instead of "formal constituent unit"	request discussion on components, constituents etc. LC suggestion in line 899 removes need for this term	14: p. 101	discuss	Request discussion	disagree agree LC	disagree, prefer solution in line 899 below
899	Fascicle: revise last sentence	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	14: p. 42
900	File (Digital resources): query whether second sentence belongs at entry for "Digital resource"	agree, also belongs there	14: p. 101	agree	Agree	agree LC	agree, belongs both places
901	Filmslip: add definition	agree	14: p. 101	agree	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	no idea - what is it?	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
902	Filmstrip: revise definition	agree	14: p. 101	agree	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	agree
903	Finding aids: add definition	agree	agree	agree	14: p. 13	agree	agree
904	Focus for the description: if used in rules, add definition	agree	14: p. 101	agree	Agree	agree	agree
905	Format: illustrate difference between this and "Medium"	agree	14: p. 101	agree	Agree	agree	agree
906	Format: revise to cover digital materials	agree	14: p. 101	agree	Agree	agree	agree
907	Format: add a see also reference to "Manifestation"	agree	14: p. 101	agree	Agree	agree	agree
908	General material designation: revise to indicate that GMD may be a composite term	14: p. 18	request discussion	discuss	Agree	discuss	no logner applicable, as this concept may disappear
909	General material designation: replace "or" with "and"	agree, prefer LC line 910	14: p. 101	discuss	Agree	agree ACOC	no logner applicable, as this concept may disappear
910	General material designation: revise definition	agree	request discussion	discuss	Agree	agree	14: p. 42, no logner applicable, as this concept may disappear
911	Globe: revise definition	agree	14: p. 102	agree	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
912	Globe: query inclusion of "or any imaginary place"	disagree, although uncommon it would otherwise not be clear they should be treated as cartographic	14: p. 102	disagree	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	disagree	disagree, prefer to keep
913	Half-title: query extending concept to frames, screens, etc.	agree	14: p. 102	agree	Agree	agree	agree
914	Incipit: delete from Glossary	agree	14: p. 101	agree	Agree	agree	agree
915	"In" analytic: add definition	agree	request discussion	agree	14: p. 13	agree	agree
916	Integrating resource: revise definition to include concept of replacement volume	agree	14: p. 102	agree	Agree	agree, but not keen on precise wording; "replacement volume set" not in general use here	disagree
917	Issue number (Sound recordings): add see reference to "Label number" (new)	agree	See 5JSC/AACR3/I/LC resp/ALA resp	agree	Agree	agree	14: p. 42
918	Item: consult CC:DA Task Force on FRBR Terminology response to draft of Part 1	agree	14: p. 102	agree	Agree	agree	agree
919	Japanese style: reference to "Oriental" may be considered offensive	agree	14: p. 102	discuss	Disagree	disagree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
920	Key-title: omit hyphen and include "continuing" before "resource"	agree	14: p. 102	agree	Agree	agree	agree
921	Kit: query omission [Need for it dependent on final text]	agree. define if used in the rules & meaning different from dictionary definition	request discussion	agree	Agree	2A: p. 6	agree, keep
922	Label: add definition based on AACR2 footnote in 6.0B1	diagree. Dictionary definition. To be discussed as part of Glossary policy revision	14: p. 102	disagree	Agree	disagree	disagree
923	Label number: add definition, wording suggested	agree	See 5JSC/ AACR3/I /LC resp/ ALA resp	agree	Agree	wait for ALA	14: p. 42
924	Libretto: add definition, wording suggested	disagree, term not used in rules. To be discussed as part of Glossary policy revision	See 5JSC/ AACR3/I /LC resp/ ALA resp	discuss	Agree	wait for ALA	14: p. 43

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
925	Light box: add definition	disagree, dictionary definition. To be discussed as part of Glossary policy revision	14: p. 109	disagree	Agree	disagree	disagree
926	Machine-readable data file: query if reference still required	agree	14: p. 102	agree	Agree	agree	agree
927	Manifestation: include that physical embodiments may include "intangible resources"	agree	14: p. 103	agree	Agree	agree	agree
928	Manifestation: add FRBR definition	agree, modify as needed	agree	agree	Agree	agree	14: p. 43
929	Manuscript: clarify difference between "manuscript" and "unpublished"	request discussion	14: p. 103	agree	Agree	agree	discuss
930	Manuscript: revise definition	request discussion	request discussion	agree	Agree	discuss	14: p. 43
931	Map: query inclusion of "or any imaginary place"	disagree, although uncommon it would otherwise not be clear they should be treated as cartographic	14: p. 103	disagree	Disagree	disagree	disagree, prefer keep
932	Map series: add definition, wording suggested	agree	14: p. 103	agree	Agree	agree	agree
933	Medium: query meaning of "print" in example	request discussion re format and medium	14: p. 103	discuss	Disagree	disagree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
934	Medium: expand definition	request discussion re format and medium	14: p. 103	agree	Agree	agree	agree, defn. needs re-working
935	Medium: add definition of term in context of GMDs/SMDs	request discussion re format and medium	request discussion	discuss	Agree	discuss	14: p. 43
936	Microform: include need for magnification device	agree	14: p. 103	agree	Agree	agree	agree
937	Micrographic: if term is used in the rules add definition	agree	14: p. 104	14: p. 22	Agree	agree	agree
938	Miniature score: reconcile with footnote at C1.5B2.2.3	agree	14: p. 104	agree	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	wait for ALA	disagree, prefer solution in line 942 below
939	Miniature score: revise to say "See Score"	agree	See 5JSC/AACR3/I/LC resp/ALA resp	agree	Agree	wait for ALA	14: p. 43
940	Model: remove "of a real thing"	agree	14: p. 104	agree	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	agree
941	Moon: [tactile alphabet] add definition	agree. Define if used in rules	request discussion	agree	Agree	14: p. 18	agree, if in rules
942	Moving image: add definition(GMD), wording suggested	request discussion on appropriate termininology in rules	14: p. 104	agree	Agree	discuss	discuss
943	Multilevel description: add definition	agree	14: p. 104	agree	14: p. 13	agree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
944	Multimedia resource: refer to first definition under "Medium"	request discussion	14: p. 104	discuss	Agree	discuss	discuss
945	Multimedia resource: query application of definition	request discussion	14: p. 104	discuss	Agree	discuss	discuss
946	Multimedia resource: add definition (are conveyed in different media)	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Agree	discuss	14: p. 43
947	Multipart monograph: replace "within more than one but" with "in"	agree	14: p. 104	agree	Agree	agree	agree
948	Multipart resource: query whether definition includes serials, if so add to definition	agree	14: p. 104	discuss	Agree	discuss	discuss; it covers serials but what about integrating resources?
949	Music: revise parenthetical definition of "musical notation"	agree	14: p. 105	agree	Agree	agree	agree
950	Music: expand definition beyond usage as GMD	agree	14: p. 105	agree	Agree	agree	agree, esp. in light of new approach to GMD
951	Music: change "Braille" to "braille"	agree	request discussion	discuss	14: p. 13	discuss	agree
952	Musical presentation statement: query inclusion of "or musical"; query if "physical" is necessary; query inclusion of "source of information" and added clause	agree	14: p. 105	agree	Agree	agree	agree - just say presentation of the music
953	Musical presentation statement: rename "Musical format statement" and revise	-	-	-	-	-	See 5JSC/LC/4
954	Nonprocessed sound recording: include "field recording"	agree	See 5JSC/ AACR3/I /LC resp/ ALA resp	agree	Agree	wait for ALA	14: p. 43

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
955	Numbering: reservations re extension to all multipart resources; revise second sentence	agree	14: p. 105	agree	Being discussed	agree	agreed to limit to serials for numbering area, but other things also have numbering ; addition to secod sentence is helpful
956	Optical disc (Digital resources): include "DVD-ROM"	request discussion of term.	14: p. 105	discuss	Agree	discuss	discuss
957	Optical disc (Digital resources): add see also references to "Sound disc" (new)	request discussion of term.	14: p. 105	discuss	Agree	discuss	discuss
958	Other title information: use "manifestation" rather than "resource"	agree	14: p. 105	agree	Agree	agree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
959	Overhead projectual: use "Overhead projector" and define it	disagree. Term intended to cover the thing that is projected not the projector - but prefer remove reference: neither term is used in the rules nor differs from dictionary definition.	14: p. 105	disagree	Agree	disagree	disagree; don't need term
960	Pamphlet: exclude music in a notated form; query use of "independent"	request discussion	14: p. 105	discuss	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	discuss	discuss
961	Pamphlet: query second definition	request discussion	14: p. 105	discuss	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	discuss	discuss
962	Pamphlet: make definition more helpful	request discussion	request discussion	agree	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	14: p. 18	discuss
963	Pamphlet: revise first definition, add closing period to second definition	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	discuss	14: p. 43
964	Part: clarify "one of two or more physical units" in definition 2	agree	14: p. 106	agree	Agree	agree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
965	Part: change term used to distinguish fascicles from parts	agree	14: p. 106	agree	Agree	agree	agree
966	Part: query whether definition 2 is related to individual library binding policies	agree	14: p. 106	agree	Agree	agree	agree
967	Part: use "formal component unit" instead of "formal constituent unit"	request discussion of constiuent and component	14: p. 106	discuss	Agree	discuss	agree
968	Part: change form of see also reference to second definition of "Issue"	agree	agree	agree	14: p. 13	agree	agree
969	Part: add definition of term in context of GMDs/SMDs	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	14: p. 43, may be moot with new approach to GMD
970	Part (Music): revise definition	agree on need for revision, too complex phrasing used in 2nd definition	See 5JSC/ AACR3/I /LC resp/ ALA resp	agree	Agree	wait for ALA	14: p. 43
971	Photograph: add definition, wording suggested	request discusion in relation to policy on Glossary	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree	14: p. 43
972	Physical unit: add definition	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	14: p. 13	discuss	discuss

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
973	Piano [violin, etc.] conductor part: delete and replace with two separate entries, wording suggested	agree, add refs	See 5JSC/ AACR3/I /LC resp/ ALA resp	agree	Agree	wait for ALA	14: p. 43
974	Piano reduction: add see reference to "Piano score"	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	14: p. 43
975	Piano score: expand definition to include all non-vocal "piano reductions"	agree	14: p. 106	agree	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	disagree, prefer solution at line 976 below
976	Piano score: revise definition	agree	See 5JSC/ AACR3/I /LC resp/ ALA resp	agree	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	wait for ALA	14: p. 43
977	Piece: note also used in rules for pieces of a game	agree	14: p. 106	agree	Agree	agree	agree
978	Piece: query whether "physical" is required"	disagree	14: p. 106	discuss	Agree	agree	disagree
979	Plate number (Music): revise definition	request discussion	See 5JSC/ AACR3/I /LC resp/ ALA resp	discuss	Request discussion	wait for ALA	14: p. 44
980	Preliminaries: change comma to semicolons in three phrases	agree	14: p. 107	agree	Agree	agree	agree
981	Preliminaries: query extension of concept to other media besides printed books	request discussion	14: p. 107	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
982	Print/Printed: add definition	request discussion	14: p. 107	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
983	Prominent: add definition	request discussion, prefer to use in dictionary sense, rather than relate to prescribed sources	14: p. 107	discuss	Agree	discuss	discuss
984	Published: add definition	agree	14: p. 107	agree	Agree	agree	agree
985	Publisher: add definition	agree	request discussion	14: p. 22	Agree	agree	agree
986	Publisher's number (music): revise definition	no opinion	agree	agree	Request discussion	agree (assume ALA not covering in #865 doc)	14: p. 44
987	Publisher's stock number (sound recordings): add see reference to "Label number" (new)	agree	See 5JSC/ AACR3/I /LC resp/ ALA resp	agree	Agree	agree	14: p. 44
988	Recto: query re Anglo-centric bias in definition 2	query	14: p. 107	disagree	Request discussion	disagree	
989	Reduced score: add see reference to "Condensed score"	agree	agree	agree	Being discussed- GMD/SMD	agree	14: p. 44

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
990	Reference source: use "resource" instead of "source"	disagree, source makes it clearer that this can include people, letters etc.	14: p. 107	disagree	Disagree	disagree	disagree LA, agree ACOC
991	Replacement volume set: add definition, wording suggested	agree	14: p. 107	agree	Agree	agree, but would rather not use at all if poss (see 916)	agree
992	Reproduction: add definition; or find better term	request discusion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	14: p. 44
993	Resource: see comments	request discusion	14: p. 108	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
994	Resource, Digital: query whether inverted see reference is necessary	agree	14: p. 108	agree	Agree	agree	agree
995	Score: revise definition	agree	See 5JSC/AACR3/I/LC resp/ ALA resp	agree	Being discussed- GMD/SMD	wait for ALA	14: p. 44
996	Section (Cartography): revise wording	agree	14: p. 108	agree	Agree	agree	agree
997	Set of music materials: add definition, wording suggested	request discussion.	See 5JSC/AACR3/I/LC resp/ ALA resp	discuss	Request discussion	wait for ALA	14: p. 44

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
998	Sheet: exclude music in notated form from definition	request discussion.	14: p. 108	discuss	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	discuss	discuss
999	Sheet: include broadside	request discussion.	14: p. 108	discuss	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	discuss	discuss
1000	Sheet: revise definition	request discussion.	request discussion	discuss	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	discuss	14: p. 44
1001	Single-part resource: add definition	request discussion	3: p. 27	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	14: p. 44
1002	Sleeve: revise wording	agree	14: p. 108	agree	Agree	agree	agree
1003	Sound disc: add definition	agree	14: p. 108	agree	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	agree	agree
1004	Sound recording: include a cross reference to "Non-processed sound recording"	agree	14: p. 108	agree	Agree	agree	agree
1005	Specific material designation: query limitation to physical unit	request discussion	14: p. 108	discuss	Being discussed-GMD/SMD	discuss	disagree, should be covered by TF on type & form of content/ carrier
1006	Standard number: delete "uniquely"	agree, or add 'is intended to'	14: p. 108	agree ACOC	Disagree	agree ACOC	agree ACOC
1007	Statement of responsibility: use "manifestation" instead of "resource"	request discussion	14: p. 108	agree	Request discussion	agree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
1008	Statement of responsibility: extend to cover situation provided for by A1.1F14	disagree. existing wording already covers A1.1F14 as is state 'relating to' not 'named'	agree, request discussion	discuss	Disagree	14: p. 18	disagree, as rule covers the exception
1009	Study score: add see reference to "Score"	agree	See 5JSC/ AACR3/I /LC resp/ ALA resp	agree	Agree	agree	14: p. 44
1010	Supplied title: revise initial phrase	agree	14: p. 108	agree	Agree	agree	agree
1011	Tactile media: revise definition	agree	14: p. 108	agree	Agree	agree	agree
1012	Tactile media: change "for use by the visually impaired" to "for use by visually impaired people"	request discussion. Australian community preference is 'people with visual impairments'	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	14: p. 18	agree ACOC rewording
1013	Tactile media: add period to end of definition	agree	agree	agree	14: p. 13	agree	agree (editorial correction - not needed in this table)
1014	Technical description: add definition	disagree, prefer to define scope in the rules	14: p. 109	agree	Disagree	agree	agree (just as adding bibliographic description)

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
1015	Text: broaden definition	agree	14: p. 109	agree	Being discussed- GMD/SMD	agree	agree
1016	Text: revise definition 2	agree	See 5JSC/ AACR3/I /LC resp/ ALA resp	agree	Being discussed- GMD/SMD	agree	14: p. 44
1017	Tinted: add definition	disagree, dictionary definition. To be discussed as part of Glossary policy revision	14: p. 109	disagree	Disagree	disagree	disagree
1018	Title frame: query whether title has to be included	agree	14: p. 109	agree	Agree	agree	agree
1019	Title page: clarify that analytical title page is part of the definition	agree	14: p. 109	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	agree
1020	Traditional format (Oriental books): reference to "Oriental" may be considered offensive	agree	14: p. 109	discuss	Disagree	disagree	agree
1021	Trailer: delete "to be released at a later date"	agree	14: p. 109	agree	Agree	agree	agree
1022	Unit: add definition, wording suggested	query	request discussion	agree	Agree	agree	14: p. 44
1023	Unpublished: add definition	agree	14: p. 107	agree	Agree	agree	agree (may also need self-describing…)
1024	Verso: query re Anglo-centric bias in definition 2	agree	14: p. 109	disagree	Disagree	disagree	agree
1025	Video media: rewrite definition with clear, simple language	agree, but request discussion	14: p. 109	agree	Request discussion	agree	agree

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
1026	Violin conductor part: add definition, wording suggested	agree	See 5JSC/ AACR3/I /LC resp/ ALA resp	agree	Agree	wait for ALA	14: p. 44
1027	Vocal score: revise definition	query	See 5JSC/ AACR3/I /LC resp/ ALA resp	query	Being discussed- GMD/SMD	wait for ALA	14: p. 44
1028	Volume: query electronic multipart resources coming under definition 1 only	agree	14: pp. 109-110	agree	Agree	agree	agree
1029	Volume: rewording of definition 2	agree	14: pp. 109-110	agree	Agree	agree	agree
1030	Work: add definition	14: p. 18	14: p. 110	14: p. 22	Agree	14: p. 18	agree per line 1031 below
1031	Work: add FRBR definition	agree, modify as needed	agree	agree	Agree	agree	14: p. 44
1032							
1033	**Other comments on terminology**						
1034	no use of the term metadata	agree. Can be included in introductory material relating RDA to other standards	1A: p. 6	agree ACOC	Agree	agree ACOC	agree ACOC
1035	avoid creation of additional jargon	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	disagree	1A: p. 12
1036	restrict use of the term "publication"	agree	1A: p. 6	agree	Agree	agree	agree
1037	regularize synonymous terms for "unpublished" (e.g., "non-processed", "unedited")	agree	agree	agree	Agree	agree	4: pp. 28-29

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
1038	acknowledge different use of term "multilevel description" in archival description	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	discuss (cf 16)	2A: p. 20
1039	inconsistent use of terms "facsimile", etc.	agree	1A: p. 6	agree	Agree	agree	agree
1040	clarify meaning of "artefacts that are not intended primarily for communication"	disagree, meaning is probably as clear a s it can be!	4: p. 29	agree ACOC	Request discussion	disagree agree ACOC	agree, but have no solution to recommend
1041	question varying use of "carrier" and "physical carrier"	agree	1A: p. 7	agree	Agree	agree	agree
1042	prefer "accompanying material" to "ancillary material"	agree s/a lines 560, 842, 1042	1A: p. 7	agree	Agree	agree	2A: p. 19
1043	question use of adjectival vs. other forms for chapter headings in Section B	being discussd as part of new structure	2B: p. 20	being discussed	Being discussed	being discussed	not applicable with new RDS structure?
1044	question use of "image" in scope notes referring to cartographic resources	agree	2C: p. 23	agree	Agree	agree	agree
1045	consider using "printed" instead of "print"	request discussion	2C: p. 23	discuss	Request discussion	2C: p. 8	discuss
1046	question use of the term "graphic" to refer to both content and media	agree	agree	agree	Being discussed- GMD/SMD	agree	2C: p. 26
1047	question significance of change from microform to micrographic	agree	1A: p. 6; 2C: p. 23	agree	Agree	agree LC	agree, prefer microform

Line	Comment	ACOC	ALA	BL	CCC	CILIP	LC
1048	question suitability of the term "tactile material"	disagree, but perhaps include refs from these terms in Glossary?	1A: p. 6	disagree - agree ACOC	Query	disagree agree ACOC	disagree
1049	use of "early printed books, etc." vs. "early printed resources"	request discussion. Lines 117, 545, 682, 786, 890, 1049 are related	1A: p. 7	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	agree
1050	reinstate use of "realia"	request discussion re best term	2B: p. 22	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	discuss
1051	use of "component" needs to be clarified	agree	12: p. 66	agree	Agree	agree	agree
1052							
1053	**Appendices**						
1054	when App. A is considered, change guideline to transcribe what you see	request discussion	request discussion	discuss	Request discussion	discuss	Ed. table