

To: Joint Steering Committee for Revision of AACR

From: Canadian Committee on Cataloguing

Subject: AACR3 – Part I – Constituency Review of December 2004 Draft

1. Objectives and principles

CCC would like to preface its comments on the draft Part I of AACR3 by expressing its appreciation to the editor. The document provides a sound theoretical framework for cataloguing activities while at the same time reflecting the current reality of the cataloguing environment.

CCC appreciates the increased flexibility introduced in this draft and the fact that rules which were previously limited to a specific type of media are now opened up to other formats.

The principles provided in this document will provide a surer footing for cataloguers to follow when, inevitably, situations arise that will require the exercise of further judgement. As one of CCC's members expressed it, the objectives and principles incorporated in this AACR3 are a kind of "coming of age" for cataloguing. It was also noted that having the principles clearly articulated in the code will facilitate teaching cataloguing and training new cataloguers.

Most of the concerns that were expressed during CCC's discussion of this draft relate to its use by specialist cataloguers who would prefer to have all the rules affecting special materials together in one place. Some of these difficulties would be alleviated by strengthening the reference structure in the text; most of them could be solved by an electronic version of AACR3 which would enable, for example, all of the rules for cartographic materials to be brought together for ease of use.

2. Organization of the rules

Introduction

(p. I-2) Organization of the rules, 5th paragraph, last sentence: it might be helpful to state specifically that where there are gaps in the rule numbering the general rule in chapter A would apply. The assumption is that the rule in A1 applies unless there are specific instructions directing the cataloguer to one of the other chapters.

Section A – General rules

Scope and organization of chapter A1 – General rules for description

(p. A1-10) A1.0D, 3rd sentence: change "entry" to "bibliographic description".

(p. A1-11) A1.0F: instructions on recording separate letters or initials formerly given at 1.1B6 have not been included here. See also comment below at **(p. A1-14) A1.1B1, 2nd sentence.**

(p. A1-13) A1.0L, 1st and 2nd sentences: change "entries" to "bibliographic descriptions".

(p. A1-14) A1.1B1, 2nd sentence: inaccuracies (e.g., use of [sic]) in transcription are important and should appear in the listing. The order of the rules **A1.0F7. Letters or words intended to be read more than once** and **A1.0F8. Inaccuracies** could be reversed so that this sentence,

wherever it appears (e.g., A1.1D1, A1.1E1, A1.1F1, A1.2C1, A1.2E1, etc.), could read: “Follow the instructions in A1.0F with respect to capitalization, accentuation, abbreviations, punctuation, symbols, inaccuracies, etc.” Instructions on recording accents present in the chief source (former 1.1B1) should be included (or is this implied?), as well as instructions on recording separate letters or initials (former 1.1B6) should also be included here or at A1.0F.

(p. A1-15) A1.1B1, 2nd paragraph: suggest that this paragraph be deleted (see comments below at **(p. A1-83) A1.7B4**) or reworded as follows:

Record the source of the title proper in a note if considered to be important (see A1.7B4).

(p. A1-18) A1.1B10: a resource without a collective title could have a supplied or devised title. However, at A1.1B10, the cataloguer is already directed to A1.1G. How does one get to A1.1B11? Should there be a reference from A1.1G to A1.1B11 to be able to supply a collective title in instances when, for example, a resource consisting of a large number of physically separate components but lacking a collective title is to be catalogued as a unit?

(p. A1-18) A1.1B11, 1st paragraph, last sentence: the source of a title proper not taken from the chief source is to be recorded in a note (A1.1B1). Given that a supplied or devised title composed by the cataloguer would not be taken from the chief source, the source of the supplied or devised title should be recorded in the note area. The exception as noted in this sentence originally appeared in rule 4.1B2 and should be deleted entirely or restricted to B1.1B11. The sentence at A1.1B11 to read:

Record the source of a supplied or devised title in the note area (see A1.7B4).

(p. A1-25) A1.1F5: this rule retains a “rule of 3” provision; will this rule be revisited when Part II is revised?

(p. A1-29—A1-30) A1.1G: see comments above at **(p. A1-18) A1.1B10**.

(p. A1-30) A1.2A2, 1st sentence: it appears that this rule has been revised, i.e., information taken from a prescribed source other than the chief source (e.g., preliminaries, colophon) must now be placed in square brackets. Was this revision intentional? (Cf. AACR2 1.2A2). Should the sentence be revised to (cf. A1.4A1):

Take information recorded in this area from the chief source of information or from other preliminaries or colophon.

(p. A1-31) A1.2B1: if the proposed change to A1.2A2 (above) is not accepted, suggest that the first sentence read:

Transcribe an edition statement as it appears on the chief source of information.

(p. A1-31) A1.2B: there is no instruction on how to deal with edition statements inseparable from the title (former 2.15B). Such instruction could be between A1.2B3 and A1.2B4. Additionally, instruction as to whether such edition statements are or are not part of the title proper could be near A1.1B6 on omissions and abridgements.

(p. A1-73) A1.6B2, 2nd paragraph: delete this paragraph as it is unnecessary since instruction in the first paragraph already addresses this situation, i.e., “choose the most prominent form”. In addition, the relationship between this rule and A1.1B7 (Title in two or more forms) is not clear, e.g., should full form still be preferred over acronym or initialism?

(p. A1-83) A1.7B4: when would this note ever be made given that the chief source can be any of the sources listed at **A1.0A2**? If it is only in cases of supplied or devised titles, the second paragraph of A1.1B1 is not necessary since A1.1B11 addresses this situation. If, however, the source of title can be taken from a source other than a chief source, then A1.0A4 should make that clear. Alternatively, suggest that A1.7B4 be revised as follows to cover all situations:

A1.7B4. Source of title proper. Make a note on the source of the title proper if considered to be important.

(p. A1-95) A1.7B24, 2nd paragraph, 2nd sentence: delete this sentence as this practice, that is applicable only to music in AACR2, would not work well with sound recording numbers. By deleting this sentence, the practice followed in AACR2 for sound recordings would be extended to music instead of the other way around. This would work better as a general rule applicable to all formats and would make the rule easier to follow.

Section B – Supplementary rules applicable to specific types of content

Scope and organization of chapter B1 – Text

(p. B1-2) B1.1B11, 1st paragraph: we query whether an exception not to record the source of a supplied title composed by the cataloguer in the note area should be made. See comment above at **(p. A1-18) A1.1B11, 1st paragraph, last sentence**.

(p. B1-4) B1.4F8: suggest that this rule would be more appropriate at B1.4F9. The reference at A1.4F9 is to A1.7B12, the same reference as is made at B1.4F8.

Scope and organization of chapter B3 – Cartographic resources

(p. B3-1—B3-2) B3.0A: prefer the scope for cartographic materials in AACR2. Additionally, the instructions at the former 3.0J1 (Description of whole or part) no longer appear. Explicit instructions to choose whole over part are not covered at A1.0A1.

(p. B3-2) B3.1B11: since this is a new edition of AACR, suggest amending this rule to include subject as well as area covered. Suggested wording to be added to the end of the sentence:

Always include in the devised title, enclosed in square brackets, the name of the area covered, and, if applicable, the subject depicted.

(p. B3-2) B3.1E6: since this is a new edition of AACR, suggest amending this rule to include subject as well as area covered. Suggested wording to be added to the end of the sentence:

If the title proper does not...supply in square brackets, as other title information, a word or brief phrase indicating the area covered, and, if applicable, the subject depicted.

(p. B3-2—B3-3) B3.3A1: instructions that at the first level for cartographic material, only scale is mandatory for the mathematical details area have not been included (cf. former 3.0D).

(p. B3-6—B3-8) B3.3D: the former 3.3D in AACR2 (Statement of coordinates and equinox) was designated at the rule level as an *optional addition*. Although JSC has made the decision not to use optional addition in favour of *optionally* in AACR3, we think for this situation it would be clearer to present this rule as:

B3.3D. Statement of coordinates and equinox (Optional)

Otherwise, *optionally* would need to be added at both subrules, B3.3D1 and B3.3D2. See also comment at **10. General material designation (p. A1-19) A1.1C.**

Scope and organization of chapter B4 – Graphics

(p. B4-1—B4-2) chapter B4: given that there are only two rules in chapter B4 it is likely that they would become forgotten and overlooked in actual daily work. Suggest that these two rules could be incorporated into the general chapter.

The only difference between B4.1B11 and A1.1B11 is the preference for indicating the nature of the collection in the devised title, a concept that already seems to be present in the general rule. A1.1B11 just needs to mention assembled collections, perhaps with a tie-in to A1.1G with their supplied/devised titles.

The two elements of B4.7B21 not in the general rule are: a) adding statements of responsibility to titles (also appears at B2.7B21 and B6.7B21) and could be considered general practice; and b) adding number of cards, frames, slides, etc., which is a specific form of a directive about adding duration that appears again as a special rule (B6.7B21).

Scope and organization of chapter B5 – Three dimensional resources

(p. B5-1—B5-2) chapter B5: given that there is only one rule in chapter B5, suggest that this chapter could be incorporated into the general chapter.

The only concept of B5.1F1 not explicit in the general rule is that responsibility for a 3D resource includes responsibility for the display or selection of the resource. As that is the obvious way to understand responsibility in this context and the glossary definition of statement of responsibility covers this, this rule (& chapter) is unnecessary. Examples relating to a 3D resource would be useful at A1.1F1.

Scope and organization of chapter B7 – Moving images

(p. B7-2) B7.1B1: propose that a rule parallel to B6.1B1 be given since videorecordings can also contain performances of music and therefore can have titles similar to titles of music sound recordings. Add the following rule (description of this type of resource borrowed from draft of Part II):

B7.1B1. Transcription of the title proper. For data to be included in titles proper for moving image recordings of performances of music, see B2.1B1.

(p. B7-2) B7.1B11: propose the addition of a rule parallel to B6.1B11 (see comment above at **(p. B7-2) B7.1B1**) as follows:

B7.1B11. Supplied or devised title. If a resource lacks a title, follow these particular instructions.

Commercials. Devise....

Moving image recordings of performances of music. For data to be included in titles proper for moving image recordings of performances of music, see B2.1B11.

Unedited material and newfilm. Include....

(p. B7-2) **B7.1D1:** propose the addition of a rule parallel to B6.1D1 (see comment above at (p. B7-2) **B7.1B1**) as follows:

B7.1D. Parallel titles

B7.1D1. For supplementary instructions on transcribing parallel titles for moving image recordings of performances of music, see B2.1D1.

(p. B7-4) **B7.7B24:** propose the addition of a rule that would cover numbers associated with videorecordings. When there are multiple numbers associated with a resource, the only option currently is to record such numbers as quoted notes. Because of the similarities between numbers associated with videorecordings and those with sound recordings, the new rule could be based on rule B6.7B24:

B7.7B24. Numbers associated with the resource (other those covered in A1.8). Make notes on publisher's stock numbers (usually an alphabetic and/or numeric symbol) as found. Precede each number by the brand or trade name associated with it on the label or container (see A1.4D5) and a colon.

[new examples]

If the resource has two or more numbers, record the principal number if one can be ascertained, otherwise record both or all. If one of the numbers applies to the set as a whole, record it first and designate it as such.

If the resource consists of separately numbered units, record inclusive numbers if the numbering is consecutive; otherwise record individual numbers or, if there are more than three of these, the first number and the last numbered separated by a diagonal slash.

Or, alternatively, the rule could just refer to B6.7B24 to avoid redundancy (wording based on B2.7B24 and B6.7B24):

B7.7B24. Numbers associated with the resource (other those covered in A1.8). Make notes on publisher's stock numbers (usually an alphabetic and/or numeric symbol) that appear on the resource as instructed in B6.7B24.

[new examples]

Section C – Supplementary rules applicable to specific types of media

Scope and organization of chapter C1 – Print and graphic media

(p. C1-9) **C1.5C10.1:** *b&w* is not used for cartographic resources and we query whether this is an intentional revision of the rules.

(p. C1-13) C1.7B1.1: this rule appears to be a hold over from chapter 4 but with the addition of a section for production method, thus resulting in an anomaly between this rule and the production method at C1.5C4.1. We suggest the following for aligning the two rules. Paragraphs 1, 3, and 4 should be moved to C1.5C4.1 (production method) with the instruction that if the method cannot be given precisely, to record it in a note (see C1.7B1.1).

(p. C1-15) C1.7B5.1: given that rule B1.1B11 Ancient, medieval, and Renaissance manuscripts and oriental manuscripts lacking a title page is an expansion of AACR rule 4.1B2, it would appear that C1.7B5.1 is not necessary and should be deleted. At A1.7B5, last paragraph, delete the reference to “*manuscripts* (C1.7B5)”.

(p. C1-16) C1.7B28.1: this rule should not apply only to *Early printed books, etc.* It is conceivable that a current publication is imperfect, (cf. C1.5B2.1.15 (i.e., 2.5B15 reference to 2.7B20 did not restrict only to early printed books, etc.)). See also comments at **15. Style, References, (p. C1-6) C1.5B2.1.15.**

Scope and organization of chapter C3 – Tactile media

(p. C3-1—C3-3) chapter C3: this chapter is too small to be useful with only two rules and with some information on this material already appearing in A1.

(p. C3-1—C3-2) C3.5C2.1: could easily be in A1.5C2 as no other special rules stem from this general rule.

(p. C3-2) C3.5D1: this rule is just a reference back to the general rules.

(p. C3-2—C3-3) C3.7B13: the information at this rule would need to be a subpart of A1.7B13.

Scope and organization of chapter C5 – Audio media

(p. C5-2) C5.5C11.2, 2nd paragraph: metric unit symbols such as *cm* and *mm* are not considered abbreviations (A1.0C). Is it intentional that metres per second appear as “*m. per sec.*”?

(p. C5-3) C5.5C11.6: suggest adding “surround” (now encountered with SACDs) to the rule:

C5.5C11.6. Number of sound channels. Record the number of sound channels, if the information is readily available, using one or more of the following terms as appropriate:

mono.
stereo.
quad.
surround

[rest of rule not transcribed]

(p. C5-3) C5.5C11.7: suggest adding *SACD* and *DVD* to the rule as follows:

C5.5C11.7. Recording and reproduction characteristics. *Optionally*, record the recording and reproduction characteristics (e.g., *Dolby processed*, *NAB standard*, *SACD*, *DVD*).

3. Focus of the description

(p. A1-5) A1.0A1, 1st paragraph: we don't know why but we think that focus of description sounds better (we did not list the occurrences of this in A1.0A1). Additionally, we suggest that a lead-in sentence (cf. LCRI 1.0) for the focus be given:

A1.0A1. Focus of the description. The first decision to be made is the focus of the description. The sources of information for a bibliographic description are dependent on the focus of the description.

4. Resources in an unpublished form

(p. I-3) Resources in an unpublished form: since, for example, rule A1.4C8, refers to unpublished digital resources, we suggest that the copyright definition be included in the introduction to cover these types of materials.

5. Resources issued in successive parts

Numbering area (A1.3)

(p. A1-36—A1.41) A1.3: we should acknowledge that .3 is different from the other areas of the rules and have the references to its use for *music* and for *cartographic resources* appear at the beginning of A1.3. With the suggested restructuring, the last two paragraphs of A1.3A2 and A1.3A4 could be deleted as there will be no relationship from these rules in the general chapter to B2 and B3. A1.3A1 will only address numbering and the heading “Numbering,” which so far does not appear, could be used.

(p. A1-37) A1.3A1: suggest that the reference to B2.3 read “B2.3A1” and the reference to B3.3 read “B3.3A1,” given that there are specific references to .3A2, .3A3 in the following subrules. Note that there are no references to B2.3B, B3.3B, B3.3C, B3.3D, B3.3E. This seems to be contrary to the organization of the rest of the rules, i.e., if there is no supplementary rule, the rule in the general chapter would apply, which is *not* the case at the .3 subrules. The subrules of the general chapter relate only to numbering.

(p. A1-37) A1.3A1: formerly, this area was used only “if cataloguing from the first and/or last issue or part” (AACR 12.3A1a). As this condition does not appear here, it would mean that this area is to be used whether the first and/or last is available or not. Was this an intentional revision?

6. Integrating resources

Technical description area

(p. A3-6) A3.5B1: the rule as stated indicates that a one volume updating loose-leaf could never be recorded as 1 v. (loose-leaf) until it is complete. However, it is possible that an ongoing updating loose-leaf can consist of only 1 physical unit. Additionally, there should be a link to C1.5B2.1.8. (Cf. link to C7.7B14 at A1.7B14). Note that the original AACR2 rule 1.5B5 was applicable only to a multipart item.

Note area

(p. A3-10) A3.7B27.1: it is not obvious what “additional instructions on identifying the issue, part, iteration...” have been added to the instructions at A1.7B27. This rule appears to replicate the rule at A1.7B27. For *integrating resources*, the cataloguer has already been instructed to catalogue from the current iteration (A1.0A1d), which, presumably, is the latest iteration. It is not necessary to restate this at A3.7B27.1.

7. Assembled collections

No comments.

8. Early printed resources

No comments.

9. Sources of information

(p. A1-6) A1.0A2, 2nd sentence: without explanations for “prominence,” “completeness,” and “formal presentation,” this rule may be difficult to apply. This rule proved challenging when tested by CCC members. See also comment below at A1.7B4. Additionally, we suggest adding “generally” (cf. A1.0A5, 3rd sentence):

If the information in two or more such sources varies in degree of completeness, generally, prefer the source that provides the title proper as well as the most complete information relating to the title and statement of responsibility area, the edition area, and the publication, distribution, etc., area. If two or more such sources are equivalent with respect to completeness, prefer (in this order):

(p. A1-6—A1-7) A1.0A2: the CCC rep for the cartographic material community did not feel that A1.0A2 would work for that material and preferred the retention of the AACR2 approach for chief source.

(p. A1-7) A1.0A2, last paragraph of rule: the situation noted in 1.0A3aiv does not appear to be addressed in the Draft. If the last paragraph of A1.0A2 is to cover such situations, it is not made clear that a “collective” chief source is to be treated as a single source. Is there a better word than “collective” so that it is not confused with the meaning of collective at A1.1G? In addition, the first example is misleading; we suggest replacing it with the following:

The chief source of information may be unitary in nature (e.g., a title page) or may be collective (e.g., the complete title proper appearing on facing pages, the labels on either side of a disc, a sequence of title and/or credit frames)

We note that the example illustrating “collective” in AACR2 1.0A3 was “the entire cartographic resource” and question if this paragraph at A1.0A2 is accurate, or necessary, when choosing an entire resource as chief source is no longer an option..

(p. A1-8) A1.0A3c: a resource does not contain works directly but rather manifestations of works. Suggest the following rewording:

c) *Chief sources of information for individual works contained in the resource.* If the resource comprises manifestations of two or more works ... information for all of the manifestations as if they were a single source.

(p. A1-8) A1.0A4: is one of the “other sources” treated as the chief source or, is there no chief source if one of these “other sources” is the source of information? If one of these sources is used as a source of information, what is the link to A1.0A5 to Chief source of information under the Prescribed Source of Information column? Current Glossary defines *chief source of information* as the “source of data to be given preference as the source from which a bibliographic description

(or portion thereof) is prepared,” thus implying that these other sources can be the chief source. See also comment below at: **(p. A1-15) A1.1B1, 2nd paragraph.**

(p. A1-8) A1.0A5: the prescribed source of information for the edition area is the chief source (i.e., preliminaries are no longer a prescribed source). This would mean that edition information taken from sources other than the chief source (e.g., t.p. verso) would be recorded in square brackets. Is this change intentional?

10. General material designation

In general, CCC likes the revision to the GMD rules although there was support for moving the GMD out of the Title and Statement of Responsibility Area. CCC's comments on the GMD follow (some of the comments reflect the results of a limited test of the application of the GMD rules to “real life resources”):

- suggestion was made that the medium be considered as a qualification to the content term and recorded in parentheses; e.g. [text (digital)]
- the term *data* will require a definition (or footnote) since, in a general sense, everything is data
- preference was expressed for retaining the term *cartographic materials* rather than *cartographic resources*
- preference was expressed for the term *microform* rather than *micrographic*
- suggestion was made to add *manuscript* to the list of media terms
- *sound* or *audio* not both – the “or” is a possible problem because it might hamper the ability to retrieve a precise set, since it makes the controlled vocabulary a little less controlled
- one of the examples tested was a lecture on sound cassette. Choice of GMD was not straightforward since a lecture is language material but not necessarily text
- another example tested was a set and slides and a sound cassette, which was described as two or more parts issued simultaneously, no one part predominating. It was felt that, from a user perspective, it would not be helpful to indicate the GMD as “mixed content : multimedia”. It would have been useful for the user to know that the content was graphic and sound, and that the graphic was projected. However, if one wants to consider the option of defining the content/media more precisely for multimedia resources, then one definitely has to take the GMD out of the title and statement of responsibility area and put it in its own area. Moving these kinds of terms outside of area 1 also puts us more in line with other metadata communities (though it might cause problems if the ISBD community follows a different route)
- another concern was the desire of users to know the carrier up front. One almost needs three lists, with a controlled vocabulary for carriers; the terms can then be reformulated into something more user-friendly if necessary, such as icons, or terms users will recognize. Now that we have introduced the option to use conventional terminology in area 5, we can rely even less on the SMDs to ensure consistent display and/or retrieval, either in combination with the content and media terms of the GMD or on their own.

Editorial comments:

(p. A1-19) **A1.1C** – the GMD rule in AACR2 was designated at the rule level as *Optional addition*. Although JSC has made the decision not to use optional addition in favour of *optionally*, we think that for this situation it would be clearer to present this rule as:

A1.1C. General material designation (Optional)

See also comment at **2. Organization of the rules, Scope and organization of chapter B3 – Cartographic resources, (p. B3-6—B3-8) B3.3D.**

(p. A1-19) **A1.1C1:** (if the suggestion above for multimedia is not accepted) suggest revising the first sentence to indicate that only one term from each list should be used:

Optionally, indicate the type of content contained in the resource, *or* the medium in which the content is conveyed, *or* both, using a term from each of the following lists.

(p. A1-19) **A1.1C1, 2nd paragraph:** suggest adding a second sentence as follows:

When using both terms, record the term indicating content before the term indicating medium.

(p. A1-20) **A1.1C3:** should there be a heading for: **Facsimiles and reproductions**? Suggest for clarity restructuring the sentence to exclude the parenthetical examples and give them as examples with explanatory text.

(p. A1-20) **A1.1C4:** the corollary of this rule, stating that the GMD of the predominant component is to be used if there is a predominant component part, is not explicitly stated anywhere.

11. Publication, distribution, etc., area

Publication, Distribution, etc., area comments: Eliminating the use of *s.l.* and *s.n.* will make it very difficult to distinguish published from unpublished material. CCC would prefer to retain this distinction. Suggest that either the use of these abbreviations be re-instituted, or some other more generally understandable phrasing be substituted for these abbreviations. The following is a suggestion:

- (p. A1-45) **A1.4C6:** in place of “[s.l.],” use: [place unknown]
- (p. A1-48) **A1.4D7:** in place of “[s.n.],” use: [publisher unknown]

(p. A1-52) **A1.4F8, last paragraph of rule:** suggest that this paragraph is more appropriate at A1.4F9 and, if agreed, the reference would then be to B1.4F9.

12. Technical description area

In general, CCC found the relationship between **A1.5. Technical Description Area** and **Section C Supplementary Rules Applicable to Specific Media** confusing. Providing general instructions at the beginning of A1.5 that more detailed instructions are given in section C may help as the actual references are not found until one gets further down in the rules. In addition, the references to section C are to very generalized groupings and not to specific types of materials, e.g., it is not obvious that cartographic materials are included in *print and graphic media*. However, what is especially deceptive is that the rules in A1.5 are “bare bones” while the

examples are complex. Rules governing the form of the examples are only given in section C. We do not think that examples without rules are particularly helpful; the examples should not dictate the rules. CCC also feels that the term, “Technical description” is too broad as this area actually describes both the physical and technical aspects of a resource. Propose that this area be called “Physical/Technical Description area”.

CCC’s other comments follow:

General rules on extent (A1.5B)

- The specialists groups (Cartographic and Music) prefer that *Content* be placed before *Carrier*, this preference based not only on the greater importance of content to carrier but also on the organizing principle of *whole* before *part*, e.g.,
 - 1 atlas (2 microfilm reels) vs. 2 microfilm reels (1 atlas)
 - 1 atlas (4 v.) vs. 4 v. (1 atlas)
 - 1 score (2 v.) vs. 2 v. (1 score)
- Propose that Table 2 precede Table 1.
- The rule indicating the number of maps in an atlas (AACR 3.5C4) has not been included and should be.
- Table 2: the list for text (pages, leaves, columns) may apply to any bound item and not just text, e.g., art prints or art reproductions.
- Suggest that resources that combine different media on a single carrier be addressed at A1.9 “Multimedia resources” as well, e.g., CD on one side and a DVD on the other; DVDs that contain videorecordings as well as sound recordings
- **(p. A1-60) A1.5B2, 2nd paragraph of rule:** what is the relationship between the use of “identical” in reference to physical units at A1.5B1 and in reference to components at A1.5B2. Both are to be added before the specific material designation. Does one ever add both?

General rules on other technical details (A1.5C)

- **(p. A1-62—A1.63) A1.5C1:** the order of other technical details in the Consistency TF report was proposed to retain the present order for maps and retain sound before colour as is presently the case in computer files and motion pictures/videorecordings. In bringing colour above polarity, medium and physical material, the ordering for manuscripts, graphics and microforms is disrupted instead. The following proposed order probably disrupts the least number of existing records but would require renumbering all the subrules in this section:

special format characteristics
 layout
 production method
 polarity
 sound characteristics
 illustrative matter
 colour
 medium
 physical material
 mounting
 projection characteristics
 other digital characteristics

- **(p. A1-63) A1.5C2, 1st paragraph:** this appears to be the only rule giving instructions on the use of “large print” and “closed captioning”. If the examples within the parentheses are suggested terms for usage, suggest that they also appear in italics for consistency (cf. A1.5C4):

If the resource is in a format specially designed for persons with disabilities (e.g., *large print, braille, closed captioning*) give an indication of the format.

- **(p. A1-63) A1.5C4:** suggest that *manuscript* be added as an example of a production method, or is this method applicable only to section C1? This is an instance where it is confusing that examples at A1.5C6 and A1.5C7 include *ms.* when this term has not been addressed in the preceding rules.
- **(p. A1-66) A1.5C10:** the placement of colour in the order of technical details produces varying results:

1 globe : plastic, on metal stand, col.
(*does this mean it is a coloured metal stand?*)

vs. 1 globe : col., wood, on metal stand (C4.5D1.2)
(*does this mean it is a coloured globe?*)

13. Note area

(p. A1-89—A1-90) A1.7B13: it might be helpful if Duration could be given as a subrule since a note is not just applicable to “a resource without a collective title and described as a unit (see A1.1G)”. **Duration of performance** appears specifically at C1.7B13.6 as a subrule with a heading but does not appear as a reference from rule A1.7B13. There should also be some linkage/connection to A1.5B3. Playing time.

(p. A1-96) A1.7B27, 1st paragraph: suggest that “basis of description” be revised to reflect the term used at A1.0A1 and, for consistency, that the following terms appear in italics and in bold:

For ***resources issued in successive parts, integrating resources, and multipart monographs***, if the description is not based on the first issue, part, or iteration, identify the issue, part, or iteration used as the focus of the description (see A1.0A1).

(p. C7-4) C7.5C13.1, 2nd paragraph: the following paragraph seems to be a very useful general rule for .5C for all chapters of C that have specific rules at .7B13, e.g., C6.5C10.1, C6.5C12.1:

If such characteristics cannot be recorded succinctly, record them in a note (see C7.7B13).

(p. A1-80) A1.7A4, 2nd paragraph: use of “entered”; this is a section where Part II terminology for citation of a work/expression/manifestation needs to be reflected.

14. Glossary

The Glossary should include definitions for:

Bibliographic description (Cf. ISBD definition: A set of bibliographic data recording and identifying a resource.)

Data

Finding aids**“In” analytic**

Multilevel description (Cf. ISBD definition: A method of bibliographic description based on the division of descriptive information into two or more levels. The first level contains information common to the whole or main resource. The second and subsequent levels contain information relating to the individual part or other unit.)

Physical unit

(p. Glossary-7) Music: for consistency in this document, “Braille music” should appear as “braille music”.

(p. Glossary-7) Part : the reference to the second definition of *Issue* should be in the following form (cf. reference at *Monographic series*):

See also Fascicle, Issue 2, Part (Music).

(p. Glossary-10-11) Tactile media: add a period at the end of the definition.

15. Style***Tables of contents for chapters and areas***

(p. A1-5) A1.0. Preliminary rules: “Contents:” as per chapter contents on p. A1-1 should be given (A1.0A—A1.0L).

Captioning of subrules

(p. A1-17) A1.1B7, 3rd paragraph: we feel that this part of the rule should be a separate subrule with its own subheading, **A1.1BX. Acronym or initialism**. Rather than being regarded as a “title in two forms,” such a title could be considered a title proper and other title. To parallel the first two paragraphs of this rule, suggest that the last sentence of the proposed subrule read:

Record the acronym or initialism as other title information (see A1.1E).

(p. A1-37) A1.3A1, 1st paragraph: this paragraph should continue on the same line as the heading “**Application**” (cf. B2.3A1 and B3.3A1). Note that past practice of referencing more than one rule has been in the form: (see A1.3B—A1.3G). (Cf. A1.4G2).

(p. A1-40) A1.3F, heading: all the rules from A1.3B to A1.3G apply to multipart resources although that term has not been included in any of the headings except at A1.3F. Suggest the heading be revised to:

A1.3F. Ceased publication

(p. A1-95) A1.7B26: suggest the addition of “manifestation” to the heading and the 1st sentence as follows:

A1.7B26. Details of the original manifestation. In describing a facsimile or reproduction, record all the details of the original manifestation in a single note (see also A1.7A4). Record the details of the original manifestation in the order of the areas of the description.

(p. A1-96) A1.7B27, 1st paragraph: rule subheading should read: “**Issue, iteration, or part described.**” (matches Content heading on p. A1-4 and p. A1-79). Suggest that “basis of description” be revised to reflect the term used at A1.0A1 and, for consistency, the following terms should appear in italics and in bold:

For ***resources issued in successive parts, integrating resources, and multipart monographs***, if the description is not based on the first issue, part, or iteration, identify the issue, part, or iteration used as the focus of the description (see A1.0A1).

(p. A2-14) A2.7B27: rule subheading should read: “**Issue, iteration, or part described.**” (matches Content heading on p. A2-2 and rule heading at A1.7B27). Or, should the heading only read: **Issue or part described**, since “iteration” is in the scope of A3?

(p. A3-10) A3.7B27.1: the rule subheading should read: “**Issue, iteration, or part described.**” (matches Content heading on p. A3-2 and rule heading at A1.7B27). Or, should the heading only read: **Iteration described**, since “issue” and “part” are in the scope of A2?

References to related and supplementary rules

The qualifier “additional” is used for some references to chapters A2 and A3 whereas “supplementary” is used for references to section B or section C. We query whether this distinction is important. In addition, there should be more consistency in the use of “additional”/ “supplementary” in cases when the rule in chapter A1 also applies, e.g., see comment below at **(p. A1-15) A1.1B1, penultimate paragraph of rule**. Only in the following cases would qualifiers not be necessary:

- when the instructions are specific, e.g., A1.1F1: For instructions on recording statements of responsibility pertaining to editors of *serials* and *integrating resources*, see A2.1F1 and A3.1F1;
- when there is a reference back to the rule in A1, e.g., A2.1E1: Transcribe other title information as instructed in A1.1E if considered to be important.

Having said that, the rules are not always so straightforward. For example, at A1.4F1, there are references on recording dates for *resources issued in successive parts* and *integrating resources* to A2.4F1 and A3.4F1. However, rule A1.4F1 is also applicable to those types of resources as are the other subrules at A1.4F (e.g., form of the date), but there is no indication at A2.4F1 or A3.4F1 that one needs to refer to A1. Note that AACR2 12.4F1 included a reference to the general chapter (“as instructed in 1.4F”) for formulation of the date.

One of the more complicated areas is **A1.2B. Edition statement**. References to chapters A2 and A3 appear at A1.2B1 and A1.2B3 but not in any of the other subrules of A1.2B. However, at A2.2B1, there is a reference back to A1.2B so it would appear that all of the subrules at A1.2B are applicable to *resources issued in successive parts*. Although the 2nd paragraph (p. I-1) of Organization of the Rules states that A2 and A3 “modify certain general rules”, it is not always clear which rules in A1 still apply. In addition, the flipping back and forth between A1 and the referenced chapters make the print format somewhat cumbersome to use.

(p. A1-11) A1.0D2, last paragraph: suggest “A1.2C” be included as a see reference.

(p. A1-13) A1.0J, 1st paragraph: suggest “A1.1C3” be included as a see reference.

(p. A1-13) A1.0J, 2nd paragraph of rule: make an additional rule reference: (see A1.7A2 and A1.7B26).

(p. A1-15) A1.1B1, penultimate paragraph of rule: given that the preceding instructions regarding wording, order, capitalization, accentuation, abbreviations, punctuation, symbols, as well as the second paragraph, apply to *resources issued in successive parts* and *integrating resources*, this sentence should read:

For additional instructions on transcribing a title proper for *resources issued in successive parts*...

or

For instructions on transcribing a title proper containing obvious typographic errors for *resources issued in successive parts*...

Otherwise it would seem that A2.1B1 and A3.1B1 contain the complete instructions for transcription of title proper of these types of resources. The use of “additional” in such instructions appears at A1.1B8, 4th paragraph; the inclusion of more specific instructions appears at A1.1F1, 3rd paragraph.

(p. A1-15) A1.1B1, last paragraph: suggest including a reference to *moving images* (B7.1B1) since videorecordings can also contain performances of music and therefore can have titles similar to titles of music sound recordings:

See also supplementary instructions on transcribing a title proper for *music* (B2.1B1), *cartographic resources* (B3.1B1), *sound* (B6.1B1), *moving images* (B7.1B1), and *digital media* (C7.1B1).

(p. A1-16) A1.1B6, 4th paragraph: sentence should read: “For additional instructions on ...” for the same reason as mentioned in comments above at **(p. A1-15) A1.1B1**.

(p. A1-20) A1.1D1, last paragraph of rule: add as follows (see comment above at **(p. A1-15) A1.1B1**):

See also supplementary instructions on transcribing a parallel title for *music* (B2.1D10), *sound* (B6.1D1), and *moving images* (B7.1D1).

(p. A1-29) A1.1G1: to parallel the wording at A1.0G, suggest adding the following to the sentence (cf. A1.1G3):

In describing as a unit a resource lacking a collective title in which one component part is predominant (see A1.0G), treat the title of that component part as the title proper and name the other component part (s) in a contents note (see A1.7B21).

(p. A1-33) A1.2B3, last paragraph: suggest that “additional” be added: For additional instructions....

(p. A1-34) A1.2B7: suggest that there be a reference to A2.2B1. See also comment below at **(p. A2-6) A2.2B1**.

(p. A1-49) A1.4F1, 3rd paragraph of rule: the placement of instructions for *resources issued in successive parts* and *integrating resources*, directing one to see A2.4F1 and A3.4F1 implies that A1.4F1 and the subsequent subrules do not apply (which is not the case). Suggestions: 1) references back to A1.4F2—A1.4F9 could be made at A2.4F1 and A3.4F (cf. A2.1E1 back to A1.1E), or, 2) reword: “For additional instructions on recording dates for ...” (cf. A1.1B8, last paragraph).

(p. A1-52) A1.4F9: the two rules referenced in the note area do not lead to a justification of the example “dates of collection of data,” i.e., the specific rule in the note area for this example (C7.7B9) becomes apparent only after following the reference for *digital media* at A1.7B9. Is the example too specific? Should rule A1.7B21 also be referenced?

(p. A1-70) A1.5E1: for clarity, there should be a reference to A1.0A1e indicating that a separate entry for an ancillary resource can be created if considered to be important on its own (AACR 1.5E1a (i.e., make a note and a separate entry)).

(p. A1-71) A1.5E1, 3rd paragraph of rule: ancillary material to a resource issued in successive parts should actually appear in A2; it may be more consistent to make a reference to rule A2.5E1. Alternately, suggest this paragraph is more appropriate at A2 given that the examples appear to indicate that this rule would only affect resources in A2.

(p. A1-72) A1.6A1, 2nd sentence: given that Sources of information now precedes the instruction to “Enclose each series statement (see A1.6J) in parentheses” at A1.6A3. Punctuation, we suggest that a reference be given at the end of the sentence:

Enclose any information supplied from ... within the parentheses enclosing each series statement (see A1.6A3).

(p. A1-76) A1.6G1, 7th and 8th paragraphs of rule: there is no difference in treatment between “simultaneously issued parts of a multipart resource” (A1.6G1) and “parts of a multipart monograph”(A2.6G1). While logical, is it necessary to repeat the instructions? Note that A1.3D1 refers to a multipart resource with subsequent issues.

(p. A1-79) A1.7A1, 2nd paragraph: as there are gaps in the numbering within the ranges given, suggest the references be revised to the basic rule for **.7B. Notes** for those chapters: (see A2.7B and A3.7B).

(p. A1-81) A1.7A4, last paragraph of rule: suggest deleting the last sentence (repeats instruction at A1.7B26) and adding a see reference to A1.7B26 at the end of the paragraph:

In describing a reproduction of another ... the notes relating to the original manifestation (see A1.7B26).

(p. A1-82) A1.7B3: there should be a reference to A1.5C2 with regard to closed captioning; conversely, there should be a reference to A1.7B3 from A1.5C2.

(p. A1-83) A1.7B3, last paragraph of rule: sentence should read:

See also supplementary instructions on notes pertaining to language and script for *music* (B2.7B3).

(p. A1-83) A1.7B5, 2nd paragraph: reference should be to “title proper” and rule reference should be to X.7B5.1:

For instructions on notes pertaining to changes in title proper for *resources issued in successive parts* and *integrating resources*, see A2.7B5.1 and A3.7B5.1.

(p. A1-83) A1.7B5, 3rd paragraph: revise rule reference for *manuscripts* to (C1.7B5.1).

(p. A1-87) A1.7B11, 2nd paragraph, 1st sentence: the see also reference to A1.3G should be a see reference (cf. see references at A1.7B14).

(p. A1-90) A1.7B13, penultimate paragraph of rule: the see reference to *resources issued in successive of parts* should read A2.7B13.2 given that A2.7B13.1 is not applicable to this rule.

(p. A2-4) A2.1E1a: suggest that the see reference be moved to the end of the sentence (cf. reference to A1.1E4 at A2.1E1b):

If an acronym or initialism of the title appears in the chief source of information with the full form of the title, transcribe the acronym or initialism as other title information (see A1.1B7).

(p. A2-5) A2.1E1, last paragraph of rule: the reference A1.7B7 should read A2.7B7 (although only A2.7B7.1 for change in other title information appears at A2.7B7). At A3.1E1, the reference is to A3.7B7 and the situation is the same.

(p. A2-6) A2.2B1: the reference is back to A1.2B (not A1.2B1) implying that all the subrules at A1.2B are applicable. However, there is an additional reference at A1.2B3 to see A2.2B3. Is this consistent organizationally within the rules? See also comment below at **(p. A3-5) A3.2B1**. Additionally, the first sentence seems a form of repetition of A1.2B7. See also comment above at **(p. A1-34) A1.2B7**.

(p. A2-7) A2.4F1, 2nd paragraph of rule: the reference to A1.7B12 is unnecessary as that only leads to a reference for *resources issued in successive parts* at A2.7B12 (the other rule referenced).

(p. A2-9) A2.6G1: there should be a reference to A2.7B17 (specifically A2.7B17.1) from this rule. A2.7B17.1 appears to conflict with the first paragraph at A2.6G1; suggest that there be an option to follow A2.7B17.1, e.g., revise last sentence of first paragraph as follows:

Otherwise, record all the numbers or make a note if considered to be important (see A2.7B17).

(p. A2-9) A2.7B2: the frequency of ancillary material should not be in the general chapter as there are specific rules for frequency at A2 and A3. There should be a reference to A2 from the rules dealing with ancillary material of this type (i.e., A1.5E1 and A1.7B14).

(p. A2-14) A2.7B17.1: as noted in comments above at **(p. A2-9) A2.6G1**, given that this rule applies specifically to “numbering within a series,” there should be a specific reference from A2.6G1. Although there is a general reference to A2.7B17 from A1.7B17, a specific reference from A2.6G1 would be more useful.

(p. A3-3) A3.1E1a: suggest that the see reference be moved to the end of the sentence (cf. reference to A1.1E4 at A3.1E1b):

If an acronym or initialism of the title appears in the chief source of information with the full form of the title, transcribe the acronym or initialism as other title information (see A1.1B7).

(p. A3-4) A3.1E1, last paragraph of rule: the reference to A3.7B7 is misleading in that A3.7B7 only addresses Change in other title information (A3.7B7.1) and leads back to A3.1E7 but not A3.1E1. Should the reference be made to A1.7B7 or should there be a more general rule at A3.7B7 before the specific rule on Change in other title information? (Cf. A2.7B12.1). See comments above at **(p. A2-5) A2.1E1**; reference treatment should be the same as at A2.1E1.

(p. A3-5) A3.2B1: rule A1.2B1 directs the cataloguer to A3.2B1 at which point the cataloguer is referred back to A1.2B1 if considered to be important. However, what is confusing is whether subrules A1.2B2, A1.2B4, etc., also apply. The reference should be to A1.2B (not A1.2B1) as at A2.2B1.

(p. A3-6) A3.4F1, 2nd paragraph of rule: the reference to A1.7B12 is unnecessary as that only leads to a reference for *integrating resources* at A3.7B12 (the other rule referenced).

(p. A3-8) A3.5B1: a modified version of the last paragraph at A1.5B1 should be given as the last paragraph:

See also supplementary instructions on recording the number of physical units for *updating loose-leafs* (C1.5B1).

(p. A3-6) A3.5C14: to parallel A2.5C14, suggest the following addition:

If other technical details are added...to reflect the current iteration as instructed in A1.5C and make a note...

(p. A3-7) A3.5D4, 2nd paragraph: for consistency, suggest adding “(see A3.7B13)” at the end of the sentence:

If the dimensions of a subsequent iteration change, change...and make a note if the change is considered to be important (see A3.7B13).

(p. B2-4) B2.3B: we note that there is no specific reference to rule B2.3B from chapter A1 whereas there are specific references to B2.3, B2.3A2, B2.3A3. The restructuring suggested at **5. Resources issued in successive parts, Numbering area (A1.3)** may address this issue.

(p. B3-3—B3-5) B3.3B: there should be a reference to the note area B3.7B11. See also comment below at **(p. B3-10) B3.7B11**.

(p. B3-10) B3.7B11, last paragraph of rule: given that there is a reference to B3.3B4 here, there should also be a reference to B3.7B11 from B3.3B4.

(p. B6-3) B6.7B1: should be qualified as applying to recorded music, not all recorded sound:

Make a note on the medium of performance of recorded music, if it can be determined, as instructed in B2.7B1.

(p. B6-4) B6.7B21: the see reference to “see A1.5B3” seems to imply that “duration of the piece” is synonymous with “playing time”. Therefore, there should be a reference to B6.7B21 from A1.5B3.

(p. B7-4) B7.7B21: there should be a reference as to how to record duration, e.g., (see A1.5B3) and length of the shot e.g., (see C6.7B13.1).

(p. C1-2) C1.5B2: suggest deleting the separate references to the subrules of C1.5B2 and generalizing the wording as follows (cf. C1.5D1, C3.5D1) (note the correct subrule reference for *manuscripts* is C1.5B2.5):

C1.5B2. Number of components. Record the number of components as appropriate to the type of resource being described as instructed in the following rules.

C1.5B2.1. Pages, leaves, etc. Record...

C1.5B2.1.1. Record the number of pages, leaves, or columns....*etc.*

(p. C1-6) C1.5B2.1.15: the reference for a note on imperfections (C1.7B28) leads only to **C1.7B28.1. Early printed books, etc.** Suggest that an example of an item with imperfections be given at A1.7B28 and the reference at C1.7B28 be revised to apply generally to all *print and graphic media*.

(p. C1-8) C1.5B2.4, 2nd paragraph: it appears that the see reference to C1.7B13 is a general reference to make a technical description note since this particular example “Each view in 3 segments” is not given at C1.7B13. This contrasts with the rule and the examples at C1.5B2.1.12 and C1.5B2.1.13 where the rule and the examples are almost duplicated at C1.7B13. Note that the reference at C1.5B2.1.12 reads C1.7B13.1.

(p. C1-15) C1.7B13.2: there should be a reference from C1.5C10 to this rule given that there is a reference to “colour printing”.

(p. C3-2) C3.5C2.1, 2nd paragraph: suggest adding the following sentence at the end of the paragraph (cf. A1.6J1):

If this cannot be stated clearly in the technical description area, record details in a note (see C3.7B13).

(p. C3-2) C3.7B13, 2nd paragraph: suggest adding the following to distinguish the note from C3.5C2.1 (cf. wording at C6.7B13.1f):

For resources that include both tactile components and components in print or graphic media, make a note on details identifying the tactile components not recorded in the technical description area (see C3.5C2.1).

(p. C6-3) C6.5B2.4: there should be a reference to A1.5B3 for playing time.

(p. C6-5) C6.7B13.1b: is there a relationship between *length of film or tape to duration* (referenced from C6.5B3)?

(p. C7-4) C7.5C1: should there be a further rule reference following “record other technical details as applicable”?

(p. C7-6) C7.7B13, 1st paragraph: add “area” (cf. C6.7B13); to justify the see reference from C7.5C13.1, add a reference to C7.5C13; rephrase as follows (see also comments at **15. Style. Clarity of instructions, (p. C7-4) C7.5C13.1**):

Make notes giving technical details for a remote access digital resource not recorded in the technical description area (see C7.5A1, C7.5B1, and C7.5C13).

(p. C7-7) C7.7B15: suggest that the first two sentences be deleted as they just repeat the sentences at A1.7B15. Rule C7.7B15 should read from “Record the following characteristics...”

Clarity of instructions

(p. I-1) Introduction, Scope, 2nd sentence: query whether the term “catalogue entries” should be used.

(p. I-4) Introduction, Levels of description, 4th sentence: instead of “entry” use “bibliographic description”:

The three levels of description...because they prescribe a bibliographic description that is in conformity....

(p. A1-14) A1.1A1, 2nd paragraph, 2nd sentence: for comprehensibility, we suggest the following reordering of the sentence (note the correction to “appear”):

However, if case endings are affected, or if the grammatical construction of the data would be disturbed, or if one element is inseparably linked to another, transcribe the data as they appear on the source of information.

(p. A1-18) A1.1B11, 1st paragraph, 6th sentence: delete this sentence and include it as part of the first sentence otherwise it would appear that the instructions applied only to the option; first sentence to read as follows:

For a resource lacking a chief source of information, either supply or devise a title and enclose such a supplied or devised title in square brackets.

(p. A1-20—A1-22) A1.1D: “transcribe” and “record” appear to be used interchangeably in all the subrules: “transcribe” (A1.1D1, A1.1D2, A1.1D3), “record” (A1.1D2, A1.1D4, A1.1D5). **If the rules regarding transcription are applicable (A1.0F), then “transcribe” should be used**

consistently. **GENERAL comment: this comment is applicable for all instances of substituting “record” for “give” in the revised rules.**

(p. A1-30) A1.2A3, 1st sentence: change “that” to “such” as follows:

In describing a facsimile or reproduction that has edition information pertaining to the original manifestation as well as such information pertaining to the facsimile....

(p. A1-32) A1.2B2, 2nd paragraph of rule: add “in square brackets” at the end of the sentence.

(p. A1-38) A1.3B1, 1st paragraph, penultimate sentence: add “manifestation” as follows:

In describing a facsimile or other reprint, record ...designation of the original manifestation.

(p. A1-40) A1.3D1, 1st sentence: suggest adding “in square brackets” as follows:

If the first issue or part of a multipart resource...define a designation pattern, supply in square brackets numbering for the first issue or part based on that pattern.

(p. A1-43) A1.4B5, 2nd sentence: suggest adding “in square brackets” as follows:

Supply in square brackets the real publication, distribution, etc.,...

(p. A1-43) A1.4C2: suggest adding “in square brackets” as follows:

Supply in square brackets another form of the name of a place...

(p. A1-43) A1.4C3, 2nd sentence of rule: suggest adding “in square brackets” as follows:

Supply in square brackets the name of the country, state, province, etc.,...

(p. A1-44) A1.4C4: suggest adding “in square brackets” as follows:

If a place name appears on ... transcribe it as it appears, and add in square brackets the full form...

(p. A1-45) A1.4C6, 1st paragraph: suggest adding “in square brackets” as follows:

If the place of publication ... uncertain, supply in square brackets the probable...

(p. A1-49) A1.4E1: suggest adding “in square brackets” as follows:

Optionally, add in square brackets to the name of a publisher...

(p. A1-49) A1.4F1, 1st paragraph, 2nd sentence: suggest adding “in square brackets” as follows:

If the date is not of the Gregorian...source of information and follow it with the year(s) of the Gregorian or Julian calendar in square brackets.

(p. A1-50) A1.4F2, 1st paragraph, 2nd sentence: suggest adding “in square brackets” at the end of the sentence.

(p. A1-51) A1.4F7: suggest adding “in square brackets” as follows:

If no date of publication, distribution, etc.,...the source of information, supply in square brackets an approximate date of publication.

Optionally, add in square brackets an approximate date of publication...

(p. A1-62) A1.5C1, 1st paragraph: suggest adding “technical” to read as follows:

Record the following technical details, as applicable to the resource, as instructed in the following rules (in this order):

(p. A1-84) A1.7B8, 1st paragraph: the first sentence is confusing; suggest that this rule could be simplified by deleting “forms of”.

(p. A1-95) A1.7B24, 2nd paragraph, 1st sentence: suggest rewording “in describing a resource in several volumes” as follows (cf. B6.7B24):

If the resource consists of separately numbered units, record inclusive....

(p. A2-6) A2.4F1, 1st paragraph: for clarity, suggest adding “only” to the first two sentences and placing the third sentence in the first position:

If the first and last published issues or parts are available, record the beginning and ending publication dates, separated by a hyphen. If only the first published issue or part is available, record the beginning date followed by a hyphen. If the resource has ceased or is complete and only the last published issue or part is available, record the ending date, preceded by a hyphen. If the publication date is the same for all issues or parts, record only that date as the single date.

(p. A2-7) A2.4F1, 3rd paragraph: suggest adding “in square brackets” as follows:

Optionally, supply in square brackets the beginning and/or ending....

(p. A2-9) A2.7B2, 3rd sentence: it is not necessary to be consistent with this type of note; suggest that the sentence read as follows, using either wording:

If changes in frequency have been numerous, a general statement may be made (cf. A2.7B6.1, A2.7B8.2) or make a general note (A2.7B5.1).

(p. A3-6) A3.4F1, 1st paragraph, last sentence: suggest adding “in square brackets” as follows:

For an *updating loose-leaf*, supply in square brackets the date of

(p. A3-6) A3.4F1, last paragraph of rule: suggest adding “in square brackets” as follows:

Optionally, supply in square brackets the beginning and/or ending....

(p. A3-7) A3.7B2, 3rd sentence: it is not necessary to be consistent with this type of note; suggest that the sentence read as follows, using either wording:

If changes in frequency have been numerous, a general statement may be made (cf. A2.7B6.1, A2.7B8.2) *or* make a general note (A2.7B5.1).

(p. A3-7) A3.7B2, 3rd sentence: it is not necessary to be consistent with this type of note; suggest that the sentence read as follows, using either wording:

If changes in frequency have been numerous, a general statement may be made (cf. A2.7B6.1, A2.7B8.2) *or* make a general note (A2.7B5.1).

(p. B1-2) B1.1B11, 1st paragraph: suggest adding “in square brackets” as follows:

If a text or assembled collection ...supply or devise a title proper and enclose it in square brackets as instructed below.

(p. B1-3) B1.1E6: suggest adding at the end of the sentence: “in square brackets”.

(p. B2-3) B2.1B11: suggest adding “in square brackets” as follows:

In a devised title proper for music, record in square brackets all of the elements prescribed

(p. B4-2) B4.1B11: suggest adding “in square brackets” as follows:

If an assemble collection of graphic resources lacks a title, supply a title... indicating the nature of the collection, and enclose it in square brackets.

(p. B7-2) B7.1B11, Commercial: add “in square brackets” as follows:

Devise and enclose in square brackets for a short

(p. B7-2) B7.1B11, Unedited material and newsfilm: add “in square brackets” as follows:

Include in a supplied or devised title enclosed in square brackets for unedited....

(p. C1-5) C1.5B2.1.8: it is unnecessary to repeat the instructions at C1.5B1; suggest rule read as follows:

For *updating loose-leafs*, do not record the number of pages following the qualifier (loose-leaf) (see C1.5B1).

(p. C1-10) C1.5D1.3, 1st paragraph: for consistency, use the form as for C1.5D1.4; the spelling of “centimeters” should be revised to: “centimetres”:

Record the height x width in centimetres.

(p. C1-11) C1.5D1.3.3: this rule can be simplified as follows (cf. C1.5D1.2):

Record the dimensions of an unbound *manuscript* as instructed in C1.5D1.1. If the manuscript is kept folded, add the dimensions when folded, separating the dimensions by a comma.

(p. C4-2) C4.5D1: revise this rule to read:

Record the dimensions in centimetres, to the next whole centimetre up, as instructed in the following rules.

(p. C4-2) C4.5D1.1, 1st paragraph: delete the second sentence.

(p. C4-2) C4.5D1.3: delete “in centimetres” at the end of the sentence.

(p. C6-2) C6.5B2: the wording could be generalized as follows (cf. C1.5D1, C3.5D1):

C6.5B2. Number of components. Record the number of components as appropriate to the type of resource being described as instructed in the following rules.

C6.5B2.1. Filmstrips and filmstrips. Record...

C6.5B2.2. Stereographs. Record the number of pairs of frames...*etc.*

(p. C7-4) C7.5C13.1, 1st paragraph: rephrasing the rule would make the reference to *remote access digital resource* more consistent (note the rewording at C7.5B1 from 9.5B3):

When recording the extent of a remote access digital resource (see C7.5B1), record other digital characteristics....

(p. C7-5) C7.7B5: given that this is a note, it would be more accurate to use “record” here (as used at C7.2B1) instead of “transcribe”. (Of interest: “record” was used in AACR2 (1978 edition) but “transcribe” has been used at 9.7B4 in all subsequent editions of AACR, perhaps to distinguish a file name or data set name appearing on the resource from a locally assigned file name, etc. Does the use of the term “transcribe” make that obvious or is the distinction necessary?)

(p. C7-6) C7.7B13, 2nd paragraph: for consistency, add “area” as follows:

Make notes on the number or approximate number of files...or bytes, not recorded in the technical description area if readily available....

(p. C7-6) C7.7B14: for consistency, add “area” and rephrase as follows:

Make notes on details of any ancillary material for a remote access digital resource if not recorded in the technical description area (see C7.5A1 and C7.5E1).

(p. A1-30) A1.2A3, 1st sentence: change “that” to “such” as follows:

In describing a facsimile or reproduction that has edition information pertaining to the original manifestation as well as such information pertaining to the facsimile....

16. Typographical and grammatical errors, etc.

(p. A1-4) Chapter A1, Contents, A1.10B: “Analytics” should be in lowercase: Parts of “In” analytics

(p. A1-4) Chapter A1, Contents, A1.0F6: heading should read: Symbols, etc.

(p. A1-5) A1.0A1bv: change “accompanying” to “ancillary”.

(p. A1-7) Footnote 2: this footnote should appear on p. A1-6.

(p. A1-9) A1.0C1, 3rd paragraph: “(see A1.3A3)” should read: “(see A1.3A4)”.

(p. A1-13) A1.0J, 1st paragraph: “A1.1B4” should read “A1.1B3”.

(p. A1-38—A1-40) A1.3B, A1.3C, A1.3D, A1.3E, A1.3F: the term “multipart resource” used in these rules does not appear as “*multipart resource*” whereas this term used at A1.7B11 does.

(p. A1-41) A1.3G1, 2nd paragraph, 2nd sentence: the order of the see references should be numerical, i.e., (see A1.6G1, A1.6H3, and A2.1B8). There should also be a comma preceding “and” (cf. A1.4B1, 2nd paragraph).

(p. A1-46) A1.4D1, 2nd paragraph: delete “(see A1.4D)”

(p. A1-48) A1.4D5: no space between the 2nd and 3rd paragraphs.

(p. A1-54) A1.5, Contents: correct the font size of: “A1.5C5 Polarity”

(p. A1-55) A1.5A6, 4th paragraph of rule: “preceded” should read: “precede”.

(p. A1-57) A1.5B1, Table 1, SMD comments: *braille cassette* should appear in the **Tactile** column, not in the *3-Dimensional* column

(p. A1-62) A1.5B5, 2nd paragraph, 2nd sentence: “Optionally” should be in italics: “*Optionally*”

(p. A1-69) A1.5D3, 3rd paragraph: delete the comma before “(C1.5D3)”; the beginning parenthesis should not be in italics and should not be bold.

(p. A1-76) A1.6H: delete “(see Glossary)” as was done at A1.1B2.

(p. A1-76) A1.6H3: revise “new series,” “second series,” to: *new series, second series* (cf. A1.3G1).

(p. A1-84) A1.7B8, 4th paragraph: for consistency (cf. A1.7B5), delete “for” before *moving images*.

(p. A1-88) A1.7B11, 3rd paragraph of rule: this paragraph should be divided into two paragraphs as follows (cf. A1.7B9):

For additional instructions on notes pertaining to material specific details for *resources issued in successive parts*, see A2.7B11.

See also supplementary instructions on notes pertaining to material specific details for *music* (B2.7B11) and *cartographic resources* (B3.7B11).

(p. A1-92) A1.7B18, 1st paragraph: delete the parentheses around the specific degrees since instructions are given to enclose the statement of the degree in parentheses (note that otherwise the parentheses should be in italics):

(e.g., *M.A.* or *Ph.D.* or, for theses to which conventional abbreviations do not apply, *doctoral* or *master's*)

(p. A1-96) A1.7B28, 3rd paragraph: delete the comma after “*etc.*”; the opening parenthesis of (C1.7B28) should not be in italics nor in bold.

(p. A1-98) A1.8B1, 1st sentence: change “the” to “an” as follows:

Record an International Standard Book Number (ISBN), an International Standard Number (ISSN), or any other

(p. A2-1) Chapter A2, Contents, A2.1B8: add: A2.1B8 Title in two or more parts

(p. A2-3) A2.1B8: the phrases “new series,” “second series” should appear as *new series* and *second series* (cf. A1.6G1)

(p. A2-8) A2.5C14, 2nd sentence: change “physical” to “technical”:

If other technical details are omitted or changed....

(p. B1-2) B1.1B11, 1st paragraph: “unpublished” should appear as “*unpublished*” (cf. B1.4F8).

(p. B1-3) B1.1E6, 1st paragraph: “unpublished” should appear as “*unpublished*” (cf. B1.4F8).

(p. B2-4) B2.3: add “AREA” to rule heading to read:

MUSICAL PRESENTATION STATEMENT AREA

(p. B3-1) B3.0A: capitalize “earth”.

(p. B3-4) B3.3B2, 1st paragraph, 1st sentence: add the ending parenthesis after “resource” but before the period.

(p. B3-8) B3.3D2, last paragraph of rule, 1st sentence: “charts” should read “collections of charts”.

(p. B4-1) B4.0A, 2nd paragraph: capitalize “earth”.

(p. B5-1) B5.0A, 2nd paragraph: capitalize “earth”.

(p. C1-1) Chapter C1, *Contents*: add after C1.5C3 Layout as follows:

| | |
|----------|------------------------|
| C1.5C3 | Layout |
| C1.5C3.1 | Maps, etc. |
| C1.5C3.2 | Charts and flip charts |

(p. C1-3) C1.5B2.1, footnote 1 of rule: change “publication” to “resource”.

(p. C1-5) C1.5B2.1.7c: add a full stop at the end of “as appropriate”.

(p. C1-5) C1.5B2.1.9, 1st paragraph: delete “(see Glossary)” as was done at A1.1B2.

(p. C1-7) C1.5B2.2.2: revise sentence to be consistent with C1.5B2.5:

Add the pagination, etc., as instructed in C1.5B2.1.

(p. C2-2) C2.5B2: the see reference should read: (see C1.5B2).

(p. C3-1) C3.5, *Contents*: the rule number for Special format characteristics is C3.5C2.

(p. C4-1) C4.5C10: the rule number for the text of the rule should read: C4.5C101

(p. C6-1) C6.7B13.3, *Contents*: “Videorecordings” should read: “Videorecordings”

(p. C6-3) C6.5B3: “videodiscs” should appear as *videodiscs* (cf. C6.4C11.1).

(p. C7-4) C7.5B2, last paragraph of rule: “A1.59” should read: “A159”.

Appendix

EXAMPLES GROUP

(p. A1-9—A1-10) A1.0C1: suggest adding an example to illustrate the use of metric unit symbols after the 8th paragraph of the rule.

(p. A1-17) A1.1B7, last paragraph of rule, example: add acronym as other title information as follows:

Linguistics and language behavior abstracts : LLBA
(Title appears on the source of information in full and as LLBA)

(p. A1-19) A1.1C2: instructions indicate that either *sound* or *audio* is used but not both; an example using [sound] (vs. [audio]) might be helpful; suggest also adding an example similar to the last example at A1.1E5 to illustrate the full variety of placement of the GMD:

Recreation information : opportunities for people with intellectual disability. News sheet
[GMD]

(p. A1-22) A1.1E1, last example: does this example conflict with the last paragraph of A1.1B7? Suggest that this example be deleted or added at A1.1B7 as an example for which the rule is not applicable. An example at a given rule should not indicate an exception to another rule.

(p. A1-23) A1.1F1, 4th example: suggest that this example be moved to follow the 2nd paragraph since this sentence (formerly the 2nd sentence of the 1st paragraph) is now a separate paragraph.

(p. A1-62) A1.5C1: suggest that the examples appearing in the following subrules should not be using terms that have not yet been introduced in the preceding rules, e.g., *ms.* at A1.5C6.

(p. A1-66) A1.5C10: suggest adding example: “col. ill.”.

(p. A1-84) A1.7B9, 1st paragraph: to justify the reference (and the example) from A1.4F9, add examples from 9.7B7.

(p. A2-8) A2.5B1, last example: the explanatory text does not seem appropriate given that the original example at 12.5B2 was intended to be an example of an *integrating resource* (i.e., an updating loose-leaf) issued in 2 binders, thus the explanatory note. The 3rd example and the last example should both be deleted from this rule. According to C1.5B1, the qualifier (*loose-leaf*) is to be added only for *updating loose-leafs* which, according to the glossary, can only be an integrating resource (A3).

(p. B2-7) B2.7B24, 2nd paragraph: the see reference to A1.7A4 appears to be rather meaningless (although it was originally a reference to 5.7B7 that included reprint examples). Suggest that it would be logical to add reprint examples at A1.7A4.

(p. C1-11) C1.5D1.3.3, examples: given that these examples are for *manuscripts*, *ms.* should appear in the technical details of all the examples.

(p. C1-11) C1.5D1.4, 2nd example: *ms.* should be moved as follows:

1 sheet (1 map) : *ms.* ; 123.5 x 152.4 cm