Proposal to improve consistency in "supertype" elements

Prepared by Thomas Brenndorfer, past NARDAC Representative to the RSC; submitted by Linda Barnhart, RSC Secretary, with thanks to the RDA Assessment Group for their direction

Abstract

RDA text is inconsistent in the wording and placement of information about supertype elements. This proposal recommends editorial changes to ten elements to improve consistency and increase clarity and one change to the Registry to correct a missing narrower element.

This proposal comes to the RSC for discussion and approval because of the need to add, move, and adjust options.

Most of these changes will be made in the CMS to RDA instructions. There is one recommendation that will require a change to the Registry. This change has been reviewed by the Technical Team Liaison Officer.

Background

This proposal originated in discussion by the RDA Assessment Group (AG2021-06) in July-October 2021. While at the time the group agreed to submit this as a Fast Track, upon further reflection and because of the number of elements involved, a proposal seemed more appropriate.

This issue came to the group through feedback from Kate James on April 12, 2021.

There are ten elements designated as "element supertypes:"

> Work: coordinates of cartographic content
> Work: numeric designation of musical work
>
> Expression: capture information
> Expression: form of notation
>
> Manifestation: digital file characteristic
> Manifestation: digital representation of cartographic content
> Manifestation: groove characteristic
> Manifestation: projection characteristic of motion picture film
> Manifestation: sound characteristic
> Manifestation: video characteristic

As shown in the screenshots and tables in the recommendations below, the March 2022 release shows a variety of treatments of supertype text. The recommendations unify the approach and make the element text consistent.

Justification

This proposal is made to improve consistency and increase clarity in RDA.

Impact

These changes are basically editorial. The consistency across similar elements will make RDA easier to interpret and to translate. These changes are not expected to have significant impact on current cataloguing.

Because options in RDA text are moved or added, policy statement writers will need to evaluate these changes and move or create corresponding policy statements.

This proposal will not require much if any new translation. However, the element text that is changed in this proposal (if approved) will need to be synchronized in each translation to reflect the new order of instructions.

Summary of Recommendations

Recommendations 1-4: Move the option from Prerecording to Recording

Recommendation 1:
    For Work: coordinates of cartographic content, move the option in Prerecording to Recording.
Recommendation 2:
    For Work: numeric designation of musical work, move the option in Prerecording to Recording.
Recommendation 3:
    For Expression: capture information, move the option in Prerecording to Recording.
Recommendation 4:
    For Expression: form of notation, move the option in Prerecording to Recording.

Recommendations 5-10: Adjust the existing wording and option placement for consistency

Recommendation 5:
    For Manifestation: projection characteristic of motion picture film, separate the existing text and move the option in Prerecording to Recording.
Recommendation 6:
    For Manifestation: groove characteristic, add the option to Recording.
Recommendation 7:
    For Manifestation: video characteristic, adjust the wording in Prerecording and move the option to Recording.
Recommendation 8:
    For Manifestation: sound characteristic, adjust the wording in Prerecording and add a Condition/Option the option to Recording.
Recommendation 9:
    For Manifestation: digital file characteristic, adjust the wording in Prerecording (including adding a missing narrower element to the list), remove the existing Option from Recording, and add the "standard" Option to Recording.
Recommendation 10:
    For Manifestation: digital representation of cartographic content, adjust the wording in Prerecording and add three Options to Recording. Add Manifestation: cartographic data type as a narrower element.

Recommendations 1-4: Move the option from Prerecording to Recording

The Work and Expression elements have instructions that are consistent in wording and placement:

Prerecording

This element is an *element supertype*.

For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if suitable:

[text specific to the element here]

OPTION

Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes.

From analysis of element subtypes, the option is generally found in the **Recording** section. This makes sense, given that the instruction is to "Record" and is not "information so that the agent who creates the metadata can decide if the element is appropriate, or if another element could or should be used." (Guidance, Introduction to RDA)

Recommendations 1-4 move this option to **Recording**. The rest of the supertype (and other) information remains in Prerecording. The wording

For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if suitable:

will be used as standard wording for the other supertype elements in the following recommendations.

Recommendation 1: For Work: coordinates of cartographic content, move the option in Prerecording to Recording.

CURRENT (March 2022 release)
Work: coordinates of cartographic content **Prerecording** This element is an *element supertype*. For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if appropriate: • For terrestrial cartographic content, record Work: longitude and latitude →⊟ • For terrestrial cartographic content that is more precise than longitude and latitude coordinates, record Work: strings of coordinate pairs →⊟ • For celestial cartographic content, record Work: right ascension and declination →⊟ **OPTION** Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes.

PROPOSED
Work: coordinates of cartographic content **Prerecording** This element is an *element supertype*. For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if appropriate: • For terrestrial cartographic content, record Work: longitude and latitude →⊟ • For terrestrial cartographic content that is more precise than longitude and latitude coordinates, record Work: strings of coordinate pairs →⊟ • For celestial cartographic content, record Work: right ascension and declination →⊟ **Recording** Record this element as a value of Place: appellation of place →⊟ or as an IRI. **OPTION** Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes.

Recommendation 2: For Work: numeric designation of musical work, move the option in Prerecording to Recording.

CURRENT (March 2022 release)

Work: numeric designation of musical work
 	
Prerecording
 	
This element is an *element supertype*.
 	
For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if appropriate:
 	
• Work: **serial number of musical work** ⟶
• Work: **opus number** ⟶
• Work: **thematic index number** ⟶.
 	
    OPTION
    Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes.

PROPOSED
Work: numeric designation of musical work **Prerecording** This element is an *element supertype*. For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if appropriate: • Work: **serial number of musical work** ⟶ • Work: **opus number** ⟶ • Work: **thematic index number** ⟶. **Recording** Record this element as a value of a Nomen: **nomen string** ⟶ or as an instance of a **Nomen** ⟶.   <u>**OPTION**</u>   <u>Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes.</u>

Recommendation 3: For Expression: capture information, move the option in Prerecording to Recording.

CURRENT (March 2022 release)
Expression: capture information **Prerecording** This element is an *element supertype*. For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if appropriate: • Expression: **date of capture** → • Expression: **note on capture** → • Expression: **place of capture** → **OPTION** Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes. A significant difference in a value of this element or an *element subtype*, if any, may indicate a boundary of the entity that requires the recording of a new instance of the entity. For guidance and instructions on the criteria that are used to determine that an expression is distinct from other expressions, see **Expression. Entity boundary** →.

PROPOSED
Expression: capture information **Prerecording** This element is an *element supertype*. For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if appropriate: • Expression: **date of capture** → • Expression: **note on capture** → • Expression: **place of capture** → A significant difference in a value of this element or an *element subtype*, if any, may indicate a boundary of the entity that requires the recording of a new instance of the entity. For guidance and instructions on the criteria that are used to determine that an expression is distinct from other expressions, see **Expression. Entity boundary** →. **Recording** **OPTION** Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes.

Recommendation 4: For Expression: form of notation, move the option in Prerecording to Recording.

CURRENT (March 2022 release)
Expression: form of notation

Prerecording
 	
This element is an *element supertype*.
 	
For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if appropriate:
 	
• Expression: **form of musical notation** ⊒
• Expression: **form of notated movement** ⊒
• Expression: **form of tactile notation** ⊒
• Expression: **script** ⊒
 	
  OPTION
 	
  Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes.
 	
A significant difference in a value of this element or an *element subtype*, if any, may indicate a boundary of the entity that requires the recording of a new instance of the entity.
 	
For guidance and instructions on the criteria that are used to determine that an expression is distinct from other expressions, see **Expression. Entity boundary** ⊒.

PROPOSED

Expression: form of notation

Prerecording

This element is an *element supertype*.

For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if appropriate:

- Expression: **form of musical notation** →
- Expression: **form of notated movement** →
- Expression: **form of tactile notation** →
- Expression: **script** →

A significant difference in a value of this element or an *element subtype*, if any, may indicate a boundary of the entity that requires the recording of a new instance of the entity.

For guidance and instructions on the criteria that are used to determine that an expression is distinct from other expressions, see **Expression. Entity boundary** →.

Recording

> **OPTION**
> Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes.

Recommendations 5-10: Adjust the existing wording and option placement for consistency

The Manifestation element supertypes will need a little more modification but can still be made to easily fit the pattern.

Recommendation 5: For Manifestation: projection characteristic of motion picture film, separate the existing text and move the option in Prerecording to Recording.

CURRENT (March 2022 release)
Manifestation: projection characteristic of motion picture film   **Prerecording**   This element is an *element supertype*.   **OPTION**   Record a *projection characteristic* if considered important for identification or selection. Record the following characteristics as separate elements, as applicable: • Manifestation: **presentation format** ⤷   • Manifestation: **projection speed** ⤷   For the aspect ratio of a motion picture film, see Expression: **aspect ratio** ⤷.   For the colour characteristics of a motion picture film, see Manifestation: **colour content** ⤷.   For the sound characteristics of a motion picture film, see Manifestation: **sound characteristic** ⤷.   For special equipment requirements for projection, see Manifestation: **equipment or system requirement** ⤷.

PROPOSED

Manifestation: projection characteristic of motion picture film

Prerecording

This element is an *element supertype*.

<u>For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if suitable:</u>
- Manifestation: presentation format
- Manifestation: projection speed

For the aspect ratio of a motion picture film, see Expression: **aspect ratio** ⤐.

For the colour characteristics of a motion picture film, see Manifestation: **colour content** ⤐.

For the sound characteristics of a motion picture film, see Manifestation: **sound characteristic** ⤐.

For special equipment requirements for projection, see Manifestation: **equipment or system requirement** ⤐.

Recording

<u>**OPTION**</u>
<u>Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes.</u>

Recommendation 6: For Manifestation: groove characteristic, add the option to Recording.

CURRENT (March 2022 release)
Manifestation: groove characteristic **Prerecording** This element is an *element supertype*. For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if appropriate: • Manifestation: **groove pitch** ⇥ • Manifestation: **groove width** ⇥ **Recording** **Recording an unstructured description**

PROPOSED
Manifestation: groove characteristic **Prerecording** This element is an *element supertype*. For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if appropriate: • Manifestation: **groove pitch** ⇥ • Manifestation: **groove width** ⇥ **Recording** **OPTION** Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes. **Recording an unstructured description**

Recommendation 7: For Manifestation: video characteristic, adjust the wording in Prerecording and move the option to Recording.

CURRENT (March 2022 release)
Manifestation: video characteristic

Prerecording

This element is an *element supertype*.

> **OPTION**
>
> Record the following characteristics as separate elements, if considered important for identification or selection, as applicable:
>
> - Manifestation: broadcast standard ⊞
> - Manifestation: video format ⊞

For an aspect ratio of a video, see Expression: aspect ratio ⊞.

For the colour characteristics of a video, see Manifestation: colour content ⊞.

For the sound characteristics of a video, see Manifestation: sound characteristic ⊞.

For additional characteristics of digitally encoded video, see Manifestation: digital file characteristic ⊞.

For special equipment requirements for projection, see Manifestation: equipment or system requirement ⊞.

PROPOSED

Manifestation: video characteristic

Prerecording

This element is an *element supertype*.

For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if suitable:

- Manifestation: broadcast standard
- Manifestation: video format

For an aspect ratio of a video, see Expression: **aspect ratio** ⏷.

For the colour characteristics of a video, see Manifestation: **colour content** ⏷.

For the sound characteristics of a video, see Manifestation: **sound characteristic** ⏷.

For additional characteristics of digitally encoded video, see Manifestation: **digital file characteristic** ⏷.

For special equipment requirements for projection, see Manifestation: **equipment or system requirement** ⏷.

Recording

OPTION
Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes.

Recommendation 8: For Manifestation: sound characteristic, adjust the wording in Prerecording and add a Condition/Option the option to Recording.

The element supertype Manifestation: sound characteristic has an existing Condition box under **Recording** stating "A manifestation does not consist primarily of recorded sound." In addition, the wording in the Prerecording section has an implicit condition of "For manifestations consisting primarily of recorded sound …". These two conditions form a parallel structure unique to this element.

This recommendation retains the two Conditions but places them both under the **Recording** section. Other than that, this element supertype is modified to use the same patterns for the other supertype elements.

CURRENT (March 2022 release)

Manifestation: sound characteristic

Prerecording

This element is an *element supertype*.

> ### OPTION
>
> For manifestations consisting primarily of recorded sound, record the following sound characteristics as separate elements, if considered important for identification or selection, as applicable:
>
> - Manifestation: configuration of playback channels →
> - Manifestation: groove characteristic →
>   - Manifestation: groove pitch →
>   - Manifestation: groove width →
> - Manifestation: playing speed →
> - Manifestation: recording medium →
> - Manifestation: special playback characteristic →
> - Manifestation: track configuration →
> - Manifestation: tape configuration →
> - Manifestation: type of recording →

For instructions on recording additional characteristics of digitally encoded sound (e.g., audio encoding formats such as MP3), see Manifestation: digital file characteristic →.

Recording

> ### CONDITION
>
> A manifestation does not consist primarily of recorded sound.

> ### OPTION
>
> Record sound characteristics if considered important for identification or selection.

Recording an unstructured description

PROPOSED

Manifestation: sound characteristic

Prerecording

This element is an *element supertype*.

For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if suitable:

- Manifestation: configuration of playback channels
- Manifestation: groove characteristic
  - Manifestation: groove pitch
  - Manifestation: groove width
- Manifestation: playing speed
- Manifestation: recording medium
- Manifestation: special playback characteristic
- Manifestation: track configuration
- Manifestation: tape configuration
- Manifestation: type of recording

For instructions on recording additional characteristics of digitally encoded sound (e.g., audio encoding formats such as MP3), see Manifestation: **digital file characteristic** ⊡.

Recording

CONDITION
A manifestation consists primarily of recorded sound.

> **OPTION**
> Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes.

CONDITION

A manifestation does not consist primarily of recorded sound.

> **OPTION**
>
> Record sound characteristics if considered important for identification or selection.

Recording an unstructured description

Recommendation 9: For Manifestation: digital file characteristic, adjust the wording in Prerecording (including adding a missing narrower element to the list), remove the existing Option from Recording, and add the "standard" Option to Recording.

The element supertype Manifestation: digital file characteristic can also be easily modified to fit the pattern. However, there is a missing element subtype in the **Prerecording** section, even though it is indicated as a "narrower element": Manifestation: digital representation of cartographic content.

In addition, the Recording section has an Option for recording values for Manifestation: digital representation of cartographic content, but this Option box would be redundant with the more general Option to be added in: "Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes".

CURRENT (March 2022 release)

Manifestation: digital file characteristic

Prerecording

This element is an *element supertype*.

Record the following characteristics as separate elements, as applicable:

- Manifestation: **encoded bitrate**
- Manifestation: **encoding format**
- Manifestation: **file size**
- Manifestation: **file type**
- Manifestation: **regional encoding**
- Manifestation: **resolution**

For instructions on recording the colour characteristics of a digital file, see Manifestation: **colour content**.

For instructions on recording other sound characteristics of a digital file, see Manifestation: **sound characteristic**.

For instructions on recording other video characteristics of a digital file, see Manifestation: **video characteristic**.

For instructions on recording special equipment requirements, see Manifestation: **equipment or system requirement**.

Recording

> **OPTION**
>
> For digitally encoded cartographic content, also record cartographic data type, object type, and number of objects as Manifestation: **digital representation of cartographic content**.

Recording an unstructured description

PROPOSED

Manifestation: digital file characteristic

Prerecording

This element is an *element supertype*.

For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if suitable:

- Manifestation: digital representation of cartographic content
- Manifestation: encoded bitrate
- Manifestation: encoding format
- Manifestation: file size
- Manifestation: file type
- Manifestation: regional encoding
- Manifestation: resolution

For instructions on recording the colour characteristics of a digital file, see Manifestation: colour content ➡.

For instructions on recording other sound characteristics of a digital file, see Manifestation: sound characteristic ➡.

For instructions on recording other video characteristics of a digital file, see Manifestation: video characteristic ➡.

For instructions on recording special equipment requirements, see Manifestation: equipment or system requirement ➡.

Recording

OPTION

For digitally encoded cartographic content, also record cartographic data type, object type, and number of objects as Manifestation: **digital representation of cartographic content**.

OPTION
Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes.

Recommendation 10: For Manifestation: digital representation of cartographic content, adjust the wording in Prerecording and add three Options to Recording. Add Manifestation: cartographic data type as a narrower element.

For the element supertype Manifestation: digital representation of cartographic content, there is one element subtype (Manifestation: cartographic data type) but there are also two other values (which are not element subtypes) which could be recorded directly with this element: "object type" and "number of objects used to represent spatial information".

To make this element supertype consistent with the others, the **Recording** section can be modified to contain three Option boxes, one for the element subtype (following the pattern), and the other two for the other values recorded directly with this element. The final result from this recommendation makes this element supertype consistent with all the other element supertypes.

Another fix is required. Manifestation: cartographic data type does not appear as a narrower element to Manifestation: digital representation of cartographic content on the element page. This will require an adjustment to the Registry.

CURRENT (March 2022 release)
Manifestation: digital representation of cartographic content **Prerecording** This element is an *element supertype*. **OPTION** For digitally encoded cartographic content, record the following information if it can be readily ascertained and is considered important for identification or selection: • Manifestation: cartographic data type ⊞ • object type • number of objects used to represent spatial information **Recording** **Recording an unstructured description**

PROPOSED

Manifestation: digital representation of cartographic content

Prerecording

This element is an *element supertype*.

For a more specific description, use one of the following element subtypes if suitable:
- Manifestation: **cartographic data type**

Recording

> **OPTION**
> Record the values of one or more of the element subtypes.

> **OPTION**
> Record the object type.

> **OPTION**
> Record the number of objects used to represent spatial information.

Recording an unstructured description

. . .

Related Elements

For broader elements, see Manifestation: digital file characteristic ⬙.

For narrower elements, see Manifestation: cartographic data type.