

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Dave Reser, LC Representative
Subject: Revision of 9.6

When LC agreed to 6JSC/BL/4 at the JSC meeting in Chicago, it was with the understanding that the elements in 9.6.1.6-9.6.1.9 would only be added to authorized access points if needed to differentiate. The CORE statement at 9.6 reflected this decision; unfortunately, existing instructions in 9.19.1.1 conflict with the revisions to the CORE statement at 9.6, creating the paradox noted by the CCC Rep in an email to the JSC (and noted by some PCC/NACO libraries as well).

The solution to the problem proposed by the BL is to revise the CORE statement at 9.6, but we believe that 0.6.4, 8.3, 9.19.1.1, and 9.19.1.2 need to be revised as well. We would agree to the BL proposal 1) with ALA's proposed addition of the word "real" *and* 2) with our additional changes proposed for 0.6.4, 8.3, 9.19.1, and 9.19.1.2, which we have added in this response. Our reasons for this include:

1. We supported the idea of a fictitious or non-human entity as a creator in RDA because these entities may be credited as creators in resources. Often these resources do not explicitly identify the entities as non-human or fictional. For example, the fictitious mouse journalist Geronimo Stilton attributed as the author of many children's books, and the television character Richard Castle attributed as the author of several novels. The author website for Castle at Amazon.com does not give an indication of his fictitious status. Before RDA, LC deleted name authority records created for them on multiple occasions because the catalogers creating the NARs were unaware of the fictitious status. We would prefer not to put catalogers in the position of doing research to determine whether such creators are 1) real and 2) human. We also do not want catalogers to change access points previously thought to be valid when information about the personhood of creators becomes available after the fact.
2. To automatically add an element clarifying the particular status of "personhood" seems contrary to the scope of 9.0 to treat all persons alike, even if they are fictional or non-human.
3. Many persons from sacred scripture are recognizable and established in the LC/NACO database without the addition "Biblical figure." Examples of these persons include Jesus Christ; Herod Agrippa I, King of Judea, 10 B.C.-44 A.D.; Mary, Blessed Virgin, Saint; John, the Baptist, Saint; and Solomon, King of Israel. These authorized access points are unique and have been used for decades in the card and online catalogs; we see no benefit to changing them or doing the follow-up maintenance.

4. The core element list at 0.6.4 and 8.3 should have been edited last year when the new element sub-types were added at 9.6. Because of 9.6.1.9 Other Designation (which is core only if needed to distinguish), the element “Other designation associated with the person” should not be listed without qualification at 0.6.4 and 8.3.

In addition to these objections, we would like to take this opportunity to correct other existing issues with 9.19.1.1 and 9.19.1.2. We note that 9.19.1.2 has been problematic since the U.S. RDA Test in 2010. In retrospect, we were probably too hasty to agree to the additions made by BL/4 to this instruction without extensive revision, and acknowledge that our proposal, 6JSC/LC/16, also contributed to the already cumbersome exceptions at 9.19.1.2. These are the main problems with the current instructions at 9.19.1.2:

1. The meaning of the phrase “(in this order)” is unclear. As recently noted by the CCC Rep, it seems to suggest the order in which additions are made, until you look at the examples, which do not show that order. Nor does it seem desirable to follow that order of additions, which would create authorized access points like: Fluffy (Spirit) (Dog). The instructions in 9.19 do need to specify the order of additions to authorized access points, beyond those about fuller form of name in 9.19.1.4.
2. The caption for the instruction is “Title or Other Designation Associated with the Person;” however, the list also refers to “Profession or occupation,” which is neither a title nor an other designation associated with a person. It is counterintuitive for catalogers to look in 9.19.1.2 for instructions about adding such a term to a name not conveying the idea of a person. We have suggested a change to move this instruction to 9.19.1.1, which is somewhat modeled on BL’s proposed change for names not conveying the idea of a corporate body in 6JSC/BL/12/rev.
3. The titles and other designations listed in 9.19.1.2 are very different in form, use, and “coreness.” Rather than grouping unlike elements together with several exceptions, it seems more desirable to break them up into separate sub-instructions. This way, when both titles *and* other designations are being added, as often happens with “Saint” and “(Spirit),” clear instructions can be provided about the order and necessity of additions.

Marked-Up Copy

0.6.4 Section 3: Recording Attributes of Person, Family, and Corporate Body

When recording data identifying a person, family, or corporate body, include as a minimum the following elements that are applicable and readily ascertainable.

Record the elements as separate elements, as parts of the authorized access point representing the person, family, or corporate body, or as both.

Preferred name for the person

Title of the person (a word or phrase indicative of royalty, nobility, ecclesiastical rank or office; a term of address for a person of religious vocation)

Date of birth

Date of death

Other designation associated with the person (for a Christian saint, a spirit, a person named in a religious work, a fictitious or legendary person, or a real non-human entity)

[remainder of list omitted]

If the preferred name for the person, family, or corporate body is the same as or similar to a name by which another person, family, or corporate body is known, differentiate them by recording as many of the additional identifying elements in the following list as necessary. Record these elements as separate elements, as parts of the authorized access point representing the person, family, or corporate body, or as both.

Title of the person (another term indicative of rank, honour, or office)

Fuller form of name

Profession or occupation

Period of activity of the person

Other designation

[remainder of list omitted]

8.3 Core Elements

When recording data identifying a person, family, or corporate body, include as a minimum the following elements that are applicable and readily ascertainable. Record the elements as separate elements, as parts of the authorized access point representing the person, family, or corporate body, or as both.

Preferred name for the person

Title of the person (a word or phrase indicative of royalty, nobility, ecclesiastical rank or office; a term of address for a person of religious vocation)

Date of birth

Date of death

Other designation associated with the person (for a Christian saint, a spirit, a person named in a religious work, a fictitious or legendary person, or a real non-human entity)

[remainder of list omitted]

If the preferred name for the person, family, or corporate body is the same as or similar to a name by which another person, family, or corporate body is known, differentiate them by recording as many of the additional identifying elements as necessary in the following list. Record these elements as separate elements, as parts of the authorized access point representing the person, family, or corporate body, or as both.

Title of the person (another term indicative of rank, honour, or office)

Fuller form of name

Profession or occupation

Period of activity of the person

Other designation

[remainder of list omitted]

9.19.1.1 General Guidelines on Constructing Authorized Access Points to Represent Persons

[1st paragraph and examples omitted]

Make additions to the name as instructed at [9.19.1.2 RDA](#)–[9.19.1.7 RDA](#), in ~~that order~~, as applicable.

[examples omitted]

~~Make the additions specified at [9.19.1.2 RDA](#) even if they are not needed to distinguish access points representing different persons with the same.~~

Person whose name consists of a phrase or appellation not conveying the idea of a person. For a person whose name consists of a phrase or appellation not conveying the idea of a person, add after the name:

- a) a term indicating profession or occupation (see 9.16) for human entities,
- or
- b) a term indicating fictitious or legendary character (see 9.6.1.7)
- or
- c) a term indicating type, species or breed for real non-human entities (see 9.6.1.8)

Make this addition to a name that consists of a phrase or appellation not conveying the idea of a person even if it is not needed to distinguish access points representing different persons with the same name.

EXAMPLE

Stone Mountain (Writer)

Big Hand (Musician)

PSK-13 (Rapper)

G-8 (Fictitious character)

Battleship (Race horse)

Splash (Dog)

Wolverine (Fictitious character)

not Wolverine (Soldier)

Rin-Tin-Tin (Dog)

not Rin-Tin-Tin (Actor)

but

Obama, Bo

Kent, Clark

Wonder Woman

Mr. Ed

Frosty, the Snowman

Make the additions specified at [9.19.1.3 RDA](#)–[9.19.1.7 RDA](#) if they are needed to distinguish access points representing different persons with the same name.

[remainder of instruction omitted]

9.19.1.2 Title or Other Designation Associated with the Person

Add to the name one or more of the following elements (~~in this order~~), as instructed at 9.19.1.2.1-9.19.1.2.6, as applicable:

- a) a title of royalty (see [9.4.1.4 RDA](#) [9.19.1.2.1](#)) or nobility (see [9.4.1.5 RDA](#))
- b) the term *Saint* (see [9.6.1.4 RDA](#)) a title of nobility (see [9.19.1.2.2](#))
- c) a title of religious rank (see [9.4.1.6 RDA](#) [9.4.1.8 RDA](#) [9.19.1.2.3](#))
- d) the term *Spirit* (see [9.6.1.5 RDA](#)) the term *Saint* (see [9.19.1.2.4](#))
- e) a term indicating a person named in a sacred scripture or an apocryphal book (see [9.6.1.6 RDA](#)) the term *Spirit* (see [9.19.1.2.5](#))
- f) the term *Fictitious character*, *Legendary character*, etc. (see [9.6.1.7 RDA](#)) an other designation associated with the person (see [9.19.1.1.2.6](#))
- g) a term indicating type, species, or breed (see [9.6.1.8 RDA](#))
- h) the profession or occupation (see [9.16 RDA](#)) for a person whose name consists of a phrase or appellation not conveying the idea of a person.

The term *Spirit* is always added as the last element in the authorized access point.

Make the additions listed in a)-d) and f) before adding dates of birth and/or death or period of activity.

When adding multiple elements from f), enclose each term in a set of parentheses.

EXAMPLE

Anne, Queen of Great Britain
 Borselen, Frank van, graaf van Oostervant
 Anglès, Jules-Jean-Baptiste, comte
 Pius XII, Pope
 Desitheos, Patriarch of Jerusalem
 Ruricius I, Bishop of Limoges
 Arundel, Philip Howard, Earl of, Saint
 Garland, Judy (Spirit)
 Messenger Number One from the Secret Love Star (Spirit)
 Stone Mountain (Writer)
 Big Hand (Musician)
 PSK-13 (Rapper)
 Adam (Biblical figure)
 Holmes, Sherlock (Fictitious character)
 Aeneas (Legendary character)
 Lauder Lass (Horse)
 Henrietta (Cat)

Exceptions

Title of nobility. Add a title of nobility only if the title or part of the title commonly appears with the name in resources associated with the person or in reference sources. In this context, disregard reference sources dealing with the nobility. In case of doubt, add the title.

~~**Saint.** Do not add *Saint* to an access point representing a pope or an emperor, empress, king, or queen.~~

~~**Title of religious rank.** Add a title of religious rank to the name of a person whose given name is recorded as the first element in the preferred name only if the title or part of the title commonly appears with the name in resources associated with the person or in reference sources. In case of doubt, add the title.~~

EXAMPLE

~~Augustine, of Canterbury, Saint~~

~~Title "Archbishop" not commonly used in resources associated with the person or in reference sources~~

~~Augustine, of Hippo, Saint~~

~~Title "Bishop" not commonly used in resources associated with the person or in reference sources~~

~~Teresa, of Avila, Saint~~

~~Title "madre" not commonly used in resources associated with the person or in reference sources~~

9.19.1.2.1 Title of Royalty

Add a title of royalty (see 9.4.1.4) even if it is not needed to distinguish access points representing different persons with the same name. Add the title of royalty after the preferred name.

EXAMPLE

Anne, Queen of Great Britain

Carlos, Prince of Asturias

Gustav I Vasa, King of Sweden

Isabella, of Parma, consort of Joseph II, Holy Roman Emperor

9.19.1.2.2 Title of Nobility

If the title of nobility (see 9.4.1.5) or part of the title commonly appears with the name in resources associated with the person or in reference sources, add the title to the name. In this context, disregard reference sources dealing with the nobility. In case of doubt, add the title. Add the title of nobility even if it is not needed to distinguish access points representing different persons with the same name.

EXAMPLE

Borselen, Frank van, graaf van Oostervant

Anglès, Jules-Jean-Baptiste, comte

Add the title after the preferred name unless applying 9.19.1.4. When applying 9.19.1.4, add the title after the fuller form of name.

EXAMPLE

Puymaigre, Th. de. (Théodore), comte

9.19.1.2.3 Title of Religious Rank

Popes. Add the title Pope or Antipope (see 9.4.1.6) after the preferred name.

EXAMPLE

Pius XII, Pope

Hippolytus, Antipope

Bishops, etc. and other persons of religious vocation. For bishops, etc. (see 9.4.1.7) and other persons of religious vocation (see 9.4.1.8).

If:

the given name is recorded as the first element in the preferred name

and

the title or part of the title commonly appears with the name in resources associated with the person or in reference sources

then:

add the title of religious vocation.

Add the title even if it is not needed to distinguish access points representing different persons with the same name. In case of doubt add the title.

EXAMPLE

Dositheos, Patriarch of Jerusalem

Ruricius I, Bishop of Limoges

Alexander, Bishop of Alexandria, Saint

but

Augustine, of Canterbury, Saint

Title "Archbishop" not commonly used in resources associated with the person or in reference sources

Augustine, of Hippo, Saint

Title "Bishop" not commonly used in resources associated with the person or in reference sources

Teresa, of Avila, Saint

Title "madre" not commonly used in resources associated with the person or in reference sources

Add the title after the preferred name unless applying 9.19.1.4 (fuller form of name).

When applying 9.19.1.4, add the title after the fuller form of name.

EXAMPLE

M. Alicia (Mary Alicia), Sister, S.C.N.

Title, including initials representing a Christian religious order, added after fuller form of name

9.19.1.2.4 Saint

Add the term *Saint* (see 9.6.1.4) to the preferred name unless the access point represents a pope or an emperor, empress, king, or queen. Add the term after the fuller form of name (see 9.19.1.4) and title of nobility (see 9.19.1.2.2) or title of religious rank (see 9.19.1.2.3), as applicable.

EXAMPLE

Arundel, Philip Howard, Earl of, Saint

Manyanet, José (Manyanet i Vives), Saint
"Saint" added after fuller form of name

Boniface, IV, Pope

not Boniface, IV, Pope, Saint

Vladimir, King of Dalmatia

not Vladimir, King of Dalmatia, Saint

9.19.1.2.5 Spirit

Construct the authorized access point for the spirit of a person by combining (in this order):

- a) the authorized access point for the person
- b) the term *Spirit* (see 9.6.1.5)

EXAMPLE

Garland, Judy (Spirit)

Blount, Harry, 1880-1913 (Spirit)

Messenger Number One from the Secret Love Star (Spirit)

Elijah (Biblical prophet) (Spirit)

9.19.1.2.6 Other Designation Associated with the Person

Add one or more of the following types of terms if needed to distinguish one access point from another:

- a) a term indicating a person named in a sacred scripture or an

apocryphal book (see 9.6.1.6)

b) the term *Fictitious character*, *Legendary character*, etc. (see 9.6.1.7)

c) a term indicating type, species, or breed (see 9.6.1.8)

Add the term after the fuller form of name (see 9.19.1.4), title of royalty (see 9.19.1.2.1) title or nobility, (see 9.19.1.2.2), title of religious rank (see 9.19.1.2.3) or the term *Saint* (see 9.19.1.2.4), as applicable.

EXAMPLE

Adam (Biblical figure)

Henrietta (Cat)

Lennox, Bill (Fictitious character)

Caulfield, Holden (Holden Morrisey) (Fictitious character)

Mary Theresa, Sister (Fictitious character)

For instructions on adding the term *Saint* to the authorized access point, see 9.19.1.2.4.

For instructions on adding the term *Spirit* to the authorized access point, see 9.19.1.2.5.

Optional Addition

Add one or more of the following types of terms listed in 9.19.1.2.6 even if there is no need to distinguish one access point from another.

EXAMPLE

Obama, Bo (Portuguese water dog)

Lear, King of England (Fictitious character)

Joan, Pope (Fictitious character)

Leibowitz, Isaac Edward, Saint (Fictitious character)